STORIES FROM MONTREAL

09

Volume 19

WITH SUPPORT FROM CONCORDIA COUNCIL ON STUDENT LIFE

Stories from Montreal



Stories of Montreal: 2019-2020 Special Edition

Sociology and Anthropology Student Union members:

Olivia Desgroseilliers - Stories from Montreal Coordinator Hussain Almahr - Stories from Montreal Coordinator Marie Figuereo - Stories from Montreal Editor in Chief

Editors:

Banafsheh Cheraghi Hanine El Mir Maria Bouabdo Siobhan Wilkinson Maggie Hope

Authors:

Amanda Van Oort Andrea Santamaria Arielle Quéraud Benjamin Lamy Chloë Lalonde Daria Danita Emilie Charron Felix Bonnevie Jessica Agathangelou Maliha Latif Mor Argaman Philippe Boucher Rachel Lalonde Rebecca Aberra Roxxane Perron Yana Iossel

Acknowledgements Introduction - Olivia Desgroseilliers © Chapter I - Emilie Charron © Chapter II - Rachel Lalonde © Chapter III - Philippe Boucher © Chapter IV - Chloë Lalonde © Chapter V - Andrea Santamaria © Chapter VI - Roxxane Perron © Chapter VII - Felix Bonnevie © Chapter VIII - Arielle Quéraud © Chapter IX - Amanda Van Oort © Chapter X - Mor Argaman © Chapter XI - Jessica Agathangelou © Chapter XII - Benjamin Lamy © Chapter XIII - Yana Iossel © Chapter XIV - Rebecca Aberra ©

Chapter XV - Maliha Latif © Chapter XVI - Daria Danita ©

Cover page designed by Allie Brown.

Book formated by Olivia Desgroseilliers.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form without permission in writing from the publisher.

The content of each chapter of this book is the sole responsibility and property of the respective authors.

Printed in 2021 by Le Caius du Livre (Quebec, Canada).

Funded by the Sociology and Anthropology Student Union (SASU) in collaboration with the Concordia Student Union and the Concordia Council on Student Life (CCSL).



STUDENT SERVICES

Concordia Council on Student Life

National Library of Canada: ISBN: 978-1-7777595-1-3

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements - P. 9

Introduction - P. 10

By: Olivia Desgroseilliers

Section I: Anthropology & Sociology Essays

Chapter I - Ethnonationalism and Right-wing Populism in Post-Soviet Hungary - P.18 By: Emilie Charron

Chapter II - One of "Those Girls": Making One's Place in the Montreal Pole Community - P. 32 By: Rachel Lalonde

Chapter III - Impacts of Government Policies on Indigenous Food Sovereignty:The Kahnawá:ke Case - P. 62 By: Philippe Boucher

Chapter IV - Paint: A Study of Paint as a Political and Environmental Object - P. 75 By: Chloe Lalonde Chapter V - The Mothership Hotel: A New Innovative Design to make Montreal Green - P. 108 By: Andrea Santamaria

Chapter VI - Tooth Fairy: A North American Tradition - P. 134 By: Roxxane Perron

Chapter VII - Queering Virtual Worlds: Identity Performance in Virtual World Video - P. 145 By: Felix Bonnevie

Chapter VIII - Intellectual Disability and Sexual Rights - P. 164 By: Arielle Quéraud

Section II: Honors Anthropology & Sociology Essays

Chapter IX - Catching the Spirit: Dynamics of Spiritual Capital in the Coupling of American Evangelicalism and Media Technology - P. 178 By: Amanda Van Oort

Chapter X - Mediating Identity Through an Instagram Filter: The Nuances of Instagram Usage Among Montreal's Undergraduate Students - P. 208 By: Mor Argaman

Chapter XI - The Failure of Drug Criminalization: Decriminalization and Harm Reduction as Viable Approaches to Addiction - P. 262 By: Jessica Agathangelou

Chapter XII - Means of Living: The Viability of Dairy Farms in 21st Century Laurentides - P. 299 By: Benjamin Lamy

Chapter XIII - Buying the Government's Ganja: Changing Consumption Practices among Montreal's Longterm Marijuana Consumers - P. 335 By: Yana Iossel

Chapter XIV - A Critical Race Theory Perspective: The Implications of the Advances in Biomedicine - P. 371 By: Rebecca Aberra

Chapter XV - The Gendered and Racialized Dimensions of Fibromyalgia: A Contested Chronic Pain Illness - P. 406 By: Maliha Latif

Chapter XVI - "It Takes Many Beers": The Processes Towards Authentic Leadership in Today's Evangelical Church of Montreal - P. 454 By: Daria Danita

Acknowledgements

The Sociology and Anthropology Student Union and the Stories from Montreal team would like to begin by acknowledging that Concordia University is located on unceded Indigenous lands. The Kanien'kehá:ka Nation is recognized as the custodians of the lands and waters on which we gather today. Tiohtià:ke/Montréal is historically known as a gathering place for many First Nations. Today, it is home to a diverse population of Indigenous and other peoples. We respect the continued connections with the past, present and future in our ongoing relationships with Indigenous and all peoples within the Montreal community.

We would like to thank all the participants for their patience and commitment in this project. This unprecedented year prolonged the process far beyond the usual timeline. It's completion is the result of everyones cumulative dedication and interest in this edition.

We would also like to thank all other contributors, such as the Concordia Student Union, the Sociology and Anthropology Student Union and the Concordia Council on Student Life (CCSL) for helping make this project a reality.

A special mention to Aida Setbel and Van Loc.

Introduction Written by: Olivia Desgroseilliers

Through this journal, we strive to make Anthropology and Sociology more accessible and approachable to a wider audience. People often wonder what the discipline of Anthropology and Sociology studies, and we hope that this journal helps answer that question. Anthropologists and Sociologists study everything from people to cultures, traditions, and economies. We study with and from communities around the globe, and our discipline works in tandem with many others. Anthropology and Sociology students have a responsibility to learn from the disciplines past mistakes and practice in a safe, inclusive and respectful manner. It needs to become representaive and inclusionary of all; and we hope that this journal is a small step in that direction. The Stories from Montreal journal began as a way to allow students to showcase and publish their academic work. It allows them to gain experience and grow their knowledge of academia and the process behind publishing an academic journal. The early editions showcased projects written for the Anth-315 Field Research class, and was named from the fact that most students conducted their research in Montreal. For the more recent editions, including this one, students from the Anthropology and Sociology programs could submit an

essay from any class as long as it met certain pre-established criteria. For the first time in the journal's history, we decided to expand this edition to include essays written by the Sociology and Anthropolgy Honours class. The honours class works on their thesis for an entire academic year before presenting their resulting work. We thought that the Stories from Montreal journal would be a good place to publish and show case their work as well.

This edition is composed of eight essays written by Anthropology and Sociology students, as well as eight essays from the Anthropology and Sociology's Honor program.

Section 1: Anthropology and Sociology Essays

Chapter I, entitled "Ethnonationalism and Right-Wing Populism in Post-Soviet Hungary" discusses the current political situation in Hungary and the imporatnce of the rule of law. The author also discusses the rapid growth of rhetoric and nationalist, and the role it plays in the rising populist movement.

Chapter II entitled "One of "Those Girls'; Making One's Place in the Montreal Pole Community" gives us an inside view at the Montreal pole dancing community. With the use of research and interviews they conducted with members of the community, the author explains and defines the sport of pole.

Chapter III entitled "Impacts of Government Policies on Indigenous Food Sovereignty: The Kahnawa:ke Case" dives deep into the colonization of Indigenous peoples in Canada. It discusses the historical policies put in place to regulate and control the traditional food systems used by Indigenous peoples. They also discuss the impact the Indian Act had on Indigenous peoples and their food systems.

Chapter IV entitled "Paint: A Study of Paint as a Political and Environmental Object" explores the dichotomy between the hierarchies created by paint, the social and the material. It discusses the transformative nature of pain and its socio-cultural, political, environmental and educational issues. The essay makes a case for the power of paint and its transformative qualities.

Chapter V, entitled "The Mothership Hotel: A New Innovative Design to Make Montreal Green" discusses self-sustaining environmentally friendly houses, also known as Earthships. It examines the Montreal Biodôme and how it could be turned greener. It also discusses the flora and fauna who live within institutions such as the Biodôme and their role.

Chapter VI, entitled "The Tooth Fairy: A North American Traditions" explores the myth of the tooth fairy and how it grew to become so popular. It considers how the tooth fairy teaches children about transactions and how capitalist culture encourages commodification; particularly the commodification of the self. They explain how the tooth fairy myth reflects both personal and social norms and views.

Chapter VII entitled "Queering Identity Performance in Virtual Video Games" uses queer theory to explore marginalized communities who play video games. It looks at the game *Second Life* to discuss the real-life effects of virtual video games on people and their identities.

Chapter VIII entitled "Intellectual Disability and Sexual Rights" discusses the sexual and reproductive rights of people with intellectual disabilities. It dives deeper into explaining the need principles of individuals with intellectual disabilities, and uses a comparative case study to illustrate and further explain the findings.

Section 2: Honours Anthropology and Sociology Essays

Chapter IX entitled "Dynamics of Spiritual Capitalism in the Coupling of American Evangelicalism and Media Technology" looks at the realtionship between the growing American Evangelical community and social media through a sociological lens. They also discuss the intersection of gospel with the American economy and culture, and its resulting impact.

Chapter X entitled "Meditating Identity Through an Instagram Filter: The Nuances of Instagram Usage Among Montreal's Undergraduate Students" discusses the growing importance of social media platforms and its effect on individuals' personal identity. It focuses on the platform Instagram, and also explores the topic of sexual identity and sexuality in realtion to social media.

Chapter XI entitled "The Failure of Drug Criminalization: Decriminalization and Harm Reduction as Viable Approaches to Addiction" studies the effects of drug criminalization on users, and argues that decriminalization and harm reduction are a viable replacement to the traditional idea of criminalization. It discusses the benefits of a health and social approach instead of a legal one.

Chapter XII entitled "Means of Living: The Viability of Dairy Farms in 21st Century Laurentides" discusses the dairy industry in Quebec, and the text was inspired by the author's personal experience. It focuses particularly on the region of the Laurentides, and the essay proposes potential tactics in order to ameliorate the current situation for many dairy farms across Quebec.

Chapter XIII entitled "Buying the Government's Ganja:

Changing Consumption Practices Among Montreal's Long Term Marijuana Consumers" explores the recent legalization of Marijuana in Canada and the effect on marijuana users who are used to obtaining their product elsewhere. It focuses specifically on the narratives constructed around marijuana consumption and its relationship to identity.

Chapter XIV entitled "A Critical Race Theory Perspective: The Implications of the Advances in Biomedicine" uses critical race theory to examine racial disparities and the mechanisms which maintain and intensify said disparities. It looks more specifically at how race and biotechnology interact with each other.

Chapter XV entitled "The Gendered and Racialized Dimensions of Fibromyalgia: A Contested Chronic Pain Illness" discusses medically unexplained symptoms and the perceived legitimacy of illness and symptoms. Through the lens of medical sociology, this essay links the feminist concept of intersectionality and the experience of women who have Fibromyalgia with social constructs around illness.

Chapter XVI entitled "It Takes Many Beers: The Processes Towards Authentic Leadership in Today's Evangelical Curch of Montreal" studies the growing movement of Evangelical non-denominational Christians in Quebec. It takes a particular look at where men situate themselves within the Evangelical movement, and how it affects the notions of authentic masculinity that are often observed in the church. It discusses the effects of theological ideology on an individuals notion of masculinity.

Section I: Anthropology & Sociology Essays

Chapter I

Ethnonationalism and Right-Wing Populism in Post-Soviet Hungary

Written By: Emilie Charron

Chapter I Written By: Emilie Charron

There are emerging discourses in the field of political anthropology which consist of interpreting the social constructs of ethnicity and nationalism, along with the role they play in the negotiation of power and political life in the nation-state. The creation of modern nation-state can arguably be at odds with previous notions of nationhood, wherein the distinction of nations by territorial and political means differs from the long-established notions of a common culture, kinship and ethnic background. The traditional and modern interpretations of the nation are at odds around the world in our current state of global neoliberal capitalism. This is especially the case for Hungary, a country which is arguably defined by a recent historic pendulum of political inclinations — going from fascist regimes to operating as a socialist Soviet satellite state — which is characteristic of countries having faced socio-economic anxieties that are improperly addressed by scapegoating. Along with the political shifts, Hungary is having an identity crisis: the complex linguistic and cultural history which has defined the nation's sense of self for so long has led to a state of constant paranoia and Hungarians have now entertained the idea of autocratic ethnonationalism. One must first implement an anthropological interpretation of how nationalism and ethnicity converge. Then it is critical to situate the case study of Hungary within the critical theory and World-systems paradigms borrowed from Morelock and Narita (2018) to assess how the historicization of the country's socio-political behaviours coincide with its use of symbolic exclusion to assert its collective identity.

Theorizing Ethnicity, Nationalism and Collective Identities

Ethnicity has long been deemed a tricky term to assess from an anthropological point-of-view, as it "only exists in relation to other groups" and it "refers to distinctions [which] are recognized by both the in-group and the outsiders" (Lewellen, 2003, 166-7). Ethnicity would refer to socio-cultural criteria assessed based on descent, a common place of origin, and a collective sense of kinship (Lewellen, 2003, 167). The construction of ethnicity can be arguably tied to the power relations which are implied by the assessment of ethnic categorization. This process of categorization is established by those in a position of relative power, generally those of 'dominant' socio-cultural groups. When observing ideological discourses regarding ethnicity, it is important to note that the dominant groups are usually immune from the 'ethnic' label, as they impose themselves as the default and as the "universal group" (Lewellen, 2003, 168). When dominant groups engage in ethnic politics, they are marginalizing minority groups and exploiting their identities for trivial scapegoating. This behavior can be observed in many post-colonial nation-states such as the United States, Canada, Chile, and Brazil, as they problematize the existence of their respective Indigenous communities (Lewellen, 2003, 164). This behaviour also applies to the case of Hungary, where minority groups such as Jews and Roma have been historically scrutinized and vilified regardless of the political regime in power. The emergence of 'legitimized' nationalist discourses can be traced to the nineteenth century - particularly in the case of Europe — where instances of multiple reactionary ethnonationalisms in Central and Eastern Europe began to develop well into the twentieth century (Lewellen, 2003, 172). Lewellen suggests that these resurgences were partially helped by the extreme political ideologies which permeated the territory at the time (fascism and communism), and the

national tensions would continue to grow in Eastern Europe well-after the fall of the Soviet Union (2003, 172-3).

The social construction of ethnicity cannot work without the implementation of collectivity measures, which can easily be used retroactively by means of exclusion. One first must make anthropological considerations for the social constructs of ethnicity and other forms of symbolic mechanisms for collectivity. One can observe this social process in Dawne Moon's (2013) study regarding the inclusionary and exclusionary measures employed within the context of American-Jews' emotional habitus regarding the collective affiliation or renouncement of the Israeli state in the twenty-first century. Moon's article demonstrates the importance of emotions, and how symbolic power (particularly in the form of exclusion) is used to produce and maintain collective identities (281). Along with the concept of emotional habitus, Moon refers to other theories by Pierre Bourdieu, particularly linking "relations of complicity" (272) to some of the measures of exclusion implemented by those who sympathize with the hegemony of the Jewish state. While citing what some of her frustrated informants told her, she describes some of the methods of exclusion which are weaponized against Jewish-Americans and progressive Israelis who are critical of the current Zionist regime. Critics are painted as "self-loathing, self-hating Jews" (Moon, 2013, 275) or seen as naive and instantly othered from the Jewish community if they question the treatment of Palestinians or other ethnic minorities (Moon, 2013, 278, 287). This results in the state having a "monopoly on the authority to define Jewishness," where the symbolic boundaries they create lead to "institutional discrimination" (Moon, 2013, 278, 289). This kind of behavior can easily be linked to other nation-state case studies, and can particularly relate to contemporary Hungary's fixation on what makes a 'good Hungarian' and who is deemed a 'bad Hungarian' according to their devotion to the nationalist cause.

Historicising the Magyar People of Hungary

Hungarians generally derive their sense of nationalism from the sense of pride in their unique Magyar language, which derives from the tribal Magyar conquests of the Carpathian Basin in the late ninth century (Hann, 2015; Faludi, 2016). After its founding Arpád dynasty converted to Christianity, Hungary's subsequent development placed it in the unique geo-political space of navigating the dominant Western European norms while remaining loyal to its historically Eastern, Eurasian roots (Csepeli & Örkény, 1996). Of course, this entire premise of the country's founding must be anthropologically considered as a social construction of the nation's collective identity. Hungary arguably was in a period of prosperity after they were freed from the Ottoman Turks by the Austrian Empire in the seventeenth century, and by default became an important part of the Hapsburg dynasty (Csepeli & Örkény, 1996, 249). During this time period, German migrants became the urban bourgeoisie of Hungary, which was followed by the influx of Eastern European Jews, Greeks, and Armenians into urban society (Csepeli & Örkény, 1996, 249). Following the First World War, the Treaty of Trianon separated and reduced the size of the long-established Hungarian territory, where ethnic Magyars were subsequently displaced into neighbouring countries. The country's political elite did not take this treaty well and sided with Nazi Germany in 1944, in hopes to reclaim their lost territory and reconnect their people (Csepeli & Örkény, 1996; Fox & Vermeersch, 2010; Hann, 2015). Hungarian cultural nationalism certainly was on the decline during the Soviet occupation, as citizens were more focused on integrating into the political system (Csepeli & Örkény 1996,

256). This by no means indicates that nationalism itself was no longer relevant — on the contrary — as the failed Revolution of 1956 proved that Hungarians were longing to regain their political independence and become a sovereign state once more.

Hungarians never really seemed to recover from the perceived loss inflicted on their nation due to the Trianon treaty. Even after the fall of communism in 1990, the newly democratic Hungarian state implemented laws which would encourage the collective identity of ethnic Hungarians beyond the country's borders. The implementation of the minority rights legislation fit into the ambiguous political landscape at the time, when the EU was establishing unification amongst European nations, and the Hungarian government complied in hopes that it would be a vehicle for Hungarian unification (Fox & Vermeersch, 2010, 331). Hungary's Status Law was a success in reunifying ethnic Hungarians through means of granting "extra-territorial quasi-citizenship rights to trans-border Hungarians on the basis of shared ethnicity" (Fox & Vermeersch, 2010, 339).

Situating Post-Soviet Hungary within World-Systems and Critical Theory

The World-systems analysis, pioneered by Immanuel Wallerstein, supposes that today's capitalist World-system is a direct product of the colonial systems which were in place since the sixteenth century in "the Americas, Africa, and Asia [where] capitalist expansion subordinated [societies] and held them tightly within an integrated system" (Morelock & Narita, 2018, 145). This theory postulates that in this particular example, the dominant groups who subordinated others were the 'core' in this World-system, and the colonized were the 'periphery.' It must be noted that this "Eurocentric supposition" was not always the case and will not always be, as it would contradict the "fluctuant historical character of this structure" (Morelock & Narita, 2018, 145). The theory becomes more intricate as Wallerstein introduces the possibility of 'semi-peripheries,' nations which are in a liminal state of exercising socio-economic power on a global platform yet are still beholden to larger hegemonic structures at the core. Wallerstein (and by extension Morelock and Narita) seems to suggest that semi-peripheral nations are more prone to nationalist tendencies (2018, 147). This certainly can be an insinuation of Hungary's place

within the modern World-system, as well as reflect its flirtation with ultra-nationalism. Consequently, "the institutional limits of liberal democracies" allows for the development of "ultra-nationalism and right-wing populism into a broad transnational movement that may be headed towards autocratic rule" (Morelock & Narita, 2018, 148).

The authors' implementation of Jürgen Habermas' critical analysis of nationalism (and populism) can help achieve an adequate explanation of how these movements employ ideological tropes of representing 'the People' in order to seek legitimacy (Morelock & Narita, 2018, 147). In the case of right-wing populism, the mechanisms used include the "revolt of 'the people' against the elite and an underclass or scapegoat subpopulation" (Morelock & Narita, 2018, 137). Hungary would certainly be reflective of this characteristic, as more often than not, subpopulations such as Jews and Roma are categorized as "the enemy within" (Fox & Vermeersch, 2010, 344). Jews are particularly linked to all the foes which are associated with Hungary, as they're likened to the European Union and the United States, and more broadly to a leftist global conspiracy (Fox & Vermeersch, 2010, 345). Morelock & Narita explicitly refer to this kind of

scapegoating when alluding to the discursive tactics implemented by Hungarian Prime Minister Viktor Orbán, as his nationalist rhetoric is "polarizing public allegiances and affections regarding who to categorize as 'the people'." (2018, 138).

I would further argue that Hungary's place as a semi-peripheral state can help explain its employment of victimization tropes – such as insisting that the country shall no longer be beholden to the Western European core - to further propagate its calls for a total nationalist transformation of the mainstream society. Regarding the Hungarian national anthem, Faludi writes on behalf of one of her interviewees: "it's very sad and defensive. Self-pitying. If you understand the Hungarian anthem, you understand the Hungarian soul" (2016, 24). Further, Hungary's ultra right-wing party, Jobbik, still to this day regards the Treaty of Trianon as the "amputation' of Greater Hungary," wherein their discourse of "victim-hood becomes the enabler of brutality" (Faludi, 2016, 23-4).

Conclusion: Uncertain Future for Hungarian Democracy?

This article's purpose is to identify anthropological patterns present in the ethnonationalist, populist discourses that arguably shaped the turn of events in the post-Soviet Hungarian state. The situation is still incredibly delicate and the notion of democracy in Hungary (and other Eastern European states) is still uncertain as the heads of state continue to change the rule of law for in favour of a more autocratic regime. Since Fidesz (the Hungarian Civic Alliance), a rightwing nationalist party, has taken over government for the second time in 2010, Prime Minister Viktor Orbán has ultimately challenged the rule of law and freedom of speech by implementing new legislations which would repeal "the previous Constitution's four-fifths majority requirement for initiating of a new Constitution," and introduce more rigid media laws (Hinsey, 2012, 136-7). Most evidently, Orbán has managed to increase polarizing discourses within contemporary Hungarian society by presenting the harsh duality of "patriotic-anti-patriotic; nationalist- nationally non-reliable; Hungarian-anti-Hungarian; and the expansive use of 'communist' in order to distinguish 'friend' and 'enemy"' (Becker, 2010, 30).

References

Becker, J. (2010). The rise of right-wing populism in Hungary. SEER: Journal for Labour and Social Affairs in Eastern Europe, 13(1), 29-40.

Csepeli, G., & Örkény, A. (1996). The Changing Facets of Hungarian Nationalism. Social Research, 63(1), 247-286.

Faludi, S. (2016). Pity, O God, the Republican: What America can learn from Hungary's "Viktator". The Baffler, (31), 20-33.

Fox, J., & Vermeersch, P. (2010). Backdoor Nationalism. European Journal of Sociology / Archives Européennes De Sociologie / Europäisches Archiv Für Soziologie, 51(2), 325-357.

Hann, C. (2015). Why Post-imperial Trumps Post-socialist: Crying Back the National Past in Hungary. In O. Angé & D. Berliner (Eds.), Anthropology and Nostalgia (pp. 96-122). New York, NY: Berghahn Books. Retrieved from Google Books.

Hinsey, E. (2012). The New Opposition in Hungary. New England Review, 33(2), 126-142. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/23267240

Lewellen, Ted. (2003) The Politics of Identity: Ethnicity and Nationalism in Political Anthropology (pp. 159-180) London, UK: Praeger.

Moon, D. (2013). Powerful emotions: Symbolic power and the (productive and punitive) force of collective feeling. Theory and Society, 42(3), 261-294. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/43694688

Morelock, J., & Narita, F. (2018). Public Sphere and World-System: Theorizing Populism at the Margins. In Morelock J. (Ed.), Critical Theory and Authoritarian Populism (pp. 135-154). London: University of Westminster Press.

Chapter II

One of "Those Girls": Making One's Place in the Montreal Pole Community

Written By: Rachel Lalonde

Chapter II By: Rachel Lalonde

A few steps away from the cobbled roads of Old Montreal is a narrow entryway, squeezed against the side of a bar. Painted on a small, antique-looking sign is a woman suspended from a vertical pole, advertising the name of the studio. The text and the silhouette are all various shades of pink. Over the past twenty years, pole fitness has grown into a prevalent sport, with regional and international competitions, held multiple times a year in many countries. Books, online lessons, and instructional DVDs are readily available in Canada in both English and French, and an in-home pole will run you about three hundred dollars depending on the brand. By all accounts, pole fitness should be a booming industry, advertised in any newspaper. Yet, most studios rely on word of mouth strategy and social media to do their advertising. Even above my home studio, alongside the sign for the pole, I have a much larger (and more socially acceptable) "Yoga" printed on the door.

It is not to say that pole fitness in Montreal is a secret; most students are relatively open about what they do. The Canadian Pole Sports Federation hosted its 2019 annual competition in Laval, and the International competition of the same year was in Montreal. Certain moves from pole fitness have entries in the Guinness World Record Books, such as the human flag. The Arnold Schwarzenegger Sports Festival also has a category for pole fitness.

However, in all these cases, the activity under consideration is "pole fitness" or "pole sport," not the more familiar "pole dance" of pop culture. The studio I practice at identifies itself by both names and offers classes, which reflect that diversity of styles and identities. Within the community, they use different names – pole fit, pole dance, pole art – but outside the community, the decrying image of the strip club defines a considerable portion of most of the public's knowledge of pole. Among pole practitioners, they maintain a distinction between the pole of a dance studio and the pole of a club – between pole as a sport, and pole as sexual expression. The purpose of this research is to find how students of pole studios build, reinforce, and navigate the boundaries between pole fitness and sexual expression. This

study tries contextualizing the stigma within the pole community being a product of such boundary-building methods herein described.

Research into the pole as a sport has not been hard to come by in the social sciences. The past decade there has been an increase in terms of the books and articles released about pole gyms, pole as empowerment, pole as self-objectification, and pole as pornographic action. Within these various approaches, there is little literature devoted to pole practitioners' personal beliefs about the dance and its place in modern culture. This paper seeks to remedy that by delving into polers' self-definitions, and the techniques by which they attempt to carve out a place for their pastime in Quebec society.

Methodology

Observations and interviews for this paper were conducted from October 2018 to March 2019 at Studio Pole Montréa1, belonging to one of a chain of international studios. Contacts were from both within the studio and without, from among students and professionals. I believe it is better to have different sections for this part, containing "Age" as a
separate section. Participants in the research range in age from late teens to mid-forties.

All interview subjects for this research are female-presenting. While male pole dancers are quite common, they are still very much the minority within studios, so they were excluded as possible interview subjects to provide a more representative sample.

To ensure that subjects were active within the pole community and had intentions of pursuing further training -not simply trying the classes for fun- interview subjects were taken only from level one or higher, excluding the primary levels.

Data was collected primarily over a series of observant participation sessions – active participation within the classes offered by the studio, combined with attentive observing – as well as purely observational sessions – no involvement within the course, but keen observations and engagement with the students who were training. Interviews were conducted in private locations, either the homes of participants or in library study rooms, to ensure that no risk of eavesdroppers would inhibit participants from speaking truthfully. Finally, some participants provided written comments about their experiences in the form of personal emails, with the understanding that what they wrote would be used for this research. Data coding involved identifying keywords based on the three elements of boundary-building and measuring the frequency of use as well as tone (i.e. judgmental or supportive).

Definitions

Before beginning an analysis of the various aspects of my research question in light of previous research and my findings, I must clarify what I mean by the terms used in it.

Students of Pole Fitness Studios

These are the students who have learnt or are learning how to do pole, and who do so in the context of a studio/gym class setting (i.e. not one-on-one in an instructor's home).

Building Boundaries:

Referring to verbal and physical avowals of difference between pole fitness and sexual pole.

Reinforcing Boundaries

It is referring to the othering of strippers and club dancers, either through verbal objection or through defending one's actions as being semiotically different from similar acts done by a stripper or club dancer.

Navigating Boundaries

It refers to how one can actively place oneself on either side of the line drawn between pole as a sport and pole as sexualization.

Sexualization

The process by which an object, body, concept, or activity that is not inherently sex-based becomes associated with sexual activity in some regard (e.g. nudity, flexibility, dance).

Literature

Previous literature has tended to focus on topics of empowerment, embodiment, body image, stigma, and sexualization. Regardless of being an outside researcher gathering information, or an inside researcher trying to become part of the community, most anthropological and sociological research about pole dance has explored how pole dancers define themselves as women in an Anglophone, middle- and upper-class, post-feminist culture.

Samantha Holland (2010) is part of the latter group; a researcher who entered the pole fitness environment to understand how the sport could be empowering or disempowering, a positive bodily influence or a negative one. Most significantly for this paper, Holland provides a snapshot of what pole studios across the English-speaking world looked like in the early 2000s, against which to measure how modern studios operate and market themselves. The aim of Holland's participants to dissociate themselves from the strip industry in an almost passive way - not necessarily asserting differences vocally, but merely assuming that the difference is apparent and applicable to all – which illustrates one set of approaches to the three aspects of the boundary-building method.

Kerry Louise Allen (2011), though her research was published very soon after Holland's (2010), finds a markedly different tone in the pole fitness industry. Participants in her study tend to be more judgmental of strippers and those who perform for money. The most significant implication of her research is the twofold suggestion of domestication of the pole (pole as something private, done for oneself or one's partner) and an upscaling of the pole (pole as an elite sport, not for working-class women). Allen ties elements of class and status to her lengthy study of pole fitness, through a lens that is mostly feminist but also contains aspects of body studies (itself often closely linked to feminist research).

Pellizzer, Tiggeman, and Clark (2016) are part of the former group of researchers; as examples of outsiders looking into the pole community. As such, their research contains relatively little in terms of self-definitions of polers as fitness-only, sexual-only, or some combination. Their findings are quantitative, detailing the reasons people would sign up for pole classes. What correlations there are between participating in pole and feelings of self-worth and positive body image. Their study significantly points out that enjoyment of sexualization is not a personality trait unique to pole practitioners, or even more commonly found among them -adistinction about which other research has been fuzzy. This study is also useful in how it treats the concepts of women's self-objectification as being interrelated in complex ways with other aspects of identity, such as embodiment and body image.

Nicholas et al. (2018) use an interpretive approach to study pole in the context of stigma and identity formation. Their study is built entirely on the reported experiences of female pole practitioners, given throughout focus group interviews. The stigmas they look into provide examples of boundary-building in the ways that practitioners have had to explain their pastime to outsiders, as opposed to how they tell it to themselves. Instances of identity formation in their paper include concepts such as body confidence, embodiment, and empowerment, once again demonstrating a complicated relationship between those qualities in the lives of women.

Reference material for this paper includes Richardson and Locks (2014) for their definitions of various elements of embodiment and sexualization of modern culture; Mishra (2013) for her analysis of the relationship between dance classes and feminine sexuality. Besides, Keft-Kennedy (2013) for her review of how feminine-specific dances must walk a line between fitness and sensuality, and between liberation and objectification. I will not here go into the details of their contents, as none of the texts pertains directly to pole fitness in the way the previous texts do. Following the literature review, being an insider or outsider for the researcher makes a real difference in how they understand the pole in the social sciences. Because of this, my research includes a combination of relativistic and observant participation approaches. What I mean by relativistic, is the approach based on emic interpretations of my data, and on the heuristic gathering of that data. My goal is to understand a poler's identity as they have decided to define it their own, not how others have set it. While I am of course aware of the fact that the culture around them will shape any individual's beliefs and identity, it is best to try to describe an in-group's character using the ideology of that in-group.

To explain why I avoid the question of empowerment despite its prevalence in the previous literature on the pole, I quote Hunt and Curtis (2012). "There is little to be gained from an abstract contest between empowerment and exploitation since normative assessment is only possible in the light of the contextual circumstances of specific sexual encounters" (121).

Analysis of Boundaries

Building Boundaries

The main element of building a boundary between oneself as pole fitter and another as a pole dancer is in "what I do" versus "what they do." Mainly, the ways that pole students differentiate their style of the pole from that in strip clubs is by emphasizing the technique, difficulty, and lack of sexuality. For instance, a participant in Allen (2011)'s research described the classes she taught as being "much more physically challenging than anything a female stripper could do" (2011, 199). While another described the dancing done in nightclubs as a "dirty dancing type thing [where], they did a few spins, but apart from that they just bump and ground on the floor" (Allen, 2011, 167). One pole student's go-to way of describing pole is to insist that "no, I'm not a stripper" (Nicholas et al. 2018, 106), implying that it is one of the most frequent questions she receives after saying she does pole, and one of the most important for her to dismiss.

One way of creating a distinction between what each type of poler does is "by describing [the dance] in comparison to other activities which might seem as 'worse' than fitness pole dancing, or less respectful, suggesting, for example, 'it's not like I'm taking my clothes off" (Allen, 2011, 166). It is not a clear-cut distinction between the two types of the pole; however, as even between different dance traditions, there are the same divisions. Hope, who worked for eleven years as a dancer in clubs across Canada and who now teaches pole, says that the burlesque dancers sharing her stage who felt that pole dancers were "lower than us because we don't fully take all our clothes off" often snubbed her. A distinction that Hope felt was unimportant, as both professions still require the dancer to be "using [their] sexuality," and one could interpret them as equally sexual by an outsider.

When considering female-specific dances, the audience also plays into the "what I do/what they do" distinction. In the case of Baladi dancers, "approval /disapproval of performers was often determined by their gender, time and place of their performance and the nature of the audience. Female performers in nightclubs and other all-male audience venues were not considered respectable" (Mishra, 2013, 192). In the same way, Jodi, one of my interview subjects, felt that if she were to perform in a bar or club setting, people would think differently of her than if she were doing a competition of a studio showcase. She felt that "pole is not strip, it's just a performance with a pole," no matter where you perform. The second main element of building boundaries is that of the aesthetic/athletic divide – that is, whether what one does is mainly a sport, or primarily a spectacle. It is most evident in the vocabulary used by teachers in their classes and their advertising. The aesthetic/athletic divide is not itself a sharp divide between pole in a studio and pole in a club. Many studios in Montreal offer both classic pole as well as circus training and exotic dance training. Moreover, some of the participants in this paper have had experience with both gyms and clubs. Some students of Studio Pole Montréal such as Sophia used heavily athleticized terms to describe their pastime, rationalizing the fact that pole classes require bare skin by comparing it to other sportswear. "You would not wear cleats to ballet or a jumpsuit for Olympic swimming; pole fitness is no different."

What the distinction more refers to is how the people whose only experience with the pole is in a classroom assume things about the pole in clubs and as a reaction chose to describe themselves in different terms, even when the moves are themselves identical. Within the studio context, many classes intentionally do not use the word "sexy" to distance themselves from the sexual side of the pole (Holland 2010, 53). Even so, this is not universal: while some instructors will use more neutral terms such as "peel up" instead of "body roll" to describe linking moves (Live Once, 2008), others will embrace the aesthetic vocabulary by describing the acts as "majestic," "sexy," or "dynamic." It is interesting to note that at lower levels, the moves tend to have authentic names. For instance, "crucifix" is a hold in a crucifix position. "cross ankle spin" is a spin with your ankles crossed. "Chair spin" is a spin where you look like you're sitting in an invisible chair – while higher levels have moves with more creative names. "Icarus," "carpe diem," and "baby snake spin," to name a few.

When learning moves in classes which are patently aesthetic and not athletic, such as the body rolls mentioned above, they explain their presence via many semantic discourses. Some polers insist that such moves are sensual, not sexual, "drawing a fine distinction between the two" (Holland, 2010, 184). Others consist in the classes for reasons different from the logic used in club performances; for instance, the barrel roll, where the student stands with the feet apart and swings their hips in a circle, as though tracing the circumference of a barrel. This move is frequently used as a warm-up stretch for the lumbar in Studio Pole Montréal's classes, but when done in the presence of a pole, the move becomes coded as a sexual gyrating of the hips. By emphasizing its usefulness as a lower trunk and hip stretch, studios can justify its use in sport classes despite its erotic connotations.

The final way in which pole practitioners build boundaries depends on space. While some teachers do choose to teach in bars (Holland, 2010), the private classroom setting is a more appealing environment for many students. Allen (2011) describes these spaces as "well lit and modern arenas, in the suburbs of bigger cities or trendy city centre areas, providing a sense of safety and respectability" (163). In the case of Studio Pole Montréal, visitors must be buzzed in to access the building housing the studio, providing a sense of security. There are changing rooms with cubbies, yoga mats for the warm-up stretches, and bright lights in the gym itself.

Studio Pole Montréal is a particularly feminized gym, in a way that walks the line between sport and spectacle; they have LED light strips running along with the floors and ceilings in various parts of the studio, lit in multiple colours. The curtains, towels, and even facial tissues are all pink. One full wall of the studio is floor-to-ceiling mirrors, with individual mirrors spaced on the opposite wall – Pellizzer, Tiggeman, and Clark (2016) argue this is an example of the "self-ob-jectification" of recreational pole dance (37). Still, this argument entirely ignores the ubiquity of mirrors in fitness clubs and gyms, where they are used to measure and correct one's posture and form.

Reinforcing Boundaries

Students of pole reinforce the boundaries between pole as sport and pole as sexual expression through one main tactic: the othering of dancers/strippers. It differs from the "what I do/what they do" mentioned above. Since the othering of pole dancers and strippers is based not just in a list of what is done differently but assumes that the type of woman who performs pole in a club is inherently different from the kind of woman who does pole as a sport, passing the judgement on the former woman.

Pole has had a difficult time distancing itself from its origins to be taken seriously as a sport, and one of the ways it accomplishes that is by disowning its roots. The online magazine *Pole Dance International* states "it is not linked to the strip club industry and aims to 'celebrate the beauty of pole dance advocates in every form – from housewife to pole fitness champion" (Holland 2010, 141). This statement of total acceptance of pole dance includes all types of women – unless those women strip. For Hope, whose training comes primarily from strip clubs, she believes that no one could remove the pole from its roots:

"I think that, even with it being in competition and sport, I still think there is an element of sexuality, and that's why I can't give up where its roots came from. Because it [the pole] is a sexual device to work on."

While for Jodi, who has only ever trained in a pole fitness studio, the pole can exist as purely a sport, separate from its origins:

"In bars, girls are just dancing in underwear, just removing everything, and that's how they [outsiders] have this *dirty* image of the pole. Nevertheless, that is not the case; it's a sport like any other. And it's demanding, it's gratifying, and you feel great when you're doing it." Sometimes, the othering of strippers is overt, similar to several of the respondents in the study by Allen (2011), wherein a teacher she interviewed marked a distinction, "Pole dancing for fitness and pole dancing for money are two very different things, populated by two very different types of women" (170); respondents tended to describe strippers as "working class, uneducated, unintelligent and as having no other job options" (Allen, 2011, 173).

Holland's (2010) research takes a more tolerant view, where outright dismissal of strippers is less common. Instead, the othering came in the form of attributing informed choice to pole fitters but not strippers. When classes allowed the option of wearing the classic "stripper heel," students would obsess over their footwear options: "the shoes were compared, derided and admired" (Holland 2010, 87), imbued with all the sexual subtext of their origins. The choice of whether to wear them was presented not merely as to whether one was complicit in one's objectification or not, but whether one chose to empower by claiming the shoes and all they suggested as one's own. The choice of a pole fitness student to wear the heels was thus in the language of empowerment or feminism – or what might be called "post-feminist raunch culture" (Nicholas et al. 2018, 111). Consequently, students could wear shoes and still not be associated with club dancing.

Among the students and teachers of Studio Pole Montréal, neither of these approaches seem to hold any sway. Next to the receptionist's desk is a rack of accessories ranging from booty shorts with glitter and straps (straps being by far the most common decorative feature for workout attire in their gym) to stripper heels in a wide range of colours, materials, and heights. Students finishing exotic dance classes would talk about wanting to buy a pair of heels of their own, even if it was only their first or second time attending a particular dance class. Jodi said the only thing stopping her from buying a pair of dance heels was the price and the fact that she never learned how to walk in heels, and though she differentiated herself from strippers, she did not disparage them. In Hope's case, she was steadfast in doing what she was comfortable with and that "what other people did [she] didn't care about." She distinguished her style of the pole and that of strippers but did not judge those who performed only in clubs and similar establishments. For Jessica, a teacher at Studio Pole Montréal, women who pole dance in clubs are "just working," and that any stigma attached to that job is society's or the patriarchy's problem. In sum, while previous research suggests that othering of strippers/dancers is an integral part of pole fitness students' identities and justifications for their participation in the sport, this element appears to be inconsistently present or missing from the modern Québecois pole studio.

Navigating Boundaries

While the previous two headings dealt with how to explain the differences between pole as sport and pole as sexual expression, this final section details how pole practitioners obey the dichotomy they have constructed, as demonstrated by their active choices within the discipline.

A tendency in larger institutions is to stay strictly within a delineated zone, where the pole seems like a sport. As shown above, in the case of Pole Dance International's online magazine, institutions in the public eye tend to deny links to the strip industry, likely in part because they are under more scrutiny than individual dancers are. Holland (2010) lists examples of where professional pole competitions have enforced rules in an attempt to dissociate themselves from the club

scene. For instance, in some competitions, judges will mark down performances if they are perceived as too suggestive (Holland 2010, 138). In another case, a contestant was disqualified for taking off her ballet slippers between sets (Holland 2010, 137). It was considered too close to stripping.

Individual participants often list their reasons for attending pole classes as relating to fitness or artistic goals before performative goals. They chose pole over other sports or dance styles because they are curious about it, because "it is different from other forms of exercise" (Pellizzer, Tiggeman, and Clark 2016, 39), or because they dislike most sports – pole does not feel like a classic sport to them. In Jodi's words, going to the gym is for when you "want to lose weight." The pole is for when you want to "see that you're improving" – in other words, where a person may go to a gym for a long time before they notice progress in their weight loss or muscle gain, pole provides comparatively rapid results in terms of progressing through the moves. She frequently emphasized how the pole is a challenging dance, one it can take a very long time to master, but that seeing herself improve was gratifying. Moreover, the fact that it happened in an atmosphere of total support and free from judgement was a

motivator to keep trying.

Jodi defines her experience being sportive, and as such places herself on the side of the pole as a sport. However, when discussing her preferred classes and teaching styles, she emphasized that too-sporty classes exhausted her and that the choreographed classes such as "contemporary dance" were her favourite style. The artistry and the choreography were especially crucial for her. To keep from being associated with stripping, she still insists on identifying what she does as a dance-sport and sets goals for herself. She credits the body-positive atmosphere of the classes for allowing her to feel more confident in her body, and more comfortable showing her stomach in public, yet differentiates herself from strippers who "just want to show [their] body." When she describes pole dance as "artistry" and "beautiful," she creates a zone for the pole in a sports camp where she can appropriate some of the trappings of the pole as a sexual expression without having to cross the line herself into the stripping side of the pole.

The teachers at Studio Pole Montréal treat the divide in much the same way, incorporating artistry only when safely buffered by athleticism. Kiara's classes, which teach students a short pole routine from start to finish, keep themselves within the athletic side through the way the teacher emphasizes using specific muscle groups in each move, and which end stretches are targeting which muscles they had exercised that day. Cee's classes, often taught in a way that presumes an audience, do so without making the moves a spectacle; she frequently reminds students to hold their heads up, not look at their feet, and smile. At the same time, she discusses potential injuries from pole and how to treat them, which stretches are the most important for pole practitioners to learn, and the fact that one can master many pole moves can only once learned to dance through the pain.

Interpretation of Results

As previous literature suggests, there is a definite pattern in the modern pole studio for polers to create criteria for what is pole fitness or dance, and what is stripping. Practitioners can then navigate the boundaries how they see fit, although institutions tend to have stricter rules, due to societal scrutiny. However, the modern Québecois poler does not seem to reinforce the division between sport and sexuality as strongly as the literature has suggested. For possible explanations as to why pole students are more embracing of the sensual parts than the literature would suggest, we can look at Québec's history and the Quiet Revolution of the 1960s. It led to Québecois culture being generally more sexually liberated than the rest of Canada, which had never been under the yoke of the Church to quite the degree Québec had been (Le Bourdais and Lapierre-Adamcyk 2012, 232).

In Hope's opinion, the change is not limited to Québec. She believes that over the past five or six years, it has become more accepted, and that "people are looking at it as a sport, as an exercise, and realizing that there's a lot of core work and, also, sexual expression." She lists the various names by which people now refer to it – pole art, pole dance, pole sport – and generally, how one's venue for performing dictates the name by which one applies to it. This blurring of the lines means that within the discipline at least, it is becoming less necessary to dictate who can access the space of the pole studio or call themselves a pole dancer/fitter/artist. Another possible explanation is the fact that many polers are doing pole not intending to perform, but to find a personal pastime. Hope had a pole installed in her living room, and

Jodi spoke of wanting to get a pole installed in her room someday so that she could practice at home. Allen (2011) refers to this as the domestication of pole dance; however, even in the case of the 'home gym' pole she still found stigmas and paranoias about the sex industry (164). Nevertheless, these poles exist in the essential context of not having an audience – the dancer dances for themselves, the exerciser exercises for themselves. In other words, "the female body [can be] something other than a fetishized object, always-already appropriated for male pleasure" (Keft-Kennedy 2013, 69), and reclaiming the sensuality of pole is a statement that the male gaze can be avoided.

Conclusion

In general terms, the "build, reinforce, and navigate" method of constructing one's identity can apply to pole fitness as a sport-art hybrid, where it comes into conflict with the pole as sexual expression. Pole students and teachers with fitness backgrounds exhibit tendencies to differentiate between what they do and what strippers do, to create categories of people who do one type of pole over another, and to obey the definitions they have created. Québec polers, in contrast, break the method by not enforcing the second technique. Despite a strongly-enforced difference between pole as sport and pole as sexual expression and practitioners can employ certain symbols to identify themselves as being part of one camp or the other, the broadly critical view of sexuality present in the existent literature is absent from my data. Tonally, my participants were either neutral or positive toward the idea of pole dancers using poles as accessories to sexual entertainment; the definitions they created were for their ease of communication more than for othering any member of the pole community.

Notes

1. All names used in this paper are changed to allow some confidentiality to the individuals and locations involved.

2. Richardson and Locks (2014) do in fact mention pole dancing on page 36; however, seeing as it is mentioned in the context of their deriding the possibility of it being considered exercise, their comment on the matter was deemed uninformed and irrelevant to this paper.

3. It is noteworthy that there is no changing room for male students, and that they must use the (door-less) storage cupboard where the equipment is kept.

4. An excellent example of this is shown in the music video

for "Fitness" by the artist Lizzo. In the video, a young black pole dancer in body paint and stripper heels holds a pose at the top of a pole set up in a locker room, spinning slowly and moving her limbs gracefully, while the words "I DON'T DO THIS FOR YOU" written in bold red type flash up and block the screen.

References

Allen, Kerry L. (2011) Poles apart?: women negotiating femininity and feminism in the fitness pole dancing class. University of Nottingham.

Hunt, Alan and Bruce Curtis. (2012). A Genealogy of the Genital Kiss: Oral Sex in the Twentieth Century. In D. Naugler (Eds.), Canadian Perspectives in Sexualities Studies (pp. 111-123). Oxford University Press.

Keft-Kennedy, Virginia. (2013). 1970s Belly Dance and the "How-To" Phenomenon: Feminism, Fitness and Orientalism. In C. E McDonald & B. Sellers-Young (Eds.), Belly Dance around the world (pp. 68-92). McFarland.

Holland, Samantha. (2010). Pole Dancing, Empowerment and Embodiment. Palgrave Macmillan.

Le Bourdais, Céline and Évelyne Lapierre-Adamcyk. (2012). Changes in Conjugal Life in Canada: Is Cohabitation Progressively Replacing Marriage? In D. Naugler (Eds.), In Canadian Perspectives in Sexualities Studies (pp. 223-234). Oxford University Press.

LiveOnce.ca (Director). (2008). Live Once. [DVD] Elisabeth Magalhaes.

Mishra, Smeeta. (2013). Negotiating Female Sexuality: Bol-

lywood Belly Dance, "Item Girls" and Dance Classes. In C. E. McDonald & B. Sellers-Young (Eds.), In Belly Dance Around the World, (pp. 181-210). McFarland.

Nicholas, J. C., Dimmock, J. A., Donnelly, C. J., Alderson, J. A., & Jackson, B. (2018). It's our little secret ... an in-group, where everyone's in ': Females' motives for participation in a stigmatized form of physical activity. Psychology of Sport & Exercise, 36, 104-113. doi: 10.1016/j. psychsport.2018.02.003.

Pellizzer, M, Tiggeman, M, & Clark, L. (2016). Enjoyment of Sexualization and Positive Body Image in Recreational Pole Dancers and University Students. Sex Roles, 74(1-2), 35-45. doi: 10.1007/s11199-015-0562-1.

Richardson, Niall and Adam Locks. (2014). Body Studies: The Basics. Routledge.

Chapter III

Impacts of Governmental Policies on Indigenous Food Sovereignty: The Kanawá:ke Case

Written By: Philippe Boucher

Chapter III Written By: Philippe Boucher

Colonization of Eastern North America began in the 16th and 17th centuries with the arrival of English, French and Dutch settlers (OTC, 2007). Europeans settled alongside Indigenous people who helped the settlers survive in a region which was unknown to them (OTC, 2007). Settlers took advantage of the resources of the land, but were still largely dependent on their hosts (OTC, 2007). They began building their own establishments, laws and political structure in efforts to convert surrounding Indigenous nations to Western ways of living (OTC, 2007). The first Indigenous reserve in what is known as Canada, was officially recognized in 1637 in Sillery, near Quebec City (Miquelon, 2012). Since then, governments under France, the British Empire and the Canadian Confederation have attempted to control Indigenous food systems, but never succeeded (Government of Canada, 1996). Colonial policies did not reach their objective to assimilate Indigenous lives and cultures to European customs.

Policies related to food systems were diverse and included permit systems, the pass system, and the Indian Act, which enforced the subdivision of territories and maintained European governance.

Controlling Food Systems

The history of government policies varies depending on region and historical period. Policies encouraging agriculture had different impacts in the Canadian Prairies in comparison to Eastern Indigenous nations who traditionally practice agriculture along the Great Lakes and Saint Lawrence River. For instance, the permit system established in 1881 in the Indian Act was applied to Western "Indians" (OTC, 2007). These people would need the approval of Indian agents to sell agricultural products (Government of Canada, 1996). The first volume of the Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1996), states that "anyone who purchased Indian agricultural produce without the appropriate permit was subject to summary conviction and a fine or imprisonment for up to three months" (271). The main objective of the permit system was to control exchanges between Indigenous and non-Indigenous people, especially to reduce the flow of alcohol in Indigenous communities (Government of Canada, 1996). These regulations were even expanded to all "Indians" in 1941 by including permits to sell furs and wild animals until 2014 (OTC, 2007). The Indian Act still allowed the Minister to exempt some individuals or bands using permits (Moss and al., 1991). Nevertheless, frameworks of control and regulation of Indigenous food systems were clearly present in the Indian Act.

This method of controlling food systems was suggested by non-Indigenous people to reduce competition (Government of Canada, 1996). Indeed, many non-Indigenous farmers complained that Indigenous farmers benefited from a supposed "government assistance to reserves" and placed pressure on governments to put discriminatory restrictions on the sale of Indigenous agricultural products (Government of Canada, 1996, 271). The Royal Commission on Aboriginal People ordered by the Government of Canada in 1996 exposed Hayter Reed, then deputy superintendent general of Indian affairs, who managed the application of the permit system. Reed wanted to limit the access to Western technology by Indigenous people because he saw them "as savages who needed to surpass a stage of barbarism before they could be considered civilized" (Government of Canada, 1996, 171). Due to limited access to European tools, frameworks of Western agriculture were not sufficient for many Indigenous peoples who were not traditionally involved in farming (Rueck, 2013). Restrictions on modern farming technologies could be considered as a way of encouraging poverty in these communities (Rueck, 2013). These regulations seem to be more present in the Canadian Prairies, however similar examples also occurred on the Canadian West Coast regarding fisheries.

In 1892, only 40 in 3,000 Indigenous people along the Fraser River had a license which allowed them to fish independently from canneries (Indigenous Foundations, n.d.). Restricted access to these "independent" licenses was enforced when a memorandum of understanding signed in 1912 between Canada and British Columbia created an openly discriminatory policy giving priority to non-Indigenous people to access fishing licenses (Menzies & Butler, 2008). In addition, highly productive Indigenous fishing technologies were prohibited, while many Indigenous people on the West Coast of Canada did not have the means to buy boats and participate in the fishing industry (Indigenous Foundations, n.d.). Although in 1924, Indigenous communities in British Columbia were able to receive seine-net fishing licenses, the majority of these licenses had already been given to non-Indigenous people (Indigenous Foundations, n.d.). Therefore, Indigenous communities did not have the opportunity to expand their fishing industry because of strict government control. These colonial restrictions impacted food security through a loss of connection to the land, water, and environment for Indigenous communities living on reserves.

The Kahnawá:ke Case

On the south shore of Tio'tia:ke (Montreal), there is a settlement now known as Kahnawá:ke where the Kahnawakehró:non community was known for its expertise in agriculture (Department of Indian Affairs, 1877). In comparison with Indigenous nations in Western Canada, the Kanien'kehá:ka (Mohawk) had agricultural traditions embedded in their way of life (Department of Indian Affairs, 1877). In an 1877 report of the Deputy Superintendent General of Indian Affairs, it is stated that "the Local Agent at Caughnawaga [Kahnawá:ke], in the same Province, reports that some of the Indians on that Reserve rank as first-class farmers" (Department of Indian Affairs, 1877, 6). To encourage other First Nations to follow suit, various agricultural and industrial exhibitions were organized in Kahnawá:ke beginning in 1882 (Rueck, 2013).

In the late 1800s, the Canadian government claimed that Kahnawá:ke community members were more likely to use agriculture than hunting in comparison to past generations (Rueck, 2013). Hunting and fishing were continuously practiced, however, but were less visible by outsiders who had difficulties understanding Kanien'kehá:ka traditions (Rueck, 2013). This misconception of Kanien'kehá:ka connection to the land is also present in many policies, especially those related to gender. Women played and still play an important role in Kanien'kehá:ka agricultural systems, but settlers viewed women as fragile and considered Indigenous women's work in agriculture as a sign of Indigenous men lacking strength (Carter, 2016). This could explain why some 1843 reports only recognize fifty men working in agriculture within the community, because they likely ignore work done by women in smaller scale fields (Rueck, 2013). According to Rueck, several hundred women and their families were involved in agriculture (2013). Marcoux also noted that gender roles were still very apparent in 1847, as men organized the fieldwork while women and older men did any remaining

agricultural work (Rueck, 2013). Therefore, Indigenous people were not "lazier" than Europeans—as was the common misconception—but instead worked differently by dividing tasks according to Indigenous tradition. Moreover, settlers imposed policies to minimize Indigenous women's rights compared to men, specifically in regards to land ownership (Rueck, 2013). In the 1850s, legal elimination of women's rights to land was accepted by Kanien'kehá:ka male leaders, despite it being discriminatory (Rueck, 2013). Indeed, they saw it as a way to protect their lands from settlers who wanted to marry Indigenous women with the intention of obtaining Indigenous land (Rueck, 2013). There are no archival sources about the amount of approval from women and men in the community regarding this measure when it was established. In any case, women's access to land was restricted, and until 1985, women would lose their Indian status if they married a non-status man (Government of Canada, 1996, 252).

The Indian Act was also used to control land reserved for the Kahnawá:ke nation by encouraging subdivision and reduction of the reserve size (Rueck, 2013). Indeed, after the Northwest Uprising in 1885, the federal government used a policy of reserve subdivision by imposing a Western model of the individually owned lots where each family only had access to a specific space to work on (Rueck, 2013). However, in Kahnawá:ke, a report made by Indian Affairs states: "They cultivate a limited quantity of land, but most of the Reserve which is in their own hands, is lying idle, unprofitable alike to themselves and the country at large" (Pennefather, 1858, A21-20). This common argument pushed the Canadian authorities to give some "surplus" parcels of land to non-Indigenous people as the land was supposedly not being used efficiently regarding agriculture. In addition, if an "Indian" was enfranchised, he then became "non-Indian," which meant the land he owned was no longer part of the reserve (Rueck, 2013). This process of subdivision aimed to reduce the size of the communities by favoring private property over communal sharing systems (Rueck, 2013). Therefore, enfranchisement allowed Canadian authorities to reduce the numbers of Indigenous peoples recognized by the government.

Governance over the land is also crucial as the Canadian government imposed a non-traditional governance system called "band council." This imposition of the band council is specifically regulated by the Indian Act which stipulates that only one person in each community is able to represent the community as a chief (Rueck, 2013). This concept goes directly against the ideas of traditional Kanien'kehá:ka governance, as decisions were traditionally made consensually by consulting various groups within the community (Rueck, 2013). For instance, Shatekaienton (Louis Beauvais) was named as traditional chief in the 1850s, when he was 20 years old (Rueck, 2013). He held this position until 1889, when the band council was established (Rueck, 2013). In reaction to the imposition of Western democracy, there was an impressive mobilization of community members (Rueck, 2013). A series of petitions against the new electoral system took place, one of which gathered 121 people asking to end "the republic form of government of electing persons" (Reid, 2014, 86-88). The Liberal party debated this petition in the House of Commons, arguing that Kahnawá:ke was more advanced than other First Nations and proved they have "more responsibility governing themselves" (Rueck, 2013, 309). However, the changes were never made, and the band council structure is still applied today, largely impacting Indigenous autonomy within their own food systems.
In conclusion, the Indian Act imposed many European social constructs that changed Indigenous relations to the land. It restricted access to land and water, and outlawed the right to hunt and fish, and limited cultural practices regarding land use. It also disrupted gender roles, by degrading women, their rights and their roles within their communities. The Canadian government's colonial policies such as the Indian Act and the permit system encouraged subdivision of the land and disruption of Indigenous governance, which has also impacted food systems. These effects began to appear in the 19th century, accelerated throughout the 20th century and are still present nowadays. Indigenous communities' lack of control over their own land contributed to food insecurity and the general instability of their well-being. These colonial stratagems brought drastic changes regarding Indigenous peoples' access to their land. Trauma from land usurpation remains very present and many Indigenous organizations and individuals continue to advocate for Indigenous rights to land and freedom.

References

Carter, Sarah. (2016). Imperial Plots: Women, Land, and the Spadework of British Colonialism on the Canadian Prairies. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 455.

Department of Indian Affairs. (1877). Report of the Deputy Superintendent General of Indian Affairs. http://central.bac-lac.gc.ca/.item/?id=1877-IAAR-RAAI&op=pdf&app=indianaff%20airs.

Government of Canada. (2018). Indian Act. https://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/acts/i-5/page-6.html#h-332153.

Government of Canada. (1996). Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: The Indian Act. Vol 1 (9). http://data2.archives.ca/e/e448/e011188230-01.pdf.

Indigenous Foundations. (n.d.). Aboriginal Fisheries in British Columbia. https://indigenousfoundations.arts.ubc.ca/ aboriginal_fisheries_in_british_columbia.

Menzies, C. R., & Butler, C. F. (2008). The Indigenous foundation of the resource economy of BC's North Coast. Labour/Le Travail, 61, 131-149.

Miquelon, Dale. (2012). Sillery. L'encyclopédie canadienne. https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/fr/article/sillery.

Moss, W. and al. (1991). Aboriginal People: History of Dis-

crimination Laws. Accessed via http://publications.gc.ca/ Collection-R/LoPBdP/BP/bp175-e.htm.

Natural Resources Canada. (n.d.) KAHNAWAKE. Indian Lands History in Quebec. https://www.rncan.gc.ca/sites/ www.nrcan.gc.ca/files/earthsciences/pdf/land-surveys/ KAHNAWAKE_FR.pdf.

Office of the Treaty Commissioner (OTC). (2007). Treaties and the Law. http://www.otc.ca/public/uploads/resource_ photo/Treaties_and_Law-Info_Bg.pdf.

Pennefather, R.T., Fromme Talfourd, and Tho. Worthington. (1858). "Report of the Special Commissioners to Investigate Indian Affairs in Canada." in Appendix No. 21. Journals of Legislative Assembly, Vol. 16. Province of Canada. https://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.9_00955_16_6/38?r=0&s=1.

Reid, Gerald. (2004). Kahnawà:ke: Factionalism, traditionalism, and nationalism in a Mohawk community. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.

Rueck, D. (2013). Enclosing the Mohawk commons: a history of use-rights, land-ownership, and boundary making in Kahnawá: ke Mohawk Territory. PhD diss., McGill University.

Chapter IV

Paint: A Study of Paint as a Political and Environmental Object

Written By: Chloë Lalonde

Chapter IV Written By: Chloë Lalonde

This research stems from past work exploring how makers use and interact with art materials, namely painting supports. Where my past research focused on painting as craft object and a field of study, held in high respect in the art world, as well as how makers' interactions with their practice critique the current maker-culture and various art worlds (academic, professional, community, etc.) that they belong to, this study will elaborate on how Concordia students and young children interact with paint, and why this interaction is subject to environmental interest. I will do so by analyzing images of paint in and out of use, focusing mainly on the idle characteristic of these images and how in its idleness, paint holds the potential power for transformation. With environmentalism and sustainability being a key concern in our current socioeconomic, sociocultural climate, things are still being made, art is still being created, paint is still being used by professional artists, painting students, in childhood educa-

tion, in household chores, and protests. On each occasion, a discussion occurs questioning what paint is the right paint to use in these circumstances, and in doing so, a material hierarchy forms. In painting students, oil paint and hand-mixed paints live at the top of the hierarchy, but in childhood education, water-soluble and washable paints are valued higher than "professional" counterparts. My research will explore these hierarchies and the language used to differentiate each type. By analyzing how paint has been used in contemporary instances through various news articles, pushing this notion of transformation (political, environmental, educational, skillful, decorative, etc...), I will use Marshall Macluhan's idea, "the medium is the message" (Macluhan, 1964, 7), as the basis for my arguments. If we follow this statement, assuming it as true throughout this paper, then the way paint is used, in art-making or protest, determines its social role, not the final product it was used to create, not the formal qualities of the content of paintings, but how the paint is being used, why, and by whom.

Background: Historical and Contemporary Context Humans have been making since the Paleolithic era. The term, "Stone Age" (Miller, 2007, 26) refers to the first use of stone in the development of tools to facilitate day-to-day survival. Since, paintings have been discovered on the walls of caves all over the world, to tell stories, document history and pass down their knowledge. With the development of aesthetics in the late eighteenth century, we are now able to look back at these works and talk about their formal and aesthetic qualities, in addition to their functional uses. Western aesthetics play a massive role in the globalization of art practices, as many cultures do not intend to make work for art's sake, and some do not have a word for "art."

Painting soon grew to become a dominant field within the art world, from capturing the likeness of the upperclassmen before the invention of cameras, to painting to paint and push the boundaries of this flexible material. Traditional paint ranges from egg-tempera on wooden boards primed with rabbit skin glue, to encaustic (wax) painting on wooden panels, to custom oil paints using raw powdered pigments on wood or primed canvas. At some point in the mid-nineteenth century, paint became industrialized and plasticised (Lambourne, 1999, 2-3). Varieties of paint were produced for a variety of purposes. Acrylic and latex paints were created to be long-lasting and durable. Paint was made (cheaply and expensively) and dried into small quantities to make watercolours.



Figure 1. Two hierarchies created by paint (Lalonde, 2019) It was only quite recently, that painting has become an accessible household activity, thanks to the commercialization of materials. Questions regarding the role of art within society and culture have been brought up since the Renaissance, though this is not necessarily of importance in the context of this research, it is relevant to consider. Regardless of the formal contents of the work, by just existing as one of many mediums of art-making, paint creates hierarchies.

Watercolour and acrylic are located, interchangeably, at the end of hierarchy (a.) because of the inherent skill needed to use watercolour properly rank it higher, though it has been made in various forms embraced in childhood education, where it is more generally preferred than acrylic. Though among students, it's regarded as "not real paint," showing preference to the painterly qualities of acrylic paint. The latter, produced en masse, in starter kits of varying degrees of viscosity, flow, effects, glossiness, etc.

As seen in *Figure 2*, "professional" paint is determined by its degree of pigmentation, smooth flow, drying time and comparison to "traditional" oil and watercolour painting techniques. "Student-grade" or "beginner" paints are determined by the size of their container, convenience, and health concerns (non-toxic and odour-free).



DeSerres

Low Viscosity Professional Acrylic

from \$4.99 - \$5.99

Low Viscosity is Tri-Art's new format of professional acrylic paint. The format is water-like and free flowing, allowing for very fine strokes and smooth applications. Colours are highly pigmented, lig + Show More

Available in 36 colours



Golden Open Acrylic Paint

from \$10.99 - \$24.39

Open Acrylics are a highly pigmented, professional, and slow-drying line of acrylic paints. The increased working time expands their use to include more traditional techniques once only possible with oils, such as portraiture and landscape painting. They are suitable for some printmaking techniques.

- Stays wet for longer periods of time.
- Economic; requires less paint = less waste.
- Ideal for portraiture, landscaping and printmaking.

Because thick applications dry slowly, it is recommended to use them thinly (+1 mm). Drying time can be accelerated by mixing Open acrylics with fasterdrying acrylics such as Fluid and Heavy Body colors.

Because Open acrylics dry slowly, painters who cover their palettes or use sealed containers have been able to use the same colors for weeks, reducing the amount of paint wasted and preserving color mixtures for future use. In addition, brushes that have been unintentionally left out for many hours can still be cleaned.

Not for use with oil paints.

Design and a line of the state of the state

Golden

Box of 10 Golden Professior Fluid Acrylic

\$66.99

🖷 Ships in 2 business day

This set offers a selection of 10 Golden Professional Fluid Acrylic Colors that are fundamental to the serious artist working with fluid viscosity acrylics. The Golden Principa Fluid set provides artists with a cost effective means to setting up a basic palette, capable of mixing a full range of hues, tints, and shades that can later be supplemented with the wide selection of Fluid color offerings. Fluids are the most versatile paint formula produced by Golden, easily adaptable to a wide range of applications. They are ideal for spraying, brushing, or mixing with all Golden Colors including Heavy Body and Airbrush Colors. When mixed with water, or Golden Acrylic Flow Release, the Fluids are very useful for staining or watercolor techniques.

Quantity per bottle: 1 oz



Ē



Liquitex

Basics Acrylics Set - 12 x 22 ml

\$19.97 \$28.99

A Ships in 2 business days

Basics brand acrylics are perfect for beginners, and offer a wide range of intense permanent colours, which are opaque and easy to use. Basics are water resistant and non-toxic. These acrylics can be mixed together and diluted in water, or thinned with any medium. Supports: Suitable for most non-greasy surfaces. Drying time: 30 minutes, stays flexible while it dries. Tool maintenance: Clean brushes with soapy water. Practical information: Suitable for children.

- Show Less



DeSerres

DeSerres acrylics - Student grade

from \$5.75 - \$89.99

DeSerres student-grade acrylics are ideal for covering large surfaces and offer excellent value.

Sold in three convenient sizes, DeSerres acrylics are non-toxic, odour-free and offer luscious colours. They are easy to work with and are most certainly the answer to every artist's needs.

Usage: Mural painting, backgrounds or furniture, or for any student project.

Supports: Most surfaces, including canvas, cardboard and wood. Also suitable for primed metal.

Tool maintenance: Clean brushes with soapy water.

Drying time: About 15 minutes for a thin coat, and about three hours for a thick coat (of about %".)
- Show Less



Talens Amsterdam

Amsterdam Acrylic

from \$7.49 - \$23.99

Amsterdam student grade acrylics are fairly resistant to light, and are suitable for student projects. They apply well, resist to alkaline, and are a good choice for murals and large surface projects.

Usage: Backgrounds, or any student project.

Supports: Adheres well to non-greasy surfaces, including paper, cardboard, canvas, wood, plywood, concrete, pressed wood and plaster.

Drying time: Approximately 15 minutes for a thin coat, and about three hours for a thick coat (about % *.)

Tool maintenance: Clean brushes with scapy water.

Practical information: Containers are made of plastic and are entirely recyclable. None of the pigments contain heavy metals. - Show Less

Figure 2. Types of acrylic paint (Deserres, 2019). Screenshot by Chloë Lalonde

Who is paint for?

"Humans are inherently aesthetic and artistic creatures." - Ellen Dissanayake

According to Ellen Dissanayake (1995), art is for everyone, it is predisposed in our biology, as the desire for food, shelter, love and so on. Art, like hunger, is a behaviour in its own right, something that is craved and can be satisfied. The brands mentioned above have built reputations and distinguish themselves by their use. Mark Golden, CEO of Golden Artist Colors Inc., developed Just Paint, an online community "to provide artists with the best tools to meet their needs [and] inform and empower artists in the realization and preservation of their creative vision"(Just Paint, 2019, "About Us" section). Liquitex, previously Permanent Pigments, defines themselves by their innovation, and the lightfastness materiality of their cadmium-free paints, having developed the first water-based acrylics in the 1950s.

Cadmium is a highly toxic metal that has been introduced to paints to enhance its vibrancy. However, according to a painter, Dan Schultz, "in the paint-making process, the pigment is fused with sulfides and coated in the particular medium's binder (oil, acrylic, gouache or watercolor). This process renders the cadmium insoluble in water, and therefore the human body. We can't absorb it," (Schultz, 2018, para. 9). Rendering the paint is not particularly toxic unless dry and sanded. It might be the lack of cadmium that allows some acrylic paints to fall lower on this hierarchy. But most painters are completely unaware of the components of the paint they use, choosing it mainly by its packaging and product description. According to my research, parents, and teachers are most likely to buy water-soluble and toxic-free paints, and professional artists or student artists, are more likely to risk toxicity in favour of pigmentation.

I spoke to Jose Garcia Sierra, the president of the Painting and Drawing Student Association at Concordia, who explained that his father is a painter, allowing him to grow up playing with different kinds of paint. When he finally chose to start painting seriously, he was done playing around. His practice is methodical and organized, not only does he know which colours, tones, saturation and mediums he will work with before he even begins to paint, but he frequently works from digital collages created using Photoshop and later introduces elements from observation. He revealed that each piece costs him approximately \$150 to create, and his paints of choice are Van Gogh and Kama Pigments, due to the high concentration of the pigment. In our discussion, he said that he does expect his paintings to be in the trash in a couple of decades, which is why he intends to use materials of the highest quality to create aesthetically pleasing paintings that will be worth the time and effort he devotes to his practice, and will hopefully increase its cultural value.

Considering the increasing material accessibility of painting, my experience as an art educator, being involved in Concordia's maker-community has revealed that this community is composed of not only teachers and students, but community members and general citizens alike. They are not all art students, they are not all well versed in the arts and painting practices. But they all have a profound appreciation for the arts, and a deep desire to create and document.

Paint as Object in the Art World

"I tried to keep the paint as good as it was in the can" -Frank Stella

Frank Stella is an American painter interested in minimalism and post-painterly abstraction. According to Tate, "the post-painterly abstractionists were ruthless in their rejection of the inwardness and mysticism of abstract expressionism and of any residual references to the external world, and they also explored new approaches to composition. What they created was a purely factual kind of art which, more than ever before, functioned in terms of the basic elements of the medium itself; form, colour, texture, scale, composition and so on" (2019). In other words, post-painterly abstraction is the embodiment of Macluhan's "the medium is the message" (Macluhan, 1964, 7). Stella's paintings are flat and geometric, working with commercial paint colours straight from the can with large brushes to avoid having to free himself from drawing. "I didn't want to make variations; I didn't want to record a path. I wanted to get the paint out of the can and onto the canvas," (Lippard, L. R, 2015) said the artist in an interview in the 1960s with Donald Judd and Bruce Glaser.

More recently, painters like Ian Davenport have been exploring pour painting. Pour painting is, like the term suggests, the pouring of paint from its container to any surface. This kind of paint is usually mixed with mediums that will keep the mixture very fluid and rich, instead of watering it down. These mediums can be purchased in a variety of effects that will change the finished product in some way. Interested in the flow of paint, Davenport creates puddle paintings with commercial acrylic house paints. Some melt off of walls and onto gallery floors, while others are more restricted to their supports. In the works of both these artists, paint is regarded as the meaning-maker. Here the paint transforms its own meaning as an element worthy of contemplation, rather than the medium used to tell a visual story. We can analyze the way these artists interact with paint as a critique of painting and a critique of the art world. Here, paint opens the doors to having a social role, to critique, in and of itself.

Paint in Art School

I was lucky enough to observe professor Joseph Siddiqi's, Materials and Techniques class last year. This class requires students to experiment with a variety of paints, namely egg tempera, and hand-mixed oil, it is the only painting class of this nature at Concordia. I had the opportunity to speak with a couple of students, though at the time I was interested in their painting supports, I still accumulated much information about the paints they used and why they used them.

One student, an oil painter experimenting in self-portraiture without photographic references, prefers to use oil on stretched cotton canvas. They also considered their works studies, and not final or "real" paintings. They were not concerned about proper gessoing techniques. At the time this student was working with acrylic gesso over oil paint, which reactivated the paint causing it to smudge, creating blue stains in the white gesso. This is viewed as a big no-no in the painting community. "It isn't archival," they said. A painting that is archival has greater cultural value, in art school than one that isn't, as it is intended to last for potentially hundreds of years. However, the academic environment allows room for and encourages exploration of material, in ways that might be considered a waste of time out of school.

I passed by another student as they were showing their work to Joseph. I noticed it was painted on a red bed sheet, which I later found out was the support for a piece done on paper, mounted on top of the sheet. They explained that they frequently use bed sheets that had been purchased inexpensively from thrift stores, however, they noted that it wasn't the most efficient painting practice as it would degrade and rot over time. The student also mentioned that they didn't really care for that, as being a student, they are likely to pull it off the wooden stretcher and repaint with oil for another project.

This difference between "real" paintings and studies is becoming more evident, a common concept shared among painting and drawing students, and one parallel to Dissanayake's (1988) concepts of "good" and "great" art. Students in this class take different stands on the matter. Some are more interested in archival work, focusing on making the final product one that lasts, while others are just interested in painting freely. The academic world of painting seems to be separated from the cultural world of painting, as it values and encourages the exploration of media rather than repetition. Store-bought oil paint was preferred here because of its convenience, though students were prized for choosing to complete their final projects in other mediums, namely egg tempera, hand-mixed oils, and in one case, encaustics. Acrylic paint was not an option. Here, the value of the paint used is predetermined by the institution doing the teaching. Art school prioritises painting for the sake of painting, for self-expression, and for artistic growth. The paint one uses has the power to transform a student's artistic career through the relationships developed with professors, other students, and the framing of the paintings made for public display and exhibitions. Here it raises political and environmental questions, but it does not answer them.

Paint in Community Art Classes

I am a community art educator. I've been teaching paint-

ing, drawing and mixed media courses for five years now. Though that may not seem like long, it has opened my eyes to many issues surrounding the layperson's use of paint. For the most part, community art classes function in two ways, the material is included, or participants are expected to bring their own. I currently work with both means. At one centre, I supply paint on styrofoam trays, bulk coffee lids, and paper plates. At another, students are expected to have their own paint. I have palettes and styrofoam trays to put the paint on, though they typically have their own means of doing so too. Most parents prefer cheap paints at first, typically from the brand Decoart, which can be purchased in a large variety of colours from the Dollarstore. Though they typically will only buy primary colours (the Decoart primary colours mix to create very dull shades of secondary and tertiary colours, leaving students frustrated with the results,) or parents let their children choose which paints they would like. Which results in kits comprising of glittery, unmixable paints and neon colours. Only when a child shows promise or passion will parents invest in paint upgrades: primary colour kits from Liquitex or Pebeo.

There is no controlling what kind of painting supplies par-

ents will buy for their children, even if I provide a list of suggested material. In most cases, my students will show up with the aforementioned material, and sometimes this includes disposable paint palettes, which affords an incredible amount of waste. In Figure 3, one of my very promising students is pictured, set up with their canvas in progress, underdrawing and reference. Below is their disposable palette, smeared with paint used in the painting. In the bottom left corner, we can see a paint tube, Liquitex Soft Body Acrylic, their paints of choice. Liquitex describes the product as a "low viscosity professional acrylic paint [that] gives excellent coverage, a satin finish and high levels of artist-quality pigment for archival brilliance. It's incredibly versatile" (Liquitex, n.d) Lot's of paint flows from the tube at once, it's hard to manage the amount one needs, especially for a child. Lot's of paint is used, some to paint with, but most of it, the leftovers on the palette are spread around and disposed of.



Figure 3. Paint in community art education. Disposable paint palettes. (Lalonde, 2019).

Paint disposal is the very centre of art education. It's on every teacher's mind. We see lots of paint go to waste. It's this idea of waste and what that means in this context that is part of my dilemma. Using paint in this context means some will be used and some will be disposed of. Some teachers save paint by scraping the untouched leftovers on palettes back into their proper containers, some teachers create a mystery blend of all leftover paints. It's hard not to think about the environment and the paint drying in the pipes, clogging drains. My issue with paint in community art education is proper paint conservation is quite difficult to teach, and I make that my goal. Paint in the sense becomes more than a tool of expression or subject of skill, it becomes an issue of environmental concern, of educational concern.





Figure 4. Paint in community art education. Disposal and reusable palettes. (Lalonde, 2019).

Paint in the World

This year alone, paint has been used in protest all over the world, with recorded instances in Hong Kong, Taiwan, Bolivia, Iraq, and El Salvador. In most of these instances, paint was used, squirted or poured, right out of a bottle onto another person or building. In Hong Kong, paint was used, diluted with water, against the protestors, to mark them. In a 2012 article in Foreign Policy, Maki Haberfeld of the John Jay College of Criminal Justice in New York states that, "injecting semi-permanent, bright-colored dyes into water cannons is a relatively cheap and nonviolent way to identify and detain rioters after crowds disperse and deter demonstrators who worry about staining their clothing or skin" (Friedman, 2012, para. 3).

Red paint, more specifically, is most frequently used because it alludes to blood. Dousing a target in red paint can act as a reminder of the blood they have caused to shed. In El Salvador, protestors stood beside a victim of rape who was accused of murdering her stillborn son, dousing the Attorney General's office in red paint (Garcia, 2019). In Bolivia, the mayor of Vinto, Patricia Arce, was assaulted and doused with red paint due to her political affiliations (Machicao, M. & Semple, K, 2019). These targets become symbols for acts of violence they have not directly committed but represent.

Videos



Figure 5. Paint in protest (Youtube, 2019). Screenshot by Chloë Lalonde.

At its most simple, I would assume paint would be the medium of choice here because of its material components. It is opaque, it stains, it covers. It is easily accessible. It can look like blood. "Whether organizations are protesting about wages, climate change, social injustices against the society or even animal cruelty, paint has been used extensively to bring about the required change," writes Michael Olschimke, CEO of Scalefree in is 2012 project investigating methods of nonviolent action. Here, Olschimke's research identifies the various uses of paint in art activism as a tool to convey a message through an image. Though with the information I've gathered, this reliance on conveying a message with a painted image is dated. The simple presence of paint, especially in any area that it usually isn't, makes a statement.

"The question of representation through material culture becomes one of interpretation, performance, and re-presentation. A painting, a photograph, or a writing is a representation of the world as it is perceived (and possible to be perceived) through the materiality of painting or photography or writing. It is not a direct, unmediated transmission of an objective reality. It is an act that makes a difference" (Frantz, 1998, 795.)"

Paint in Idleness:





Figure 6. Paint in idleness at CUCCR. (Lalonde, 2019).

Frantz compares painting to writing, a means of expressing or describing an idea, a representation of life in some way, though the two forms of communication differ as "painting's function is to present the world beyond language in such a way that it can again be present (or represented) to the viewer" (1998, 796.) If we think of writing as the outcome of communicating ideas in a written language for others to understand, where writing is limited is in knowing the language. Paint, in and of itself, affords no language or code. In some cases, it is the medium one uses to record a language or code, but it can transcend that, transcend literacy. This idea has been touched upon earlier on in my paper, with the significance of its use in protests and in the classroom. Though these past topics have been discussing paint in use. In idleness, paint holds a very different potential.

There are two instances I would like to consider, paint in tubes or containers, and paint on a palette or any intermediary device between its container and its intended use. In its tube, paint is pristine, fresh, pure, painful and excited to open and use for the first time. After a while, paint in its container becomes old, dry, gross... I find myself more at ease using opened paint, I am not worried I will waste it. Unlike the glittering possibilities brought forth with new paint, waiting for the right way to use it, it's perfect purpose. When buying paint at the store, I am filled with wonder. There are so many options to choose from, so many possibilities. Other times I know exactly what I am looking for to complete a project, I go straight to it, grab it and go. No time to linger and fantasize about the promises other paints might offer.

Before its use, in its container paint promises possibility. Then it is used, something happens, pouring, painting, splattering, before then, it is put somewhere else. You don't use paint straight from its container. You don't want to accidentally ruin it by mixing in a bit of another colour directly inside. So you take a bit out, but it elsewhere, then you can do your mixing, then you can use it. Even when dousing targets in protests an intermediary device is used, sometimes a water bottle- as seen in El Salvador (Garcia, 2019), other times a hose. Never straight from the container. Some painters I've spoken to explained that they see their intermediary devices, in this case, palettes, as a place for experimenting, and their tubes as an untouchable source. On a palette, it matters not so much if the paint is wasted, it is the tube that must be savoured.

I work at Concordia University's Centre for Creative Reuse (CUCCR). The centre collects materials from campus that would have otherwise been thrown away and makes them available to students and members of the general community. A portion of this material is paint, leftover from campus office renovations or found in students' lockers post lockerclean-out date in the Visual Arts building. CUCCR keeps the paint off of the floor. It isn't up for grabs for everyone to take, though if someone asks for some, we will offer specific amounts or colours. Anna Timm-Bottos, who started CUCCR in 2017, always tells me that this is because it'll get grabbed up very quickly. But people rarely come in asking for paint, so it just sits there in our secret stash in the back. We don't even use the paint for the workshops and skillshares I help organize. Arrien Weeks, CUCCR co-founder said that it would make sense if we gave them out to new painting students, oil paint is not cheap but the concept of using old paint, working with what one has, could be an interesting pedagogical angle. In other words, CUCCR is holding on to paint for the right purpose. We don't know what to do with the tubes ourselves, so we're waiting for the right initiative to transfer our idle paints and dispose of them properly.

The idea of paint waste is one that is on everyone's mind but is not spoken about. Professors in art schools spend little time teaching proper disposal methods. And in my experience, I've made grand attempts to use leftover paint on my student's palettes to create other works. Though the problem here is, when I make them, these abstracts, they mean nothing to me. Their purpose becomes an embodiment of waste. They say nothing, standing as leftovers, the leftover potential for something greater.

The illusion of idleness is a very interesting crossover that can be observed in several of the works I've included above, see pour paintings and Davenport's puddle paintings. As paint dries, it's role is carried out, and it returns to being idle once more. But this time it's idleness is permanent, it can no longer transform, but it can be added to, and perhaps it can be removed. The disposal of paint brings up many environmental questions pertaining to its very materiality, because, for the most part, paint is not made to be removed, it is not made to break down and degrade, only transform, cover and be covered.

Conclusion

I began my research looking at the two hierarchies created by paint, social and material. In terms of the material hierarchy we've explored various uses of paint, including its role in idleness, and the impact of the context it is used in. With the ability to cover, uncover, and be disposed of, paint has a transformative socio-cultural role that brings up concerns with political, environmental and educational issues, regardless of the types of paint under consideration. Paint as a medium, as an opaque solution with many uses and purposes, has the power to transform, highlighting diverse problems, directing the attention of the masses. Users question the way in which paint tells a story and how it leaves a mark, not only on a surface but on society and all the aspects that come with it.

References

Acrylic Paint. (n.d). Deserres. https://www.deserres.ca/en/ art-graphic/paint/acrylic-paint

Dissanayake, E. (1995). Homo Aestheticus: Where Art Comes From and Why. University of Washington Press.

Dissanayake, E. (1988). What Is Art For? University of Washington Press.

Frantz, N. P. (1998). Material Culture, Understanding, and Meaning: Writing and Picturing, Journal of the American Academy of Religion, 66(4), 791-816.

Friedman, U. (2012, January 24). Why do police douse protesters with colored water? Foreign Policy. https://foreignpolicy.com/2012/01/24/why-do-police-douse-protesterswith-colored-water/

Garcia, A. (2019, September 9). Salvadoran activists hurl confetti, paint to protest new abortion trial. Reuters. https:// www.reuters.com/article/us-elsalvador-abortion-protests-idUSKCN1VV06M

Golden Artist Colors, Inc. (n.d) About Just Paint. Just Paint. https://justpaint.org/about-jp/

Lambourne, R., & Strivens, T. A. (Eds.). (1999). Paint and surface coatings: theory and practice. Elsevier.

Lippard, L. R. (2015, July 10). What You See Is What You See': Donald Judd and Frank Stella on the End of Painting, in 1966. Artnews. https://www.artnews.com/art-news/retrospective/what-you-see-is-what-you-see-donald-judd-and-frank-stella-on-the-end-of-painting-in-1966-4497/

Machicao, M. & Semple, K. (2019, November 17). Bolivian Mayor Assaulted by Protesters in Postelection Mayhem. The New York Times. https://www.nytimes.com/2019/11/07/ world/americas/bolivia-mayor-protest-paint.html

Mustalish, Rachel. "Modern Materials: Plastics." Metmuseum.org, Sherman Fairchild Center for Works on Paper and Photograph Conservation, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Oct. 2004, www.metmuseum.org/toah/hd/mome/ hd_mome.htm.

McLuhan, M. (1964). Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man, 1964. McGraw Hill

Miller, D. (2007). Stone age or plastic age? Archaeological Dialogues, 14(1), 23-27. https://lib-ezproxy. concordia.ca/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww. proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fstone-age-plastic%2Fdocview%2F198998833%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D10246

Soft Body Acrylic. (n.d). Liquitex. https://www.liquitex. com/row/products/professional/colors/soft-body-acrylic/

Tate (n.d). Post-Painterly Abstraction - Art Term. Art &

Artistic Tate, www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/p/post-painterly-abstraction.

Olschimke, M. (2012, February 10). 198 Methods of Nonviolent Action: Paint as Protest, Olschimke. https://www. olschimke.eu/2012/02/10/paint-as-protest/

Schultz, D. (2018, September 18). Is Cadmium Paint Toxic? Dan Schultz Fine Art. https://www.danschultzfineart.com/ is-cadmium-paint-toxic/

Paint in Protest. (n.d) Youtube. https://www.youtube.com/ results?search_query=paint+in+protest
Chapter V

The Mothership Hotel: A New Innovative Design to Make Montreal Green

Written By: Andrea Santamaria

Chapter V Written by: Andrea Santamaria

Recent research in the municipal government of Montreal has indicated several concerns about harbouring animals in enclosed spaces throughout their entire lives. Therefore, it would be propitious for Montreal to tear down the Biodôme and reconstruct a building with more sustainable practices, such as The Mothership Hotel. The Mothership Hotel would be a rendition of Earthships, which are self-sustaining environmentally friendly houses (Purdy, 2017). The Mothership Hotel would be beneficial in helping animals, reducing urban heat and pollution, and generating an all-inclusive location where individuals would be able to learn more about how to preserve the environment and how to assist in constructing future Motherships. There has been a recent shift in ideologies on how zoos are depicted. Originally, animal institutions were created for entertainment purposes. However, zoos have now adopted a new model known as the neoliberal biodiversity conservation model, which consists of an amalgamation of ideologies and schemes that assert na-

ture can only be preserved on the premise that it generates a profit (Büscher, Sullivan, Neves, Igoe & Brockington, 2012, 4). The paradigm consists of objectifying nature to inherently save it. The Montreal Biodôme's mission is to "educate," "conserve," and "conduct scientific research" (Biodôme, 2019). However, the issue is recognizing if the Biodôme is accomplishing its mission, or if it is solely trying to generate a profit. This essay will be separated into three sections. The first section will examine the consequential aspects of the neoliberal biodiversity conservation model in relation to why the Biodôme should be removed. The second section will focus on the proposed design, The Mothership, which is meant to replace the Biodôme. Finally, the third section will outline the benefits of this new design.

According to David Harvey (2007), neoliberalism is a hegemonic discourse with the potential to unfavourably affect socio-economic and political spheres (22). Harvey (2007) argues that although the neoliberal model can generate economic growth, the underlying concern is that the subordinate groups are the ones suffering at the expense of the dominant ones (22). The neoliberal biodiversity conservation model stems from neoliberalism, as it targets innocent animals for the sole purpose of generating a profit. For instance, the Montreal Biodôme fixates itself on how to play an essential role regarding the conservation of endangered species (Biodôme, 2019). Since 1994, they have "provided new habitats" for five threatened species: Goeldi's monkeys, golden lion tamarins, cotton-top tamarins, parakeet from Northern Brazil, and hyacinth macaw (Biodôme, 2019). However, there are currently two hundred and thirty species at the Biodôme (Biodôme, 2019). This means that solely 2.17% of the species that are housed are endangered and that 97.83% of the other species have no additional purpose than pure entertainment.

The profits the Biodôme receives do not go solely to the animals for conservation purposes. Rather, they are used for the park to further the "disneyization" and increase profits (Beardsworth & Bryman, 2001, 27). "Disneyization" is the process in which Disney-themed principles are managing numerous animal institutions, including zoos (Beardsworth & Bryman, 2001, 27). Alan Beardsworth and Alan Bryman (2001) discuss four ways in which "disneyization" is presented in zoos: merchandising, dedifferentiation of consumption, theming, and managing emotions (emotional labour)

(83). Merchandising is a principle in which these animal institutions attempt to profit off of animals (Beardsworth & Bryman, 2001, 96). For instance, there is a gift shop at the Biodôme, where they sell animal trinkets, keychains, t-shirts, mugs, and stuffed animals. Additionally, the dedifferentiation of consumption consists in not only the animals' presence in these institutions, but also in having restaurants, nearby hotels, and occasional rides (Beardsworth & Bryman, 2001, 94). The Montreal Biodôme has three restaurants, as well as numerous hotels and various activities to keep guests engaged in their exhibits. Theming is a discourse that endorses profit over conservation (Santamaria, 2018). For instance, theming encourages the exoticizing of "others" (Milstein, 2009, 35). The Biodôme is divided into five themes: "Tropical Rainforest," "Laurentian Maple Forest," "Gulf of St-Lawrence," "Labrador Coast," and "Sub-Antarctic Island" (Biodôme, 2019). The issue is that this produces the "othering effect", generating a human-nature duality (Milstein, 2009, 34-35). The final principle is the concept of emotional labour, which affects staff members, as well as animals (Beardsworth & Bryman, 2001, 96-97). Both are compelled to make the most of the visitors' experiences. If they don't, it lowers business and takes away from the Disney illusion the Biodôme is attempting to generate. The "disneyization" of the Montreal Biodôme aids in displaying the illusion of the adopted neoliberal biodiversity conservation model.

Regarding the illusion of the neoliberal biodiversity conservation model, zoos are constructed in a certain way to never have visitors face one another across the exhibit (Milstein, 2009, 37). Certain zoos have recently removed glass displays and inaugurated an "innovative" model to display the animals, where guests can observe certain exhibits looking downwards (Milstein, 2009, 38). Instead of viewing animals at eye-level, visitors see them from above, making it seem as if the animals are "free" (Milstein, 2009, 38). Zoo critics argue that these animal institutions are ensnared between science and recreation, as they are educating visitors on a "false sense of the natural order," producing this hierarchical system which suggests that animals are used for human purposes only (Milstein, 2009, 29).

Currently, the Biodôme is under construction for renovations. A video was released on their website, explaining what the new Biodôme will look like. The fundamental change is having visitors look at the exhibit from above (Biodôme, 2019). As Tema Milstein (2009) discussed, this generates the illusion that the animals are "free," which is a component of the neoliberal biodiversity conservation model (38). The Biodôme is, therefore, attempting to fit within the neoliberal mould, appearing to better the lives of the animals, although it is not the case. The main issue is that the Montreal Biodôme is contradictory. It claims its main concern is animal conservation, however, at the beginning of the video, it states, "we want to better showcase the ecosystems and ultimately offer visitors a more moving experience" (Biodôme, 2019). The video ends with "our goal is to make a lasting impact on the people who come to the Biodôme. How will they feel after their visit?" (Biodôme, 2019). Nowhere in the video did they mention how the renovations will better the animals' lives. The Biodôme's goal is to please their customers, however, there is no benefit in having an establishment like this in Montreal. There are various alternatives to learn about animals without keeping them captive for their entire lives and making them suffer. Alternatively, what would be beneficial and sustainable for the environment would be to replace the Biodôme with an "Earthship" hotel (Earthship Global, 2019).

The concept of the Earthship was created by the architect Michael Reynolds, who wanted to develop off the grid sustainable houses (made of recycled materials), meaning the energy source is independent (Purdy, 2017). To generate electricity, an Earthship uses wind turbines, solar panels, and biodiesel for both heating and cooling (Purdy, 2017). Moreover, the Earthship's giant cistern can capture rainwater from the roof and "transfer it to a Water Organization Module (WOM)," which then purifies the water, making it potable (Purdy, 2017). The rear walls of the Earthship are usually "covered by dirt" or "built directly into hillsides to promote the generation of passive energy" (Purdy, 2017). The outside walls are made of recycled aluminum cans, while the inside walls are mostly composed of old tires covered by plaster, adobe, or stucco (Purdy, 2017). At times, the inside walls can be made with recycled bottles or cans (Purdy, 2017). That being said, Montreal ought to create a Mothership Hotel, a rendition of the Earthship, as the city is a prime location because of the significant amount of tourism throughout the year.

The development of green infrastructures is primarily beneficial in highly urbanized cities (Watts, 2015, 9). With the enrichment of urban ecosystems, it can have many advantages, including health benefits, clean air, and temperature regulation (Watts, 2015, 9). Watts et al. (2015) explain the Ecosystem-based adaptation (EbA) and how it utilizes services directly related to the "ecosystem, biodiversity, and sustainable source management as an adaptation strategy" to improve natural resilience and diminish vulnerability (9). It can be consolidated with infrastructures or additional technological advances (Watts, 2015, 9). EbA mediations can be productive in subduing certain "climate change vulnerability as it provides both disaster risk reduction functions, and enables improvements in livelihoods and food security, especially in poor and vulnerable settings" (Watts et al., 2015, 9).

The combined effect of "adaptation and climate" can generate mitigating effects by assisting the purification and storage of carbon, which in turn, will improve human health (Watts et al., 2015, 9). Trees can assist in reducing the "concentration of pollutants," however, it depends on the species as some are more effective than others, for instance, tree canopies are able to reduce urban heat by 40-99%, which will, in turn, help "mitigate climate change" (Watts et al., 2015, 9). Therefore, the Mothership would mainly consist of canopies to reduce urban heat in Montreal. As well, a green urban design has the ability to "improve mental health through increased physical activity and social connectivity" (Watts et al., 2015, 9).

In Flanagan's reading, William Whyte expresses that public spaces where people feel comfortable can encourage communication (Flanagan, 2010, 13). This is important because The Mothership, although a hotel, would grant access to public visitors to certain sections in order to educate them on the environment and on how they could assist in environmental justice. Mimi Sheller (2014) argued that mobility is a "resource" that not everyone has equal access to (795). However, having the Mothership accessible to the public during the day would reduce the inequality as no one would be required to pay for the visit or to book a room (Santamaria, 2019, 4). This location would encourage social interaction, as the goal of the Mothership is to make Montreal a "green" city, and in order to do so, there needs to be community involvement and ideas from the youth, adults, and professionals in the field (Moretti, 2017, 92; Santamaria, 2019, 2). As Tallie Segel (2019) mentioned in her guest lecture, we need to use the right (logic and reasoning) and left (creative) sides

of our brain in order to find solutions to solve the climate change issue.

The Mothership would have, in the yard of the hotel, a community garden accessible to everyone. There are numerous benefits to having community gardens. For instance, they can be used for therapeutic purposes, offering both physical and mental health benefits (Marsh et al., 2018, 339). The reason why individuals enjoy these gardens is that they are hubs for "intercultural, intergenerational, socialisation and knowledge sharing, friendship formation and mentoring" (Marsh et al., 2018, 339). For example, those who were victims of domestic violence, and/or had issues with drugs and alcohol, gathered at community gardens for their meetings (Marsh et al., 2018, 339). The sessions were often promising, as gardens help mitigate mental health issues. Moreover, the soil used to plant has antidepressant microbes, which contribute to healing mental health problems naturally, without the need for medication (Marsh et al., 2018, 339).

Furthermore, gardens have been known to decrease non-violent crimes. For instance, in Tasmania, Australia, some neighbourhoods were facing issues of misdemeanour offences committed by youth (Marsh et al., 2018, 339). A group of gardeners, instead of approaching the police, decided to handle the situation on their own and managed to get some of the misbehaving youth to join one of their cooking classes offered in the community garden (Marsh et al., 2018, 339). This led to a decrease in offences (Marsh et al., 2018, 339). According to Statistics Canada, a report from 2017 illustrated that youth non-violent crime in Quebec had increased since 2016 (Crime Severity Index, 2017). Therefore, having The Mothership located in a highly dense urban area where crime is inevitable, would be beneficial as the youth could help participate in community gardens or even aid with the construction of future Motherships in the city.

To conclude, the Montreal Biodôme is another institution that has fallen victim to the neoliberal system society has in place. Animals are suffering in these institutions to generate a profit and entertain visitors. Animals do not have a voice, and it is our responsibility to speak for those who cannot. It is for these reasons that The Mothership would be beneficial for the City of Montreal. It is not solely a hotel, but rather, a network to spread environmental justice. It is a place where people, whether young or old, rich or poor, educated or uneducated, able-bodied or disabled, can gather and find solutions together to mitigate and adapt to climate change, as I argue one cannot work without the other. Having The Mothership Hotel implemented in Montreal would help prevent another institution from being a victim of neoliberalism. As Harvey (2007) said:

"the creation of this neoliberal system has entailed much destruction, not only of prior institutional frameworks and powers... but also of divisions of labor, social relations, welfare provisions, technological mixes, ways of life, attachments to the land, habits of the heart, ways of thought, and the like" (23).

Therefore, let's protect the animals while making the City of Montreal more sustainable.

Pictures:







4.





5.











10.



11. Part 1



11. Part 2



References

Beardsworth, A., & Bryman, A. (2001). The wild animal in late modernity: The case of the disneyization of zoos. Tourist Studies, 1(1), 83–104. Retrieved from: https://0-doi-org. mercury.concordia.ca/10.1177/146879760100100105

Büscher. B, Sullivan. S, Neves. K, Igoe, J. & Brockington, D. (2012). Towards a Synthesized Critique of Neoliberal Biodiversity Conservation, Capitalism Nature Socialism, 23(2), 4-30. Retrieved from DOI: 10.1080/10455752.2012.674149

Biodôme. (n.d.). Retrieved from: http://espacepourlavie.ca/ en/Biodôme

Crime severity index and weighted clearance rates, police services in Quebec. (2017). Retrieved from: https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/t1/tbl1/en/tv.action?pid=3510018701

EarthshipGlobal. (n.d.). Retrieved from: https://www.earth-shipglobal.com/

Flanagan, W. G. (2010). Urban Sociology: Images and Structure. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers. Introduction & Chapter 1: 1-15

Harvey, D. (2007). Neoliberalism as Creative Destruction. The Sage Journals, 610 (1), 21-44. Retrieved from: https://doiorg.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/10.1177/0002716206296780 Marsh, P., Brennan, S., & Vandenberg, M. (2018). "It's not therapy, it's gardening": community gardens as sites of comprehensive primary healthcare. Australian Journal of Primary Health, 24(4), 337–342. Retrieved from: https://0-doiorg.mercury.concordia.ca/10.1071/PY17149

Milstein, T. (2009). "Somethin' Tells Me It's All Happening at the Zoo": Discourse, Power, and Conservationism. Environmental Communication, 3(1), 25–48. Retrieved from: https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia. ca/10.1080/17524030802674174

Moretti, C. (2017)."Walking." In: Elliott D and Culhane D. A different kind of ethnography: Imaginative practices and creative methodologies. University of Toronto Press: 91-11

Purdy, E. (2017). Earthship. Encyclopædia Britannica. Retrieved from: https://www.britannica.com/topic/Earthship

Santamaria, A. (2019). Sun Life Building: Urban Analysis. Concordia University.

Santamaria, A. (2018). Neoliberal Biodiversity Conservation: Is it making a difference?. Concordia University.

Segel, T. (2019, March 11). Climate change & the future of cities. Speech presented at Concordia University, Montreal.

Sheller, M. (2014). "The new mobilities paradigm for a live sociology." Current Sociology 62.6: 789-811. Retrieved from: https://doi.org/10.1177/0011392114533211

Watts, N., Adger, W. N., Agnolucci, P., Blackstock, J., Byass, P., Cai, W., Cox, P. M. et al. (2015). Health and climate change: policy responses to protect public health. The Lancet, 386(10006), 1861-1914. Retrieved from: http://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/1479102/1/Colbourn_final%20commission%20 -%20word.pdf

Photos References

1. n.a. (n.d) Earth home [Photograph]. Metaphysics Speaks. https://metaphysicsspeaks.com/earthships-self-sustaininghomes-for-a-post-apocalyptic-land/

2. Johnson, C. (2016) Earth home [Photograph]. Earth 911. https://earth911.com/home-garden/live-in-earthships/

3. Kim, E. (2011) Tires rammed with earth and stacked. [Photograph]. Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/ Earthship#/media/File:Tire_Bricks_(5751089164).jpg

4. KVDP. (2011) The water system with irrigated flush toilet, as used in most earthships. [Photograph]. Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Earthship#/media/File:Earthship_water_system.png

5. Fred the Oyster. (2010). Regular Earthship Design. [Photograph]. Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Earthship#/media/File:RegularEarthshipDesign.svg

6. Smith, A. (2011). Natural convection cooling an Earthship. [Photograph]. Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/ wiki/Earthship#/media/File:Convection_banner_1.jpg

7. n.a. (n.d) Earthship. [Photograph]. Taos Tennis. http:// www.taostennis.com/attractions/earthship-taos-2/

8. n.a. (n.d) Earthship. [Photograph]. True Activist. https://www.pinterest.ca/pin/407505466264558477/?lp=true

9. n.a. (n.d) Earthship interior. [Photograph]. Earthship New Zealand. http://earthship.co.nz

10. Jacobsen, K. (2016). Earthship interior. [Photograph]. Visit Taos Mexico. https://taos.org/earthships-taos-born-bred/

11. n.a. (n.d). What is an Earthship? infographic. [Photograph]. Earthship Global https://www.earthshipglobal. com/about-us

Chapter VI

The Tooth Fairy: A North American Tradition

Written By: Roxxane Perron

Chapter VI Written By: Roxxane Perron

Many cultures across the world have specific practices tied to baby teeth and, as such, there are many different traditions concerning their utilization and/or disposal once they fall out of children's mouths. Our tradition in North America consists of leaving a lost tooth under the child's pillow for the Tooth Fairy to collect in exchange for a small amount of money. The Tooth Fairy, most commonly characterized as a winged female carrying a sparkling wand (Capps & Carlin, 2013, 267), is a prominent figure in North American popular culture, as it has been estimated that this mythical creature visits 90% of American households (Hodges, 2015, 948). This specific rendition of a baby teeth tradition highlights the symbolic significance of losing one's baby teeth within our culture and also embodies some of our predominant cultural values.

The Tooth Fairy belongs to a group of figures, including a

mouse, a rat, a spider, and other representatives from a wide range of cultures, that are tied to rituals involving baby teeth (Wells, 1997, 426). However, the iconic combination of a tooth, a pillow, a fairy's visit, and money is particular to a rather recently created and strictly American tradition. The Tooth Fairy's emergence in North America is traced back to the early 1900's, before which this mythical figure as it is known in our culture today, had never been referred to in literature nor folklore (Tuleja, 1997, 13-14). The Tooth Fairy gained popularity throughout the 20th century, and became nationally established by the 1950's, with the widespread integration of this developing tradition evidenced by the first appearance of the Tooth Fairy in popular literature in a story appearing in Collier's magazine in 1949 (Tuleja, 1997, 17). Several hypotheses explain why the Tooth Fairy went from a relatively obscure folk tale to a nationalized custom after the Second World War.

An increase in discretionary income after the war, coupled with the emerging notion that parents should want to fuel their children's imaginations, may have contributed to the spread of the tradition, as families now had extra money that they could spare to spend on children's fantasies. Furthermore, publications about the Tooth Fairy and, even more significantly, the increasing appearance of fairies in cinematography greatly contributed to increasing this mythical figure's popularity. Before Lee Rogow's story in Collier's magazine, the Tooth Fairy had been sparsely mentioned in early 20th century literature. But, as more of these types of stories emerged and were propagated, and as movies such as Cinderella (1950) and Peter Pan (1953) continued to introduce children to fairies, the Tooth Fairy herself was consolidated and became a significant part of childhoods across North America (Tuleja, 1997, 17-19). Additionally, the Tooth Fairy is believed to have been created to help children cope with the loss of their baby teeth (Capps & Carlin, 2013, 266-268). The Tooth Fairy relieves the child's anxiety about their lost tooth by replacing it with anticipation for her visit (Capps & Carlin, 2013, 277), and brings with her the promise that a new, better tooth will appear to replace the old one that she takes away (Wells, 1997, 435). As a result of all of these factors, the Tooth Fairy became quite iconic in North America, and remains a popular tradition to this day (Wells, 1997, 426).

Turner's conception of symbols as operators that produce

social transformation (1975) can be applied to the Tooth Fairy custom of North America, because children losing their teeth is culturally seen as a rite of passage into adulthood. In this regard, the lost baby tooth holds much symbolic meaning, as the Tooth Fairy ritual and ensuing social transformation cannot take place without it. The Tooth Fairy, and the loss of a tooth, fit well into Turner's three phases of a rite of passage (Wells, 1997, 426). On the physiological level, separation occurs when the child's first baby tooth falls out and the Tooth Fairy takes it away, the liminal phase is marked by the gap in the child's teeth, and then, aggregation occurs when the adult tooth finally grows in. As the Tooth Fairy comes to collect every one of the child's baby teeth, not just the first, the separation and liminal periods can last for months to years, until all of their adult teeth have finally appeared, marking a completed transition from the status of "child" to that of "big kid". The Tooth Fairy tradition also marks a psychological transition in the child, as they learn about the Tooth Fairy when they lose their first tooth; believe in the Tooth Fairy during the liminal period of tooth loss; then stop believing, and are thusly incorporated into the category of the "grown-ups", when they discover that their parents have been playing the Tooth Fairy all along (Wells, 1997, 429). Finding out the truth about the Tooth Fairy can therefore be considered to constitute a rite of passage out of childlike innocence and into the much less magical and whimsical reality of adulthood (Tuleja, 1997, 13). On both of these levels, the Tooth Fairy tradition plays an important role in the completion of the rite of passage. The lost baby tooth that is given into the care of the Tooth Fairy so that an adult tooth can grow in its place symbolizes the child's transition into adulthood through bodily change and the eventual loss of belief in the Tooth Fairy symbolizes the mental state of childhood that is being left behind in favour of discovering the world from an adult perspective.

By applying Geertz' theory of culture as social meaning (1973) to the tradition of the Tooth Fairy, we can see how the symbol of the baby tooth and the action of monetary exchange associated with it reflect how society is conceptualized in North America. The fact that money comes into play in a capitalist exchange of sorts during the Tooth Fairy ritual speaks to the very nature of our free-market society: in a "typical American fashion, the Tooth Fairy [comes] for a business deal" (Hodges, 2015, 948). The Tooth Fairy's connection to our economic market, is made even more obvious

by the existence of the Tooth Fairy Index. In fact, every year since 1998, the American dental insurance company Delta Dental has carried out an annual nationwide poll to find out how much money the tooth fairy has been paying children for their teeth. According to the data, even the Tooth Fairy is impacted by broad market forces, as depicted by the inflation of tooth exchange rates that Delta Dental has documented. In 1998, the average payout for a tooth was 1.30\$, but the amount continued to inflate year after year, following the economy, until it reached a peak of 4.50\$ in 2017 (King-Miller, 2019); a valiant example of how the Tooth Fairy tradition, though perceived as a game, mimics our economic behavior. As a tradition created and introduced to children by adults, "the economic message of the custom is an adult and modern one: 'Produce and Sell'" (Tuleja, 1997, 20). Through the Tooth Fairy tradition, children are subconsciously being taught capitalist values, the value of money and of cash payments, and the logics of monetization and of the free market, all of which are quite important to grasp in order to become fully functioning members of North American society and to keep it running as it is.

The capitalist nature of our thinking that finds a way to turn

everything into a commodity, including our own body parts, can also be tied into Nancy Scheper-Hughes' analysis of the monetization of body parts (2007). Stories of children forcing out baby teeth that aren't quite ready yet in order to get a few extra bucks sooner rather than later are not uncommon (Hatton, 2006). Effectively, the Tooth fairy tradition seems to forward the notion that one's body can become economically productive (Tuleja, 1997, 20), and this calculation of body parts' cash value brings to mind Scheper-Hughes' observations in Manila, where selling an organ has become a routine way of gaining an extra income (2007, 509).

Additionally, returning to Geertz, the cultural value placed on hygiene, and particularly oral hygiene, is also reflected through the Tooth Fairy ritual, as it is understood that the cleaner and whiter one's tooth is, the more the Tooth Fairy will pay for it (Tuleja, 1997, 14-15). In this way, the Tooth Fairy propagates our cultural preoccupation with dental hygiene. In fact, Hodges even outlines what he calls the 'American Dental Dream', or the vivid desire for white, straight, and strong teeth in a culture constantly reinforcing the message that this is how teeth should look in order for one to be considered respectable and successful (2015). Studies have even shown that people who have "culturally ideal smiles" are perceived more positively than people for whom this is not the case (Hodges, 2015, 947). In a society where crooked, yellow, and missing teeth are seen as reflecting similar tarnishes on one's character, the Tooth Fairy tradition axed on rewarding strong, white, cavity-free teeth inevitably carries with it and passes on this underlying societal preference and its social meanings.

In conclusion, our Tooth Fairy tradition is quite reflective of our worldview, as it serves to help navigate North American life stages, in particular the physiological and psychological transition from child to adult, and builds off of dominant North American values, evident through the Tooth Fairy's exchange of teeth for cash at the market rate and her preference, mirroring society's, for pearly whites in good condition. It is clear that this custom, which is a staple of North American childhood for most, yet that is seldom given a second thought, is much more than a simple charade to stoke the imagination of children.

References

Capps, D., & Carlin, N. (2013). The Tooth Fairy: Psychological Issues Related to Baby Tooth Loss and Mythological Working Through. Pastoral Psychology, 63(3), 265–280. doi: 10.1007/s11089-013-0545-5

Geertz, C. (1973) Thick description: Towards an Interpretive Theory of Culture. 310-323. Retrieved from https://philpapers.org/archive/GEETTD.pdf

Hatton, S. (2016, May 12). A loose tooth puts a bite on capitalism. Retrieved from https://www.kansascity.com/news/ local/community/joco-913/joco- opinion/article77275342. html.

Hodges, N. (2015) The American Dental Dream. Health Communication, 30(9), 943-950. doi: 10.1080/10410236.2014.914621

King-Miller, L. (2019, June 7). How much should the tooth fairy pay? Retrieved from https://www.vox.com/the-high-light/2019/5/31/18644508/tooth-fairy-rate-kids-traditions.

Schepper-Hughes, N. (2007). The tyranny of the gift: sacrificial violence in living donor transplants. American Journal of Transplantation, 7(3), 507-511.

Tuleja, T. (1997). The Tooth Fairy: Perspectives on Mon-
ey and Magic. In P. Navez (Ed.), The good people: New fairylore essays (p.406-425). Retrieved from https://books.google.ca/books?id=DLmoKKkxAX0C&pg=PA426&lp-g=PA426&dq=the+making+of+an+icon:+the+tooth+-fairy+in+north+american+folklore+and+popular+cul-ture+rosemary+wells&source=bl&ots=XBnORGCh-Go&sig=ACfU3U0mCyo62S-LCKDOxmIMMngv4Px-wAA&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwjdzuWOu4PmAh-WCneAKHc9YDgoQ6AEwDXoECA8QAQ#v=onep-age&q=the%20making%20of%20an

Chapter VII

Queer Identity Performance in Virtual World Video Games

Written By: Felix Bonnevie

Chapter VII Written By: Felix Bonnevie

We often look to video games as a temporary escape from the confines of reality. Each game, from wartime shooters to Mario Kart, offers its own view of life and in doing so, tells us something about the user, themselves. For many individuals and communities, the escapist desire goes beyond just temporary removal; for them, video games are the real world. Contemporary Game Studies have shown that although gamer identities are expanding to include women and non-heteronormative people, the industry itself still depends on young men as their main demographic (Greer, 2013). Video game subcultures have also been "long characterized" by homophobic attitudes, often putting non-straight, as well as transgender or non-binary players in situations of discrimination or hostility. This general lack of representation of people who identify with marginalized identities may be symptomatic of larger, hegemonic trade practices in media (Ruberg, 2018, 87). However, using queer theory to analyze and discuss the ways that marginalized communities utilize

video games – through existing literature and qualitative research – will perhaps shed new light on how virtual worlds can be seen as conditioners or actualizers of users' ideal versions of themselves. Through this study, I intend to answer the following: how are video games used as an alternate means of performing identity for persons whose ideal and actual selves do not match in real life? Further, what real-life effects do virtual world video games offer to such users?

Case Study

Second Life is a massive multiplayer online game (MMOG) that was created in 2003. Users of this game navigate a virtual world through avatars (or computer-generated bodies) which can equally reflect or diverge from one's actual appearance and lifestyle. Despite its age and a lack of frequent updates, the game remains one of the most popular MMOGs to date with over a half million players in 2018 (Buscemi, 2020) – a number which reflects how virtual worlds can be sustained with little more than a dedicated and engaged user base. Second Life will be particularly noted in my research due to it being one of the only MMOGs to mimic real life without significant overarching themes like films or ancient time periods. The game has its own economy and uses a fic-

tional currency called the Linden. In Second Life (and other MMOGs), one's objective is up to the individual player, whether the pursuit of a pretend occupation, a means of income through converting Linden to real dollars, or merely a place to socialize. With a map comparable in scale to the size of a small country, Second Life offers many places to go, and many people to meet.

Literature Review

In the emerging discipline of Game Studies, several authors have discussed the intersection of virtual world games (or MMOGs) and the building and strengthening of self-identity. Adrienne Shaw finds that identifying as a gamer "intersects with other identities such as race, age, sex, etc (2011, 28)." Shaw believes that scholars must "look critically at how people articulate their own relationship to gaming" before making statements on behalf of these players (2011, 28). In the essay titled "The Ideal Self at Play: The Appeal of Video Games That Let You Be All You Can," the authors discuss the ideal self versus the actual self, arguing that video games can be a "rich environment" for development of the self through performing, or "trying out" identities that may be internalized, rather than presented to the world (2012,

69). They also believe that people with wide discrepancies between their ideal and actual selves benefit most from MMOGs in which they can embody their ideal characteristics. To that end, Anil Ananthaswamy claims that this imagination of alternate identities can combat the "challenging or hostile realities they [transgender people] face" (2007, 1). In line with Butlerian thoughts on gender, Greer claims video games are equally a "terrain on which sexuality may be 'enacted', indeed 'performed'" (6). In MMOGs, this is done through the avatar.

Kelly Bourdreau argues that avatars represent "fragmented bits of the self" which are manifested through the relationships the player has both with the game and with other players (2007, 3). In turn, she argues that these technologically mediated interactions "shape and harmonize" identities of the player. In contrast, Jonathan Cohen claims that playing as an avatar different from one's actual identity is to "surrender consciousness," or to "forget about one's self [to] adopt an external point of view" (2001, 247-248). This perspective relates to Nakamura's concept of identity tourism. She says, "on the internet, nobody knows that you're a dog; it is possible to 'computer cross-dress' and represent yourself as a different gender, age, race, etc" (Stone, 2001, 3). While problematic in the context of white males appropriating alternate racial identities online, which is Nakamura's main support, this rhetoric when applied to transgender players of MMOGs becomes problematic and dehumanizing. The term "cross-dresser" amalgamates all those identities which do not conform to hegemonic codes in gender and dress; it puts men who wear dresses, females who wear men's clothes, transgender men, and transgender women in the same basket. It is worth noting a counter to these arguments, which is that if players are embodying an "ideal self," as Henrik Schønau-Fog and Thomas Bjørner (2012) argue, then they are not surrendering anything; rather, these imagined/embodied traits are already present within the player.

Schønau-Fog and Bjørner (2012) argue that in-game relationships and interactions are what keep people playing. Przybylski et al. (n.d) add that while contained in virtual worlds, the social, physical, emotional, and sensory elements of MMOGs produce meaning for players that go beyond the game itself. This intersection between self and play which these authors discuss indicates that games, like all forms of media, are a means of representation and self-identification. While scholars tend to disagree about the significance of embodying an avatar, they all tend to agree that gameplay inside these virtual worlds is informed by their avatar's appearance, which does not always reflect the presented identity of players. Therefore, the importance of social engagement in MMOGs, where players interact through the guise of their avatars' appearance, is significant. Many scholars have begun to recognize video games as a powerful social tool in creating spaces of social interaction and identity embodiment, where identities may vary from the players' actual selves. However, what remains somewhat unclear from this research is why individuals turn to fictitious virtual spaces for support instead of seeking out help in real life. Further, the literature seems to be inconclusive as to the distinction between identity performance and identity escapism in these contexts. Supplementing sparse and occasionally misrepresentative literature with qualitative research and testimonies will perhaps provide more authentic accounts of these players' experiences and clarify to what end their involvement with video games is beneficial in producing self-identification and aiding personal growth.

Findings

My research indicates that, in line with Butlerian ideas on gender as being performed, the same is true when people play video games, especially ones that foster social interaction among players in online spaces. This is to say that although video games operate in fictitious worlds, these technologically mediated experiences are nonetheless just as important to some users as real-life ones. Often, they are more important to people who use these games as a means of expressing their internalized identities. MMOGs appear to be useful to individuals during stages of self-discovery, since they are able to safely experience what it would be like to be their ideal selves in a judgement-free space. Furthermore, and to my surprise, MMOGs like World of Warcraft and Grand Theft Auto, which are intentionally inauthentic representations of real life, have also been found to be beneficial to transgender players. Despite the players not being able to replicate real-life situations such as becoming a lawyer, or getting a coffee with a friend, the avatar is nonetheless just as important in their respective gameplays. A transgender gamer, Veritas (2017) stated that "it's a chance for us to play as our preferred gender. We can finally be that badass chick who saves the day from hordes of aliens or that righteous dude who fights the

undead masses to avenge his mortal soul, but whatever your quest is... you finally get to do it as you" (1). Veritas adds that customization options such as the wardrobe can be useful in "experimenting with different looks without ever spending any real money" (2017, 1). It is also worth noting that many transgender players are open in real life about their identities and use MMOGs merely to socialize. Laura Ess, a transgender Second Life player who spoke of her experiences on YouTube, uses an avatar who appears transgender; that is to say, the avatar's physique (broad shoulders and a masculine face) are not traits that pass as being cisgender.

Alternatively, one can choose an avatar which does appear as cisgender. A comparison can be made between users whose avatars do not represent their actual physique, and Schønau-Fog and Bjørner's observation that young boys can try out masculine identities while playing video games (2012, 70). If we regard identity as something that is not inborn but rather acquired through processes of socialization, then video games can be seen as a catalyst for self-realization, or merely self-exploration, during this transition. This is significant because it reverses the element of escapism traditionally thought to exist in video games. Here, a distinction can be made in which users may not think of the game as an escape from reality, but as an alternative to reality itself. This data starkly contradicts Cohen's view that adopting an alternate avatar is to forget about one's own identity. While this may be true for some people in certain cases, this point of view assumes that one's identity is attached to their physical appearance, which doesn't take into account those who experience gender or identity dysmorphia.

While several authors have cited MMOGs as being useful in discovering one's ideal sense of self, my research points to a surprising element: the aspect of having a community in MMOGs. Second Life includes the option to join groups or guilds, many of which are targeted toward LGBTQ players. For example, Laura Ess (2010) speaks of her own positive experiences with the game in her YouTube video. She explains, "there's a transgender lounge, where you can sit and chat in a comfortable environment. The transgender resource center is another place where you can meet other people who may have the same problems" (Ess, 2010). Laura later states that these resources are "the answer" for transgender people who have difficulty finding local support groups or people to talk to in real life. She adds that Second Life has its own hate crime and suicide memorial, with services given "on that very day" (Ess, 2010). This testimony is telling of feelings of comradery and support that virtual world games can provide. Not only can people practice their (ideal) identities safely, but there are spaces dedicated to fostering constructive dialogues and providing support. This relates to Nick et al.'s assertion in "The Online Social Support Scale: Measure Development and Validation" (2018) which indicates that in contemporary society, the internet now plays an enormous role for millions of people around the world in "development and maintenance of social relations." According to Nick et al., "online platforms give rise to new and pervasive social niches that appear to operate in ways quite similar to in-person social niches," (as cited in Gonçalves, Perra, & Vespignani, 2011). This is quite significant because for many, this support may not be present in real life. Most social institutions are founded on structures that force individuals to identify themselves as male or female, such as schools and universities, hospitals, and religious institutions. This produces a "regime of gender dichotomy," (as cited in Rosenberg, 2004, Thorpe, 2017, 1). In contrast to gay bars and villages where cisgender men are able to find community and refuge from discrimination, transgender

individuals are not afforded the same safe spaces, nor are they traditionally accepted in spaces deemed "gay," even by members of the broader LGBTQ community. According to Thorpe (2017), these codes "erase trans bodies and attempted self-definition" (1). It appears that transgender users of MMOGs turn to gaming through an awareness of society's shortcomings, compensated for by interconnectivity of similar people around the world.

In the past, online chat forums provided a one-dimensional platform for discussion. Now, these online simulations of community have permeated the games sphere as well. Furthermore, regarding the difficulty that transgender individuals face finding support and being understood, these online worlds are just as significant to users as real-life communities. While existing literature has laid the groundwork for explaining the beneficial relationship that MMOG players have with these games and their avatars, testimonials provide more expansive, truthful, and recent accounts of these games and their meaning amongst individuals and communities. In general, people use video games and MMOGs for a myriad of reasons such as self-identification, escapism, and the relief of stress, depression, and/or rage. All of these

contexts reveal the larger purpose of media to satisfy and reflect human desires of being understood. This, and the fact that communities are now emerging inside virtual worlds, indicates that these multi-user contexts are really microcosms of reality in which societal norms and values are not only reflected but are the basis of interaction and gameplay.

When conducting research for this topic, certain limitations made it difficult to proceed. There seems to be a lack of terminology which recognizes communities within the video game cyberspace, as well as a lack of terms surrounding the avatar in relation to the ideal self, that goes beyond mere experimentation. For example, certain scholars' discussions of identity tourism risk conflating crossdressing with transgenderism, which completely overlooks the objectives of users who desire to play games with alternate genders from those they present in real-life, as a means of imagining and achieving them. Furthermore, this rhetoric plays into the same phobic sentiments which are often present in video games. Consequently, another limitation in my research was the need to apply older, possibly dated terminology to practices which are constantly evolving over time. Finally, the need to consult non-scholarly sources which depict the issues in a more subjective way means that there are still perspectives to be accounted for by scholars of Game Studies, such as postmodern forms of gender and identity. These findings and conclusions are nonetheless important to broader understandings of the socially valuable nature of MMOGs to people with marginalized identities.

In the future, it would be interesting for scholars to conduct further research on video game solutions to gender dysmorphia and self-identification. Significant data would need to be collected in order to analyze how and to what end queer and transgender folks seek out video games to either perform gender or sexual identity, or to combat feelings of dysmorphia. A subsequent need for more queer scholars would provide empirical knowledge, which can play a role in expanding scope of Games Studies to include more diverse perspectives. Alternatively, scholars must recognize Shaw's notion that gaming coincides with identity; meaning, we must look to how gamers view themselves in order to understand the patterns of their behavior, and the meaning of their engagement.

Conclusion

It is my understanding that video games are but one digital medium among the myriad of others which engage with individuals' views of themselves. It appears that the original purpose of MMOGs has expanded to act as an online utopia for people who aren't accepted by society in real life. With an increasing number of games in recent years that offer transgender storylines or characters, video game developers may be beginning to realize that reaching out to queer and transgender demographics is mutually beneficial for individuals who seek representation as well as their own trade practices, (Villarreal, 2018). As trans writer Aerinn Hodges-Kolfage has experienced with Facetune, an application that renders selfies through a process that applies ideal facial characteristics, "it's less about what is 'real' or not." She claims that what matters is how the medium helps users actualize what they see in themselves (2018). The same can be said for video games, where assuming the part of a character is deeply tied to that character (or avatar's) appearance. Perhaps an increase of games which celebrate non-heteronormative ways of being and believing will act as a catalyst for other media forms to redefine the scope of their representation to include more diverse and inclusive narratives.

References

Ananthaswamy, A. (2007). A life less ordinary offers far more than just escapism. New Scientist, 195(2618), 26–27. Retrieved from http://0-search.ebscohost. com.mercury.concordia.ca/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=26415264&site=eds-live

Bonnie Ruberg. (2018). Straight-washing "Undertale": Video games and the limits of LGBTQ representation. Transformative Works and Cultures, Vol 28 (2018). https://0-doiorg.mercury.concordia.ca/10.3983/twc.2018.1516

Boudreau, K. (2007). Pixels, parts & pieces: constructing digital identity. Retrieved from http://0-search.ebscohost. com.mercury.concordia.ca/login.aspx?direct=true&d-b=edsndl&AN=edsndl.oai.union.ndltd.org.LACETR.oai. collectionscanada.gc.ca.QMG.975805&site=eds-live

Buscemi, J. (2020, February 16). Who's still on 'Second Life' in 2020? Retrieved from https://www.mic.com/p/second-life-still-has-dedicated-users-in-2020-heres-what-keeps-them-sticking-around-18693758

Castronova, E. (2004). The Price of Bodies: A Hedonic Pricing Model of Avatar Attributes in a Synthetic World. Kyklos, 57(2), 173-196. doi:10.1111/j.0023-5962.2004.00249.x

Cohen, J. (2001). Defining Identification: A Theoretical Look at the Identification of Audiences With Media Characters. Mass Communication & Society, 4(3), 245–264. Retrieved from http://0-search.ebscohost.com. mercury.concordia.ca/login.aspx?direct=true&db=ufh&AN=5209452&site=eds-live

Ess, L. [Laura Ess]. (2010, November 28). Transgender in Second Life [Video file]. Retrieved November 27 from from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JdEaQNgeQMg

French, K. (2017, October 16). First They Got Sick, Then They Moved Into a Virtual Utopia | Backchannel. Retrieved November 27 from https://www.wired.com/2017/02/firstthey-got-sick-then-they-moved-into-a-virtual-utopia/

Goncalves, B., Perra, N., & Vespignani, A. (2011). Validation of Dunbar's number in Twitter conversations. arXiv preprint arXiv:1105.5170.

Greer, S. (2013). Playing Queer: Affordances for sexuality in Fable and Dragon Age. Journal of Gaming & Virtual Worlds, 5(1), 3–21. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia. ca/10.1386/jgvw.5.1.3pass:

Hodges-Kolfage, A. (2018, July 13). For Trans Women Like Me, Facetune Is a Way to See Our Real Selves. Retrieved November 27, 2018, from https://broadly.vice.com/en_us/ article/zmkxn8/trans-women-who-use-facetune-for-photos

Nakamura, L. (2001). Head Hunting in Cyberspace: Identity Tourism, Asian Avatars and Racial Passing on the Web. The Womens Review of Books, 18(5), 10. doi:10.2307/4023600

Nick, E. A., Cole, D. A., Cho, S. J., Smith, D. K., Carter, T. G., & Zelkowitz, R. L. (2018). The Online Social Support Scale: Measure development and validation. Psychological assessment, 30(9), 1127.

Przybylski, A. K., Weinstein, N., Murayama, K., Lynch, M. F., & Ryan, R. M. (n.d.). The Ideal Self at Play: The Appeal of Video Games That Let You Be All You Can Be. PSY-CHOLOGICAL SCIENCE, 23(1), 69–76. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia.ca/10.1177/0956797611418676

Rosenberg, S. (2004). An introduction to feminist poststructural theorizing. Feminist issues: Race, class and sexuality, 35-57.

Schonau-Fog, H., & Bjorner, T. (2012). "Sure, I Would Like to Continue": A Method for Mapping the Experience of Engagement in Video Games. Bulletin of Science, Technology & Society, 32(5), 405–412. Retrieved from http://0search.ebscohost.com.mercury.concordia.ca/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ987342&site=eds-live

Shaw, A. (n.d.). Do you identify as a gamer? Gender, race, sexuality, and gamer identity. NEW MEDIA & SOCI-ETY, 14(1), 28–44. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia. ca/10.1177/1461444811410394

Stone, A. R. (1994). Will the Real Body Please Stand Up?: Boundary Stories about Virtual Cultures, Cyberspace: First Steps, Michael Benedikt. Thorpe, A. (2017). Where Do We Go? Gender Identity and Gendered Spaces in Postsecondary Institutions. Antistasis, 7(1), 1–12. Retrieved from http://0-search.ebscohost.com.mercury.concordia.ca/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eue&AN=121624161&site=eds-live

Veritas, C. (2017, February 11). Video Games Allow Transgender People to Be Themselves. Retrieved November 27 from https://www.huffingtonpost.com/charlize-veritas/ transgender-people-video-games_b_9205330.html

Villarreal, D. (2018, March 27). These 5 Video Game Characters Illustrate the Evolution of Trans Representation in Gaming. Retrieved November 27, 2018, from https://hornet.com/stories/transgender-video-game-characters/

Chapter VIII

Intellectual Disability and Sexual Rights

Written By: Arielle Quéraud

Chapter VIII Written By: Arielle Quéraud

Dehumanization as a systemic process allows for freedom and autonomy to be retracted from individuals envisaging notions of cognitive capability found within legislative discourses that claim to protect individuals who are vulnerable to marginalization. Laws that define cognitive capabilities and are meant to help people are an example of dehumanization on a systemic level. Through an exploration of legal discourses on human rights, needs principles and sociological theory, this essay will highlight universalized Western concepts relating to parenting and sexuality that contribute to the dehumanization process of intellectually disabled individuals. This paper will argue that the lack of concise policy, disproportionate power relations, neoliberal ideologies and economic factors act as barriers for intellectually disabled individuals in achieving autonomy regarding sexual expression and parental rights. First, an uncovering of power relations based on Foucauldian theory and parental needs principles illustrate determinants of sexual expression derived from

dominating ideologies of parents/guardians of intellectually disabled individuals living at home. This analysis will be extended through South Africa and Ireland using the work of Foley and Kahonde et al. (2019) to contextualize power relations across varied cultural and economic environments of different nations. Secondly, a demonstration of how the murky quality of universal human rights policies in the context of disability rights allows for national legislations to define policy criteria, contributing to a growing paradox within the moral foundation of universalizing human rights will be discussed. This leads to the growth of non-consensual sterilization cases of the intellectually disabled.

Contextualizing Power Relations: Regime of Care and Needs Principles

Both Foley (2014) and Kahonde et al. (2019) emphasize power dynamics between designated guardians and individuals with intellectual disability living under their care. Differences in culture and economic status between the Irish and South African contexts reveal varied urgency in addressing sexual rights of intellectually disabled adults, while also signaling dominance over the intellectually disabled person living with their family members under their regimes of care.

Foley (2014) focuses on legal discourse within Irish society using the qualitative approach of semi-structured interviewing to reveal power dynamics between intellectually disabled individuals living at home and their mothers. Through a Foucauldian lens, he pinpoints these power relations based on the parent's perceptions that cognitive capability works in defining the sexual autonomy of their charges with Down syndrome. Foley states: "Foucault's most important insights is namely that knowledge and power are inextricably linked" (2014, 77). The idea of intellectual ability being a barometer for independence is used in the discourse of needs principles. Foley's study illustrates that a lack of intellectual capacity acts as a justification of an ongoing "paternalistic regime of care" (2014, 67). The mothers' understanding of cognitive capabilities coincide with Irish law and are limited through their views of how sexuality should be expressed. This position maintains that autonomy is fully granted only through the institution of marriage. Foley states: "Section 5 of the Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Act of 1993 [...] states that it is a criminal offence for an individual with a mental impairment who is not living independently to engage in sexual relations unless they are married" (2014, 65).

The mothers in Foley's study agree then that possessing a certain level of cognitive ability is crucial to granting autonomy that surpasses the expressed sexual wishes of their children with Down syndrome. Foley uses the term "capacity/ autonomy discourse" to illustrate the creation of boundaries with their children on the foundation of diminishing potential harms that come with sexual expression (2014, 78).

Foley (2014) states that the mothers in this study understand that their children have sexual needs but reject the notion that sexual acts of expression are a means to an end. He posits that these mothers are pushing for romantic love to be attached to sexual expression to acquire a "...normal identity, and to act accordingly" (Foley, 2014, 74). Generally these mothers perceive "acting accordingly" as pursuing a sexual relationship with someone who is at a perceived cognitive level that is equal to that of their adult children with Down syndrome and is suitable for them to love. Foley states: "Thus, all of the respondents were adamant that there was no principled embargo on their adult children embarking on a sexual relationship – provided it was with someone else that had Down syndrome" (2014, 73). According to the mothers, this constriction is laid out as a means to avoid sexual harm or exploitation.

Kahonde et al. (2019) use a constructivist approach as opposed to Foley's Foucauldian method to discover economic and need-based factors that largely determine how South African family caregivers consider the sexuality of young adults with intellectual disabilities. Kahonde et al. (2019) state that "in most cases, lifelong care and support will be the family's responsibility with varying degrees of government and other forms of funded support (2)." This trend is most common in low to middle income countries where formal out of home living options are either non-existent or minimal" (Kahonde et al., 2019, 279). Kahonde et al. (2019) reveal that most research done on the sexuality of intellectually disabled individuals within the context of South Africa considers poverty as an important factor of a need to "protect and prioritise the safety of the family member with intellectual disability, over facilitating their access to sexual rights when they need to" (Kahonde et al., 2019, 279). Many families do not have access to resources such as adequate funding or social assistance to allow room for the sexual expression of their relatives with intellectual disabilities. The needs determined by the family caregivers are dependent on the family's economic and social needs. This unification of needs within the familial unit distinguishes it from Foley's work within the Irish context because the threat of poverty is more prevalent in South African families as seen in the study. This threat of poverty in relation to the Irish sample posits a decision to put the caregiver's needs before supporting the sexual rights of their family members with intellectual disabilities (Kahonde et al., 2019).

One of the needs of the caregiver is defined as a "need to avoid extra burden of care" in respect to unwanted pregnancy (Kahonde et al., 2019, 285). In the event of a birth from what they consider to be an unfit couple, the child is then considered a financial burden on the family. Sterilization is promoted by the family to avoid the extra care it would take to raise the child. Kahonde et al. (2019) also mention that intellectually disabled relatives of those providing care are perceived as children themselves. The infantilization of these individuals perpetuates an idea that to allow them to explore their sexuality and have the right to a sexual education is "not a priority" (Kahonde et al., 2019, 284). This places other forms of basic care and support in the forefront of care providers' concern when working with people with intellectual disabilities because they have fewer supportive options, due to a lack of social programs dedicated to the welfare of intellectually disabled people in South Africa (Kahonde et al. 2019). This reality then forcefully places these families in a situation of deciding between the family's safety or the sexual and reproductive freedom of their charges.

In conclusion, the individuals with intellectual disabilities in both studies were not interviewed and thus were not given the freedom of expressing their experiences as they pertain to relationships and sex. Both Foley and Kahonde et al. (2019) accentuate an undercurrent of power between the intellectually disabled and the families providing them care. In Kahonde et al.'s (2019) article, the economic welfare of the family is forcibly put before the right of sexual expression of their disabled relatives in most of the households under investigation. Differences in culture and economic status between the Irish and South African contexts reveal varied ways of conceptualizing sexual rights of intellectually disabled adults, while also indicating the presence of dominance over the intellectually disabled person living with their family members under their regimes of care.

Human Rights Policy Reformation for the Intellectually Disabled

Vague language used in the universal policies for human rights of intellectually disabled individuals creates varying definitions of "best interests" that allow cases of non-consensual sterilization to continue worldwide (Little, 1992, 217). Another element that undermines the effectiveness of human rights discourse concerning non-consensual sterilization is "rights inflation" (Clément, 2018). Clément's theory of rights inflation claims an overuse of human rights objections to counteract acts variably deemed as inhumane. This in turn creates a pecking order of rights that become tangled in a slow bureaucratic process hindering a potential grip on obtaining justice for subjugated individuals and groups. Little and Clément demonstrate the pitfalls of universal human rights policies that put intellectually disabled individuals in a position to be harmed and stripped of their humanity.

Little recognizes the absence of a clear freedom from non-consensual sterilization and declares that in the context of protecting the intellectually handicapped from non-consensual sterilization, universal human rights have been largely "inadequate in defining the circumstances in which these rights can be restricted" (Little, 1992, 205). The vague nature of international human rights policies allows domestic legislation to define the "proper legal safeguards," which convolutes the objective of universalization of human rights laws (Little, 1992, 208).

The international rights of intellectually disabled people need to be reformulated. Its language should be more concise and demonstrate an awareness of the lack of public resources for the care of intellectually disabled people, and the tendency to misjudge their capabilities in regarding them as undeserving of full human rights (Little 1992, 226). Unavailability of UN support is used as an excuse for indecisiveness on the domestic front of legal action concerning rights for people with intellectual disabilities (Little, 1992, 227). This leads to an inadequate amount of legal protection for these individuals from non-consensual sterilization. Little mentions the arbitrary use of the term "best interests," which is weighed by the legal system and guardians of a person without the incumbent's input (1992, 217). The author proposes that the solution lies within the aided commitment of both the international and domestic level of human rights platforms to reformulate policies that clearly stipulate the illegality of non-consensual sterilization of people with intellectual disabilities (Little, 1992). One potential issue arising from reformulating this policy is a type of rights inflation. One solution is to "frame these grievances as social justice" to efficiently prevent non-consensual sterilization of individuals with intellectual disabilities and form funded programs to match the economic and social factors within varying societies (Clément, 2018, 158).

Universal Human rights policies should be reformed to clearly indicate the illegality of non-consensual sterilization including individuals with intellectual disabilities. Using the discourses of universal human rights and social justice movements, it is possible to replace the extreme idea that non-neurotypical individuals should be stripped of their right to procreation based heavily on economic factors.

In conclusion, the analysis of these articles puts into context the need for a reformed international law and a call for the emergence of social justice to end non-consensual sterilization of intellectually disabled individuals. The need for social programs in cultivating the autonomy of intellectually disabled people is essential to the welfare of society in combating the standardized ideal of what a sexual and parental being is. In describing the macro and micro elements of power relations within these families, the authors have demonstrated that intellectually disabled people generally need more social support to express their sexuality safely. Significant strides could be made with the help of social programs aimed at providing information and support for families in what can be understood as a sensitive area of human life.

References

Clément, D. (2018). Human rights or social justice? The problem of rights inflation. International Journal of Human Rights, 22(2).

Foley, S. (2014). A Foucauldian reading of mothers' views on the paternalism/autonomy debate in relation to the sexual practices of their intellectually disabled adult sons and daughters. Irish Journal of Sociology, 22(2).

Kahonde, Callista K., Judith McKenzie, and Nathan J. Wilson. (2019). Discourse of Needs versus Discourse of Rights: Family Caregivers Responding to the Sexuality of Young South African Adults with Intellectual Disability. Culture, Health and Sexuality, 21(3).

Little, H. (1992). Non-Consensual Sterilisation of the Intellectually Disabled in the Australian Context: Potential for Human Rights Abuse and the Need for Reform. Australian Year Book of International Law, 14.

Schueths, A. M. (2019). Not Really Single: The Deportation to Welfare Pathway for U.S. Citizen Mothers in Mixed-Status Marriage. Critical Sociology, 45(7/8).

Section II:

Honours Anthropology & Sociology Essays

Chapter IX

Dynamics of Spiritual Capital in the Coupling of American Evangelicalism and Media Technology

Written By: Amanda Van Oort

Chapter IX Written By: Amanda Van Oort

In this paper, I aim to provide a sociological context to understand the prevalent overlapping relationships and signifiers of value between the fields of protestant evangelicalism and the broader American culture within an information/ communication system that is increasingly mediated by technology. This interplay of celebrity, religion, profit and politics is best understood using the theory of Spiritual Capital, which emerged from Pierre Bourdieu's theory of Cultural Capital. While the concept of Spiritual Capital has been defined and discussed in a variety of ways within academic literature, more can be said regarding both its application outside of strictly religious/spiritual communities and within in our increasingly mediated world.

Through a historical and cultural analysis of the co-development of modern Evangelicalism alongside communication technologies in America (past and present), I argue that Evangelical Protestantism has become a primary bearer of
Spiritual Capital in the United States to the extent that it has absorbed prevailing logics from the economic and communication fields in its embrace of media technologies and furthermore that its capital has become a signifier of value in applications outside the field of religion proper. This is revealed through the parallel rise of televangelism and prosperity gospel practices with the advancement of religious communication technologies and economic developments, the effect of which is a collapsing or blurring of the lines of distinction which separate the televangelist pusher of prosperity gospel from the marketing maven brand endorser.

I build my argument first with an overview of Bourdieu's Field theory and his concept of Capital, which has been extended by scholars into the concept of Spiritual Capital which will be discussed afterwards. Once this theoretical framework is laid out, a historical analysis focused on the expansion of Evangelicalism, communication technologies and their intertwinedness will be explored, including the impact of technology on traditional forms of charismatic leadership. The discussion that follows reveals a cultural terrain wherein (i) the authority of the religious field (American Evangelicals) maintains its power through the adoption of areligious symbols/systems related to the dominating idéeforce of economics (neoliberal capitalism) evidenced by its embrace of communication technologies, and (ii) that political/cultural agents are able to utilize symbols and rituals of Christianity as a recognizable spiritual capital (currency) beneficial to their own growth, maintenance and dominance.

<u>Theoretical Framework: From Bourdieu's Field The-</u> ory and Capital to Verter's Spiritual Capital

The concept of Spiritual Capital is inspired by Bourdieu's theory of Social Capital. While not explicitly connected by Bourdieu himself, these theories fit like a glass slipper with another Bourdieuian theory known as Field Theory. Field theory is beneficial as an analytical resource because it takes the focus off of the relations between individual social agents and opens up the ability to consider relations (especially power relations) between broader sets of relations, each containing their own histories, structures and realms of knowledge. A 'field' is a subset of interconnected relations which exist in relation and competition to other fields in various degrees of autonomy, while also having its own internal struggles for dominance. As Dan O'Hara (2000) explains, all independent fields are subsumed by the social field, which is in turn subsumed by the field of power. While each field is "relatively autonomous and independent," (44) they nonetheless exert effects and force on the others in what Bourdieu describes as a struggle to "impose the legitimate vision of the social world" (2005) and is thus also vested with a higher portion of power.

Likewise, agents within fields struggle against one another so as to enforce the dominant discourse of the field, but this struggle is different in that it is rooted in certain presuppositions. The field is a site of actions and reactions performed by social agents (individuals, organizations) who are endowed with permanent dispositions, partly acquired in their experience of these social fields (Bourdieu, 2005). These permanent dispositions as well as the position that an agent holds within a field and any other acquired attributes are potential "capital." Such capital in relation to other capital and institutional relations within the field have the effect of pre-constraining the actions of a social agent, while at the same time they maintain a margin of freedom from which they act and affect, based on their positions within a given field. Agents can grab hold of the dominant discourse by

wielding capital from both their position within their field and external fields, such as politics and culture, in order to create a vision or to exert effects which cause the rest of the field to organize behind them (Bourdieu, 2005). In the context of the crux of this paper, Evangelicalism, having gained a position of power within the field of religion in American society acts upon and is acted on by other fields in a struggle for power.

Bourdieu's theory of Capital is based on Marx's economic analysis of Capital where accumulated wealth (capital) is put through a productive process of labour so as to increase the original value put in, leading to profit or surplus value which is then put back into the same process (Marx, 1990). Bourdieu then opens this idea up to other realms of social existence beyond economics and outlines instead three primary types of capital (Bourdieu, 1986). There is the Economic form of capital (monetary wealth), the Social form of capital (one's interpersonal connections), and the Cultural form of capital (knowledge, skills) (Bourdieu, 1986). Drilling down further, Cultural capital exists in three different states: the embodied state characterized by traits such as beliefs and values which have become internalized and naturalized, the objectified state comprised of "cultural goods" (pictures, books, dictionaries, machines, fashion, Instagram accounts, TV, etc.) and the institutionalized state which "confers entirely original properties on the cultural capital which it is presumed to guarantee" (Bourdieu, 1986). These three forms of capital all work directly or indirectly to locate one's status within the social terrain of power and often even buttress each other. Given its association to beliefs, values, goods and institutions, the Bourdieuian conception of Cultural Capital became an attractive template for scholars, such as Bradford Verter, trying to understand the field of religion, giving birth to the concept of Spiritual Capital.

Verter's conception of Spiritual Capital, like Bourdieu's Cultural Capital, is taken as a matter of disposition rather than mere acquisition, and operates in the same three forms as cultural capital- the embodied state where it is a part of one's identity or habitus, the objectified state where it can be observed through both material (artifacts) and immaterial symbols (preferences, morals, connections, piety), and the institutionalized state (Verter, 2003). As with Bourdieu's cultural institutionalized state, its spiritual counterpart centres on the power that (religious/spiritual) organizations exercise in order to legitimate "an arbitrary array of religious goods, promote the demand for these goods, and feed the supply by bestowing qualifications on a select group of authorized producers" (Verter, 2003, 160). In addition to the institutionalized state of Spiritual Capital, Verter acknowledges the existence of extra-institutional spiritualities that have Spiritual Capital, such as various New Age religions (2003) which nevertheless produce and promote goods and maintain their own power-hierarchies. While Bourdieu differentiates such extra institutional faiths based on their scale of production, particularly "the field of large-scale production" (Bourdieu, 1993) as being more culturally dominant, this is confounded in the realm of televangelism. This is because it functions through mass media which collapses the distinction between large and small organizations, allowing both to reach large audiences.

In addition, the same inter-related, supporting relationships used in the original three forms of capital put forth by Bourdieu remain intact with the insertion of Spiritual Capital and field theory. For example, presidential prayer breakfasts can be interpreted both as events where those with authority in the religious field use their spiritual capital to support and legitimize the authority of the political fields à la institutionalized cultural capital, and vice versa— the political authority legitimizing the beliefs, practices and authority of the spiritual systems which the invited religious leaders represent.

As Spiritual Capital can be garnered using generalized/abstract symbols which apply to a variety of faiths and or beliefs, it is not necessary for an explicit nor complete legitimation to be made about a belief system in order for the agent/institution representing it to be able to wield that legitimation for their benefit. Indeed, there may be great advantages in signalling vague yet specific enough points of religiosity so as to gain approval from a wide array of people. A case-in point comes from a Washington Post (2004) article discussing the ambiguity of particular theological stances when it came to the faith of the openly Evangelical president George W. Bush Jr. While the president spoke of the way "Jesus changed his heart" and his belief in "the power of prayer," it remained less clear his stance on more divicive points of doctrine such as biblical inerrancy, homosexuality and the theory of evolution. In discussing the phrase choice of "culture of life" after attending a Catholic pro-life event, the article points out: "By using such phrases, Bush signals to

Evangelical Protestants and conservative Catholics that he is with them, while he avoids taking explicit stands that might alienate other voters or alarm foreign leaders" (Cooperman, 2004). In attending certain events and using terms that call to mind points of doctrine rooted in certain belief systems, the president becomes understood as someone who shares those values, without actually saying so. This illuminates the general malleability in which capitals (and to the goal of this thesis, Spiritual Capital) are able to work.

In analyzing this dynamic of Spiritual Capital as it pertains to the American society, it is helpful to consider the history of Christianity in America, the modes used in thinking about it, and its role in American culture. This allows us to come to an understanding of how Christian symbolism, imagery and stories have become embedded so much into American culture to the point that those able to wield them can do so with the expectation of receiving some sort of benefit beyond what might be achieved by those who choose not to, whether as a complete opt out or in favour of another set of beliefs, practices and symbols.

The Civil Religion: Questioning the Secular Revolution

While this paper contends that protestant evangelicalism is a specific branch of Christianity which reigns control of the religious idée-force in America as opposed to any other, it should be noted that the historical significance of Christianity in the American ethos is not something founded purely on personal piety. Rather, it is often used as an abstract set of symbols, stories, rituals and ideas which have been called forth time and time again throughout American history to give credence, gravitas and weight in matters considered civil or patriotic and outside of the parameters of areas formally associated with religion, such as a church.

This condition is described by Bellah in his conception of what he calls "America's Civil Religion" (1967) stating, "What we have, then, from the earliest years of the republic is a collection of beliefs, symbols, and rituals with respect to sacred things and institutionalized in a collectivity...while not antithetical to and indeed sharing much in common with Christianity, was neither sectarian nor in any specific sense Christian" (Bellah, 1967, 8, emphasis added). While the concept of the Civil Religion differs somewhat from Spiritual Capital, when we hold it as a fact along and intertwined with the history of Evangelical Christianity, it creates a strong cultural context for observing Spiritual Capital as something in and exterior to the religious field in the American imagination.

Some historians hold that the value of religion in America has been waning since the civil war, that "if private religiosity sustained itself, its expression has been largely innocuous and irrelevant to public affairs" (Butler, 2004, 1360, emphasis added). However, historian Jon Butler disputes this based on historic and economic evidence, which reveal both a stable and growing identification with personal faiths by individuals in the state and by contesting the all-encompassing role of religion for individuals in the pre-civil war era. He states that as it concerns academic literature such as text books, American historians tend to emphasize the role of religion in shaping social discourses in the years before the civil war (Butler, 2004), while also playing down its role in modern American life. Rather than seeing faith as remaining a central part of the historical discourses regarding how the country has been shaped, it instead appears in small bursts in literature, much like a jack in the box toy bursts out (Butler, 2004). This tendency has obscured the foundational role of religion and its stasis within American life, impacting the way we understand the motivations driving individual and group action and contributing to a sense of marginalization for those who hold religious values in society. Contra this tendency, Butler points to statistics which show that rather than depleting in the 20th century religious affiliations have actually risen: affiliation rates were 40-45% in the 1880s (and) 60-65 percent in the 1980s. The rates have remained relatively stagnant since that time, with the notable shift in declining membership rates for Mainline churches and rising membership in Evangelical ones (2004, 1362). This rise in affiliation rates affirms a growing general interest in Christian spirituality in modernity while the shift from mainline denominations to Evangelical ones supports the view that Christian Evangelicalism has come to hold the lion's share of capital in the religious and indeed the larger cultural field in America. I turn away now from the notion of secularization, to explore how Evangelicalism developed along and inside of other aspects of American culture, and dominated the religious field.

Advancing Media and Rising Televangelism

The true roots of what would later become the televangelist movement (Diekema, 1991) are located in the post civil war era. This time was characterized by crusading religious personalities such as Charles Finney (Diekema, 1991; Smith, 2017) who "found, made, and handed on practices for the public presentation of private lives [and] fused the veracity of private selves with the omnipresence of abstracted public selves" (Smith, 2017, 22). Finney utilized what he called a "scientific method" in his revival sessions in order to gain converts (Diekema, 1991), means of which included the use of informal language, eyesight (Diekema, 1991: Smith 2017), and performances of emotion (Smith, 2017). This performative work employed by Finney both informed and mirrored those used by politicians and performers of the time (Smith, 2017) for the advancement of their own position within their fields. Despite this interchange of tactics, while Finney often gets positioned as a trailblazer in the religious field who "should be understood within the context of the emerging "star system" (Smith, 2017, 25), the point is missed that so too should politicians and performers be understood as expanding into the religious field (system) via techniques of Evangelicalism.

In addition, it's notable that this example shows agents of multiple fields using similar tactics to appeal to a large generalized population for growth and advancement before the advent of digital media, and thus foreshadows the triumph of heterodox, commercial, hybrid popular religion" (Turner, 2011) advanced through technologies and politics of globalization. Indeed, not long after Finney's time, preachers such as Samuel Parkes Cadman and Aimee Semple McPherson began applying the techniques developed by Finney first to their own itinerant revival meetings and then to the new media of radio, before passing the baton in the age of TV.

Since these early days of mass media, the coupling of new media technologies with Evangelism has become almost a point of doctrine- in 1968 Christianity Today already mused that "Television is the most effective means of penetrating closed doors and closed minds that the Church has ever had..." ("Outreach to the masses," 1968 cited in Schultze, 1987, 250). The significance of technology to Evangelical traditions is evident not only in tracing it's early adoption of media, but its vast reach since the advent of TV. For instance, there were 1,134 religious radio stations in the United States as of 1986—a 10 percent jump up from 1985— and

while this is impressive, it is nowhere near as impressive as the 100% jump from 104 to1050 in the same year for religious television stations (Schultz, 1987, 246). This both reinforces Butler's arguments about the centrality of religious belief in modern America and situates the depth of embrace with which protestant evangelicals adopted communication technologies and its logics.

In considering these communication technologies, it is important to recall that like all technology, neither mass media nor social media and its contents are created, maintained or reproduced in a valueless vacuum (Smith, 2017), neither economically nor relationally speaking. To this end, I pivot to considering how mediated relationships, especially those between a perceived authority figure (such as a religious leader, politician or celebrity) and their followers, differ from those that are un-mediated, and how media as a socially constructed form of communication imbues certain logics into its content, whatever its "intended" use. A helpful framework for this is found in the distinction between Max Weber's writing on Charisma, and David Diekema's addition of Pseudo-Charisma.

The term Charisma was used by Weber to describe "bearers of specific gifts of body and mind that (could be) considered supernatural" (1978, 352), who through such gifts assist in the satisfying of a group's or individual's "extraordinary needs" (Weber, 1978, 1121). Weber's original theory posited two types of Charisma-the pure and the routinized. In the context of American history, "pure" charismatic leaders and relationships dominated the pre-civil war era, and routinized charisma dominated the post civil war era, before the rise of mediated personalities. For example, Charles Finney would be placed in the category of the routinized charisma on account of the specific, rehearsed methods he used, versus the spontaneous, dissolving mythical bursts which characterize pure charisma. However, with the rise of media, Diekema saw it necessary to add a new type of charisma to account for the temporal-spatial difference that it created (1991). Building on Weber, this new type of charisma- "Pseudo-Charisma" combines the qualities of the "pure" charismatic and the "routinized" charismatic with the distinct elements of the non-present nature of the mediated relationship, the non-reflexive nature of television and the de-contextualization nature of the television medium (Diekema, 1991). The result of these three elements on those receiving the content

put forth by the mediated authority figure is a disorienting quality since "there is no temporal extension, no mutually acknowledged shared past or mutually constructed shared future (which gives) the illusion of intimacy" (Diekema, 1991, 154). Mediated relationships, while still social, do not have the same social quality that exists in real-time interaction and can as such be considered parasocial interactions between real social beings. Parasocial relationships like those between the televangelist and their viewer differ from the itinerant revivals in that the viewer can maintain a sustained routinized relationship with the personality via regular programming of the televangelist, while the televangelist is required to maintain certain points of personality, phrasing and emotional height to maintain a captivated audience.

Prosperity Gospel and The Economics of The American Dream

The intersection of the fields of economics and religion, the evolution of religious history, technology and charisma come together in the modern theology of "The Prosperity Gospel." This theology originated within protestant Evangelicalism in the period after WWII and began to rise just after (and due to) the advent of televangelism with a focus on the healing of the body as obtained through declarations of faith and the authority to "confess and possess" (Bowler, 2013). This authority stemmed from "Laws of Faith" first described by a preacher named Kenneth Hagin, based on legal concepts surrounding the rights of the believer in light of the sacrifice of Jesus which in essence laid out the earthly benefits the believer had access to through commands made "In Jesus' Name." Economic miracles regularly began being confessed alongside healing miracles in the early 50's (Bowler, 2013) alongside ministerial calls for donations from the religious leaders facilitating the healing to their followers. This soon evolved from 'donations' to leaders explicitly asking followers to send in sums of money as "seeds" to signify their faith, and that in exchange for supporting "God's work" they would be blessed with even larger financial/ material blessing. Yet as Bowler points out, the time when this was popularized were the boom years in which many families considered the possibility of home ownership for the first time or were able to enjoy luxuries such as indoor plumbing and electrical appliances, (2013, 62) understood as Capitalism's golden age. Thus she argues that middle class evangelicals came to believe that God had a hand in the economic boom they were experiencing personally while also

expounding faith in the capitalist economic system that was working for them (Bowler, 2013).

The coupling of this golden age of capitalism with theologies of righteousness via material blessings mirrors Turner's own assessment on the relationship between the two: "The growth of consumer society has had a significant impact on religion in terms of providing models for the commodification of religious lifestyles, and much global religiosity involves a complex chemistry of spirituality, individualism and consumerism" (Turner, 2011). Turner's phrasing illustrates that unlike the golden age of capitalism, this theology has not ceased, but remains intertwined with the ethos of the rich American lifestyle. This is especially evident in the impetus towards individualism in the prosperity gospel of the 70's and beyond as described further by Mary Wrenn. Wrenn (2019) explains how when the outcome of an individual's life experience within neoliberalism is beneficial to the individual, it is spiritually explained from the pulpit or the TV/Computer as a manifestation of their faith and harmony with the will of God and how experiencing economic hardship can then be linked to sin, lack of faith or demonic activity rather than directed at structural issues of the economic system itself. In a prosperity gospel embedded in neoliberalism, because each person relies directly on God for their health, wealth and happiness and God alone has the ability to provide for one's needs, it functions to absolve individuals or communities of any sense of responsibility for sustained material support.

While traditional religious institutions and communities depend(ed) upon a style of commitment that was "locally oriented, congregationally based, and characterized by individualism, pragmatism, and moralism... encouraging a limited eclecticism in belief and practice" (Edgell, 2012, 251), the electronic church, increasingly accessed through portable electronic devices in a post-industrial consumer society enables increased individuality and mobility, thus questioning the centrality of congregation and locality to religious experience today. Turner says "there is nothing particularly new about popular religion, but what is important is the global scale and the social impact of such religious commodities" (2011). While faith and even a dominant faith via Spiritual Capital may not be new, there is a new dynamic brought by global communication technologies which increase the scale and scope of its reach into society. Technology complicates

and alters the experience of faith by encouraging the creation of new, more centrally individualistic but globalized conceptions of faith.

Throughout the historical journey laid out so far there has been the allusion or spectre of an interchangeability between the signifiers of power in the religious field and assumed secular fields in American society, without being addressed head-on, which I attempt to do now. Thinking of the interplay between religious values and the greater society (fields) in Bourdieuian terms allows for recognizing greater nuance between different agents and fields. In Western religious terms of attention and political clout, Evangelical christianity appears as a dominant force in the history, production and reproduction of American society as evidenced by its proxy to civil religion and discourses by agents in politics and media.

In accepting the analysis of Bellah (1967) that there exists this "civil Religion" built on biblical/judeo Christian themes and imagery used in such a way as to legitimize, give context or become allegoric for specific moments in American history or for the actions by the representatives of the state

(such as with presidential inaugurations), then we tacitly accept a value producing function (spiritual capital) that can be derived from its application. In addition, the breadth of its application must either go beyond an overt signalling to those in the country that personally engage and/or agree with the religious symbols used in the given context at any given time of its use so as to be permissible to a majority of citizens, or be at minimum banal enough metaphors so as not to be problematic enough to call for their immediate and forth-going from a majority of citizens. As such, there is reason to assume that the same value extracted by way of symbols, imagery and myth in application to the state can be applied to other fields such as media, as well. That is, media organizations and agents who utilize generalized Christian symbols, artifacts, language whether implicitly or explicitly may strengthen their own position in appealing to a diffused Christian base much the same way as George W. Bush, using specific symbols could endear themselves to people on the basis of doctrine that he may or may not personally agree with. In this way evangelicalism as the dominant source of spiritual capital is able to traverse from the category of "popular religion" to "popular culture."

Simultaneously, the Evangelical world has long utilized technologies and techniques arising from and congruent with tastes, techniques and rationales of the capitalist, consumer culture and post-industrial society in which it originated as previously discussed. Where specifically Evangelical forms of Protestant Christianity are embedded in a country's history, civil religion, and in its mass media where both "religious" and "secular" personalities employ similar tactics to build mediated relationships which they profit off of, the lines that separate symbols of religion and secular culture become almost interchangeable. Turner saw such interchangeability in 2011, stating as he looked around and forward that, "In particular, the religious media are well placed to assume a commanding position in the rise of post institutional spirituality in which the new individualism can absorb religious images in producing a new cultural hybridity" (2011). Given this, it is reasonable that as communication technologies fuelled by capitalism evolve and expand, the dominant bearer of Spiritual Capital will have an expanded presence diffused throughout culture over time.

<u>Conclusion and Avenues for Future Research</u> When Evangelical rhetoric and symbols are conceived as a

type of Spiritual Capital situated in American society by terms of Bourdieu's Field Theory, one is able to see the cultural landscape in a new way and can agree with the sentiment of Turner that "Globalized religions (like Evangelical Christianity) are constantly and inevitably drawn into the global circuits of capital insofar as they are themselves converted into lifestyles and into agencies offering commodities and services that cater to the needs of their clients" (2011). Where the term "electronic church" has historically been used to describe programs and services offered through radio and television as extensions of physical churches and ministries, it can (and should) be expanded today to include the vast landscape of digital media-podcasts, websites, email, and social media apps such as Instagram, Facebook, Twitter, etc. Likewise, the title of "televangelist" coined in the 50's in relation to TV preachers, becomes expandable today to any agent who draws upon symbols congruent with Evangelical Christianity within these new media.

While I have taken a more generalized approach in analysing the dynamics of Spiritual Capital in American culture between the dominant protestant Evangelicalism religion and media technologies, I see many opportunities to build on

this work with greater specificity. In particular, the dynamics of Spiritual Capital within the religious field and other cultural fields built on interchangeable symbols can be further analyzed in popular music industries and celebrities. A great inspiration for my own work has come from observing Justin Bieber and Kanye West who both provide the opportunity to observe coexisting capitals (Spiritual and others) in ways unique to an American and globalized music industry and celebrity context. For example, that Bieber peppers his Instagram account with content promoting his personal brand as it relates to music and fashion (Drew House, 2020) as well as "backstage" affirmations and encouragements of Christian faith, and that he has ended concerts (promoted on the basis of the areligious pop music which made him famous) with unoriginal songs created and used in Evangelical worship popular in the 90's (Saunders, 2016), call to mind the tactics of Finney and the parasocial dynamic of pseudo-charisma (Diekema, 1991). Kanye West for his part released a pro-Christianity rap called "Jesus Walks" in 2004 that peaked on (the secular) Billboard's top 100 at #11, and recently his more blatantly Evangelical "Jesus is King" album debuted at number one on Billboard's top 200 (Caulfield, 2019). The continued and indeed enhanced level of stardom

and success both individuals experience in a "secular" music celebrity media complex by use of (and not in spite of) their evangelical signalling complements my own analysis that the mutual embrace of evangelicalism and media has produced profits for both fields. Insomuch as the dissemination of knowledge and symbols flows from the institution into the objectified and the embodied, the religious values and meanings disseminated by American evangelical agents become intertwined with the economic values imbedded in the communication technologies as products of capitalism, and by the same logic the economic values imbued in technologies birthed by capitalism become intertwined with the meaning and values disseminated by the religious agents who use them.

References

Bellah, R. (1967). Civil Religion in America. Journal of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, 96(1), 1-21.

Bourdieu, E. (1986). The Forms of Capital. Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education. (pp. 241-258). Greenwood

Bourdieu, E. (1993). The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature. Columbia University Press

Bourdieu, P. (2005). Political Field, the Social Science Field, and the Journalistic Field. Bourdieu and the Journalistic Field. (pp. 29-47). Polity

Bowler, K. (2013). Blessed: A History of the American Prosperity Gospel. Oxford University Press. http:// www.oxfordscholarship.com/view/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199827695.001.0001/acprof-9780199827695.

Butler, J. (2004). Jack-in-the-Box Faith: The Religion Problem in Modern American History. Journal of American History, 90(4), 1357–78. https://doi.org/10.2307/3660356.

Caulfield, K. (2019, November 29). Kanye West's 'Jesus Is King' Album Aiming for No. 1 Debut on Billboard 200 Chart. Billboard. https://www.billboard.com/articles/business/chart-beat/8540937/kanye-wests-jesus-is-king-albumforecast-no-1-debut Cooperman, A. (2004, September 16). The Washington Post: Bush Leaves Specifics of His Faith to Speculation. NBC News. http://www.nbcnews.com/id/6014570/ ns/us_news-washington_post/t/bush-leaves-specifics his-faith-speculation/.

Diekema, D. A. (1991). Televangelism and the Mediated Charismatic Relationship. The Social Science Journal, 28(2), 143–62. https://doi.org/10.1016/0362-3319(91)90001-K.

The House of Drew. (n.d.) Drew House. https://thehou-seofdrew.com/.

Edgell, P. (2012). A Cultural Sociology of Religion: New Directions. Annual Review of Sociology, 38, 247–265.

Marx, K. (1990). Capital: A Critique of Political Economy. Penguin Books Limited.

O'Hara, D. (2000). Capitalism and Culture: Bourdieu's Field Theory. Amerikastudien / American Studies, 45(1), 43–53. Saunders, M. (2016). Bieber Sings Delirious? Six Other Musical Acts and the Worship Songs They Should Cover. Christianity Today. https://www.christiantoday.com/article/ bieber-sings-delirious-heres-six-other-musical-acts-and-theworship-songs-they-should-cover/96123.html.

Schultze, Q. J. (1987). The Mythos of the Electronic Church. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 4(3), 245. https:// doi.org/10.1080/15295038709360134.

Smith, T. A. (2017). Political Theology through a History of

Preaching: A Study in the Authority of Celebrity. Homiletic (Online), 42(1), 18–34.

Turner, B. (2011). Religion and Modern Society: Citizenship, Secularisation and the State. Cambridge University Press.

Verter, B. (2003). Spiritual Capital: Theorizing Religion with Bourdieu against Bourdieu. Sociological Theory, 21(2), 150– 74. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9558.00182.

Weber, M. (1978). Economy and Society. University of California Press.

Wrenn, M. V. (2019). Consecrating Capitalism: The United States Prosperity Gospel and Neoliberalism. Journal of Economic Issues (Taylor & Francis Ltd), 53(2), 425-32.

Chapter X

Mediating Identity Through an Instagram Filter: The Nuances of Instagram Usage Among Montreal's Undergraduate Students

Written By: Mor Aragman

Chapter X Written By: Mor Aragman

By existing within a society that recognizes and cherishes individualism as an unwavering state of being, Instagram has grown into something much more meaningful and revealing than simply a social network through which individuals post photos and interact with others. The photo and video-sharing application's ubiquity among contemporary Western societies and embeddedness in mainstream culture and mundane life is indicative of its significant role in its users' lives and identities. Instagram launched in 2010 and quickly became increasingly user friendly and added more features allowing its users to easily create, edit, and share content while also interacting with other users and their content. With over a third of all social media users, approximately 800 million people, using Instagram as one of their main social networking tools ("How Many People Use Instagram?," 2017), it has undoubtedly embedded itself into contemporary culture of today's digital age. According to Bloomberg Intelligence, the platform's estimated value is over \$100 billion, indicating a 100-fold increase since it was purchased by Facebook in 2012 (McCormick, 2018). This pronounced increase in the application's global usage and popularity marks a clear desire among individuals today to share photos and interact with others. Part of the reason behind this phenomenon of Instagram as a necessary part of modern life is related to humankind's contemporary focus on individualism, identity, and the link between the two. It is inevitable that individuals are inherently self-interested, and this is reflected in their use of social media. But this medium does not exist in a vacuum, and thus our online performances and negotiation of identity emerge through various frameworks and systems that both challenge these processes and enable them to occur, which will be further elucidated through the following research.

This research engages with literature from the anthropology of identity, as it accentuates the process of identity negotiation that an online presence entails, as well as digital anthropology and anthropology of performance. These bodies of literature will further illustrate the relatedness of online and offline spheres, as demonstrated by participants in the following study. Though there is already a substantial amount of research on the relationship between identity formation and negotiation and the digital world, most of it focuses on applications like Facebook and Twitter, and less on Instagram; thus, this research on Instagram evidently contributes to the pre-existing identity-social media discourse. This research is relevant in terms of the significance and omnipresence of Instagram in contemporary societies in Montreal and beyond. However, its relevance extends past its users, as the research addresses anthropological questions concerning identity that have been posed for decades, such as Erving Goffman's dramaturgical approach to identity and Judith Butler's model of performativity. This research will examine the phenomenon of the "finstagram" account, often shortened to "finsta," which is a portmanteau of the words "fake" and "Instagram", as this is extremely common among undergraduate students who use Instagram, and will likely offer a new and interesting perspective on notions of privacy, intimacy, and Goffman's notion of frontstage and backstage. Additionally, Butler's theory of performativity offers a concrete framework through which to analyze the research participants' use of the platform in shaping their daily negotiations of identity. Montreal's undergraduate students essentially act as agents in the navigation and constant renegotiation of their identities through a myriad of nuanced processes facilitated by Instagram and its features. They do so in terms of their sexuality and sexual identity, freedom and constraints, and the ways in which they use the platform's features strategically.

The topic of sexuality and sexual identity as explored and expressed through Instagram has emerged as notably pertinent to this argument through the research process, and thus the anthropology of sexuality will be discussed as well. Research participants were recruited using a public Instagram story. A few were selected from those who responded, based on who seemed the most keen and reliable. Their level of interest was revealed in a short conversation following their response to the Instagram story, and they seemed to be genuinely fascinated by the research topic and were eager to help. After meeting the selected participants for the first time, it became clear who would be consistently committed and reliable throughout the research process, thus narrowing down the number of participants even more. Two of the participants were selected based on previous observations of their Instagram activity, which made them stand out as being potentially interesting and significant to this research.

By chance, three out of the four participants happen to be queer, and brought up the relationship between their queerness and their experiences on Instagram of their own accord. The fourth participant, who did not explicitly identify as queer, spoke in depth about their sexuality without being prompted to do so. The participants' sexuality was not considered as a factor in whether or not they would be selected, and was not immediately evident through observing their Instagram activity. Because all the participants prioritized their sexuality and/or sexual identity when describing their negotiation of identity through Instagram, it was determined that this topic would be included as one of the research foci. It is important to note that the pool of potential participants consisted entirely of individuals who were already following my personal account. This of course indicates that diversity among those selected as research participants was limited. The experiences described in this thesis thus represent a very specific set of lived experiences and opinions, rather than a general reflection of queerness on Instagram. The goal of this research is not to attempt to represent the interconnectivity of identity and Instagram in general, but to show how the two are linked through the intimate and deeply personal experiences of various individuals. The names of the participants have been changed to maintain their anonymity.

The research methodology entailed becoming further acquainted with the selected participants through informal participant observation, which consisted of meeting with them, both one on one as well as with others in a space in which they felt comfortable. After getting to know them better, formal interviews were conducted in which they were asked specific questions about their use of Instagram, their own understandings of their everchanging relationship with Instagram throughout the lifetime of their online persona, and their views on Instagram as a vehicle in their identity negotiation and construction. While research was conducted in person, digital ethnography was also utilized by consistently observing the participants' activity on Instagram throughout several weeks; this included taking note of their presentation of self through their posts and through their stories, and of their engagements with others through the application. Conducting research through both digital and physical fieldwork was crucial in the pursuit to observe the participants' online and offline selves, but also an effort to elucidate the interrelatedness of online and offline worlds in contemporary societies and the increasingly blurry boundaries between the

two (Ardévol & Gómez-Cruz, 2014). Effectively conducting digital research entails not only observing participants' online personas and how they choose to present themselves through their use of Instagram, but also interacting with one's participants digitally which creates an additional, digital dimension to the researcher-participant relationship (Ardévol & Gómez-Cruz, 2014). Not only does this deepen the researcher's understanding of their participants' online identities, but it allows the researcher to extend their relationship with their participants into all the realms in which they are conducting their research, further enriching the research process and adding nuance to the research experience on both ends. During the physical participant observation and interview sessions, elements of digital ethnography were incorporated by viewing the participants' Instagram accounts and profiles with them, asking them questions about specific photos they had posted and using their online self-presentation as a means of guiding a conversation surrounding their offline self-presentation. Theo Van Leeuwen & Carey Jewitt (2011) suggest doing so in The Handbook of Visual Analysis, as this allows participants to carefully observe and explore the context of their own content and offer an insider's perspective, deepening the researcher's analysis and under-
standing of the material. Using specific methods of digital ethnography in conjunction with a normative approach to anthropological ethnography allowed for a deeper examination and definition of the subtleties inherent to the participants' online and offline construction and negotiation of identity.

This thesis aims to shed light on the distinct and nuanced ways in which some of Montreal's undergraduate students negotiate and manifest their sexuality and sexual identity through their use of Instagram, as well as how this expression of sexuality can be interpreted as performative. Their experiences of Instagram include navigating various spheres of intimacy, as well as notions of authenticity and a prioritization or rejection of certain aesthetics. The research participants discuss encountering feelings of empowerment and disempowerment through digital validation and their engagements with their own bodies through Instagram. Different strategic uses of the social networking platform are employed in order to gain agency, heighten mindfulness, and revisit embodied experiences. The participants' digital existences exemplify the ways in which Instagram uplifts its users in their negotiation and expression of identity in very

personalized ways.

Chapter 1: Sexuality and Sexual Identity

This chapter will highlight the various ways in which the participants either exercise their sexual freedom through Instagram or use Instagram as a vehicle in negotiating and expressing their queerness, or a combination of both. These processes are undoubtedly significant to the formation and navigation of one's identity, and their interconnectedness with Instagram demonstrates the platform's ability to grant its users agency and freedom in their self-expression. Throughout interactions with the participants, it became clear that the majority experienced their queerness, and even came to terms with it or became more comfortable with it, through the use of Instagram. This chapter also explores the idea of various definitions and degrees of intimacy encountered and constructed by users through the online platform.

<u>1.1 Exploring and Expressing Queerness</u>

The majority of the participants spoke about the evolution of their queerness in tandem with their evolving presence on Instagram. Tyler is a 20-year-old anthropology student at

Concordia who is passionate about what he studies and values the meaningful connections he has cultivated with other queer people, both in Montreal and globally, through the Internet. In a candid conversation that was later used as research data, Tyler discussed his struggles of coming to terms with his homosexuality as a teenager living in a small town with an absence of queer representation. He found himself feeling isolated from those around him due to his inability to relate to them, and his social life was therefore situated online. Within this digital sphere, Tyler felt as though he could express himself in a way that felt natural, contrasting his tendency to shield and repress his authentic identity in real life. He surrounded himself with a community of queer online users that enabled him to truly be himself. Tyler explained that he first came out as gay by making an Instagram post, since he felt that this was the easiest way to reach most of the people he was surrounded by in real life. This shows how Instagram can be used by queer individuals to ease into their sexuality in a way that is comfortable to them. Due to the fact that Tyler's social life was wholly established online through Instagram and Tumblr, another online social networking site operating through the posting and reposting of photos and text posts, he felt an overwhelming pressure to

curate the ideal version of himself and put it on display. This version of himself was founded in Tyler's conceptions of coolness and queerness that were ultimately a reflection of the content he consumed digitally throughout his formative years, as he spent most of them online. Tyler explained that the online media he consumed came from a more "obscure corner of the Internet," including content shared by Instagram users that would be deemed non-normative, edgy, and radical by those living in his hometown. The content he shared in order to construct his online persona was thus comparable to the media he consumed.

Tyler's idea of desirability from which he developed his ideal self was compounded of extractions from representations of queerness and individuality that he identified with online. Since he had no way of extracting elements of queerness and individuality from his real life, due to his conservative surroundings, Tyler was compelled to explore his queer identity online, and to learn about what his queerness meant to him through observing other online users' personal experiences and expressions of queerness that they chose to share. Through his observations, Tyler discovered his individuality and unveiled his queerness while meticulously crafting an online version of himself that combined other online users' representations of queerness and individuality. For Tyler, part of growing up in a small town was that many of those around him shared similar perspectives and expressed themselves in similar ways, and Tyler was keen on differentiating himself from them.

In fact, the process of curating this online persona facilitated Tyler becoming the person he wanted to be, in a way that could not be fulfilled in real life, due to his restrictive environment. Due to these limitations that existed within his physical sphere, he used Instagram to digitally enact his authentic self: "I could kind of just post whatever I wanted... since most of the people I was interacting with on Instagram were people I had met through the Internet and the more people that followed me that had never met me and who only knew this person. [There was] a lot more freedom." Tyler felt liberated in his digital self-expression, especially since he felt that his online self was more authentically him than his offline self. Today, he is comfortable with his queerness both online and offline, and no longer feels the need or the desire to build a persona online that is not congruent with his true self. However, he still uses Instagram to maintain his connections with other gay men across the world, as he explained that there is a network of gay men globally who follow each other despite having never met.

Jesse Fox and Rachel Ralston's (2017) article discusses the freedom and agency afforded to queer individuals by online social networking platforms, since they allow these individuals to learn about their queerness through personalized means, just as Tyler did. This means that queer online users can choose their level of exposure and integration into the queer community, that they have control over the interactions they choose to engage in, and that they can express themselves in whatever means necessary as they merge their online and offline queer identities (Fox & Ralston, 2016). Tyler chose to connect with other queer men globally, which further affirmed his queer identity and continues to bring him a sense of belonging. Reflecting Fox and Ralston's idea of the merging of one's online and offline identities, Tyler eventually combined his online self with his offline self once he was situated in a physical environment that nurtured his queer identity and allowed it to flourish.

Amelie, another participant who identifies as queer, described

her journey of coming to terms with her queerness-after being raised in a heteronormative environment where queerness was not represented within the public social sphereas shaping and being shaped by her presence on Instagram. Amelie is a 22-year-old woman who finds a sense of purpose in uplifting marginalized individuals. She does so by making sure their voices are heard and by educating those around her who are less cognizant of the ways in which institutionalized systems of power consistently denigrate and alienate people of colour, those in the LGBTQ+ community, disabled people, and others who suffer the consequences of living in a predominantly white patriarchal heteronormative society. She is also constantly working to unlearn harmful ways of thinking that permeated the community in which she was socialized. The ways in which Amelie uses Instagram reinforce her existence as a queer woman through her ability to project an image of herself as unmistakably queer, in her eyes, and to have this image be positively perceived and accepted by others through unambiguous validation. Throughout her participation in the study, she continually expressed her gratitude toward the online platform and the comfort and confidence it has afforded her in her self-identity and her queerness, both of which she has struggled to

feel secure with in the past. Amelie expresses and explores her queerness through Instagram by posting pictures that she feels portray her as explicitly queer, which not only is a form of self-expression for her, but is also a means of disrupting heteronormative values that marked her upbringing, and continue to persist within the neighborhood she lives in today. By doing so, she reinforces her own queer identity and sense of security within this identity.

Nora is a 21-year-old McGill student who deeply values the connection she shares with her family, attributing who she is to the positive and encouraging household in which she was raised. She sees her queerness as being central to her identity along with her mental illness, as both dictate how she understands herself and navigates the world around her. Through her attempt at blogging on her Instagram account, where she would post product reviews, Nora learned that though she did not enjoy writing with materialistic intent, she had a passion for writing about intimate parts of herself that were not on display on her social media accounts. This included delving into her queer identity and expressing it publicly in a way that was meaningful to her and allowed her to articulate thoughts and processes pertinent to her identity that she

had previously kept private. Through Instagram, she formed connections with other users, one of whom offered her a job writing for an online platform built on notions of inclusivity, intersectionality, and representing and uplifting members of the LGBTQ+ community. This opportunity to explore and express her queerness in a public forum, and to be compensated for it, gave Nora a sense that these experiences are not only valid, but valuable to other queer individuals. Instagram has allotted Nora the opportunity to feel heard and understood as a queer woman, which has been integral to her process of shaping and navigating her own identity.

1.2 Sexuality as Performance

The topic of sexuality was highlighted by half of the participants as something they actively engage with through their Instagram persona. Ava is a 20-year-old McGill student who prides herself on her tendency to express and love herself publicly and unabashedly, as well as on her ability to fluently articulate her thoughts, needs, and desires to those around her. She is passionate about uplifting those who are marginalized, and works to bring social justice issues to the forefront in everyday conversations. She described her relationship with her body throughout her Instagram lifetime as turbulent, as she has suffered with body image issues and body dysmorphia since she was a teenager, and retrospectively recognized the ways in which her relationship with her body is reflected through her online activity. Through her oscillating conceptions of her body, she noticed that during the times in which she felt more confident, she began posting more sexually explicit content on her page, which further reinforced this confidence. Expressing her sexuality on a public platform allows Ava to appreciate her body and herself as a sexual being without experiencing feelings of shame or uncertainty, which she had been accustomed to due to her battles with body dysmorphia. Though this is not a battle that she has completely conquered and though she still struggles with body image issues, presenting herself as sexual and unashamed of her sexuality online has ultimately impacted her relationship with her body and her sexuality offline.

Here, Butler's model of performativity can be used to further examine Ava's presentations of sexuality through her Instagram. Butler explains her theory of performativity in relation to the gendered body as she states that it does not merely exist as an internal, essential part of oneself, but rather as the repetitive embodiment of a way of being which relies on and reproduces a historical situation. Applying her definition of performativity to the sexualized body, one's existence as a sexualized being is engendered by way of repetitive action and the reproduction of pre-existing beliefs pertaining to sexuality; it is in this way that Ava's online negotiation of her sexuality in relation to her body produces real-life effects. Her sexually explicit posts mirror ideas pertaining to sexuality and femininity that are widespread among contemporary Western societies, such as the notion of re-appropriating one's body through publicly displaying it in overtly intimate and personal ways, and the idea of self-empowerment and control over one's own sexuality in the face of patriarchal hegemony both online and offline. While she is reproducing pre-existing ideas of sexuality and femininity through her online self-presentation, she is also using these photos to reconstruct and renegotiate her own ideas about herself and her body. Ava explained that her body image issues stem from watching her mother struggle with these same issues from a young age, as well as disordered eating imposed on her by her family for much of her life. As a teenager, Ava's eating habits had a lot of leverage over her and her perception of her body, and she continued to actively battle patterns of

disordered eating into her adulthood. She began eating intuitively while dating her ex-boyfriend, but eventually "went off the rails and broke down the rules [she] had created for [herself] surrounding food...it wasn't healthy." Ava now feels that she engages with food in a healthier way, which impacts her body image. After leaving her toxic relationship, she explained that "catering to Instagram and liking Instagram more was also a way for [her] to take space that [she] hadn't been taking before...because [she] was repressing and repressed." Posting sexually explicit photos of her body on her Instagram thus reinforced her newfound perception of herself as an individual who has control over her own body and her own sexuality. While body image issues that have been present throughout the majority of her life continue to affect her, Ava has found solace in presenting herself as a shamelessly sexually liberated woman on Instagram.

Similarly, Niels Van Doorn's 2011 article "Digital Spaces, Material Traces: How Matter Comes To Matter In Online Performances of Gender, Sexuality And Embodiment" analyzes the significance of gender, sexuality, and embodiment through a digital lens, as he assesses the notion of virtuality and how this contributes to the actualization of these

three factors. Van Doorn argues that gender, sexuality, and embodiment are directly and essentially related to virtuality, and thus need to be performed repeatedly in order to gain significance in physical and digital environments. The publicization and consequent concretization of individuals' gendered and embodied experiences in a public digital sphere lead to the reshaping of how they retroactively experience themselves as gendered and embodied beings, precisely as these experiences transform into publicly and culturally mediated memories. Ava's embodied experiences of her womanhood and sexuality are transcribed onto her public Instagram page, thus rendering them tangible both for herself as well as for all those who follow her or visit her page. These concretized self-expressions are imbued with her own sentiments toward herself and her body, which consequently results in the concretization of these sentiments on her end. The sentiments re-emerge when she revisits these photos, actively influencing how she sees herself as a gendered and sexual individual. These tangible embodiments become part of a larger sphere of embodied experiences and memories as they appear on other users' timelines among photos posted by other users. Ava's embodied experiences of her gender and sexuality become public and are thus concretized, giving

them the power to reshape how she views herself, according to Van Doorn (2011).

1.3 Forms of Intimacy

Notions of publicness versus privacy as well as intimacy were part of this initial research design, and they remain relevant to it. The research process has elucidated that intimacy exists in various forms in the eyes of the participants and in relation to the public and the private, but also that the interconnected relationship between publicness and privacy appears to be more complex and nuanced through networked digital media (Lüders, 2007). The two are not dichotomized, but are rather interlinked through online processes that breach barriers between the two and generate leniency in defining each of these concepts (Lüders, 2007). All of the participants use either the "close friends story" feature on Instagram, which allows them to post a story that will only show up on the feeds of a selected group of users, or have a second or even third "finsta" account. However, some users have both a "close friends" list as well as a "finsta," and almost all the participants use each feature in different ways and for different purposes. Erving Goffman's dramaturgical approach to identity describes one's presentation of self

as being fragmented based on the frontstage and backstage arenas in life, where the frontstage demands a performance of identity while the backstage allows one to abandon the façade and be their authentic self. It could be argued, however, that there are multiple frontstages and multiple backstages, as seen through the participants' various understandings of public and private, and the complexities of projecting their intimacies.

The term "finsta" is ironically characterized by authenticity rather than fakeness, as many Instagram users create this second account as an outlet and as a way to connect with only those whom they consider to be their close friends. This phenomenon is seen as a means of escaping the pressures associated with maintaining one's main Instagram account, since many feel that "an aura of inauthenticity pervades the [application]" (Shah, 2017). In an article written about finstagram, Sabiq Shah explains that there are unspoken rules pertaining to Instagram that dictate how many use the platform and what kind of content they post, often aiming to uphold an image of perfection, which is what prompted the conception of the finstagram account. It has become so widespread that it is now expected of younger Instagram users, mostly girls, to have this second account where they defy the rules of a traditional Instagram account, which often includes posting unflattering photos, photos that have not been edited, and silly or embarrassing content that will only be understood by your closest friends (Herber, 2015). The rise of such a phenomenon speaks to the nature of Instagram and the way it has grown into a tool for curating one's self image and projecting an idealized version of oneself. Paired with Instagram's story archiving feature, which will be further discussed later on, one has the ability to collect memories and embodied experiences characterized by unfiltered vulnerability and intimacy both through the content they post to their finsta accounts and their finsta stories.

While the majority of the participants use their finsta and the "close friends story" feature to share more personal moments, photos, experiences, and memories with their close friends, many of them either conflate this platonic intimacy with sexual intimacy, or compartmentalize these aspects of their online existence. Tyler's case is especially interesting as he differentiated between his finsta account and his close friends based on his personal constructions of the notion of intimacy. On his finsta account, he shares photos, both

to his page and to his story, that he finds amusing, silly, and trivial, and that he does not think his followers on his main Instagram account would care to see. His finsta is a place where he can post content completely freely with no need to censor himself or curate his feed at all; he explained that he has always held the mindset that one can never worry too much about the content they post on their finsta, and if they do then they are "taking it way too far." Tyler's finsta is thus an unfiltered and, according to him, a more accurate version of his life than his main account. He contrasts this version of intimacy and privacy with his use of his "close friends story," where he posts sexually explicit photos geared toward the gay men with whom he has previously engaged with sexually online who constitute his "close friends" list. While these men are not his genuine close friends, he explained that he created this private arena to share his nude photos in order to get validation, and because he knows the users on this list will appreciate them. Tyler does not see this instance of photo-sharing as intimate, though most would, since he has always been comfortable with his body and asserts that he considers it to be "just a body." However, there is still an element of sexuality inherent to his use of his "close friends story" since he shares these photos solely

with men with whom he has interacted sexually and not his real close friends.

Ava has two separate finsta accounts, one of which is followed by her close friends in real life and presents a version of herself that she would consider to be the most authentic, as it depicts funny, sad, important, traumatic, and mundane moments of her life, essentially capturing the nuanced nature of individuals. Ava has cultivated a safe and private space where she can both express and present herself in a vulnerable and cathartic way, and where she can interact with those she cares about most all at once. Her second finsta consists solely of sexually explicit photos, but since she has recently begun posting similar content on her main account, this finsta account has been relatively inactive. Ava's three distinct Instagram accounts are representative of her distinction between publicness and privacy, and her more recent switch to using only two accounts is emblematic of her differing views of intimacy. In her case, similarly to Tyler's case, being intimate on a platonic level occupies a higher degree of intimacy and vulnerability than expressing oneself through sexual intimacy.

Nora has both a "close friends" list as well as a finsta, but does not differentiate between the two in terms of their purpose or use. Nora uses her finsta account similarly to Tyler and Ava, in that she posts content that is more personal to her identity or that she finds silly, but she also feels more comfortable being explicitly queer within this online space. Both her "close friends story" as well as her finsta represent glimpses into aspects of her personal identity, such as her queerness, that her main account does not offer. "I entered the finsta world gay," she explained, and noted that the finsta she uses currently includes significantly more queer content than her first finsta, since she began using it around the time she started dating her girlfriend and expanding her queer friend group, thus becoming more comfortable with her own queerness: "I just feel more...myself the more I grow up and grow into my queerness." Nora's various online sites of intimacy display a progression of comfortability in her own queerness, and consequently a progression of intimacy.

The purpose behind finsta accounts is ultimately cultivating an online space wherein one feels comfortable disclosing personal information and narrating their life in the most authentic and unfiltered way possible. This act of narration,

along with the element of interaction that is integral to self-presentation with one's finsta account, as seen through the participants' use of their own finsta accounts, is crucial to the exploration of identity and sense of self (Bamberg, 2011). While the content posted on the participants' finsta accounts is significant in the formation of their online identities, the ways in which they navigate processes of narration and the construction of agency are key in their identity negotiation and construction (Bamberg, 2011). Having a finsta account allows users to narrate their life in ways that differ from their narration techniques on their main accounts. This differentiation in storytelling techniques denotes the clear fragmentation of identity through using multiple accounts. Having the ability to narrate one's life in both of these ways, to two distinct sets of followers, has proven to be integral through this research, as users feel they are able to exercise agency in how they present their daily lives.

The various conceptions of publicness, privacy, and intimacy present among the participants elucidates the theory of multiple frontstages and backstages as an extension of Goffman's dramaturgical theory, where the frontstage demands a performance of identity while the backstage allows one to

abandon the façade and be their authentic self. The participants' experiences concerning intimacy, privacy, and publicness on Instagram allude to a more complex formulation of Goffman's theory, wherein there exist many degrees of publicness and privacy rather than two dichotomous realms. However, these various forms do not simply exist on a spectrum between extreme publicness and extreme privacy, but are rather multidimensional and not necessarily mutually exclusive, as they may share various elements and may be manifested in similar ways, but through diverging circumstances. It is through this reconstructed framework of Goffman's theory that we may begin to understand the underlying nuances of expressions of privacy and publicness on Instagram.

Chapter 2: Freedom and Constraint

The notions of freedom and constraint as experienced through one's online presence on Instagram came forward as complementing one another, or working in conjunction with one another, rather than as dichotomous. Examining the participants' uses of Instagram through the lens of freedom and constraint has allowed for a critical reflection of the implications of specific processes and experiences pertinent to the construction and negotiation of identity both online and offline to emerge and has framed some of the tensions revealed by this research.

2.1 Authenticity and Aesthetics

There is a clear need among the participants to maintain a sense of authenticity though their online performance, but this need largely coincides with a desire to preserve a sense of consistency in terms of the aesthetic design of one's Instagram page. Through the research it has become clear that authenticity and aesthetics are in fact not mutually exclusive, and can often work to reinforce or reflect one another.

Throughout the lifetime of Ava's online persona, she has had both freeing and constraining experiences on Instagram, and continues to experience both in conjunction with one another. The beginning of her Instagram journey was marked by visually pleasing and coordinated landscape photos, as well as a considerably prolonged execution of a black and white theme on her page, all facilitated through a separate application she used to balance the tones and colours of her photos with one another in her quest for what she conceived to be a "perfect theme." Her process of self-presentation during this time was thus limiting both in terms of her online presence and her experiences of real life- she could not live her life simply on her own terms, but only through those regulating her Instagram persona. Now that Ava has grown into her identity and is able to comfortably and confidently present who she is online, she does not maintain a specific aesthetic, but she noted that certain things still bother her, such as having two pictures with the same content and similar framing directly adjacent to one another on her page. To her, this does not represent a constraint in the way that it used to, but is simply indicative of the fact that she is still someone who is driven by aesthetics. However, now that Ava has the tools and self-security to relay this detail to aesthetic and other facets of her identity in other ways, she does not feel restricted and limited by her Instagram aesthetic in the way she used to.

Amelie discussed her need to be both authentic in terms of aspects of her identity that are meaningful to her, while also maintaining a consistent design or aesthetic on her Instagram page. Her authenticity is emphasized by her queer expressions and opposes her previous tendency to blend in and adhere to the norms of the heteronormative neighborhood in which she grew up. Amelie also aims to be authentic in her passion for social and political justice and uplifting marginalized communities through posting more educational and sometimes radical content. She places importance on the appearance of her page, since she values and is driven by aesthetic, and thus has a specific protocol in terms of the content she posts to her profile. Amelie sees herself as disrupting heteronormative values associated with her upbringing, but also through her strict representation of self. In her case, becoming comfortable with her queerness and self-identity was reflected in the effort she put into maintaining her aesthetic design. A lack of attention to aesthetic characterized a lack of security in who she was, but now that she has found herself, Amelie is able to properly display this through her attention to detail on her Instagram page.

Sonja Vivienne's 2015 book Digital Identity and Everyday Activism: Sharing Private Stories with Networked Publics focuses on digital storytelling through a framework of everyday activism and non-normative identity formation and presentation. The implications of projecting vulnerable aspects of one's identity, particularly if this identity deviates

from normative societal standards in any way, into a potentially volatile public space are presented as everyday activism through a presentation of self, since it challenges the status quo and gradually reshapes social norms through networked publics (Vivienne, 2015). Ava and Amelie share this process of non-normative identity presentation in different ways, but both use it as a storytelling function within the digital sphere. By challenging normative ideas of existing online, not only do they aim to reshape their online environment, but they also aim to present themselves as being directly associated with this process of everyday activism. Engaging in the act of storytelling entails documenting and recording one's life in an attempt to make oneself visible, heard, and hopefully understood. The participants' experiences and feelings toward the way in which they present their lives to others through Instagram on a daily basis attest to the fact that transforming one's own embodied experiences into external artefacts render them real, and thus they have the ability to influence one's negotiation of identity. The participants express that they feel empowered and liberated by the act of engaging in storytelling publicly in a way that feels authentic to them.

Ava's storytelling techniques are non-normative in that they break barriers usually in place on Instagram, since the content she posts to her stories is not regulated by the unspoken rules that many adhere to in order to conform to standards of "acceptable" self-presentation. She is not afraid to cross these boundaries and post content for herself, even though others may not deem it appropriate for a public main Instagram account. Meanwhile, Amelie defines her storytelling process as non-normative in that it diverges from the content posted by those whom she grew up with, and deviates from the collective heteronormative patriarchal mindset that dominated her upbringing. Her non-normative storytelling brings awareness to issues plaguing marginalized communities, and often results in other users replying to her stories with disapproval or, contrastingly, thanking her for changing their perspective and educating them on an issue they were not previously informed on. Both Amelie and Ava's storytelling techniques allow other users to understand them better as individuals, as their stories emphasize how they define themselves as individuals and accentuate the issues and topics that are meaningful to their identities. Vivienne describes these processes of storytelling as pertaining to everyday activism as they challenge the norm and contribute to

the expansion and diversification of publicly and culturally mediated narratives.

2.3 The Body With and Without a Filter

Ava, Amelie, and Nora have struggled with body image issues through their teenage and adult lives and continue to confront them through what and how they choose to post on Instagram. All three used to abstain from posting pictures of their bodies, their faces, as a result of their battles with body dysmorphia and of their discontentment toward the appearance of their bodies. They gradually began posting pictures of themselves, but this process was still limiting as these pictures were catering to a specific gaze. Once they began posting pictures of themselves with the purpose of showing themselves off or simply existing as human beings with bodies, they began to stop using filters.

During participant observation sessions, Ava explored the timeline of her Instagram page as beginning with various landscape photos and a clear absence of photos of herself, all having a filter applied to them. Following this phase was a slow integration of "selfies" and photos of Ava's face and body without a filter applied to them, but depicting her fil-

tering herself, she explained. Finally, we arrived at the current phase of her Instagram presence where her page consists of photos of herself, both selfies and sexually explicit photos, her friends, and anything that is meaningful to her, all unfiltered both in the figurative and literal sense; these photos depict the most free and authentic version of her identity. Here we notice two phenomena: the different degrees and conceptions of filtering oneself and one's content through Instagram, and the steady progression from concealing to revealing oneself on Instagram. Ava draws parallels between events in her real life that caused her to feel restricted and her restricted use of Instagram as a teenager, as well as transitional periods wherein she grew deeper into her own identity and found freedom in real life and her consequent freeing use of Instagram as a young adult. The transition of the content on her Instagram page from a lack of photos of herself to the consistent representation of her body in an intimate context concretizes her offline passage into freedom. While it is clear that these real-life events influenced her online identity, she also believes that enacting this freedom online has reinforced her freedom in her offline identity, exemplifying Butler's model of performativity.

Amelie made it clear that she suffers from body image issues and has recently gone through a drastic weight loss, leaving her feeling more confident, but still struggling to relate and find comfort in the appearance of her body. The beginning of her Instagram journey was also marked by a lack of photos of herself, which she eventually overcame by beginning to post photos of herself with others, but never alone. She described her weight loss as having elevated her sense of security in herself as well as in her queerness, as this is when she began dressing in a way that made her feel equally confident and queer, and inevitably confident in her queerness. It is during this time that she began posting photos of herself and her body alone, often highlighting her overtly queer way of dressing, and always without a filter. She stated that she posts photos of herself to show herself off, which reflects her newfound confidence and sense of security in her identity. She actively makes an effort to depict herself as obviously queer, further reinforcing her confidence in her queer identity. Sofia Caldeira looks at Instagram users, and sees them as authors of their own identity, as they are awarded with the opportunity of constantly inventing and reinventing themselves through their agentive contribution to the social media network, with its identity-driven functions and tools that allow individuals to embrace their individuality and online presentation of self. She discusses the emergence of the selfie, and its rapid popularization as a way of celebrating oneself online (Caldeira, 2016). Amelie's decision to post photos of her body and without a filter emphasizes her development into a freer version of herself, as she no longer felt the need to censor her content or conceal her body, which was ultimately limiting in terms of her expressing her authentic identity and her queerness.

Nora's struggles with body dysmorphia have affected her for the majority of her life, and her early exposure to societal pressures of conforming to a specific body type, due to her all-girls private schooling in an upper-class neighborhood, reinforced her pre-existing body image issues. She and her classmates would often post photos of themselves and their bodies to Instagram with the intention of attracting male attention, which, to Nora, was a clear display of inauthenticity and a form of undermining their real interests and identities. But as a teenager, her priority was to conform to this materialistic culture and to be guided by the overarching pressure of maintaining one's social media presence in a particular way. Eventually switching schools and removing herself from this toxic environment improved Nora's relationship with her body, but her body dysmorphia persisted. Today, it is still something she battles with constantly, but she is no longer afraid of posting photos of her body on her Instagram, especially since she does so on her own terms now rather than catering to a gaze or to specific body norms. Through her offline practices of mindfulness and expressing gratitude toward her body for all it does for her, Nora's online persona has grown more comfortable and freer in displaying her body publicly.

<u>Chapter 3: Self-Growth Through Specific Instagram</u> <u>Uses</u>

While the participants are inherently involved in a process of identity negotiation and renegotiation solely through their use of Instagram alone, meaning through processes and performances that may not have a determined purpose, they are also engaging in this process by employing strategic uses within the platform itself and through conscious decisions. This chapter highlights the distinct agency that Instagram users have, recognize, and exercise to their advantage in their navigation of the social media network.

3.1 Mindful and Mindless Usage of Instagram

The participants all felt that they tend to become wrapped up in Instagram due to how easy it is to use in addition to the often mind-numbing effect of a continual scroll through an overwhelming amount of content and audiovisual stimuli. It is for this reason that the majority of the participants have been more vigilant in their use of the platform and more attuned to the amount and nature of content they consume daily. They have made efforts to cut their usage down, but also admitted that they use Instagram as a stress relief and a way of escaping real-life tasks and responsibilities.

Tyler and Nora have both expressed their dissatisfaction with their mindless use of Instagram and their conscious efforts to employ mindfulness in recent years, but in different ways. Tyler's passage toward mindfulness involves caring less about his public image on Instagram and abandoning his "Instagram goals," which he previously adhered to and worked toward as a teenager. While he continues to use the application as a means of escaping reality and its responsibilities by mindlessly scrolling and simply relaxing, his use of the online platform in a mindful way stems from him distancing himself from expectations he had set for him-

self that would ultimately burden him. Nora is working toward limiting her mindless consumption, which consists of frequenting Instagram and scrolling without a purpose when she could be using her time more productively. She has found that spending her time doing more valuable tasks and activities ultimately improves her state of mind and her mental health. She struggles to find the balance between engaging in her version of mindful consumption while also tending to her friends' needs online. Nora feels that a significant part of Millennial culture today is being constantly available and present online, which can easily become overbearing and affects her ability to practice this mindfulness. Since relationships between individuals often exist at least partially through a digital sphere, and are often maintained through these online engagements, she feels the weight of the pressure to maintain her existence online in a consistent and steadfast manner. Thus, Nora consciously invests more of her time and effort into her offline relationships, and also into her relationship with herself. She explained her attempts at finding balance between the offline and online manifestations of her relationships by articulating that "a lot of our social interactions are not defined by but mediated through social media."

Ava discussed her newfound intimacy and vulnerability on the platform as she reflectively noticed a change in her usual routine of posting sexually explicit content. She explained that she would experience high levels of sexualization from men whom she did not know, until she began posting content that was vulnerable and intimate in that it was related to her personal battles with body dysmorphia, her abusive past relationship, and her experiences with disordered eating. Once she began posting this kind of content and humanizing herself, it was more difficult for her to be sexualized by others, and she began receiving varied responses from men rather than just ones referring to her as a sexual object. Ava's mindfulness in using Instagram lies in her process of breaking down barriers of privacy and intimacy while also creating barriers against sexualization through posting content of a different form of privacy and intimacy, ultimately humanizing herself. "I do very little on Instagram for a gaze, whether that be the male gaze or a humanizing gaze, like it's for me and that's why there's contradictions. Because that's how I exist" she asserted.

3.2 Archived Embodiment

Instagram has two archive features: one automatically saves

one's stories in a chronological archive, and the other allows one to archive a post rather than permanently delete it. Tyler, Ava, and Nora discussed these features and expressed their gratitude toward the first, explaining that it allows them to use Instagram as an effortless journal and a catalogue of their experiences and thoughts. It becomes especially useful in the archiving of their finsta account stories since there they post raw and unfiltered content, similar to what they would write in a journal.

Tyler, Ava, and Nora enjoy going through their archived stories and looking back on various embodied performances of identity during past events or phases of their lives. Tyler sees his finsta account as an accurate archive of his life, especially relative to his main page, since he has consistently been posting content since its conception. He now has around 1,600 posts, which reveals how often he posts on this account. Nora's first finsta account, one that has been inactive since the conception of her current finsta account, acts as an archive of a specific period of her life, which she sometimes looks back on in order to reflect on how much she has changed as a person: "it's been a long journey with Instagram, but it's hard to imagine growing up without it. And having like

an archive of all the images and like...what was behind all those moments, it's wild." When asked why she created a new finsta rather than removing the people she did not want following her and continuing to post to that account, she explained that she wanted to keep this page as an archive of her teenage experience and that she would feel bad removing those who she was no longer close with, as she has no malice toward them, they are simply not in her life anymore. This desire to hold onto a whole Instagram account as an amalgamation of archived memories and embodied experiences is characteristic of the many ways in which Instagram may act as a digital memory box: while it encourages the archiving of experiences through its automatic archiving function, it also facilitates the archiving of a whole period of one's life, including all those who followed them, those who "liked" their photos, and the interactions they engaged in with other users during that time.

Ava often looks back on her archived stories from when she was in an abusive relationship in order to retroactively recognize what her personal state of unhappiness presents as. She also uses this feature to make tangible the changes that her body has gone through over time, since body dysmorphia
often causes one to struggle with acknowledging changes in the body and even with imagining how one's body looks. She is able to look back on these archived stories and remember what she was thinking, how she was feeling, and what she was not able to realize at the time but realizes now. Her body went through a drastic change during the time of her breakup from a toxic and abusive individual, and Instagram's archiving feature concretizes this change and challenges her tendencies associated with having body dysmorphia. "[Instagram] is a vehicle by which I could make tangible the progress and the desire to not be that anymore," she said, referring to being repressed in an abusive relationship. To Ava, Instagram has facilitated a certain ability to reflect and actualize change that's physical, which reinforces the fact that bodies change overtime and that this is a normal and human process.

Niels Van Doorn (2011) views online social networked environments as an aggregation of archived gendered and sexualized performances that individuals can refer to and can collectively and discursively share with others as memories. This online construction and projection of mediated memories penetrates the boundaries between embodied memory and digital technology, as well as those of personal and cultural/collective recollection. This elucidates the notion of Instagram as an amalgamation of archived embodied experiences that ultimately change the way we see ourselves retrospectively. The participants' experiences show how collective presentations of the self also act as archived embodiments of different aspects of one's identity.

Conclusion

Instagram, and social media platforms in general, are often viewed and criticized from an outsider's perspective, or from the perspective of someone who has not grown up partially online, which inevitably perpetuates particular "prejudices or moral panics that are surrounding young people's use of new communication technology" (Larsen, 2008, 1). This stems from a fundamental lack of understanding toward the dynamic and elaborate ways in which young adults and teenagers use Instagram both in a functional sense and in their pursuit of self-discovery and exploration. Many people who do not use the social networking platform form their perception of it and of those who use it regularly based on its surface-level functionality. What they see is a need to post pictures of oneself and a reliance on validation through positive feedback on these pictures, which they consider to be superficial and trivial. It is easy to skim the surface of Instagram's functionality and subsequently construct an idea based on this peripheral understanding, which is why this study aimed to gain and provide a more nuanced understanding of young adults' Instagram use based on a cumulation of distinct and meaningful experiences. This nuanced understanding takes into account the positive and negative implications that Instagram has on its users, as described through the participants' experiences. While their experiences have not been wholly positive, at the end of the day many of them expressed their gratitude to Instagram and framed the social networking platform as something that has made them feel more secure as individuals, and something that has allowed them to express themselves in ways that they had previously been unable to. It is for these reasons that the positive elements of Instagram have been presented in this thesis. However, it would be irresponsible to ignore the negative implications that exist and that continue to affect many of its users.

As previously discussed, many experience Instagram as a digital realm characterized by portrayals of idealized versions of individuals, which works to magnify one's own shortcomings and flaws in their mind. An article by Alex Hern titled "Instagram is supposed to be friendly. So why is it making people so miserable?" explains that the pressure to consistently maintain an air of positivity is the root of Instagram's negative impact on its users, since these cheerful and seemingly perfect snapshots of people's lives are often fabricated and thus misleading. He claims that "If Facebook demonstrates that everyone is boring, and Twitter proves that everyone is awful, Instagram makes you worry that everyone is perfectexcept you," highlighting the differences between different social networking platforms, and distinguishing Instagram from other popular platforms as particularly negative (Hern, 2018, par. 4). Seeing others post idealized versions of their lives presented as reality often influences individuals to do the same, further contributing to the stream of unrealistic and deceptive content that can ultimately be damaging to impressionable and low-confidence individuals (Hern, 2018). The photo-sharing application is especially harmful due to its ability to inflict its users with a pressure to constantly be available and monitor their account and respond to notifications, which can be exhausting and can take a toll on younger users' mental health (Abington-Jefferson Health, n.d.). A study done by the Royal Society for Public Health in the United Kingdom suggests that higher social media intake among young adults results in increased likelihood of experiencing feelings of depression and anxiety, as well as a lack of sleep (Abington-Jefferson Health, n.d.). These factors combined often result in a lower quality of life, especially among users who are younger and more impressionable, and more likely to take the content they consume at face value and proceed to compare themselves, ultimately resulting in a negative self-perception (Hwang, 2019). Due to these negative implications among others, older generations have developed a general aversion to Instagram and see it as being a waste of time, especially due to the fact that it has emerged as a dominant force in mainstream culture.

Instagram has proven to be a platform that facilitates the mediation of the constant construction and re-construction of individuals' identity, both in an online and offline sense. This research has unveiled Instagram's significance in the expression and negotiation of queerness, and the platform's inherent complexities have been shown to allow users to explore and express their sexuality and sexual identity. These complexities also enable users to negotiate tensions pertaining to their freedom and constraints on the platform, and grow inwards as individuals through strategic uses of the application. Through various degrees and understandings of intimacy and privacy, users have the freedom to express themselves and their complex identities, and to enact real change in their offline persona through repetitive performances of self. By balancing authenticity and a devotion to aesthetic, or by achieving and channeling authenticity through aesthetic commitment, users can wholly express themselves in various ways, and choose how filtered or unfiltered they would like their online identity to be. The performativity of one's online presence has also been illuminated, in terms of sexual identity and sexuality, and mindful and mindless consumption, by looking at the power of one's online performance to enact real change in an offline realm.

The future of Instagram will incontrovertibly introduce new ways of constructing and negotiating one's identity, as we have already seen in the removal of public "likes" on posts. This recent change to Instagram has already shaped the ways in which individuals see themselves and others through the platform, as well as the value attached to the content they encounter online. By no longer being able to associate a numerical value to content on Instagram, whether it be public or their own, users are able to further employ their agency in assigning value themselves through other means. Taking into account the speed at which technological advancements and the growth of methods of online sociality occur, the dynamic and ever changing nature of the implications of Instagram on its users' negotiation of identity is indisputable, and maybe even unforeseeable.

References

Ardévol, E. and Gómez, Cruz, E. (2014). Digital Ethnography and Media Practices. In A.N. Valdivia (Eds.), In The International Encyclopedia of Media Studies. John Wiley & Sons. doi:10.1002/9781444361506.wbiems193

Bamberg, M. (2011). Who am I? narration and its contribution to self and identity. Theory & Psychology, 21(1), 3-24.

Butler, J. (1988). Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory. Theatre Journal, 40(4), 519-531.

Caldeira, S. P. (2016). Identities in Flux: An Analysis to Photographic Self-Representation on Instagram. Observatorio (OBS*), 10(3), 136-158.

Fox, J., & Ralston, R. (2016). Queer identity online: Informal learning and teaching experiences of LGBTQ individuals on social media. Computers in Human Behavior, 65, 635–642.

Goffman, Erving. (1956) The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life. Doubleday.

Herber, E. (2015, February 10). Finstagram: The Instagram Revolution. Medium. Retrieved from https://medium.com/bits-pixels/finstagram-the-instagram-revolution-737999d40014 Hern, A. (2018, September 17). Instagram is supposed to be friendly. So why is it making people so miserable? The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2018/sep/17/instagram-is-supposed-to-be-friendly-sowhy-is-it-making-people-so-miserable

Larsen, M. C. (2008). Understanding Social Networking: On Young People's Construction and Co construction of Identity Online. In K. Sangeetha (Eds.), In Online Networking - Connecting People. ICFAI University Press.

Lüders, M. (2007). Being in Mediated Spaces: An enquiry into personal media practices. University of Oslo.

McCormick, E. (2018, June 25). Instagram Is Estimated to Be Worth More than \$100 Billion. Bloomberg. https://www. bloomberg.com/news/articles/2018-06-25/value-of-facebook-s-instagram-estimated-to-top-100-billion

Shah, S. (2017, February 23). What's a Finstagram? The Instagram Craze That's All About Keeping it Real. Yahoo! News. https://ca.news.yahoo.com/finstagram-instagram-craze-keeping-real-155636299.html

Van Doorn, N. (2011). Digital spaces, material traces: How matter comes to matter in online performances of gender, sexuality and embodiment. Media Culture & Society, 33(4), 531-547.

Van Leeuwen, Theo, and Carey Jewitt. (2011). The Handbook of Visual Analysis. SAGE.

Vivienne, S. (2015). Digital Identity and Everyday Activism: Sharing Private Stories with Networked Publics. Palgrave Macmillan.

Chapter XI

The Failure of Drug Criminalization: Decriminalization and Harm Reduction as Viable Approaches to Addiction

Written By: Jessica Agathangelou

Chapter XI Written By: Jessica Agathangelou

The criminalization of drugs does not simply punish drug use, possession, or distribution. It criminalizes people. The focus on the individual, while having no meaningful impact on large-scale drug activities, creates a context where users are criminalized for simply being. Addiction is shaped as a vile social problem that demands a punitive response. Users are forced to bear two stigmatizing labels, drug addict and criminal. They are left to idle in their addiction.

In Canada, addiction is a social problem largely dealt with by criminalizing drugs. The current opioid and fentanyl crises make it clear that it is ineffective. My research question is: are decriminalization and harm reduction better approaches for treating addiction compared to the current criminalization of drugs in Canada? My objective is to argue against criminalization and for decriminalization and harm reduction as viable and effective approaches for treating addiction. This thesis is divided into five sections. The first section focuses on criminalization, beginning with a brief history of Canada's drug criminalization, followed by arguments as to why it is ineffective. Next, decriminalization is presented as a legal alternative to criminalization, by using Portugal as an example to argue for the benefits of transitioning to decriminalization. In section three, I argue that harm reduction emphasizes a health and social oriented approach to treating addiction that reinforces positive behaviours and provides a sense of community with non-drug addicts. It is an approach that theoretical framework to illustrate different ways of looking at addiction. The final section is an overall discussion of my arguments and conclusion to my research question.

Criminalization

<u>History of the Criminalization of Drugs in Canada</u> Before 1908, drugs such as opium and cocaine were not explicitly criminalized, but there was stigma and rhetorical shaming (Malleck, 2015, 216). The criminalization of drugs began by first targeting the non-medical use of opium with the1908 Opium Act (Malleck, 2015, 215). The Canadian Pacific Railway was largely constructed by Chinese labourers

and became a hub for smuggling opium across Canada (Malleck, 2015, 218). The increasing Chinese presence in Canada and media coverage of opium overdoses brought moral panic among white Canadians and an association was drawn between opium and Chinese immigrants. There were heavy anti-Nativism/anti-Chinese sentiments, ultimately resulting in the 1907 anti-immigration riots in Japantown and Chinatown in Vancouver (University of British Columbia, n.d.). In response to the riots, a commission was set up to assess the damage incurred to Chinese shops. Mackenzie King, the Minister of Labour at the time, was appointed to oversee this inquiry. He received financial loss claims from business owners, including mom-and-pop Chinese opium manufactures with a high gross revenue that shipped across Canada. Due to concerns about the dangers that opium posed for white Canadians, King was shocked it was legal. (Malleck, 2015, 215). These businesses did not align with Canada's purported self-image and King's recommendation to shut them down was accepted by Parliament. Subsequently, opium manufacturing and distributing became criminalized (Malleck, 2015, 227). According to Malleck (2015), the 19th Century was a period when the appropriateness of drugs was being questioned and seen as related to nativism. The

1908 Opium Act had a limited effect because it only targeted manufactures, with the exception of medical use. The act doesn't mention possession. But, in 1911, amendments were made to give police greater search and seizure powers and users were subjected to a new major offence called "found in", wherein an individual found in an opium den or manufacturing site was assumed to be a user (Malleck, 2015, 229). These amendments were largely due to the press, moral panic and anti-Chinese rhetoric. This Act created a steep decline in Chinese users because if caught, they were jailed and/or deported.

This shows that Canadian drug laws were highly racialized and structured with the intent of shaping Canada's national self-image. The Chinese were not only deemed the source of drug problems, but also as a threat to labour and whiteness. Todd Gordon (2006) linked the criminalization of drugs and the war on drugs in Canada to the fear of the immigrant 'Other,' and the threat that drugs, --and by association immigrants-- posed to Canada's market relations, culture and national identity (59). Racialized class relations were produced through a 19th century Britain construction of a bourgeois order. To uphold this order, "new" police were established to target racialized individuals and communities (Gordon, 2006, 60). A link was made between cleanliness and sanitation to poverty, disease and crime by moral reformers, and this was used to reiterate the notion that immigrants were dirty and prone to crime (Gordon, 2006, 61). This association simultaneously shaped drug policy and immigrants as the 'Other' (61).

Criminalization was a mechanism in Canada's nation-building project, trying to shape the immigrant 'Other' into civilized beings. It is inherently racialized, and targets those deemed unclean and dirty based on moral reformers' link between cleanliness, drugs and immigrants. Today, users of all races are the 'Other' and placed within the criminal domain. With such origins, it can be argued that criminalization was questionable from the outset. It was never about the affected individuals or providing treatment. It was to protect Canada's self-image. It was used to ostracize anyone different for being a perceived threat. Originally, it was a threat to Canada's labour market that sparked the war against drugs. Today, I believe the persistence to use criminalization rests on beliefs that drugs and users are a social evil, and on the desire to separate them from the image of what a Canadian

citizen is.

Ineffectiveness of Criminalization

Arguments for criminalization typically argue that it functions to deter future drug use and/or criminal behaviour through the use of punishment, or criminal sanctions.

Deterrence Theory

Deterrence theory is guided by the idea that punishment, or the fear of punishment, influences individuals to avoid criminal behaviour (Stefanovska, 2018, 25). Its logic is that rational humans weigh the consequences of their actions prior to acting. This theory situates each individual as a rational and free actor who uses ends/means calculations to decide whether to obey the law (Sung, 2003, 96). It relies on the notion that humans seek pleasure and avoid pain, assuming that people will obey the law to avoid punishment (Sung, 2003, 96). But often, potential punishment is overlooked or ignored by those in dire circumstances.

Rehabilitation from a positivist position sees reform and treatment as the focus, rather than punishment (Sung, 2003, 96). This approach serves to treat offenders therapeutically with clinical and social services instead of in a criminogenic environment of prisons and jails (Sung, 2003, 96). Hung-En Sung (2003) collected data from 263 individuals, part of Brooklyn's Drug Treatment Alternative-to-Incarceration program, who have experienced both incarceration and treatment. He questioned whether incarceration and treatment were complementary and if they had any effect on recidivism. Sung (2003) found that the likelihood of recidivism was reduced only through treatment, while incarceration showed no signs of deterrence but conveyed criminogenic effects among the participants (95).

<u>Reduces Drug Use</u>

Kora DeBeck, Thomas Kerr, Kathy Li, M.-J. Milloy, Julio Montaner and Evan Wood (2008) studied the relationship between incarceration and substance abuse among intravenous (IV) drug users. They found that 30% of female and 40% of male inmates were serving time in Canadian prisons on drug-related charges and that Canada spends roughly \$573 million annually on their incarceration (DeBeck et al., 2008, 69). This study was influenced by the lack of evaluation into how effective law enforcement and incarceration are at deterring and reducing drug use (DeBeck et al., 2008, 70). To test the assumption that there is a deterrent effect produced through incarceration, DeBeck et al., (2008) collected longitudinal data through a cohort study using participants who are IV drug users in Vancouver (70). IV users comprise a small percentage in the drug community but are the most at-risk for problematic and harmful drug consumption (De-Beck et al., 2008, 70).

DeBeck et al. (2008) found a negative association between recent incarceration and drug use cessation but noted that methadone treatments were positively associated with cessation. (DeBeck et al., 2008, 73,75). However, their sub-analyses showed an increase in IV drug use cessation after periods of incarceration, but this was not found to be statistically significant, and attributed this finding to a cohort effect (De-Beck et al., 2008, 75). The comparison of drug use patterns between incarcerated and non-incarcerated participants found no significant differences, they concluded that incarceration was not independently associated with any significant changes in decreasing drug use (DeBeck et al., 2008 75). DeBeck et al.,'s (2008) findings are consistent with previous studies, finding no positive association between incarceration and cessation (DeBeck et al., 2008, 75). This shows that cessation does occur post-incarceration, but is also related to treatment programs such as methadone. Overall, criminalization is ineffective in being a deterrent, nor is it capable of influencing cessation.

Decriminalization

Context of Decriminalization

In contrast to criminalization, decriminalization means that simple possession of drugs and paraphernalia previously categorized as illegal is not criminal anymore. Its specific meaning depends on the approach. A minimalist approach seeks reform that calls for an end to the prosecution of simple possession and small-scale drug dealing (Bayer, 199, 342). The maximalist approach conceptualizes decriminalization as a combatant to the problems produced by criminalization and its enforcement (Bayer, 1992, 342). Somewhere in the middle, decriminalization entails the medicalization of drug abuse, where physicians replace police officers and treatment replaces punishment (Bayer, 1992, 342). These conceptions have very different implications in regard to the risk of increased drug use, and roles of medicine and criminal law are very different.

In November 2017, the Canadian Public Health Association (CPHA) acknowledged that the current criminalization of psychoactive substances has been unsuccessful in their Policy and Position Statement, 'Decriminalization of Personal Use of Psychoactive Substances'. They acknowledged criminalization's lack of success and called for an alternative approach that embraced public health rather than criminality (CPHA, 2017). With the opioid epidemic, the Controlled Drugs and Substances Act and other acts were amended to introduce a more simplified approach to gain permission for operating a supervised consumption site (CPHA, 2017). There were renewals added to the Canadian Drugs and Substances Strategy exempting individuals that call emergency services for an overdose from being charged with simple possession and coverage extends to parole violations and such (CPHA, 2017).

Decriminalization in Practice: Portugal

Portugal's decision to decriminalize all illicit drugs in 2001 was radical, controversial, and done out of desperation to solve the growing public health crisis (DPA, 2018, 2). The United States' 'War on Drugs' approach was not working, and something needed to change. In 1999, Portugal had the

highest rate of drug-related AIDS in the European Union and overdoses were staggeringly high (EU) (DPA, 2018, 2). There was immense fear about the rising health and social problems associated with drugs and addiction. The government responded by creating a committee of appointed experts, including doctors, lawyers, psychologists, and social activists (DPA, 2018, 3). Upon studying the problem, the committee recommended ending criminalizing drug users, with no discretion on which drugs they use (DPA, 2018, 3). Their recommendation included opening up the dialogue about prevention and education, such as access to evidence-based and voluntary treatment interventions, the adoption of harm reduction approaches, and investments into reintegrating back into society individuals with drug addiction (DPA, 2018, 3). This brought forth a new philosophy regarding drugs and their use, based on four assumptions. The first is that drugs and their use are not inherently evil. Second, it is not possible to have a completely drug-free society. Third, there are many reasons people use drugs. Lastly, punitive policies are unethical and ineffective (DPA, 2018, 3).

Once Portugal implemented decriminalization, the Commis-

sions for the Dissuasion of Drug Abuse was set up under the Ministry of Health (DPA, 2018, 4). Individuals found using or possessing drugs by a police officer have the drugs confiscated and are referred to a Dissuasion Commission consisting of one official from the legal domain and two from the health or social service domain. They meet with the individual to determine if there is an abuse problem and if so, to what extent. Most of the individuals the Committee sees are not found to be abusing drugs (DPA, 2018, 4). These commissions are independent from the criminal justice system. If there is no abuse detected, the individual receives a provisional suspension of the proceedings. If within the following six months they are not found to be in possession of drugs again, the case is dismissed (DPA, 2018, 4). But if abuse is detected, administrative sanctions can be imposed and can vary from fines, social work, or group therapy. They receive a treatment referral that is voluntary, but refusal or rejection of treatment can result in administrative sanctions, such as a revoked driver's license or mandatory community service; however, they are unlikely (DPA, 2018, 4).

Portugal moved in the right direction. They tried the standard criminalization approach, experienced its failure and shifted

to decriminalization, adopting a harm reduction model. The Dissuasion Commission addresses abuse problems without the threat of criminal sanctions. They are not deemed as criminals, but of requiring assistance. The underlying factors of addiction are not resolved through punishment. Decriminalization of simple possession and use is a way to address the root causes of addiction and its associated harms.

Harm Reduction

Harm Reduction: An Overview

The DPA (2018) defines harm reduction as "a set of ideas and interventions that seek to reduce the harms associated with both drug use and ineffective drug policies." (DPA, 2018, 5). The aim is to minimize negative consequences and promote good health and social inclusion (DPA, 2018, 5). According to Riley and colleagues (1999), harm reduction is founded on five principles (Brocato & Wagner, 2003, 118). First, pragmatism: a pragmatic approach accepts that drugs exist and are used, and aims to minimize risks associated with using drugs (Brocato & Wagner, 2003, 118). The second principle relies on humanistic values that treat users with dignity and respect (Brocato & Wagner, 2003, 119). The third and fourth principles address the physical, social and economic "harms associated with drug use," and consider treatment as a collaborative process with users, respectively (Brocato & Wagner, 2003, 119). Last, the focus is on individual and community needs to create feasible goals (Brocato & Wagner, 2003, 119). Users are treated as people, and harm reduction treats substance abuse by addressing the external factors contributing to an addiction, also undertaking a realistic and humanistic understanding.

Harm Reduction Programs

There is no single harm reduction approach, but a multitude of proactive and person-oriented programs and methods.

Overdose Prevention Sites

Safe injection sites, or overdose prevention sites, have a lot of potential for effective addiction treatment. They provide a safe and non-judgemental space for users to consume drugs, with access to sterile supplies, medical professionals, educational tools, and counselling services (Canadian Mental Health Association, 2020). The risks of overdose, drug contamination, and disease transmission decrease in this type of environment. Drug use is not encouraged, but safe consumption is the focus on these sites. The idea is that if users are alive, there is always opportunity to seek treatment (Canadian Mental Health Association, 2020).

Needle Exchange Programs

Disease transmission, especially HIV/AIDS and Hepatitis C, is a big risk with IV drug use. Needle exchange programs allow users to exchange used needles for clean sterile ones, reducing the number of contaminated needles in the community. It is proactive and a health-based approach, but there are pros and cons. While they reduce infection rates and disease transmission, drug-related and sexual-risk behaviours, and increase access to treatment, testing and education, the opposition argues that it relies on taxpayer money, enables drug use and adds to existing problems by increasing IV drug use within the larger community (Elkins, 2017). However, research supports the benefits. The International Journal of Drug Policy published a summary in 2012 about 15 years of research done on Vancouver's Insite program. They found no association between participating in needle exchange programs and HIV infection. But they did note that needle exchange programs have higher rates of HIV infection because high-risk drug users are most likely to use them. It is

most effective to have separate sites for collecting contaminated needles and providing clean one (Elkins, 2017).

<u>Naloxone</u>

Naloxone is administered during an opioid overdose to counteract the effects occurring in the central nervous and respiratory system, allowing the individual to breathe again. It is a non-addictive prescription medication and only has a physical effect if there are opioids in the system (Harm Reduction Coalition, n.d.). It is available in Canada, but access can be challenging. Naloxone is available as a nasal spray or injection, but only the injection is approved in Canada (Canadian Centre on Substance Abuse, 2016, 1). In March 2016, the Canadian Centre on Substance Abuse published a bulletin about the availability of take-home naloxone in Canada: seven of the thirteen provinces and territories had takehome naloxone programs (1). As of 2019, all provinces and territories offer free injectable naloxone, and the nasal spray is offered for those at risk of overdosing in Quebec, Ontario and the Northwest Territories (The Canadian Press, 2019). These changes are good, but the Canadian Research Initiative in Substance Misuse received criticism on the ability to access naloxone in remote areas when it is only obtained through a health professional. Naloxone has the potential to save many lives, and its effectiveness is dependent on increasing access and information.

Theoretical Framework: Looking at Addiction Differently

To ease transitioning to decriminalization and harm reduction, another shift is required. It requires significant changes in how society understands addiction. I will argue that a nuanced understanding of addiction is required for effective treatment and it is imperative in order for decriminalization and harm reduction to be effective.

'Good' vs. 'Bad' and 'Good' vs. 'Evil'

In On the Genealogy of Morals, Friedrich Nietzsche (2006) traced how notions of "good" and "bad" shift throughout history. Nietzsche (2006) argued that the origin of "good" and "bad" is rooted in unequal power relations, between the superior and inferior, the object and the other (13). This conclusion is drawn to articulate that "good" does not translate to 'unegoistic' actions (Nietzsche, 2006, 13). "Unegoistic" and "egoistic" came to be associated with "good" and "bad" only with the decline of aristocratic values, and the

rise of slave morality (Nietzsche, 2006. 13). Those who were designated as inferior, therefore "bad", began to view those in power, the self-proclaimed "good", as "evil". Drugs and its users/addicts have been designated as bad, as the social "other" by those in power. This association functions to isolate and marginalize users and addicts. Criminalization solidifies the users and addicts as bad, and social perceptions mirror this notion through the way addicts are treated within society. I believe a form of slave morality for drug users and addicts is necessary to shine a light on the way criminalization is "evil". Criminalization reinforces the notion that drugs are bad and users and addicts are bad by default. Recreational use and addiction do not necessarily mean a person is bad, but rather that they require social support because society has failed them in a way that lead them on that path. Being perceived as "bad" blocks these individuals from opportunities to succeed and forces them to see themselves as society views them, a social pariah. It is necessary for society to re-evaluate why drugs and users are designated as the 'bad' for perceptions to shift. As long as they are viewed as bad, it will be extremely challenging for them to find their place within society and make positive choices.

<u>Alienation & Anomie</u>

Buddi Osco's (2004) article about self-exploration used Emile Durkheim's 'anomie' and Karl Marx's 'alienation' to look at his personal experiences of drug use. Although he does not feel his personal experiences of using were problematic, he argues these concepts can be applied to understanding substance abuse (105). Osco (2004) defines anomie as "a social condition characterized by instability, the breakdown of social norms, institutional disorganization, and a separation between socially valid goals and available means for achieving them" (105). It is also referred to as "the psychological condition of futility, anxiety, and amorality afflicting individuals who live under such conditions" (Osco, 2004, 105). Durkheim believed that if an individual lacks the sufficient means to realize their needs, they will never be happy, or even exist. If society cannot meet these expectations, there is a deep sense of loneliness and detachment from greater society. Durkheim argued it was society's job to regulate individual needs and to set limitations on them (Osco, 2004, 105). Modern society constantly claims that anything is possible and shoves commodities down our throats, creating and feeding an endless need to satisfy. This is a set-up for failure and disappointment. In terms of substance abuse, individuals realize they will never acquire all that they feel they

need, what society and capitalist culture tells them they need. When one feels that they cannot meet society's expectations, they become alienated and are detached from society, leaving room for an attachment to substances.

Similar to Durkheim, Marx believed that humans need to feel like they belong within society. He posited that meaningful labour makes us human, and we feel fulfilled when our work is valued, and we have a sense of purpose within society (Osco, 2004, 107). Marx argued that under capitalism, work is inherently un-meaningful because it produces poor working conditions fueled by a dominating ideology of mass production/consumption. This effectively removes the meaning and value in labour that Marx identifies as the essence of human beings. Alienation strongly relates to substance abuse because in modern capitalist society, work is prioritized and an individual's worth is measured by employment and level of income. Low-income individuals are likely to have unsatisfactory work that lacks any meaning to them with poor wages. This results in feeling alienated from society, from others, from their environment and most importantly, their essence as a human being. Feeling rejected from society on account of their lack of income and being forced to work meaningless jobs with the aim of moving up in the economic ladder leaves many restless and hopeless. These feelings of detachment from virtually all aspects of life make it likely that these individuals will seek a connection with something else, in this case drugs. Drugs can function as an escape from the dreariness of modern capitalist life and serve as a form of self-medicating to compensate for feeling so alienated.

<u>Rat Park</u>

Experimental psychologists in the 1960s theorized that the Skinner Box was reliable for studying drug addiction. A rat would be confined in a tiny box with two restriction-free levers, one provided food and the other administered a small dose of drugs in the rats' jugular veins. The rats would become addicted to the drugs and quickly die of overdose. These conclusions were interpreted as proving that drugs are instantaneously and uncontrollably addictive and aided to substantiate anti-drug advocates claims (Alexander, 2010).

Psychologist Bruce K. Alexander initially agreed with these experiments and their conclusions about addiction (Alexander, 2010). But after further reflection, he completely disagreed. He had three primary objections. First, rats are inherently social creatures and the isolation of Skinner Boxes removes that vital aspect of their lives. Alexander (2010) compares isolation for rats and humans, arguing that both cases are traumatizing in their own way. It drives people crazy, and isolated crazed rats will form an attachment towards the only available stimulus, drugs. Second, an isolated rat whose life requires no effort does not adequately measure human addiction because human life is influenced by multiple external forces. Finally, rats are simply rats, and are just not reliable for studying human addiction (Alexander, 2010).

These objections led Alexander and his colleagues to develop 'Rat Park', a large plywood box with multiple rats and lots of toys, ramps, tunnels, wood chips and wheels (Alexander, 2010). They could freely socialize, and both sexes were integrated for familial and sexual relations. The drug in-take of rats in Rat Park and Skinner Boxes were compared. Interestingly, the results of every experiment indicated higher drug use for Skinner Box rats (Alexander, 2010). In terms of humans, through his experience speaking with individuals living with addiction, Alexander (2010) found that they lacked a viable social or cultural life. Their addiction was a coping mechanism for their dislocation from society and other people. Alexander (2010) refers to social problems stemming from colonization and uses the example of substance abuse among First Nations in Western Canada. He argued that there is little drug consumption in a natural environment. The rats in Rat Park could fulfill their inherent need for socialization by being active and playing, and as a result only used drugs occasionally (Alexander, 2010). First Nations used to live in their most natural environment, but colonization brought social and cultural isolation and a plethora of social problems, substance abuse being a major one (Alexander, 2010). Alexander (2010) theorized that socially and culturally isolating environments increase drug use. Skinner boxes are inherently isolating, and the observed "addiction" is a product of just that.

Rat Park illuminates a different way of conceptualizing addiction. For Alexander (2010), modern addiction stems from how the nature of today's society creates feelings of social and cultural isolation. Hyper-individualism and an "every man for himself" mentality breeds a social environment of loneliness and isolation. For Alexander (2010), "chronic isolation causes people to look for relief", and this relief is often found in drugs.

Labelling Theory

Labelling theory in criminology was derived out of the sociological perspective Symbolic Interactionism. This perspective grew from the ideas of George Herbert Mead, Herbert Blumer and many more (Skaggs, 2016). This theory focuses on the interaction between individuals and society, and how this interaction forms the basis of meaning within society (Skaggs, 2016). According to labelling theorists, crime was created by the state and individuals in positions of power through labelling certain behaviours as "bad". These theorists found importance in how members of society react to crime and deviance. Although certain legal/legislative and police efforts to reduce crime are with the intention of helping offenders, rehabilitation for example, perhaps these criminological efforts deepen offenders' lives into crime specifically because the label these individuals are assigned as a result of their behaviour (Skaggs, 2016). Labels actively shape how members of society treat and conceptualize individuals living with addiction. This then causes individuals with addiction to internalize these labels and see themselves in this perspective as well. Once this has occurred, continuing to engage in substance abuse is heightened with riskier behaviours due a self-worth diminished by state sanctioned labels that further entrench marginalization and stigmatization, blocking any desire to rise above that label.

Discussion

The criminalization of drugs is a means to an end. It originated from a racialized association between Chinese immigrants and opium. Moral reformers in the 19th Century aided the initiative for a white bourgeois order by linking immigrants to uncleanliness and drugs. Criminalization was successful in reinforcing a racialized 'Other' and helped shape the association between drugs, uncleanliness and racialized 'Others'. This origin is important, it demonstrates that criminalizing drugs was not because of the drugs themselves. It was to reinforce the notion of the racialized 'Other' and uphold a white bourgeois order. In modern society, it remains this way and functions to ensure the marginalization of non-white groups.

Presently, criminalization continues to be Canada's approach to drugs and, by default, addiction. Simple possession and personal use remain an issue to be dealt with by the crim-
inal justice system and by some form of punishment and the possibility of a criminal record. Although it has been deemed ineffective, criminalization persists because its advocates continue to present it as a successful deterrent and that it can achieve the goal of drug cessation. These are two long-standing arguments supporting criminalization, but there is research to support the argument that both are untrue. In a study of 263 individuals from Brooklyn's Drug Treatment Alternative-to-Incarceration program, Hung-En Sung (2003) found no evidence proving that incarceration reduced the prevalence of recidivism. Rather, rehabilitation or a combination of incarceration and rehabilitation did yield some effect on recidivism prevalence. Moreover, De-Beck et al. (2008) found in their research that incarceration has no effect on cessation. But, alternative treatment, such as methadone, did have an effect. These studies' findings were aligned with other studies. It can be argued that it is time to listen to the research demonstrating that criminalization is not capable of doing what its advocates propose it does. Punitive methods like incarceration place the individual in an environment that has been shown to produce criminogenic effects. Users experience further isolation instead of treatment that addresses the root cause of their addiction.

Addiction is a social problem that continues to produce drug-related crises. It is clear that criminalization has failed to not only be effective in treating addiction, but unsuccessful in mitigating the secondary social problems stemming from drugs. It categorizes substance abuse as a crime and targets everyday individuals not involved with high-level drug operations. This approach does not get to the root problem of addiction, nor how drugs are manufactured and distributed.

It is time to abandon criminalization and transition to decriminalization. This can mean many things. Only simple possession is removed from the criminal code or substance abuse becomes medicalized where health care professionals replace law enforcement. It can even go as far as functioning as a combatant to the consequences produced and reinforced by criminalization. I believe the best structure would encompass all three facets of decriminalization because they are all equally important. Realistically, I would propose starting small with just removing simple possession from the criminal code and having the overarching ideology that decriminalization is a tool to also combat the negative effects that have been felt by criminalization. Portugal has had promising results and is a great example of how decriminalization can be a positive framework for drugs and substance abuse. For the last 20 years, it has been successful. It should be a strong indication that decriminalization is a noteworthy alternative to criminalization. It can be studied at length in order to adjust it for Canadian society. When Portugal changed how it treated addiction and users, it produced positive results for the country as a whole. I believe that decriminalization should be taken seriously because addiction should not end up falling under the criminal justice system. It should be treated as a health and social problem, not a criminal one.

The principles guiding the harm reduction approach concern humanistic values and pragmatism. It advocates for providing a non-judgemental environment for drug consumption and focuses on minimizing the risks associated with drugs rather than cessation. This approach treats addiction realistically because it avoids punishing or shaming the individual into treatment or abstinence. They provide a safe space to consume drugs and access resources for treatment, housing, employment, and financial help. Programs such as safe injection sites and needle exchanges help foster a sense of community with non-users. When they feel they are not being judged, they are more likely to use these resources and become open to making positive changes because they are being treated with dignity.

I strongly believe that for such a drastic change to occur, to move away from criminalization and towards decriminalization and harm reduction, it requires shifting how addiction is conceptualized. If addiction continues to be seen as dirty or racialized, it will always be misunderstood, and efforts to decriminalize drugs will be extremely challenging. For a long time, drugs have been "bad", they have been a "social evil". But what is deemed "good" and what is deemed "bad" is largely subjective and determined by those in power. Going back to the Opium Act and Chinese immigrants, opium was originally the only drug criminalized and this was because it was the Chinese producing it. Or presently, heroin is deemed "bad", but using opium in prescription medication like morphine is "good". In reality, they are derived from the same plant. One is bad and the other is good only because it was decided that way and it benefits those in power to do so.

Part of understanding addiction is understanding how outside forces may drive an individual towards substance abuse. Alexander (2010)'s Rat Park illustrates that addiction is about severed interpersonal relationships and treating it should include re-forming relationships. When an individual feels isolated and alone, they form a connection with a substance rather than a person. By replacing substances with people, as can be done with harm reduction programs and social resources, the individual can begin moving away from their addiction because they have formed bonds more meaningful than the ones they have with drugs.

Durkheim's Anomie and Marx's Alienation can be applied to look at how the pressures of society affects the individual. Moreover, being labelled an addict is stigmatizing, and, if internalized, the individual will believe that is all they are and not try to seek treatment. With the added label of criminal, that individual is severely blocked from gaining good employment or decent housing. These labels define how other people see them and they are inescapable if addiction is understood as something criminal and negative. With decriminalization, at least the criminal label will be removed. But the stigmatizing addict label will remain until there is an effort made to educate communities about addiction and its complexities. Individuals with a drug addiction would benefit from decriminalization and increased harm reduction programs because they will be able to stay alive and have access to resources promoting healthy and safe consumption with support. If they are being treated like humans and not criminals or a social disease, the likelihood that they will begin to feel like a person themselves and want to seek treatment are greater than discarding them in a prison hoping it will eliminate their urge to use.

Finally, I would like to return to my research question. Through my research and analysis, I would like to argue that decriminalization and harm reduction are, in fact, better approaches because how addiction is conceptualized can be re-shaped into a more nuanced understanding allowing for more effective and dignified treatment and services. The principles of harm reduction are person-oriented and I believe such an approach can save lives and be a light at the end of a dark tunnel for many people. Both decriminalization and harm reduction look at drugs realistically and focus on the individual and their needs rather than the substance and its perceived threat to society. I believe that criminalization had a long time to be effective and it has failed. It should be repealed and replaced by decriminalization and widely acces-

sible harm reduction. Portugal is evidence that it can work and produce positive results, for both users and the larger society. It benefits Canadian society as a whole to make this radical shift and it is the next step. Marijuana has recently been legalized and perceptions of it have been shifting, and it is time to continue in the right direction and decriminalize all illicit substances. Initiatives to educate communities on a nuanced understanding of addiction is important, ones that highlight how addiction is complex and requires a humanistic, not punitive, approach. Decriminalization and harm reduction's success in Canada depends on the support of communities, for there is a need to remedy the isolation felt by modern society. Community support for harm reduction programs is also valuable because it can make users feel less alienated and more accepted for who they are. If they feel less judged and stigmatized, if their lives become somewhat "normal" (not hiding in alleys to use, stealing supplies, unsafe consumption practices, etc), there is a better chance they will feel motivated towards personal development and treatment.

The approach to any social problem should be focused on bettering the lives of those affected, not making it harder. Criminalization makes the lives of users much harder. I am arguing that decriminalization and harm reduction function to improve users' lives, but they also improve the country as a whole by re-integrating users back into society by supporting them through services and programs that help, not punish. Decriminalization and harm reduction would be better approaches to treating addiction in Canada because they are realistic, humanistic and effective. This is how Canada should strive to treat addiction, not through means of punishment and labelling.

References

Bayer, R. (2018). Introduction: The Great Drug Policy Debate: What Means This Thing Called Decriminalization?. The Milbank Quarterly, 69(3), 341-363. http://www.jstor. org/stable/3350101

Brocato, J, & Wagner, E. F. (2003). Harm Reduction: A Social Work Practice Model and Social Justice Agenda. Health & Social Work, 28(2), 117-125.

Alexander, Bruce K. (2010). Addiction: The View from Rat Park. Bruce K. Alexander. https://www.brucekalexander. com/articles-speeches/rat-park/148-addiction-the-viewfrom-rat-park

Canadian Mental Health Association. (2020). Harm Reduction. https://ontario.cmha.ca/harm-reduction/

Canadian Public Health Association. (2017). Decriminalization of Personal Use of Psychoactive Substances. https:// www.cpha.ca/decriminalization-personal-use-psychoactive-substances

DeBeck, K, Thomas, K, Li, K, Milloy M. J, Montaner, J, Wood, E. (2009). Incarceration and Drug Use Patterns Among a Cohort of Injection Drug User. Addiction, 104, 69-76. doi:10.1111/j.1360-0443.2008.02387.x.

Drug Policy Alliance. (2018). Drug Decriminalization in

Portugal: Learning from a Health and Human-Centred Approach.http://www.drugpolicy.org/sites/default/files/ dpa-drug-decriminalization-portugal-health-human-centered-approach_0.pdf

Elkins, C. (2017). "Benefits and Risks of Needle Exchange Programs."https://www.drugrehab.com/2017/11/06/ pros-and-cons-of-needle-exchange-programs/

Gordon, T. (2006). Neoliberalism, Racism, and the War on Drugs in Canada. Social Justice 33(1), 59-78.

Harm Reduction Coalition. n.d. "Understanding Naloxone." https://harmreduction.org/issues/overdose-prevention/ overview/overdose-basics/understanding-naloxone/

Sung, H. (2003). Differential Impact of Deterrence vs. Rehabilitation as Drug Interventions on Recidivism After 36 Months. Treating Substance Abusers in Correctional Contexts: New Understandings, New Modalities. (pp. 95-108). Hayworth Press Inc.

Malleck, D. (2015). Drug Laws and the Creation of Illegality. When Good Drugs Go Bad: Opium, Medicine, and the Origins of Canada's Drug Laws, (pp. 214-283). Vancouver UBC Press.

Nietzsche, F. (2006). First Essay: 'Good and Evil', 'Good and Bad'. D. Smith, Trans.). On the Genealogy of Morals, (pp. 11-38). Oxford University Press.

Osco, B. (2004). Anomie or Alienation?: A Self-Exploration

of the Roots of Substance Abuse. Human Architecture: Journal of the Sociology of Self-Knowledge 2(2), 105-147.

Skaggs, S, L. (2016). Labelling Theory. Encyclopedia Britannica.https:// www.britannica.com/topic/labeling-theory

Stefanovska, V. (2018). Surveillance and Control over Incapacitation, Deterrence and Rehabilitation Effects of the Punishment. Balkan Social Science Review, 11, 23-38.

The Canadian Press. (2019). Naloxone Distribution Questions Need Answers amid Canada's Opioid Crisis. CBC News. https://www.cbc.ca/news/health/naloxone-opiods-1.5180466

University of British Columbia. n.d. Immigration: 1907 Riots. https://www.library.ubc.ca/chineseinbc/riots.html

Chapter XII

Means of Living: The Viability of Dairy Farms in 21st Century Laurentides

Written By: Benjamin Lamy

Chapter XII Written By: Benjamin Lamy

My first day at the Ferme Geneviève et Bruno Bessette (FGBB) happened to be the same day the Canadian Government rolled out the first round of its dairy compensations program. These were intended to help the country's milk producers compete with European imports (Glen, 2019), but I found they left my participants cold. Why was that? Shouldn't they be thankful for the help?

The Bessettes spent the whole day explaining to me that, in Canada, 10,371 dairies share among themselves a set amount of daily production-rates, or quotas (Canadian Dairy Information Center, 2020). Quotas are acquired by auction and generally cost much higher than a cow. The more quotas a dairy has, the more milk it can sell, and the bigger it tends to be. A dairy's size is usually determined by the head of cattle, which infers its number of quotas. Québec's dairies have on average 72 milk-giving cows (Canadian Dairy Information Center, 2020). The national average is 93. As it turned out, the amount granted to each dairy depended on their quotas. The example provided was that a dairy of the average Canadian size would get roughly enough to acquire one extra quota (Government of Canada, 2019). In other words, the brunt of Québécois dairies would fall under the curve, to the benefit of the bigger Western ranches.

I'm no farmer. My family hasn't engaged in agriculture for at least four generations. I can't speak for everyone, of course, but urbanisation is on the rise globally. Agriculture is, in fact, growing distant to more people. In fact, you don't need to be as distant as me not to pick up on the more subtle implications of the present situation. My companion and driver, when heading to my participants', grew up on a dairy farm and was very happy from the government's statement. Only after I shared what the Bessettes' had explained to me that his opinion changed.

By the turn of the century, there were about 10,000 dairies operating in Québec alone. As of today, their numbers hover around 5,000. Some have gotten bigger off of their neighbours; but most have closed. Though unfortunate, the situation isn't wholly desperate. Québec includes about half of the country's dairies, and together they supply more than a third of its total milk production, more than any other single province. Québécois dairies still have a lot of economic – and therefore political – weight, so how do they make use of it? Given their apparent sidelining by the new program, what is the actual extent of this weight? How has it played into the new rounds of international negotiations, if at all, and how do they expect to make use of it in the coming years? These interrogations, and many more besides, are summarised herein.

Surveying the Land

FGBB is located in the Laurentides geographic region of Québec, to the North of the St-Lawrence river and its heavily settled basin. The region is characterised by dense rock formations and sandy thalwegs, making it generally quite poor for agriculture (Blanchard, 1938, 8-23). This research is specifically about Québec's dairies. So, how does the Laurentides compare in that regard? The region of the Laurentides is split into three different administrative zones by the Producteurs de Lait du Québec (PLQ), milk-producers' syndical federation. These zones are the Mauricie, Lanaudière and Outaouais-Laurentides.

	Land Area (Km ²)	Dairies (D)	
Mauricie	39 746	213	
Lanaudière	13 537	181	
Outaouais- Laurentides	53 022	214	

Table I Land Area & Dairy Counts of Each of the 4 Laurentian Ad-				
ministrative Regions				

In spite of being nearly 1.5 times the Mauricie in size, the Outaouais-Laurentides has only one more dairy. As for Lanaudière, the smallest zone by far, its numbers are surprisingly close to the other two.

What, then, could explain this phenomenon? Though the three administrative zones are each made up in large part of the geographic Laurentides, all include a strip of the St-Lawrence's North Bank. It could be inferred that the inland dairy population is relatively marginal compared to that of the Bank. Otherwise, it could be that, compared to the others, Lanaudière has a meaningful specialization in dairy. If so, how does it compare to other regions?

The Montérégie is 11,111 km2, but though it is smaller

than Lanaudière it is split into two branches by the PLQ. Montérégie-Ouest has 405 dairies and Montérégie-Est has 546. Either have more than double those of Lanaudière (Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec, n.d.). Tellingly, both are entirely within the St-Lawrence basin. A similar example is the 16,130 km2 Chaudière-Appalaches, also split in two. C.-A.-Sud has 504 dairies, and C.-A.-Nord has 609 (Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec, n.d.). Most telling of all is the tiny Centre-du-Québec region, at 6,930 km2, which has a total of 743 dairies in a single administrative region (Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec, n.d.). In the following table, I've combined the two Montérégies and Chaudière-Appalaches zones into single units to give a more streamlined picture of the distribution.

	Dairies	Employees	Value	E/D	V/D
Mauricie	213	1957	100,6 mil\$	9.19	0.47
Lanaudière	181	1559	79.4 mil\$	8.61	0.44
Out-	214	2173	109,0 mil\$	10.2	<mark>0.51</mark>
Laurentides					
Montéregie	951	8109	428,4 mil\$	8.53	0.45
Centre- du-Quebec	743	10007	514,8 mil\$	13.5	0.69
Chaudière- Appalaches	1113	10315	540,3 mil\$	9.27	0.49

Table II Value & Employee Count of 6 Geographic Regions in Rela-

tion to their Respective Dairy Counts

Overall, the three Laurentian zones are the sparsest in dairies, though on average all zones have as many employees per dairy, implying similar herd sizes. Considering that the St-Lawrence basin has been settled by French-Canadians for much longer than the Laurentides, and that it doesn't suffer from the same geographical and geological constraints, this last similarity is telling.

Before proceeding, I would like to draw your attention to the Outaouais-Laurentides segment of the second table. La Conception – and FGBB by association – is included in that zone. Despite having the third-least number of dairies, it still manages to get the second-highest number of employee-per-dairy and the second-highest value-per-dairy. Though it accounts for only one more dairy than the Mauricie, it employs two hundred more people than the latter and makes eight million dollars more. This could mean one of two things: either the zone's average herd size is above the provincial average of 50, or a few local dairies bring the average up by being especially big. Whichever of these two reasons is the cause, the through-line is that the Outaouais-Laurentides employs more people in the milk industry than the average and turns a better profit for its infrastructure than most other zones.

<u>And So...</u>

What makes the Laurentides an interesting setting for this research?

All dairies in the province are members of the PLQ. They are each assigned to one of its local branches, such as Outaouais-Laurentides or Centre-du-Québec. As noted above, whatever the zone, dairies tend to orbit around the provincial average in sizes. In other words, none is too big not to rely on its peers, locally and provincially.

All Québécois dairies are, at the moment, confronted with the same dangers of unbalanced competition (Gheller 2018, 624). In the Outaouais-Laurentides in particular, which seems to put a strong emphasis on milk production, changes to the legislation always risk being catastrophic. Lobbying for preferential policy is a constant strategy. By putting up a common front, the odds are simply better stacked in their favor. Given these factors, I predict that the opportunities for communal action will find great resonance in such a zone as the Outaouais-Laurentides. As I put down my observations of a Laurentian dairy farm, I expect that the discourse of my participants will be particularly marked by the call for cooperation and consensus.

Methodology

Geneviève and Bruno are both equally involved in FGBB's operations, while also having three young children. Milk is harvested twice daily, first from 6 to 10 am, and second from 5 to 10 pm, seven days a week. Since this was their livelihood, a change in their schedule was out of the question.

For flexibility, I had to find someone with a car. I was lucky that a close relative made that trip regularly. His availability not only provided me with transport but also meant that the research suddenly involved more people, each with their own schedule to keep track of. Planning for meetings was then a series of back-and-forth between the driver and the participants, while I acted as a middleman.

My driver usually drove North on Saturdays, while Geneviève and Bruno finish the morning milking around 10, after which they try to shower, have breakfast and, on weekends, spend some time with their children. To make them comfortable, we tried to arrive at noon. My lift would leave me at FGBB, and I would spend the afternoon discussing with the Bessettes around the family table. Geneviève would often go take care of some business, either at the barn or in town. Though she did stay for a chunk of all of our talks, I ended up spending more time with Bruno.

Our first meeting was scheduled on November 16th. We discussed the family history of the Bessettes and Brassards, the farm's own history, Geneviève and Bruno's experience starting their farm, and their local involvement. The aim was to become familiarized with FGBB and its context. The moment the interview was over, we planned for our next meeting to take place on the 23rd, only one week later. Sadly, we had to push back to the 30th due to the weather having been 'too good' and the Bessettes wanting to get some more work done. Come the 30th, we focused on the relationship between producer and syndical federation. It was then that I learned more about the hierarchy of agrarian unions in Québec. For instance, milk-producers, like FGBB, are members of the association Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec (PLQ), itself a branch of the UPA. We discussed agrarian demographics, such as how milk-producers constitute an individual majority, and what political effects this has on the

UPA, a semi-democratic union.

Lucky for me, the opportunity to witness the politics of Québec's agrarian unions was soon to come. The week after the second interview would hold the UPA's yearly congress in Québec City. As a way in, the Bessettes put me in contact with one of their friends, a senior member of the PLQ branch in the Laurentides. He knew well what to expect from the congress and he supplied me with a schedule and details on the different panels.

Since the congress, I have called or texted FGBB on average once every week. Throughout the months of January and February, I used these opportunities to supplement my data with as many clarifications as I needed.

PART 1 | The 2010 Skidoo-Standoff

The Assurance Stabilisation des Revenus Agricoles, or ASRA, was set up in 2001, providing every farm in Québec the guarantee of a stable yearly revenue (La Financière Agricole du Québec, 2001). The problem was that, over the following years, growing competition outside the province meant that more and more producers required help from the insurance. As such, by 2010, the Financière Agricole du Québec (FADQ) – the agency in charge of ASRA – had accumulated a deficit of \$750 M (Pouillot, n.d.).

The solution was a compromise. The Québec Government would help relieve the deficit, but in exchange the ASRA admissibility criteria would be narrowed down. Effectively, this meant as many as 25% of ASRA's membership would be cut off (Thériault, 2010). The impacted would have been the bottom-performers, either members who had required assistance on a streak or those with the smallest production rates. In other words, it would have cut off those most at risk. Whether getting rid of members would have made ASRA more viable is debatable. Regardless, it galvanized the response.

Upward and Inward

For a bit of context, skidoo is a major winter attraction in Québec. Some regions expect upwards of \$20M annually from related industries, such as housing and catering (Thériault, 2010). Skidoo clubs are represented by the Fédération des Clubs de Motoneigistes du Québec (FCMQ) which falls under the joint authority of the Ministère du Tourisme (MTQ), the Ministère des Forêts, de la Faune et des Parcs (MFFPQ) and the Ministère de l'Agriculture, des Pêcheries et de l'Alimentation (MAPAQ). However, by far their biggest partner is the UPA.

Skidoo-ing is a highly mobile activity, and it requires a lot of space. Given that most flat and well-tended lands in the province are occupied by farms, which are private property, it was inevitable that skidoo clubs would need the consent of producers. Lucky for them, an agreement was reached, overseen by the ministries, and the FCMQ was formed, incorporating clubs into one federation, with the mandate of managing and maintaining trails for its members and at its own costs (La Fédération des Clubs de Motoneigistes du Québec, n.d.). Nevertheless, producers still have the final word, and they can choose to close off their property whenever they want. Still, before 2010, this had rarely been an issue outside of isolated cases.

In response to the ASRA changes, the subject of trails cropped up in talks as early as June in Abitibi-Timiskaming (Lavoie, 2010). In July, both the Lanaudière and Outaouais-Laurentides regions began to chime in (Ménard, 2018). By September, the Abitibi-Timiskaming branch of the UPA officially endorsed boycotting the trails that year, though the other two regions stuck to threats (Plourde, 2010). While the central administration of the UPA was still against a full mobilization, other regional branches were starting to make threats too. For instance, the Bas-St-Laurent, Gaspésie and Île-de-la-Madeleine branches all stated they would commit to a standoff were it endorsed by the Union (Radio-Canada, 2010). In the end, on December 16th, 2010, after a few days of precipitation, the UPA officially gave the green light (Soucy, 2010); there would be no skidoos going around Québec until the government backed down on ASRA.

"Solidarity, I guess"

Milk production, like poultry and eggs, falls under Canada's national supply management framework. As such, they don't fall under ASRA. When asked why dairies would bother with the standoff at all, Bruno answered: "Solidarity, I guess."

Of course, there was more to it, as Bruno himself points out mere seconds later. Many milk producers complement their dairy production with other resources. FGBB, for instance, produces cereals, which just so happens to be an AS-RA-covered production type. According to Bruno, as many as half of their sector's dairies produce some grain on the side. Given this is a small side production, more strict applicability rules for the ASRA would have affected them directly. Hence, it was an interest-driven kind of solidarity.

Let's consider for a moment: Québec dairies are susceptible to strong national and international competition. As a security, many dedicate part of their estates to the cultivation of products which benefit from a public insurance. The latter was not meant for dairies, nor made with them in mind, yet they benefit from it by following its minimum criteria. Because of how widespread this practice is, the cereal sector has been slow to develop in Québec, though ASRA was designed in part to support it. Instead, the province's largest agrarian sector, dairy, is able to benefit from the insurance even though it was designed to exclude them.

Where the Skidoos Roam

Today, if you go to ASRA's website, you will see each eligible production type has its own criteria for admission. Tellingly, it no longer punishes farms for being too small, rather encouraging them to grow. Regardless of product market value, the farm is insurable for a fixed yearly revenue.

The 2010 Skidoo Standoff was a success both for producers and the UPA. It didn't make everyone happy, of course. Steve Gaudreau, the president of the local Rimouski club Panda Aventures, resigned from office to protest the boycott (Thériault, 2010), though the club officially endorsed it. Though Panda Aventures is a microcosm of the Québécois skidoo industry, this conflict of conscience is demonstrative of what was then a wider trend.

Another way of looking at the outcome is by interpreting the paper trail. ASRA's official document is forwarded by an annotation list of all revisions up to the most recent version. There is in fact a cluster of dated changes starting in March 2010 and peaking between September and December (La Financière Agricole du Québec, 2001). However, the following entry is dated March 2011, implying the length of negotiations. Further changes in September are singled out as retroactively applying to certain clauses from the 1st of January 2011 onward, hinting at their relation to the Standoff which, as we've seen, only really caught on at the turn of the year (La Financière Agricole du Québec, 2001).

The results of the 2010 Standoff are immortalised both in ASRA's preface and its annotations, and this isn't the last time. As recently as 2017, another skidoo confrontation was threatened by the UPA in response to the government's revisions of property taxes (Radio-Canada, 2017). Though it was finally averted, to the great relief of the FCMQ, the threat itself shows that the Union has learned a valuable lesson in 2010 and is now willing to use a leverage it knows can succeed (La Fédération des Clubs de Motoneigistes du Québec, 2017).

PART 2 | Two Exciting Purchases

The great Skidoo Standoff was a formative moment for the UPA. But what about its sub-federation, like Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec (PLQ)? Each has some degree of autonomy, determined mostly by the size of their membership. What, then, can that autonomy serve, and has good invariably come of it for milk producers?

The Good One

By 1940, Québec was fast becoming a regional leader in dairy production. Industry was booming, a middle class was growing, and its demands were high for dairy (Lavertue, 1984, p. 282). Many farms at the time chose to specialize. Laurentian farms, however, had been designed for self-reliance (Couture, 2003, 93). They each grew many kinds of produce, and rarely enough to sell. As such, it took some time for the region to catch up to the trend.

In 1948, to help dairies enhance their cows' quality and performance, the Ministère de l'Agriculture, des Pêcheries et de l'Alimentation du Québec (MAPAQ) set up a commission to organise an insemination service for producers. It remained under MAPAQ until 1981, when it got its own company: the Société Québécoise d'Initiatives Agro-Alimentaires (SO-QUIA) (Centre d'Insémination Artificielle du Québec, 2007, 3). In 1997, it became the biggest milk and bovine insemination provider in the province, and was renamed Semex Alliance (Centre d'Insémination Artificielle du Québec, 2007, 3).

In 1999, since its members now rely on its services, the PLQ

decided to acquire the company. At the time, it had 9,667 subscription-paying members (Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec 2000, 13). The union also relied on the help of the CQRL and CPCAB, which today are joint proprietors of the CIAQ (Centre d'Insémination Artificielle du Québec 2007, 3).

What can be pieced together of the deliberations at the PLQ comes from what has been recounted to dairy farmers like the Bessettes by their forefathers. FGBB wasn't in operation by 1999. Bruno and Geneviève weren't dairy farmers yet, but both their families were. It seems to have been very democratic, and the term "involved" is thrown around quite a bit. In short, the purchase happened once members were in agreement over its proceedings, its costs and its partnerships. The PLQ's administration oversaw the deal, but it didn't drive it.

Bruno describes the process of the purchase as such: "We were involved". What is interesting is that his farm, FGBB, wasn't even open in 1999. This would be an inherited narrative, a way of appropriating a role for the sake of association. The CIAQ purchase is still extremely well regarded among Québecois dairies. The emphasis is on the inclusive "We" serves to underline the communal nature of the decision. Regardless of who exactly was involved, what matters is that both producers and their union worked together, in a democratic fashion, to acquire a service which they all benefit from to this day. It has almost a mythical quality and serves to the interviewee as an example of the ideal decision-making process.

The Bad One

Cows that are good at producing milk aren't great at producing meat. Farms usually try to make their herd better at one or the other, hence the difference between the dairy and bovine industries. For obvious reasons, milk producers don't make it their main business to slaughter cows for their meat. However, when a male calf is born, or when a cow grows too old, a little extra cash can be made from what little they provide.

Revenue from slaughter is split between the producer and the slaughterhouse. The higher the value rate, the more the former gains, and vice versa. Male dairy calves and aged cows not only yield less meat, they also require different techniques and equipment. As such, not all slaughterhouses offer that service (La Vie Agricole, 2013). Instead, producers have to rely on specialized slaughterhouses like ALC, which generally have low value rates (La Vie Agricole, 2013).

According to Bruno, at the time ALC was the only specialized slaughterhouse operating in Québec. By 2004, it was owned by three brothers: Louis, Philip and Jake Cola (Laforest and Proulx, 2014). What made the PLQ decide to acquire ALC is somewhat blurry, but it looks as though it wanted more control over the value rates. No doubt it felt encouraged by the CIAQ acquisition a few years prior. Throughout the negotiations, tensions ran high. In early December, they came to a boiling point when the Cola brothers decided to hold the value rates hostage, and producers organized a walk-in of the slaughterhouse (Le Bulletin des Agriculteurs, 2004). The final deal was reached quickly after this escalation, with the PLQ – with the help of the Les Producteurs de Bovins du Québec (PBQ) – paying \$62,5M for a business that observers evaluated at \$19M (Laforest and Proulx, 2014). Most damning of all, Bruno says, the unions' leadership closed the deal without thorough consultation.

Consider Bruno's description of the events: "It passed - in some places less." Again, Bruno notes that he wasn't in operation back then, but that he imagines the process must have been quick and without much room for discussion. This is corroborated by the later demands for member contributions and the strong resistance they faced, so strong in fact as to involve the provincial courts. Had the consultation been more thorough, we should expect that these details would have been sorted out before the deed, as they had been with the CIAQ purchase. There is, interestingly, a noticeable reticence in the statement to deny democratic process outright. The project did get passed, but it did so in an incomplete manner. The rhetorical maneuver, instead of underlining community, singles out some places as having been of a different – less open – mind than others, implying some form of dissent. It remains vague on the ultimate role of producers and omits entirely trying to associate the Bessettes to the event. Bruno even follows with a reminder that FGBB wasn't even open at the time.

Quickly after the purchase, the business became unprofitable (Laforest and Proulx, 2014). Unions asked for more contributions from their members, which the latter didn't want to pay given how little they had played in reaching the final deal. Courts got involved, eventually siding with the members and setting new precedents on union funding. ALC became a semi-public property, and after many reshufflings is now a marijuana plantation (Ménard, 2018). Relations between the PLQ and the PBQ were embittered, courts set a precedent for union funding, and producers became wearier of big purchases. Everyone left bruised, having accomplished not a whole lot and not prepared to do much more.

PART 3 | Run-Ins with the FADQ and the RMAAQ

So far, we have looked at scenarios involving many farms at once. For this final chapter, I would like to narrow the scope down to the Bessettes and FGBB. Specifically, I want us to look at the lead-up to its founding. It may go without saying that some of the most decisive decisions young producers have to make take place that early. Yet, it is important to understand what those decisions are exactly and what are their significance in the long run.

A Matter of Life and Land

Geneviève and Bruno Bessette grew up as neighbours. When

they returned to La Conception after their studies, they planned on starting their own farm. To do so, they would need two things: land and quotas.

In short, land is pricey. The Bessettes' got theirs for around \$3M, and it is neither 'large' nor 'prime'. Needless to say, the vast majority of young, aspiring producers don't have multiple millions lying around for the occasion. Instead, it's usual to ask a bank for funding. If you're lucky, you might apply for an investment opportunity from the Financière Agricole du Québec, which we'll remember also runs the ASRA program. Either way, becoming a proprietor, and getting one step closer to owning your own farm, means you will start off in debt, and a pretty big one at that.

Producers don't have professional retirement programs, nor do they make enough on average to have a comfortable savings plan. However, they have a trump card: their land. The ideal scenario has always been to pass on the property to the next generation. The Bessettes have worked their land for some 6 generations now, and the Brassards, their neighbours, have done so for 5. Still, this often requires parents to wait on their children to build the professional and financial credibility necessary to convince the bank for funding. What's more, other interested parties need to be considered. Real estate developers can usually outbid young, aspiring producers lacking in property. The pressure is then put on the parents as to whether they are willing for a latter and tighter retirement, or if they would rather move on more comfortably.

This can potentially put a lot of strain on family relations. In fact, it is expected to. But what about the Bessettes? Well, Geneviève's parents weren't ready to sell, but Bruno's father was willing, and what's more he waited on them to get the credibility and even gave them a bargain price. So how do we know this is unusual? Namely, since it warranted a nomination to the Tournez-vous vers l'Excellence! competition. This prize, hosted annually by the FADQ, is meant to celebrate the ideal transfer of land from one generation to the next, with a reward of some thousand dollars for the winners (La Financière Agricole du Québec, 2019). The fact that a government agency would take the time to celebrate this transaction is telling. It shows authorities have a vested interest in this generational transfer, enough so to try and promote it through exposure.
A Matter of Rights and Butterfat

A quota represents the volume of milk that can be produced for profit per day (Mussel et Al. 2013, 3). For instance, if FGBB produces more than their quotas allow, they either have to throw it out or pay a penalty for its commercialization. This is because Canada operates on a supply management system, meaning only a fixed volume of milk can circulate in its national market at any given time (Mussel et Al. 2013, 5).

Quotas are a finite resource. Whenever a producer sells one, he puts it on auction and any other producer in the same province can bid on it (Mussel et Al. 2013, 5). In theory, since no quota can be handed down within one family, or sold at a bargain between neighbours, no farm can unfairly hoard them. In practice, it means they cost a lot, going as high as \$28,000 according to the Bessettes.

Before they could buy their own farm, Geneviève and Bruno started working at an uncle's. At the same time, they started acquiring their own cattle and their first few quotas. Lucky for them, they got wind of a close neighbour who was looking to sell his own. They got in contact and eventually they agreed on a deal.

To get around the auction, they appealed to the Régie des Marchés Agricoles et Alimentaires du Québec (RMAAQ), which has the power to exempt producers from the normal regulation in special circumstances (Harvey and Belzile 2012, 6). The Bessettes' arguments were that, not only were the neighbour's quotas inactive, but the area needed new producers to renew its agrarian sector. However, once they applied to the RMAAQ, the PLQ intervened. Apparently, the Bessettes' deal had been making waves, and as they had been building their case, three other dairies had come forward with similar applications (Harvey and Belzile 2012, 1). The PLQ argued that the purpose of the regulation was to prevent one area or family from accumulating quotas. Were FGBB allowed to acquire those owned by a neighbouring farm, any other farm would have to be allowed to do the same, thus invalidating the regulation (Harvey and Belzile 2012, 1).

RMAAQ did eventually side with the Bessettes, and they got to seal the deal with their neighbours. However, it did show them, right from the start of their careers as producers, that their union, the PLQ, would not always be their ally, and that they face off against it for the sake of their own business.

Conclusion

So, what tactics have we found? The use of unions is an obvious guess, but has it proven itself reliable? When it came to the 2010 Standoff, the earliest mobilization came from a regional branch. In fact, it took a province-wide mobilization before the UPA finally came out in support. By contrast, in 2004 the PLQ and the PBQ were too eager to reach a deal with ALC, a deal which would devolve into interminable conflicts and mounting bills for their constituents.

Whether too eager or too slow, the unions' intentions don't always line up with those of producers. This is doubly true in moments of high pressure, like a provincial crisis or a tough negotiation. Though their resources can allow for great endeavors, like coordinating the Standoff across Québec or purchasing the CIAQ, they come with a large and slow apparatus. What's more, though resources are supplied by producers, how they are used is not wholly democratic. Luckily for producers, the UPA is subdivided into regions and agrarian specialties. This means each has at least two branches of representation. In fact, these branches come out looking the most decisive actors of the first two scenarios. After all, in 2010, they drove the movement, and it was their mounting appeals that finally made the UPA budge. For the PLQ's purchases, producers had a great deal of say when it came to the CIAQ, and though the union ignored them for ALC, the courts did establish that without their consultation the PLQ could make no demands after the fact. The conclusion is this: what protects the viability of a 21st century Québécois dairy like FGBB is first and foremost its involvement in the UPA, and most importantly in its sub-federations. That said, producers should not only depend on the unions. Both after ALC and in the quotas fight, the Government of Québec – through one of its agencies – proved a better ally to producers than the unions. Of course, producers can't expect to benefit from this affiliation all the time. The 2010 Standoff, for instance, pitted them against the government. Understand, rather, that alliances are circumstantial and that, whenever agendas align, producers should try and make the most of them.

Finally, perhaps the most important tactic for young and aspiring producers is to invest in their family relations. In today's market, it is easiest – though not easy – to get land from one's own family, particularly one's parents. Besides getting it, the price at which one gets their land will have long-term impacts on their financial situation. What they should aim for is, invariably, the best bargain they can get. And seeing as they will most likely buy it from their sires, the verdict is: be nice to your parents.

References

Blanchard, R. (1938). Études Canadiennes (Deuxième série). III, Les Laurentides. Revue de Géographie Alpine, 26, 1–183.

Canadian Dairy Information Center. (2020). Number of farms, dairy cows and dairy heifers. Dairy Information Centre.https://www.dairyinfo.gc.ca/eng/dairy-statistics-and-market-information/farm-statistics/farms-dairycows-and-dairy-heifers/?id=1502467423238

Centre d'Insémination Artificielle du Québec. (2007). Mémoire du Centre d'Insémination Artificielle du Québec. Centre d'Insémination Artificielle du Québec, 2-14.

Couture, P. (2003). Antoine Labelle: L'apôtre de la colonisation. Les Éditions XYZ. https://www-deslibris-ca.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/ID/417229

Gheller, F. (2018). Governing large-scale farmland acquisitions in Québec: the conventional family farm model questioned. Agriculture and Human Values, 35, 623–636.

Glen, B. (2019). First round of dairy farmer payments unveiled. The Western Producer, https://www.producer. com/2019/11/first-round-of-dairy-payments-unveiled/

Government of Canada. (2019). Government of Canada Announces Compensation for Supply-Managed Dairy Producers. https://www.canada.ca/en/agriculture-agri-food/ news/2019/08/government-of-canada-announces-compensation-for-supply-managed-dairy-producers.html

Harvey, B, & Belzile, A. (2012). Décision sur la Demande de Rectification et Décision Rectifiée. Régie des Marchés Agricoles et Alimentaires du Québec.

La Financière Agricole du Québec. (n.d). Assurance stabilisation: Admissibilité. https://www.fadq.qc.ca/fr/assurance-stabilisation/admissibilite/

La Financière Agricole du Québec. (n.d). Concours 2019 Tournez-vous vers l'excellence! https://www.fadq.qc. ca/a-propos-de-nous/concours-tournez-vous-vers-lexcellence/concours-2019-tournez-vous-vers-lexcellence/

La Financière Agricole du Québec. (n.d). Concours 2020 Tournez-vous vers l'excellence! https://www.fadq.qc.ca/apropos-de-nous/concours-tournez-vous-vers-lexcellence/ concours-2019-tournez-vous-vers-lexcellence/

La Financière Agricole du Québec. (2019). Plan Stratégique 2018-2022. http://legisquebec.gouv.qc.ca/fr/pdf/cr/P-28,%20R.%201.pdf

La Financière Agricole du Québec. (2019, July 11). 14e Concours Tournez-vous vers l'excellence! - Deux finalistes dans la région des Laurentides! Cision, https://www. newswire.ca/news-releases/14e-concours-tournez-vousvers-l-excellence-deux-finalistes-dans-la-region-des-laurentides--869702427.html Laforest, A, & Proulx, D. (2014, February 12). Achat de l'abattoir Levinoff-Colbex: une transaction financière peu rentable. Le Journal de Montréal. https://www.jour-naldemontreal.com/2014/02/12/achat-de-labattoir-levi-noff-colbex--une-transaction-financiere-peu-rentable

Lavertue, R. (1984). L'Histoire de l'Agriculture Québécoise au XIXe siècle : une Schématisation des Faits et des Interprétations. Cahiers de Géographie du Québec, 28, 275–287.

La Vie Agricole. (2013, November 20). Un abattoir pour bovins au Québec, une nécessité! http://lavieagricole.ca/372/

Lavoie, D. (2010, June 11). Accès aux motoneigistes menacé au Témiscamingue? Motoneiges.ca. https://motoneiges.ca/ actions/page?docId=3551&ctx=ctx&p=Des%20agriculteurs%20de%20Lanaudiere%20et%20Outaouais-Laurentides%20menacent%20de%20fermer%20les%20sentiers%20de%20motoneige&request_locale=en

Le Bulletin des Agriculteurs. (2004, December 3). Les producteurs achètent l'abattoir Colbex-Levinoff.https://www. lebulletin.com/actualites/les-producteurs-achtent-labattoir-colbex-levinoff-26503

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Chaudière-Appalaches-Sud. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-chaudiere-appalaches-sud/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Chaudière-Appalaches-Nord. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/ portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-chaudiere-appalaches-nord/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Centre-du-Québec. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-centre-du-quebec/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Lanaudière. Lait. org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-lanaudiere/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/les-producteurs-lait-du-quebec/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Mauricie. Lait. org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-mauricie/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Montérégie-Est. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-monteregie-est/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Montérégie-Ouest. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-monteregie-ouest/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Outaouais-Laurentides. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/portrait-outaouais-laurentides/ Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Portrait de la Production de Lait au Québec. Lait.org http://lait.org/no-tre-organisation/portrait-production-laitiere-au-quebec/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (n.d). Rapport Annuel. Lait.org http://lait.org/notre-organisation/rapport-annuel/

Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec. (2000). Recherche Économique. Rapport Annuel FPLQ 1999, 12-13. Les Producteurs de Lait du Québec.

Ménard, M. (2018, July 3). Levinoff-Colbex : de l'abattage au cannabis. La Terre de Chez Nous. https://www.laterre.ca/actualites/levinoff-colbex-de-labattage-cannabis

Mussel, A, Seguin, B, & Sweetland, J. (2013). Canada's Supply-Managed Dairy Policy : an Agenda for Reform. George Morris Centre.

Plourde, G. (2010, September 2). Sentier de motoneige menacé dans les régions de l'Abitibi, Lanaudière et Laurentides? L'Echo de Laval https://motoneiges.ca/actions/page?docId=3593&ctx=ctx&p=Sentier%20de%20motoneige%20 menace%20dans%20les%20regions%20de%20l\%27Abitibi,%20Lanaudiere%20et%20Laurentides%20?&request_locale=en

Radio-Canada. (2010, September 10). Moyens de pression limités. Ici Radio-Canada https://ici.radio-canada.ca/nouvelle/486247/agriculteurs-moyens-pression

Radio-Canada. (2017, January 17). Pas de fermeture des sen-

tiers de motoneige pour l'instant, dit l'UPA. Ici Radio-Canada. https://ici.radio-canada.ca/nouvelle/1010436/pas-defermeture-des-sentiers-de-motoneige-pour-linstant-dit-lupa

Soucy, Y. (2010, December 16). L'UPA commence à bloquer les sentiers de motoneige. Le Droit. https://motoneiges.ca/actions/page?docId=3926&ctx=ctx&the-Action=&p=L%5C%27UPA%20commence%20a%20 bloquer%20les%20sentiers%20de%20motoneige&request_ locale=fr

Thériault, C. (2010, November 17). Fermeture des sentiers de motoneige par l'UPA: un président de club démissionne. Le Soleil. https://www.lesoleil.com/affaires/fermeture-dessentiers-de-mo\\\toneige-par-lupa-un-president-de-clubdemissionne-0646683931387e180ea3ba05af43120b

Chapter XIII

Buying the Government's Ganja: Changing Consumption Practices Among Montreal's Longterm Marijuana Consumers

Written By: Yana Iossel

Chapter XIII Written By: Yana Iossel

The earliest recorded European use of marijuana in Canada dates to the early 17th century (Rubin, 1975, 497). Some believe that it was introduced by white settlers while others believe it has further history (Spicer, 2002). Marijuana was used both medically and recreationally in Canada, until the first legal prohibition of cannabis, implemented in 1923 (Rubin, 1975, 497).

Canada legalized the recreational use of marijuana on October 17, 2018 (Canada 2018). The Cannabis Act, or Bill C-45, was intended to regulate and restrict Canadians' access to cannabis. By legalizing recreational marijuana, the Government hoped to replace the illicit market by providing comparable products and cracking down on the penalties for the possession, production, distribution, and sale of marijuana outside the legal system. Unsurprisingly, the illicit market remains, with reports from 2019, claiming 40% of Canadians still purchase at least some of their marijuana from non-legal sources (Global News, 2019; Tunney, 2019). Statistics Canada (2018) demonstrates smaller numbers for Quebec, with an estimate closer to 10%. Montreal is Quebec's most populous municipality and has always had a rich and vivid nightlife, which can be well accompanied by the use of marijuana (Manson, 2014). Accordingly, marijuana use in Montreal has been a topic of investigation throughout the 20th century (Rubin, 1975).

My research focused on the narratives participants constructed around marijuana consumption to elucidate an understanding of marijuana as an identity-forming commodity. We met several times in cafes, markets, and in both participants' houses and mine. Other times, I would accompany them on errands, or we would attend art shows and events together. I conducted two formal interviews. Research was conducted between December 16, 2019 and February 28, 2020.

The Société Québécoise du Cannabis (SQDC) is the only place in Quebec to purchase marijuana legally. There are four locations on the island of Montreal, all with a similar layout. During peak hours, customers queue outside the store until they are allowed entry, upon which their IDs are checked in a vestibule separate from the product. Customers then enter in a room with a long counter behind which all the products are sorted by strains of marijuana (sativa, indica, and hybrid). The SQDC offers marijuana flowers, oils, capsules, sprays, and THC infused beverages, as well as small paraphernalia, including flower grinders and rolling papers. Customers can then complete the purchase using their preferred method of payment.

The process of procuring marijuana illicitly is less standardized, though some conventions apply. The participants expressed that almost all transactions were initiated via text. From there, some marijuana dealers provide delivery services while others require customers to go to their houses. Illicit transactions use cash only, and the use of small change is strongly discouraged. The research could not have materialized if not for the participants' candor. To provide participants with the utmost confidentiality, all names have been changed and no detailed reference to their identities is provided. It is worth noting why I chose to refer to those who sell illicit marijuana as "drug dealers". Dickinson and Jacques (2018) note:

"Many illicit drug sellers [...] resist feeling guilty by not thinking of themselves as 'drug dealers" (18).

This demonstrates that the term drug dealer comes with preconceived notions of illegality and guilt and, as such, may be considered a value-laden term. Similarly, it can serve as an umbrella term to refer to those that sell various illicit narcotics, hallucinogens, and stimulants. Despite this, drug dealer is common vernacular and was the term most often used by participants (and accordingly, how a participant, Chris, self-identifies).

The question I will be answering in this essay is as follows: Is marijuana understood as a gift or a commodity, or perhaps, both?

Chapter One: Marijuana as a Gift

Prior to legalization in Canada, options for procuring were

limited in scope. Though there were an abundance of illicit retailers, they all followed a relatively similar model of covert, of interpersonal arrangements made to acquire marijuana. C.A. Gregory ([1982] 2015) uses a Marxian approach to differentiate between gifts and commodities (6). Gifts, to Gregory ([1982] 2015), are inalienable from the individual who provides them because they establish a system of reciprocity (6). Illicit marijuana could be understood as inalienable, as some degree of interpersonal relationship is required for its exchange.

Kinship and Merchandise Bonds

Both procuring and consuming marijuana are social when considering marijuana as a gift. I met Ian, a 22-year-old man, who had moved to Montreal from Vancouver shortly after graduating high-school and had never smoked marijuana prior to his move. He began trying marijuana through friends and progressively became a regular user. Ian discussed marijuana use during a particularly difficult depressive episode in the summer of 2019. Often incapable of leaving his house for days, his drug dealer would come to his house when delivering marijuana. Ian noted, "Sometimes it's the only human interaction I'd have in like a week or a day". Though Ian remarked that such "small interactions" were generally superficial, it would momentarily make him feel better, observing that "it's human contact."

Alexandra, a 22-year-old Concordia student, similarly noted that she and her high school drug dealer have since become close friends. She explained that as their friendship grew over the years, she started accompanying him at his family dinners, noting: "his dad's a really nice guy". She continues to purchase from him regularly as a display of loyalty.

Christian Giordano (2018) contends that an individual's social knowledge is used to make conscious purchases (159). He mentions that interpersonal relationships inform purchasing decisions, as individuals prefer to acquire an object through personal relations rather than a sterile, impersonal store. An object acquired from a "durable, personal relationship" is likely to have positive, personal sentiments projected unto it, "even if the object is produced by anonymous factory workers" (Giordano, 2018, 155). Gifts are inalienable, as they establish a relationship of reciprocity between individuals (Gregory, [1982] 2015, 6). Commodity exchange, contrastingly, involves the exchange of two objects with equal value and thus reciprocity occurs instantaneously, and no further relationship is required (Gregory, [1982] 2015, 6). When conceived of as a gift, the object takes on a more personal, inalienable form, even the illicit the exchange of marijuana (Gregory, [1982] 2015, 6). Even if the two forms of marijuana were procured from the same supplier, national legalization transformed marijuana into a commodity and, thus, into an alienable object. Thus, where products are available to purchase greatly informs the sentiments attached to the acquired object. Individuals may prefer to purchase from a drug dealer with whom they can associate a face or establish an interpersonal relationship with, rather than the more sterile, government-run SQDC. [5] Giordano's article implies that the purchasing experience influences consumers' attitudes, regardless of where marijuana products are originally sourced from. Furthermore, Marx (1844) and Gregory ([1982] 2015) contend that a capitalist system estranges individuals and alienates commodities from the suppliers. This notion can, for example, be corroborated by mine and my participants' lack of consideration for those who cultivate and grow the actual product so extensively discussed in this research. It is the experience rather than the quality of the product that consumers prioritize. Gregory ([1982] 2015)

marks the importance of kinship in the distinction between gifts and commodities: "Gift exchange tends to be between people who are relatives; as the kinship distance lengthens, and the transactors become strangers, commodity exchange emerges" (18). The more an object becomes alienated from the individual providing it, the more it shifts from a gift to a commodity. Many consider drug dealers their friends, an individual with whom they have a longstanding bond. It could be argued that the illicit trade of marijuana is a gift exchange because of the kinship distance between the consumer and the drug dealer.

Relationships with Drug Dealers

On using Mauss' The Gift to conceptualize hospitality, Benjamin Boudou (2012) argues that hospitality has the social function of making "explicit the way a community forms bonds with, exposes itself to, or seals itself from outsiders" (25). Purchasing from a drug dealer often implies the establishment of trust and connection to an individual with whom there is a shared consensus of secrecy. As such, the purchaser-dealer dynamic forms an interpersonal bond while intentionally sealing themselves off from outsiders or potential criminal repercussions. Masson and Bancroft (2018) note that friendship is fundamental when purchasing illicitly. Focusing primarily on cryptomarkets, they note that when a cryptomarket buyer shares wares with friends, it serves as "part risk-management and part deal" (83). This form of risk management clearly establishes an interpersonal relationship, reiterating the notion that marijuana serves as a gift exchange between homogenous groups of people. Several participants have discussed a sense of loyalty towards their drug dealers and continue to purchase from them for such reasons. Such was the case with Alexandra, who has been purchasing from the same individual since mid-high school. The relationship was facilitated too, because her drug dealer was of a similar age to her. She discussed spending time at his house and having dinners with his parents. A friend of hers, Fiona, had recently moved from Ottawa and joined us for coffee one day. Fiona said she considered him a personal friend and missed him.

I had the privilege of speaking to the individual from whom I personally purchased marijuana in high school. Chris, a man in his mid-twenties, runs a service selling marijuana products in Montreal. I've known him for about eight years, as we briefly attended the same high school and met in later years

through mutual friends. Once a much smaller operation, he now employs upwards of five people to provide clients with a daily delivery service between 12pm and 10pm. Along with cannabis flowers, Chris provides marijuana infused oils, sprays, and an assortment of edible marijuana products. His prices are comparable to the SQDC, with a gram of dried flower averaging about \$9 CAD. Now, the SQDC does not offer edible products other than beverages. Unlike Fiona and Alexandra, who have remained loyal to their drug dealers, Chris notes that following legalization his clientele has dropped by 50% for people under the age of 35. Interestingly, in people over the age of 35, he notes, loyalty "has stayed 100%". The variable of age was unfortunately not explored in the process of my field work as all participants were in their early twenties, but it would be a valuable point of inquiry for later works.

a. Sexuality

Most of the participants were women, and though this may have provided the study with a particular bias, several women mentioned their discomfort towards their male dealers' continued advances. Barbara, a 23-year-old Concordia student, shops exclusively at her local SQDC. She does so largely out of convenience, but she mentioned her avoidance of the previous dealer she had: "I would try to buy in bulk so I could see him as little as possible". After expressing her disinterest several times, Barbara's drug dealer continued to make advances, increasing her discomfort around him. The impersonal, alienating nature of the SQDC was a welcome change to the highly personal, undesired advances of her previous exchanges. Similarly, Gregory ([1982] 2015) writes: "What a gift transactor desires is the personal relationships that the exchange of gifts creates, and not the things themselves" (13).

Many girls mentioned that flirtatious advances were often manifested in cheaper prices or better service. This corroborates Gregory's ([1982] 2015) above quote, as suppliers would rather establish a bond (whether feelings are reciprocated or not) than maximize their profits.

b. Choice

While complaining about his loss of clientele, Chris complained that his loss of clientele was due to the new and many options available. The SQDC's opening changed the patterns of consumption from small face-to-face interactions with drug dealers to large retail spaces with an ever-changing staff. Ian, who purchases from both his drug dealer and the SQDC stated: "Y'know, the SQDC— they see a thousand people a day. They're not gonna remember your face". A drawback for some, the impersonal nature of the SQDC is sought after by others.

Chapter Two: Marijuana as a Commodity

The emergence of the SQDC shifts marijuana from a quasi-gift to a commodity. Gregory ([1982] 2015) uses a Marxian approach to elucidate that commodities are distinct from gifts because they are alienable. Marx (1844) contends that under a capitalist system individuals become alienated both from the products they produce and from each other, noting "an immediate consequence of the fact that man is estranged from the product of his labor, from his life activity, from his species-being, is the estrangement of man from man. When man confronts himself, he confronts the other man" (XXIV). The shift of marijuana consumption from the illicit market to the retail spaces of the SQDC estranges customers from the employees and renders the experience significantly less personal than interactions with drug dealers. Additionally, while a gift exchange occurs between similar individuals, a commodity exchange implies difference between the transactors (Gregory, [1982] 2015: 46). Perhaps, this contributes to the sentiment that transactions with drug dealers are highly personal, while the SQDC is perceived as sterile and impersonal.

Systems of Surveillance and Privacy

Several participants expressed that they preferred shopping at the SQDC because of the privacy it offers that an illicit transactional process may not. Ian noted: "I knew if I was going to the SQDC to buy it [marijuana] I wasn't remembered. I would buy an eighth [3.5 grams, or 1/8th of an ounce] and so I wouldn't go often enough to be remembered like a regular. And that made me feel better because I was too anxious [to be personable]". Though shopping at the SQDC may feel anonymous when compared to an interpersonal transaction, it is, arguably, significantly less private than an illicit transaction. Lines are on public, often heavily frequented streets. Additionally, personal I.D. must be verified to ensure entry, and if an individual chooses to pay with credit or debit cards a record of their purchases is established. What constitutes privacy? Perhaps individuals are more accustomed to being monitored by external or institutional forces like street cameras, bank statements, and security officers than they are purchasing a commodity from a direct interaction. As such, one-on-one interactions can feel significantly more intrusive than the experience of entering a physical store.

Van den Hoven and Vermaas (2007) discuss the use of nano-technology and contemporary panopticism, and note that "nano-technology can no doubt in due course play its part in the building of a societal panopticon. Extremely small or invisible sensors may be used to feed information into a central database," and most individuals are either unaware or lack an understanding of the degree of surveillance they are under (291, 296).

Hoven and Vermaas (2007) demonstrate that the technology a retail space like the SQDC requires is inherently public. Additionally, as selling non-governmental marijuana is illegal, drug dealers implement increasingly elaborate measures to remain covert. When visiting Chris's relatively upscale apartment - for which he pays his rent entirely in cash - he showed me his three cellular phones. His 'burners' all served different functions, having different numbers for different tiered clients. His main cellphone was reserved for personal use, as his business 'burners' would frequently have the SIM cards and numbers changed. Ultimately, to leave no trace of the transaction.

Is it the immediacy of the transaction that makes the SQDC feel more comfortable of a purchasing venue? Gregory ([1982] 2015) additionally notes:

"Commodity exchange — the exchange of unlike-for-unlike— establishes a relation of equality between the objects exchanged. [...] In a commodity economy, because of the operation of the law of value, two heterogenous things are treated as equivalent and the problem is to find the common measure. Gift exchange — the exchange of like-for-like establishes an unequal relationship of domination between the transactors. This comes about because the giver usually is regarded as superior to the receiver" (46).

Many participants mentioned that the procurement of marijuana from a drug dealer almost felt like a favour. Reflecting on one dealer, Barbara noted: "Ugh- he was NEVER on time. He had a minimum order to deliver, so I'd have to buy more than I may have wanted anyway. And then, I'd text him and sometimes spend all night waiting for him to show up." Though the transactors are relatively equal, the service provided by drug dealers instills a feeling of indebtedness in customers. With commodity exchange, however, marijuana is exchanged for the amount of money that it has been deemed value. The relationship between transactors at the SQDC is terminated once the marijuana has been exchanged for currency. Most participants who purchase from the SQDC do so because of the rapidity of transactions. Transactors do not maintain extended contact and no small talk is required. Many equated procuring marijuana from the SQDC to purchasing alcohol at the SAQ. As such, the SQDC provides the illusion of privacy.

Conversely, for Barbara, the public nature of the SQDC was in fact what was appealing. Barbara is in her final semester at Concordia in Early-Childhood Education. She also works part time as an elementary school teaching aid. Given the nature of her profession, she struggled with the desire to continue smoking marijuana as she saw it as unprofessional. Marijuana consumption was highly stigmatized and seemed incompatible with her desired line of work. She noted that her experience shopping at the SQDC for the first time was both humanizing and grounding. "It's nice to see how normal it is", she said, and noted that the customers at the SQDC represented a "realistic depiction of people who smoke weed, rather than the preconceived notion of it being something 'sketchy'. It destigmatizes it." Participants are aware of the public nature of the SQDC but purchasing feels more covert because of the lack of interaction needed.

Institutional Distrust and Lack of Governmental Support

The Quebec government's monopoly is a dissuading aspect of marijuana commodification following legalization that several participants commented on. Many participants discussed their contempt towards the political implementation of marijuana legalization. Brian, a 21-year-old Anthropology and Political Science student, was the only participant who no longer purchased from the SQDC. He showed me the websites he uses to purchase marijuana, pointing out the particularly good "deals". He got quite upset when I asked why he did not like the way marijuana legalization had been implemented in Quebec. "I f**king hate the SQDC" he expressed, "I think that private industry should be in charge of weed. It's such a promising industry that could bring so much money to Quebec. But, they're not doing it because it's a provincial jurisdiction- [that's] f**king stupid". Ian also said: "I'd rather support small people than the f**king government. Might as well get these guys [drug dealers] to pay their f**king bills. They [the SQDC] are always gonna get the old people, [and] the people who can't get numbers [for illicit services]". The sentiments of participants corroborates Silvia Camussi and Anna Laura Mancini's (2019) claims that: "citizens might be reluctant to pay directly or indirectly (through taxes) for services provided by institutions perceived as corrupt, inefficient or slovenly" (500). Though many continue to purchase from the SQDC, they described their unhappiness towards the privatization of marijuana in Quebec. Similarly, a participant under the newly established legal purchasing age expressed her concern regarding the safety and health implications of the government's decision to retroactively increase the legal age of consumption. As such, many individuals were unhappy with the general functioning of the SQDC but continued to be patrons.

Chapter Three: Marijuana as Both Gift and Commodity

I argue that the recent legalization of marijuana has shifted marijuana from operating within the confines of a gift exchange to a commodity exchange. Presented with options that disrupted the singular model previously maintained, the ways in which individuals interact with marijuana consumption has changed. Such is the case regardless of where they purchase from and regardless of whether or not their purchasing patterns have changed. Gregory ([1982] 2015) writes: "A thing is now a gift, now a commodity, depending upon the social context of the transaction. [...] Things assume different social forms at different times and in different places (125)". Such demonstrates the processual and dual nature of marijuana's consideration as an object. Marijuana, thus, can exist as both a gift and a commodity, depending on the context.

Economic and Political Motivations

The works of Hayward (2010) and Willen (2007) demonstrate that the narratives people use shape how the discussed object is conceived. Following legalization, many of the discussions with participants revolved around the cost of marijuana. Though I did not have the capacity to perform a comparative study, it seems as though prior to legalization, drug dealers exclusively dictated market prices. Similarly, all suppliers in the illicit trade tended to have a generally similar price. The emergence of legal marijuana has provided consumers with a cornucopia of choices, from illicit products to legal marijuana and grey areas like online retailers. All participants (except Chris, who I suppose worries less about personal consumption than encouraging his clients to consume) discussed the cost difference between illicit marijuana and the SQDC without provocation. The capacity for choice and cost comparison demonstrates that legalization has transformed consumers' perception of marijuana to an economic commodity. Ultimately, whether or not participants decide to buy from a drug dealer, marijuana still exists as a commodity because it is being conceptualized, interpreted, and discussed as one.

As such, consumers understand marijuana as a commodity within a post-legal context. It is, thus, the processual nature of purchasing that renders marijuana both a gift and a commodity depending on the context. Legalization, however, has impacted the economic considerations that precede purchasing. Kenesei and Todd (2003) studied the importance of price in purchasing decisions, noting that "only between 54% and 60% of the shoppers look at the price tag at all" (4). Essentially, though price is perceived to be a huge deciding factor, a variety of assemblages influence consumer decisions. Diaz and Cataluña (2011) found that price is a more important variable for consumer practices when individuals do not have an established emotional bond between consumer and supplier, yet the above-mentioned quote by Kenesei and Todd (2003) demonstrates that price, while important, is not a rigid decisive factor regardless of emotional bond. Similarly, the prices provided by drug dealers are often competitive with those of the SQDC and, as per Kenesei and Todd (2003), while individuals may acknowledge the increased price they may still prefer to pay more to purchase from the SQDC specifically for the lack of emotional connection. Interestingly, however, even participants who were completely loyal to their specific drug dealers communicated costs and compared the prices they received to those offered by the SQDC, demonstrating the perceived importance of price. Essentially, as marijuana has emerged as a commodity following legalization, individuals use cost to best communicate difference between illicit and legal markets. Though they may discuss cost as a priority, the decision of where to procure marijuana is ultimately bound up in a series of interpersonal considerations.

Relationships Maintained Through Marijuana

The sharing of marijuana has yet to be extensively discussed and creates some ideological problems when considering marijuana pre and post legalization within the binary of gift versus commodity. For the purposes of comparison, I maintain that illicit transactions, as they necessitate various social constraints and rules, operate within Gregory's ([1982] 2015) definition of a gift exchange. How do we make sense, then, of the more conventional understanding of gift exchange between friends and peers?

Hunt and Barker (2001) argue that drugs serve as a mediator in interpersonal relationships, establishing friendship and confirming mutual interests (179). Some participants described using marijuana as a medium to facilitate interactions with individuals whom they may not have much in common with. Many women discussed using marijuana as an extension of their sexual repertoires. Angela, a 20-yearold Gender Studies student at McGill University, had an entire routine regarding sexual encounters. On one occasion, she graciously invited me to her home for a small gathering with her friends. Her apartment, a recently renovated apartment in the Plateau that she shares with her best friend, had a designated desk in the living room for rolling marijuana cigarettes. The plastic containers from the SQDC were labeled with her and her roommate's names and sat, piled in the corner of the desk. Her roommate had worked in a vintage store in the United States and found an antique cigar-box which they re-appropriated for marijuana use, storing scissors, rolling papers, and pre-rolled joints inside. While her roommate sat at the desk, laboriously preparing joints for the gathering's guests, Angela discussed her dating techniques. She described waiting until exactly half an hour before a date would come over to clean her apartment while smoking a joint. Doing so, she explained, would provide her with the "perfect high" when her date arrived and would alleviate any sense of discomfort or "awkwardness" she may have on a first encounter.

Harding and Zinberg concluded that while some use marijuana alone, most participants in their 1977 study consumed

the drug socially. Though all participants smoke alone, they also, all reported smoking socially. Consumption is still intrinsically social, especially if procured from a drug dealer with whom one must have a pre-existing social bond (or have been referred by someone who does). Furthermore, marijuana was often brought as form of hospitality to social gatherings. When discussing this with Ian, he noted that he never had an issue bringing marijuana to social gatherings, because he knew the act would be reciprocated— "I never ask them to pitch [in] because they're my boys, I know they're good for it". Evidently, Ian is relying on the reciprocal nature of gift exchange (Gregory, [1982] 2015). "They're good for it" shows assumption that they will provide marijuana upon future encounters. The circular nature of their marijuana exchange, thus, solidifies and maintains their friendshipestablishing them as "boys". Negative repercussions can be faced when this cycle is unidirectional, like labelling someone as a "mooch" (someone who always smokes marijuana but never provides), terminating a friendship, or, having to endure the discomfort of asking for economic compensation.

Returning to the initial question, how do we understand marijuana as a gift both in illicit transactions and in social
gatherings? Sherry (1983) writes "gift giving, then, is properly a vehicle of social obligation and political maneuver [...]. Gifts are tangible expressions of social relationships" (158). Within such a definition, illicit transactions evidently fit within a gift economy. Individuals expressed close bonds with their drug dealers. Chris, too, expressed that he considers many of his customers as close friends. Under such conditions, marijuana operates as a tangible expression of the social relations and rules that dictate the exchange. Sherry notes, however: "Gift giving is typically conceived of as exchange that is non-exploitive and characterized by a high level of sociability (Johnson, 1974). Ostensibly, there is no expectation of equivalent or formal return" (Sherry, 1983, 159). Evidently, drug dealers expect an equivalent monetary return. This contradicts the notion that illicit marijuana consumption operates as a gift economy. These transactions are, however, too social to imply a commodity exchange where both products and transactors are alienable from each other. Where does that place these transactions? If considered purely through Gregory's ([1985] 2015) model, it seems they operate in a liminal space between commodity and gift. Arguably, marijuana itself is not the defining characteristic. Rather, it is the interactions defining whether the exchange

is of gifts or commodities. These illicit transactions disrupt the binary presented by Gregory ([1985] 2015), placing drug deals in a middle ground, as a quasi-gift exchange. Mauss ([1954] 2002) explains the nature of illicit transactions following legalization and demonstrates the social relationships that characterize the gift exchange. Mauss ([1954] 2002) contends that a gift necessitates reciprocity (82). A "perpetual state of dependence" is characteristic of a gift economy, as one must constantly repay the gift to maintain a sense of equality between transactors (Mauss, [1954] 2002, 82). He elaborates: "The producer who carries on exchange feels once more—he has always felt it, but this time he does so acutely— that he is exchanging [...] his time, his life. Thus he wishes to be rewarded, even if only moderately, for this gift" (Mauss, [1954] 2002, 99). Much like Gregory ([1985] 2015), Mauss ([1954] 2002) presents a Marxist understanding of the gift as something with the capacity to alienate. In Mauss's aforementioned quote, he argues that lack of reciprocity has the potential to alienate the producer from his craft or render him less productive. Thus, Mauss ([1954] 2002) contends that even within Gregory's ([1985] 2015) understanding of commodity exchange - where goods are exchanged for their monetary value- the relationship between the producer and the consumer is intrinsically social as the producer imparts "something of himself" in the commodity exchanged, noting that "the mutual ties and alliance that they establish are comparatively indissoluble" (Mauss, [1954] 2002, 42). What I had considered a quasi-gift exchange under Gregory's ([1985] 2015) conceptual framework can be understood as part of a moral economy in Maussian terms (Mauss [1954] 2002, 30).

Ultimately, Mauss ([1954] 2002) contends that all economics lie first and foremost in the social. To trade, he believes, is to give mutual satisfaction. His text suggests a sense of camaraderie, as people become indissolubly linked through the transactions they take part in.

Anthropologist Sasha Newell (2012) expands upon this concept and contends that illicit transactions operate under a "moral economy," explaining it as "a system in which people often exchange for the purpose of maintaining and accumulating social relations, rather than merely for the purpose of maximizing their profits [...] The maintenance and accumulation of these relationships is its own kind of profit" (67). Newell's analysis applies to the economy of illicit transactions. The above quote demonstrates the liminal quality of illicit marijuana exchange as both a gift and a commodity. The moral economy perspective allows us to understand marijuana as a commodity infused with social relations. By understanding illicit marijuana transactions as part of a moral economy, we can alleviate the tension between Gregory's ([1985] 2015) gift and commodity dichotomy. Kinship and sociality lie at the core of the moral economy and are more motivating to trade than profit. Such could be seen when Barbara's drug dealer gave her better prices to charm her. Similarly, let us recall Alexandra's drug dealer who is now a close friend. Newell (2012) adds that "social connections are a liability, a collection of obligations that weighs down personal accumulation, but they are also the buoy keeping most people afloat" (68). Drug dealers rely on developing social connections to both maintain their secrecy and encourage customers' return. Similarly, many participants were more apt to pay drug dealers than the SQDC, as they perceived it more beneficial to provide income to an individual they related to. Newell (2012), too, corroborates this, as he notes: "the moral obligation to share one's earnings with one's friends and family must be honored" (68).

Through the close relationships formed with drug dealers, consumers feel a sense of obligation to provide them with income before considering the SQDC. Though all participants still frequented the SQDC, they all understood purchasing from drug dealers as a mutually beneficial process that could directly contribute to "paying someone's bills", as Ian mentioned. As the exchange of marijuana between drug dealers and their clients is necessarily social, we can understand these transactions as belonging to a moral economy.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the legalization of marijuana has provided long-term consumers with the choice of how to procure their marijuana. Once only available from drug dealers, the Canadian government's entry into the market has rendered marijuana an object to be considered economically by consumers. By considering it in economic terms, marijuana becomes interpreted as a commodity that can be alienated from its source of purchase (the SQDC). Additionally, the relationship between retail workers and customers becomes increasingly distant and estranged. As such, consumers may privilege the SQDC as their destination for marijuana consumption as it provides an impersonal and seemingly private purchasing experience. This model is opposite to the moral economy of the illicit market, which is bound up in social relations and expectations. As drug deals are incredibly personal, many report close bonds to their dealers and express the benefit of sometimes getting preferential prices as a result. Additionally, consumers can use marijuana to delineate and navigate social relationships with sexual partners and peers by engaging in a conventional gift economy. This highly social transactional model, I argue, operates in the liminal space between gift and commodity exchange, as a quasi-gift economy per Gregory ([1985] 2015). When using Mauss ([1954] 2002) and Newell's (2012) works, drug dealing can be understood as a moral economy. Thus, we must consider marijuana in a post-legal context as an assemblage of the aforementioned theories. It exists simultaneously as gift and commodity, procured both in a conventional economic sphere and a moral economy. Can we apply this theory for other transactions? It can be assumed that the exchange of other non-legal drugs operate under a moral economy as well-as the process of acquiring various drugs is at least partially similar to that of acquiring non-legal marijuanayet legal venues are not offered to consumers.

I hope that my attempts at elucidation have brought us closer to answering some of the questions posed in this essay. Though, the conversations with participants show there is no singular response. The various uses of marijuana demonstrate its incredibly malleable nature as an object that assumes the understanding imparted unto it by the individuals purchasing, using, sharing, and selling it.

References

Boudou, Benjamin. 2012. "Éléments pour une anthropologie politique de l'hospitalité." Revue du Mauss, 40(2): 267-284.

Canada. Health Canada. The Cannabis Act: The Facts. 2018. https://www.canada.ca/en/health-canada/news/2018/06/ backgrounder-the-cannabis-act-the-facts.html.

Camussi, Silvia, and Anna Laura Mancini. 2019. "Individual Trust: Does Quality of Local Institutions Matter?" Journal of Institutional Economics 15(3): 487–503.

Coomber, Ross, and Nigel South. 2004. "Drugs, Cultures and Controls in Comparative Perspective." In Drug Use and Cultural Contexts 'Beyond the West', edited by Ross Coomber and Nigel South, 13-26. London: Free Association Books.

Diaz, Isabel Maria Rosa, and Francisco Javier Rondán Cataluña. 2011. "Antecedents of the Importance of Price in Purchase Decisions." Revista de Administração de Empresas 51(4):370-381.

Dickinson, Timothy and Scott Jacques. 2019. "Drug Sellers' Neutralizations of Guiltless Drug Sales and Avoidance of "Drug Dealer" Identities." International Journal of Drug Policy 73: 16-23. Douglas, Mary, and Baron C. Isherwood. 1996. The World of Goods: Towards an Anthropology of Consumption : With a New Introduction. New York: Routledge.

Giordano, Christian. 2018. "From Political Subjectivity to Political Intentionality: The Predominance of Society Over the Individual." Lithuanian Ethnology: Studies in Social Anthropology & Ethnology / Lietuvos Etnologija: Socialines Antropologijos ir Etnologijos Studijos 18: 155-172.

Global News. 2019. "40% of Canadian marijuana users bought it illegally even after legalization: StatCan." 15 August. Accessed March 28, 2020. https://globalnews.ca/ news/5770642/marijuana-legalization-illegal-purchasing/.

Gregory, C.A. [1982] 2015. Gifts and Commodities. Chicago: HAU Books.

Harding, Wayne M. and Norman E. Zinberg. 1977. "The Effectiveness of the Subculture in Developing Rituals and Social Sanctions for Controlled Drug Use". In Drugs, Rituals and Altered States of Consciousness, edited by Brian M. DuToit. Roterdam: A.A. Balkema.

Hayward, Clarissa Rile. 2010. "Bad stories: narrative, identity, and the state's materialist pedagogy." Citizenship Studies 14(6): 651-666.

Hunt, Geoffrey, and Judith C. Barker. 2001. "Socio-Cultural Anthropology and Alcohol and Drug Research: Towards a Unified Theory". Social Science & Medicine 53(2):165-188. Kenesei, Zsófia and Sarah Todd. 2003. "The Use of Price in the Purchase Decision." Journal of Empirical Generalisations in Marketing Science 8(1): 1-22.

Manson, Mark. 2014. "World's Best Nightlife Cities." CNN Travel, October 2. Accessed April 10 2020. https://www. cnn.com/travel/article/best-nightlife-cities/index.html.

Marx, Karl, 1844. "Estranged Labor" In Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844. Web. https://www.marxists. org/archive/marx/works/1844/manuscripts/labour.htm.

Masson, Kimberley, and Angus Bancroft. 2018. "Nice People Doing Shady Things': Drugs and the Morality of Exchange in the Darknet Cryptomarkets." International Journal of Drug Policy 58: 78–84.

Mauss, Marcel, and Mary Douglas. [1954] 2002. The Gift. New York: Taylor & Francis e-Library. Web. https://libcom. org/files/Mauss%20-%20The%20Gift.pdf.

Newell, Sasha. 2012. The Modernity Bluff: Crime, Consumption and Citizenship in Côte D'Ivoire. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. EBSCOhost e-book collection. http://0-eds.a.ebscohost.com.mercury.concordia.ca/eds/ebookviewer/ebook/bmxlYmtfXzQ2MTIx-OV9fQU41?sid=8bcd85de-bf80-4f6a-81a8-f5995f319ea9@ sessionmgr4008&vid=0&format=EB&rid=1 Accessed April 7 2020.

Rubin, Vera, ed. 1975. Cannabis and Culture. The Hague, NE: Mouton Publishers.

Sherry, John F. 1983. "Gift Giving in Anthropological Perspective." Journal of Consumer Research (10) 2: 157-168.

Spicer, Leah. 2002. "Historical and Cultural Uses of Cannabis and the Canadian 'Marijuana Clash'." Library of Parliament. Web. HTtps://sencanada.ca/content/sen/committee/371/ ille/library/spicer-e.htm#B.%20%20Cannabis%20Use%20 in%20Canada.

Tunney, Catharine. 2019. "'Vibrant' black market persists as legal pot marks its first full year in Canada." CBC News, October 17. Accessed March 20, 2020. https://www.cbc.ca/ news/politics/

marijuana-one-year-black-market-1.5320552.

Van den Hoven, Jeroen, and Pieter E. Vermaas. 2007. "Nano-Technology and Privacy: On Continuous Surveillance Outside the Panopticon." Journal of Medicine & Philosophy 32(3): 283–97.

Willen, Sarah S. 2007. "Toward a Critical Phenomenology of "Illegality": State Power, Criminalization, and Abjectivity among Undocumented Migrant Workers in Tel Aviv, Israel."

International Migration 45(3): 8-38.

Chapter XIV

A Critical Race Theory Perspective: The Implications of the Advances in Biomedicine

Written By: Rebecca Aberra

Chapter XVI Written By: Rebecca Aberra

The manner in which we conceptualize race has changed dramatically over the past two centuries. As the fields of technology and medicine develop, they consistently interact with the concept of race, often reinforcing racial inequalities. Given that critical race theory (CRT) examines how racial disparities are maintained and exacerbated, this paper will use CRT as a theoretical framework to examine how technology and medicine have been used to perpetuate racial inequalities. Although historically, minority groups (and women) have typically been neglected from medical research, there has been an increase in race-specific health related research in recent years. The implications of this marginalization are still unclear and merit further investigation. It is therefore essential to proceed with caution when examining the repercussions of technological advances, especially in the field of biomedicine to ensure that no group is disadvantaged or neglected in the pursuit of scientific advancement.

There has been an increase in research on the relationship between race and health outcome inequities; however, little of this research has been grounded in CRT. CRT, if applied properly, has the potential to be foundational to provide useful insights into health equity research (Ford & Airhihenbuwa, 2010). This paper will explore how race and biotechnology interact, using CRT to look at the potential repercussions of genetics research, as well as other biotechnologies, on how we conceptualize race.

Critical Race Theory

CRT is an area of scholarship that seeks to interrogate narratives and social structures that reproduce racial inequalities (Hatch, 2015). CRT originated in the 1970s in the field of legal studies (Delgado, Stefancic & Harris, 2017). Activists, lawyers, and scholars in the U.S. noted a decline in progress that was made towards equality during the civil rights era of the 1960s. While overt racism was declining, covert racism continued, and scholars began looking for theories to explain subtle types of discrimination (Delgado, Stefancic & Harris, 2017). Thus emerged CRT. Although CRT has its origins in law, it has since exploded into a theoretical framework applicable in a wide variety of disciplines (Delgado et al., 2017). CRT draws from both critical legal studies and radical feminism. A unique characteristic of CRT that differentiates it from other academic disciplines is that it includes activism. This is to say that one of the foundational principles of CRT is not only to understand and study the dynamics of racism and power, but also to oppose racism and change power for the better. Another unique component of CRT is that it is largely built on legal storytelling, or "counterstories," that challenge the existing narrative and contrast it with the voices of people of color (Delgado et al., 2017). This is important because the voices of people of color have often been excluded or delegitimized within the scientific community.

While CRT recognizes the progress that has been made in terms of racial equality, it examines the mechanisms that facilitate the pervasive racial disparities that exist today. CRT goes beyond analyzing individual cases of racial inequity and looks at institutional structures that perpetuate racial inequalities (Reece, 2019).

CRT has three foundational claims: racism is ubiquitous, racism benefits the dominant group, and race is a social construct. The first claim of CRT is that racism is normal in the United States, and that it is embedded in all facets of American society (Christian & Seamster, 2019). It can be argued that the normality of racism leaves it unacknowledged. Furthermore, while progress has been made, and "color-blind" conceptions of equality have addressed blatant racism, virtually nothing has been done towards addressing subtle and systemic forms of racism that are embedded in US society (Delgado et al., 2017).

Beyond this, CRT posits that racism serves an important purpose in maintaining inequalities in a way that is beneficial to the dominant group. This feature is sometimes referred to as either material determinism or "interest convergence" (Delgado et al., 2017). This means that since racism furthers the interests of white individuals, the white population has no incentive to fight against it (Delgado et al., 2017). Finally, one of the key postulations of CRT is that race is a social construct, as opposed to a biological truth. This claim is often referred to as the social constructivist view of race. This view contends that while groups that originate from similar places share common physical traits, race has little or no relevance to higher order human characteristics such as personality, intelligence or morality (Delgado et al., 2017).

This is in stark contrast to biological realism, which stipulates that there are strict biological differences between races, and that race determines behaviour that results in social inequalities. Kaplan & Winther define two different types of biological racial realism. The first is bio-genomic racial realism, which stipulates that population structures of humans can be assessed through measuring phenotypic traits; the second is biological racial realism, which states that there are stable biological differences between races and that these differences can account for racial inequalities in social and economic outcomes (Kaplan & Winther, 2014). With biological racial realism, the racial disparities that are pervasive today are considered to be genetically determined, and have little to do with structural or institutional barriers. This theory is similar to that of social Darwinism (now widely discredited): the idea that human groups and races are subject to the same process of natural selection as animals. This theory has historically been associated with the view that races differ fundamentally on physical, moral and behavioural levels (Mallon, 2006). This logic has been used to rationalize the institution of slavery and colonization. While the utility of racial classification for research and medicine remains a point of contention, most sociologists, anthropologists and biologists reject the notion that races share unique behavioural "natures" (Mallon, 2006).

There is also the optimistic position of assimilation theorists, who posit that racial boundaries will blur and eventually disappear altogether over time without any radical policy interference (Christian & Seamster, 2019). This theory contends that racism is caused by mental categorization, and in changing the way we learn and talk about other races, we will change our conceptions of race, eliminating racism (Delgado et al., 2017).

CRT aims to understand the mechanisms that drive racial inequalities in order to eradicate the inequities; this emphasis is referred to as a "realist" or economic determinist stance (Delgado et al., 2017). This view holds that while the individual's biases are significant, systemic racism is the mechanism through which society allots standings and privileges. Racial hierarchies determine who has access to the best resources, including the best occupations, education and neighbourhood (Delgado et al., 2017). Therefore, drastic action is necessary to fight discrimination because people will always act according to what is in their best interest. Derrick Bell even argues that the progress made in the civil rights era appeared at a time when shifting economic circumstances aligned the self-interest of the elite white individuals with the concerns of Black people. This is counter to the notion that humanity's sense of morality has evolved over time (Delgado et al., 2017).

CRT suggests that one of the problems in understanding racism in North American society is the way we conceptualize race. Typically, race is seen in a white-other dichotomy. This binary way of thinking conceals many nuances. In this dichotomy, whiteness is considered to be the norm, the standard to which everything else is held. Asians, Black people, Latinos and other racial groups are defined in relation to the dominant group, as "non-white" (Delgado et al., 2017). This postulation oversimplifies and groups together nonwhite groups that are different from each other. One of the criticisms against CRT has been that it offers no real-world solutions to the pervasive systems of inequality. In response to this critique, I suggest that CRT could be exceptionally helpful in the field of biomedicine, specifically when examining healthcare inequalities. If incorporated into research, CRT has the potential to mitigate and minimize the disenfranchisement of minority groups.

Race and Technology

The mechanisms that reproduce racial inequality change as historical circumstances evolve, which include technological advances (Christian & Seamster, 2019). While science is often thought of as objective, innovations in biotechnology proceed with what Mueller calls "racial ignorance," a position that aims to deny or minimize the effects of racialized structures, and ignores how new technology potentially contributes to the mechanisms of discrimination (2017). This lack of consideration of systemic racial inequalities constitutes a more subtle (and less overtly racist) mechanism that favors the prevailing norms and disadvantages minorities (Benjamin, 2019).

Technology often appears to be neutral and unbiased. For these reasons, it is often overlooked that technology reinforces or contributes to racial inequalities. However, while new technologies are considered progressive, they reflect and reproduce disparities. They do so in what Benjamin (2019) calls "the New Jim Code." The term draws from the title of the book The New Jim Crow by Michelle Alexander, which suggests that the U.S. carceral system magnifies discrimination (Benjamin, 2019).

Many technology enthusiasts have suggested that innovation can potentially pave the way for a "post-human" world, where race has no meaning (Benjamin, 2019). However, this post-humanist idea is based on the assumption that everyone has a chance to be treated as equal to begin with. In fact, technological change and scientific research have had unintended negative consequences that enforce racial inequality (Benjamin, 2019). Although technology is perceived as neutral, it is possible for bias to enter through the "backdoor," by the creator or by how the technology is designed. This is paradoxical because oftentimes, technological advances and automation are framed as solutions to avoid bias and prejudice (Benjamin, 2019).

Technology has various implications for the amplification of social hierarchies: from predictive analytics used by U.S. welfare agencies to surveillance technology (Benjamin, 2019). However, the field of healthcare is especially interesting because advances in biomedicine have the potential to either diminish or exacerbate existing health disparities facing minority groups.

Racial Health Inequalities

Racial inequalities in medicine and healthcare are still pervasive today. Overall, minorities tend to live shorter lives and receive a worse standard medical of care (Delgado et al., 2017). While the difference in life expectancy between white people and Black people has largely been attributed to corresponding differences in socioeconomic status (SES), even when it is accounted for, the disparity between groups remains high (Smedley et al., 2002).

The relationship between health and socioeconomic class is interrelated. This is because lower socioeconomic status tends to lead to worse health outcomes, through eating calorie-dense, nutrient-poor foods, and an inability to access health services and other resources (Moore, 2019). However, bad health also prevents individuals from earning high income and pursuing higher education (Moore, 2019). Therefore, individuals get stuck in a vicious cycle with limited social mobility.

Experiencing racism can also have adverse effects on one's health. Racial disparities in stress-related morbidity contrib-

utes to the lower life expectancy for minorities than white people (Cozier et al, 2006). Research has suggested that Black individuals who experience racism are more likely to have chronic hypertension than their white counterparts. In addition, one study demonstrated that Black women who experienced racism and did not take action (report or talk to someone) were 4.4 times more likely to have hypertension compared to their counterparts who took action (Cozier et al, 2006). Another example of how experiencing racism has negative effects on health is seen in a study conducted by Williams et al. (2013). They found that there is significant positive correlation between perceived racial prejudice and the increase in substance use, namely cigarette smoking and alcohol consumption. This is important because the increased substance use is linked to numerous adverse health consequences. This evidence has been taken by some to demonstrate that racism has biological effects, not directly but through intervening variables (Yearby, 2018).

Mass incarceration has also been recognized to be a determinant in the health of Black and Hispanic people (Widdowson & Fisher, 2020). Incarceration contributes to stress-related morbidity as well, since being incarcerated, as well as

any contact with the criminal justice system, will inevitably cause stress. Stress has been well documented in causing poor health outcomes, such as lower immune functioning as well as cardiovascular disease (Benham & Charak, 2019). Another factor that magnifies health disparities is that minorities are more likely to experience discrimination while receiving healthcare. Research indicates that 32% of Black people say that they have experienced discrimination when seeing a healthcare provider (NPR et al., 2018). While this alone is a cause for concern, studies have suggested that as a result, 22% of Black people avoid seeking healthcare (NPR et al., 2017). Scientific research done on hypertension, obesity, substance abuse, incarceration, and stress-related morbidity have not contributed to reducing the inequity in health outcomes for Black people and other minorities. If anything, the research seems to have reinforced the prejudiced views of minority groups and exasperated exiting disparities.

Using CRT, it can be argued that the pervasiveness of racial health disparities is evidence of the prevalence of structural racism. This is because the healthcare system represents a significant social structure as well as a government regulated institution—an institution that has not benefited everyone equally (Hicken et al., 2018). It is important to note that social structures might not be inherently based on a racialized hierarchy, however, since it is the dominant racial groups that define and perpetuate norms, as a result, the institutions that reflect the norms tend to privilege those same dominant groups (Hicken et al., 2018). One of the most important ways in which we can decrease health disparities is by critically examining race-specific research and subsequent race-specific pharmaceuticals. To illustrate this point, the following examples from biomedical and genetic studies, namely Bi-Dil, the genome studies, will be placed in conversation with consumer genetic testing such as 23andMe.

BiDil as Pandora's Box

Historically, minorities have been largely excluded from scientific innovations. As Michel Foucault once said in relation to surveillance and power dynamics, "visibility is a trap" (1977). This could be the case when it comes to race-specific research. An excellent point of entry into this discussion is to examine BiDil, the controversial medication that was claimed to treat heart disease specifically in Black people (Erasmus, 2013). The drug is an example of how biomedicine and race intersect. BiDil was approved by the FDA as the first drug to be used to treat a specific racial subpopulation (Caputo-Levine, 2010). This represented a significant moment, where molecular biology, medicine, genomics, ethics and conceptions of race all converged. The drug was designed in response to evidence that indicated that Black vascular cells were different from other racial groups, specifically with respect to their propensity to produce nitric oxide (Caputo-Levine, 2010). In a sense, the approval of Bi-Dil by the FDA affirmed to the scientific community that Black people were fundamentally different from other racial groups in their vascular cells and their production of nitric oxide.

The FDA's approval was based on research suggesting that heart failure had a unique epidemiology in Black people compared to white people (Caputo-Levine, 2010). However, the same researchers demonstrated that the differences between Black and white patients were insignificant when the condition of hypertension was controlled (Houghton et al., 1997). Given that studies have linked the experience of racism in Black people with chronic hypertension, is this difference in hypertension really biological (Cozier et al, 2006)? Furthermore, in a meta-analysis conducted by Seghal (2004), it has been suggested that while Black and white patients may differ in their response to hypertensive drugs, the baseline blood pressure level is a more important guide to prescribing heart medication than supposed biological differences. Another argument against the drug's development from a CRT perspective is that the research was done with individuals who self-identified as Black. This is problematic because many people can identify as such: individuals who originate from Africa, the Caribbean, Dominican Republic, all with very different origins. This demonstrates that "Blackness" is not a scientific category that can be used as an independent variable, because what it means to be Black changes as history progresses. For instance, Blackness in the United States today is viewed differently from when society adhered to the "one drop" rule of Blackness, where even "one drop" of African blood renders the individual fundamentally different from other individuals (Davis, 2002). This issue of social identity relates to CRT's foundational theme that race is a social construct since its definition is not fixed, but rather changes with time. This understanding of race also points to the fact that CRT has valuable potential when applied to the field of medicine.

Furthermore, using CRT, it can also be argued that not only will this race-specific drug be ineffective, but that its creation and endorsement furthers racial disparities and reinforces the notion that Black people are fundamentally different from others. The counterargument may be that medicine and biology have no place in sociological considerations. However, Caputo-Levine makes the provocative claim that even the "cells of the African American heart failure patient are not merely objects [and are] subject to a degree of social construction that the quark is not" (2010, 111). This is because these cells exist and are examined within the context of how race has been historically understood (Caputo-Levine, 2010). This powerful statement illustrates that nothing in science exists outside our socio-political context and the views that shape it. Even research at the cellular level cannot only be affected by implicit bias, but it also reinforces social hierarchies. While BiDil represents a single pharmaceutical drug, its development and use can serve as a cautionary tale as race-specific science persists today and is magnified by the explosion of genetic research and the subsequent biobanks.

Questioning the "Objectivity" of Genetic Studies Genetic research became the center of public interest in

the 1990s, when the Human Genome Project (HGP) began (Phelan et al., 2013). This project aimed to sequence the entire human genome, and was initially focused on improving the health status of everyone, irrespective of race (Phelan et al., 2013). Indeed, the project aimed to unify people and endorse that race has no genetic basis whatsoever (National Human Genome Research Institute 2013). In fact, one of the most striking results of the HGP was that all humans, regardless of ethnicity are more than 99.9% similar in their genetic makeup (Phelan et al., 2013). This fact was used as evidence that race is more of a social construct than a fixed biological reality.

This unifying sentiment did not last for long, as the genetic revolution pressed on, and an increasing amount of attention and resources were being allocated to the less than 0.1% difference between the races (Phelan et al., 2013). Just as the emphasis of the HGP was centered on health, research on racial differences was done with the intention of understanding different disease outcomes among racial groups (Phelan et al., 2013). While the goal was to better treat minority groups, many have argued that focusing on genetic differences associated with race does more harm than good. While the view of race in some scholarly literature has shifted from a biological essentialist to a socially constructive ideology, it can be argued that the biological conception of race has been revived by a recent increase in genetic research (Erasmus, 2013). The use of DNA for genetic ancestry tests, as well as for the purposes of "individualized medicine," has increased exponentially over the past decade (Erasmus, 2013). It is important to examine how this rapidly growing body of genetic research affects our conceptions of race. Some scholars have suggested that perhaps this increased attention on genomics could act as a gateway to renew beliefs that races are fundamentally, biologically different, and that some are "more advanced" than others (Duster, 1990). These concerns were expressed by Troy Duster (1990) in the book Backdoor to Eugenics, wherein they explore the potential unintended consequences of genetics research on racism. Duster (1990) believes that this seemingly neutral genetic research could inadvertently serve as a Trojan horse for racist beliefs and practices.

The consequences of genetic research is not limited to the participating scientists and academics. Many news reports communicate (in an authoritative and scientific voice) the idea that the concept of race based on biological realism is an effective and beneficial way of categorizing people (Phelan et al., 2013). Simply focusing on the differences between the races, not only reinforces the importance of race, but frames the research as something that can improve public health. The unfortunate and inadvertent outcome of these types of reports is that the public will likely not limit their generalizations to disease outcomes, but will also erroneously conclude that there are fundamental differences between racial groups; if there is a racial component to heart disease, then perhaps there are also racial links to behavioural traits such as impulsivity and criminality (Phelan et al., 2013). The public discussion generated from this type of research inadvertently endorses the idea that there are genetic differences between races in relation to health (Phelan et al., 2013). In addition, the fact that these reports are typically being communicated in a scientific, neutral, and objective manner is persuasive in and of itself. This manner of presenting information conceals the social implications of such findings (Phelan et al., 2013).

Further evidence for this misunderstanding can be seen in an experiment conducted by Williams & Eberhardt (2008), which demonstrated that individuals who view race as something that is biologically fixed are more accepting of socioeconomic racial inequalities. This finding ties in well with research that documents that individuals who subscribe to biological essentialism are also associated with stereotype endorsement (Bastian & Haslam, 2006; Brescoll & LaFrance, 2004). The belief in fundamental racial differences is an integral tenet of racism (Phelan et al., 2013). This illustrates that the more the public is exposed to research on racial differences, with little or no critical analysis, the more accepting it will be towards racial inequalities and more likely to attribute them to genetics as opposed to systems of oppression.

Direct to Consumer Genetic Testing (23andMe)

As genetic testing becomes increasingly affordable, more people are choosing to send their DNA directly to consumer companies such as 23andMe for analysis (Ruckenstein, 2017). The underlying idea is that individuals are able to understand how their genetics can influence their chances of developing certain health related disorders. 23andMe is a direct to consumer (DTC) service that offers genetic testing, using single-nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) as a method of determining one's ancestry, as well as identifying certain medical predispositions. This methodology is based on the previously established correlation of certain genetic markers with specific disorders. A kit is purchased, and then sent away with a saliva sample for analysis. Three to five weeks later, the customers are provided with a report, which indicates their likely predispositions, as well as whether they are a carrier of certain types of disorders or not. The increase in popularity of these tests corresponds with the rise in personalized medicine, as more people want an individualized approach to healthcare (Stoeklé et al., 2019). It also illustrates how information and knowledge about health is no longer limited to "experts" in the field, but rather ordinary people are increasingly guided towards taking charge of their health and well-being (Nettleton, 2006 1). In addition to providing the consumer with genetic information, 23andMe uses the genetic information of its clients to generate a biobank, wherein others can pay to access the data in order to conduct correlational genetic research. With the DNA sample, there is also a questionnaire with information relating to lifestyle and demographic variables. Given that race is one of the demographic pieces of information that is collected, this merits further investigation.

Genetics and CRT, a Test in Compatibility

CRT illustrates how biobanks that are generated by 23and-Me can amplify inequalities through exclusion, effectively reinforcing a biological understanding of race. While genetic research has enormous potential, racial and ethnic minorities have been consistently underrepresented in this research (Elena et al., 2020). For instance, as stated before, 23andMe has one of the largest privately owned genetic biobanks in the world, with the DNA of an estimated 5 million individuals (Spector-Bagdady, 2016). This data is then sold to organizations for research or product development (Saukko, 2017). The difficulty with large data sets is that they tend to project a deceptive sense of objectivity (Comfort, 2018). The problem is that although the 23andMe biobank represents a huge sample size, it is far from random. Individuals who can afford genetic testing are not necessarily representative of the entire population, resulting in a significant demographic bias (Spector-Bagdady, 2016). The implication of this bias is that any research, discovery or pharmaceutical development might not be reflective of the greater population but skewed in favour of the population(s) most likely to use DNA testing services. It has the potential to mostly benefit those in the sample: predominantly upper/middle class, white and

well-educated groups (Spector-Bagdady, 2016, 516). In this sense, biobanks from 23andMe and subsequent research indirectly favor the dominant subset of the population. Ethnic minorities are rendered invisible in large-scale correlational genetic research and are unable to reap the same benefits. 23andMe has responded to this, through their launch of the "Our Roots into the Future" project, aimed at increasing the diversity of their biobank (23andMe, 2020). On their website, a timeline boasts that they have reached 45,000 African Americans in their database. The fact that there is an initiative for increasing diversity is encouraging. However, this percentage of Black people is still far from being a representative of the general population, and there is no mention of other potentially underrepresented racial groups. Using CRT, it can be shown that 23andMe potentially favors the dominant group of society in two substantial ways: the accuracy of the test itself and the nature of the resulting biobanks. The vast majority of the genetic conditions being tested for are most common among individuals of European descent. For instance, variants of the BRCA 1 and 2 genes are tested in order to estimate the risk for potential breast and ovarian cancer (Griffiths et al., 2015, p.61). However, these variants are most common to those of Ashkenazi descent; less than

0.1% of people who are outside of this ethnicity have these variants (Hesman & Sanders, 2018, 23). Only offering the testing of these variants (as opposed to thousands of others) excludes those whose ancestry is not Eastern European. The same critique can be made for 23andMe's reports on various disorders such as celiac disease, hereditary thrombophilia and macular degeneration, since they are all common to individuals of European descent (23andMe, 2020). This means that someone who is not from that subgroup of the population will not necessarily reap the same benefits from the genetic testing being offered.

One of the implications of this research is that more effort needs to be made to understand the implications of the lack of diversity and subsequent generalizability of privatized biobanks, so everyone can benefit from potential breakthroughs. In addition to correcting this bias, more research on how non-representative research has already contributed to social inequalities is necessary. It is also important to consider how genetic testing influences our notion of race. Phelan et al. demonstrated in what they coined the "reification hypothesis," that one of the unintended consequences of the genetic testing is the resurgence of beliefs that there
are essential differences between races (2014). Therefore, as the technology becomes more available and widely used, so will the notions of racial difference. This contradicts the fundamental principle of CRT that race is a social construct. Phelan et al. tested competing theories to find out if the genetic tests either promote the idea of essential racial differences or decrease the view of race as an essential category (2014). The results suggest that the use of DTC genetic ancestry testing reinforces the idea of racial differences and racial categories, making them seem inherent and immutable (Phelan et al., 2014). The results of this study have important implications, because millions of people have purchased these ancestry DNA testing kits (Phelan et al., 2014).

CRT enables us to see how the biobanks generated by 23and-Me are furthering health inequalities. This reinforcement of inequality comes about through the underrepresentation of minorities in the biobanks, as well as the type of information that can be gained by consumers from the tests. While it is important for biobanks to be genetically representative, race-based correlational research can reinforce the idea that existing inequalities are biological as opposed to social.

Conclusion

Historical conceptions of race have changed dramatically over the years. The field of science and medicine have constantly interacted with the concept of race, and often in a manner that reinforced racial disparities. Recently, conceptions of race and biotechnology have intersected to raise a series of unique issues that merit closer examination. The unintended social implications of biotechnology research are still unclear. I propose that CRT has the potential to play a pivotal role in this research. Further investigation is needed on the unintended consequences of biotechnology on racial inequalities. However, raising questions about genetic studies involving race has been perceived as opposing technological advances. However, I would argue that innovation is only progress when it does not come at the cost of certain disadvantaged groups. There is nothing regressive about examining the potential inadvertent consequences of genetic research. More attention is needed to understand how mechanisms that perpetuate racism are evolving with biotechnology and medicine. Effort is necessary in order to deconstruct racial inequalities and decrease the marginalization of minority groups. This awareness is required immediately, as it is harder to reverse changes that have occurred than it will be to prevent them from occurring in the first place.

References

23andMe. (2020). Power of Diversity. Retrieved June 14, 2019 from https://www.23andme.com/en-ca/roots/

Benham, G., & Charak, R. (2019). Stress and sleep remain significant predictors of health after controlling for negative affect. Stress & Health: Journal of the International Society for the Investigation of Stress, 35(1), 59–68.

Bastian, B., & Haslam, N. (2006). Psychological essentialism and stereotype endorsement. Journal of Experimental Social Psychology, 42, 228–235.

Benjamin, R. (2019; 2019). Race after technology: Abolitionist tools for the new jim code. Medford, MA; 4: Polity.

Brescoll, V., & LaFrance, M. (2004). The correlates and consequences of newspaper reports of research on sex differences. Psychological Science, 15, 515–520.

Caputo-Levine, D. D. (2010). Arguing Science, Creating Race: The 2005 FDA Approval Hearingsfor BiDil. Berkeley Journal of Sociology, 54, 108–123. Retrieved from. https://0search-ebscohost-com.mercury.concordia.ca/login. aspx?-direct=true&db=s- nh&-AN=57754366&site=ehost-live&scope=site

Christian, M., Seamster, L., & Ray, V. (2019). New Directions in Critical Race Theory and Sociology: Racism, White Supremacy, and Resistance. American Behavioral Scientist, 63(13), 1731–1740. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia. ca/10.-1177/000276421-9842623

Comfort N. (2018). Opening a door to eugenics. Technology Review, 121(6), 16-19. Retrieved from https://concordiauniversity.on.worldcat.org/oclc/7912510894

Cozier, Yvette C., Julie R. Palmer, Nicholas J. Horton, Lisa Fredman, Lauren A. Wise, and L. E. Rosenberg. (2006). "Racial Discrimination and the Incidence of Hypertension in US Black Women." Annals of Epidemiology 16(9): 681–687.

Critical Race Theory. (2008). In J. H. Moore (Ed.), Encyclopedia of Race and Racism (Vol. 1, pp. 365-368). Detroit, MI: Macmillan Reference USA. Retrieved from https://link-galecom.libezproxy.concordia.ca/apps/doc/CX2831200118/GVRL?u=concordi_ma-in&sid=GVRL&xid=f376902a

Davis, F. James. (2001). Who is Black: One Nation's Definition, Tenth Anniversary Ed. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.

Delgado, R., Stefancic, J., & Harris, A. P. (2017). Critical race theory: An introduction (Third Ed.). New York: New York University Press.

Duster, T. (1990). Backdoor to eugenics. New York: Routledge.

Erasmus, Z. (2013). Throwing the Genes: A Renewed Biological Imaginary of 'Race', Place and Identification. The-

oria: A Journal of Social & Political Theory, 60(136), 38– 53. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia.ca/10.3167/ th.2013.6013604

Ford, C. L., & Airhihenbuwa, C. O. (2010). The public health critical race methodology: Praxis for antiracism research. Social Science & Medicine, 71(8), 1390– 1398. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia.ca/10.1016/j. socscimed.2010.07.030

Foucault, M. (1995; 1977). Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison [Surveiller et punir. English] (Vintage Books Ed.). New York: Vintage Books.

Griffiths, A. J. F., Wessler, S. R., Carroll, S. B., & Doebley, J. F. (2015; 2015). Introduction to genetic analysis (Eleventh Ed.). New York, NY; 4: W.H. Freeman & Company.

Hatch, A. R. (2015). Critical race theory. The Blackwell Encyclopedia of Sociology, G. Ritzer (Ed.). https://doiorg.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/10.1002/9781405165518. wbeosc206.pub2

Hesman Saey, T., & Sanders, L. (2018). Risks and Riddles. Science News, 193(10), 22–26. Retrieved from http:// search.ebscohost.com.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=12974672&site=ehost- live&scope=site

Hicken, M. T., Kravitz-Wirtz, N., Durkee, M., & Jackson, J. S. (2018). Racial inequalities in health: Framing future research. Social Science & Medicine, 199, 11–18. https://0-doi-org.

mercury.concordia.ca/10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.12.027 Houghton, Jan L., Vivienne E. Smith, David S. Strogatz, Nancy L. Henches, Warren M. Breisblatt, and Albert A. Carr. (1997). "Effect of African American Race and Ventricular Hypertrophy on Coronary Vascular Endothelial Function." Hypertension, 29(3), 706-714. doi:10.1161/01. HYP.29.3.706

Kaplan, J. M., & Winther, R. G. (2014). Realism, Antirealism, and Conventionalism about Race. Philosophy of Science, 81(5), 1039–1052. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia.ca/10.1086/678314

Mallon, R. (2006). 'Race': Normative, not metaphysical or semantic. Ethics, 116(3), 525- 551. doi:10.1086/500495

Moore, K. K. (2019). Changing Our Frameworks Can Help Parse Racial Disparities in Stress-Related Morbidity: The stratification economics framework may best clarify the causes of racial health disparities, and help to develop policy solutions. Generations, 43(3), 86–89.

Mueller, J. (2017). Producing colorblindness: Everyday mechanisms of white ignorance. Social Problems, 64, 219-238.

National Human Genome Research Institute. (2013). "June 2000: President Clinton, British Prime Minister Blair Mark Completion of the First Survey of the Entire Human Genome." Retrieved October, 2019 from http://www.genome. gov/10001356

National Human Genome Research Institute. (2013). "June

2000: President Clinton, British Prime Minister Blair Mark Completion of the First Survey of the Entire Human Genome." Retrieved October, 2019 from http://www.genome. gov/10001356

National Public Radio (NPR), the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, and the Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health. (2017). Discrimination in America: Experiences and Views of African Americans. Washington, DC: Robert Wood Johnson Foundation. Retrieved from https:// www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/reports/reports/2017/ rwjf441128

National Public Radio (NPR), the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, and the Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health. (2018). Discrimination in America: Final Summary. Washington, DC: Robert Wood Johnson Foundation. Retrieved from https://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/ reports/surveys_and_polls/2018/rwjf443620

Phelan, J. C., Link, B. G., Zelner, S., & Yang, L. H. (2014). Direct-to-Consumer Racial Admixture Tests and Beliefs About Essential Racial Differences. Social Psychology Quarterly, 77(3), 296. Retrieved from http://0-search.ebscohost.com.mercury.concor- dia.ca/login-.aspx?direct=true&db=edb&AN=97726944&site=eds-live

Reece, R. L. (2019). Color Crit: Critical Race Theory and the History and Future of Colorism in the United States. Journal of Black Studies, 50(1), 3–25. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia.ca/10.1177/0021934718803735

Ruckenstein, M. (2017). Keeping data alive: talking DTC genetic testing. Information, Communication & Society, 20(7), 1024–1039. https://doi-org.libezproxy.concordia.ca/10.108 0/1369118X.2016.1203975

Saukko, P. (2017). Shifting metaphors in direct-to-consumer genetic testing: from genes as information to genes as big data. New Genetics & Society, 36(3), 296–313. https://0-doi-org.mercury.concordia.ca/10.1080/14636778.2017.135 4691

Smedley, Brian D., Adrienne Y. Stith, and Alan R. Nelson, eds. (2002). Unequal Treatment: Confronting Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Health Care. Institute of Medicine (US), Committee on Understanding and Eliminating Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Health Care. Washington, DC: National Academy Press. Retrieved from https://www. nap.edu/read/10260/chapter/1

Spector-Bagdady, K. (2016). "The Google of Healthcare": enabling the privatization of genetic bio/databanking. Annals of Epidemiology, 26(7), 515–519. https://doi-org. lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/10.1016/j.annepidem.2016.05.007

Stoeklé, H.-C., Mamzer-Bruneel, M.-F., Vogt, G., & Herve, C. (2019). 23andMe: a new two-sided data-banking market model. BMC MEDICAL ETHICS, 17. https://0-doi-org. mercury.concordia.ca/10.1186/s12910-016-0101-9

Widdowson, A. O., & Fisher, B. W. (2020). Mass Incarceration and Subsequent Preventive Health Care: Mechanisms and Racial/Ethnic Disparities. American Journal of Public Health, 110, S145–S151. https://doi-org.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/10.2105/A-JPH.2019.305448

Williams, D. R., Neighbors, H. W., & Jackson, J. S. (2003). Racial/ethnic discrimination and health: findings from community studies. American Journal of Public Health, 93(2), 200–8.

Yearby, R. (2018). Racial Disparities in Health Status and Access to Healthcare: The Continuation of Inequality in the United States Due to Structural Racism. American Journal of Economics & Sociology, 77(3/4), 1113–1152. https://doi-org.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/10.1111/ajes.12230

Chapter XV

The Gendered and Racialized Dimensions of Fibromyalgia: A Contested Chronic Pain Illness

Written By: Maliha Latif

Chapter XV Written By: Maliha Latif

Living with existential uncertainty is the reality of people suffering from medically unexplained symptoms (MUS). The term MUS is used as a label for patients who have symptoms that have no identified organic basis (Nettleton, 2006). Physical symptoms such as a headache, backache, pain in muscles and joints and fatigue are common in which pain is at the forefront of all of them (Ravenzwaaij et al., 2010). Chronic pain management is a complex matter (Nettleton, 2006). Patients with persistent MUS undergo extensive medical investigations, referrals, and unnecessary treatments because MUS is inconsistently recognized, diagnosed and managed in primary healthcare (Rosendal, 2017).

Getting an official diagnosis gives people legitimate access to the rights and privileges that come with the sick role (Nettleton, 2006). For instance, Sarah Nettleton demonstrates that living with medical uncertainty results in significant distress and dissatisfaction with the medical encounter and profession. She states, "society does not readily grant permission to be ill in the absence of an "accepted" pathology," classifying people as illegitimately playing the sick role (Nettleton, 2006, 1176). The very foundation of attaining legitimacy is integrated with biomedical knowledge because its perspective is often defined as the privileged and authoritative truth (Lian and Robson, 2018). During clinical encounters when such knowledge is lacking, interactions between doctors and patients are highly contentious (Lian and Robson, 2018).

Sociologists have rarely studied the metaphorical connotations embedded in medical categories (Conrad and Barker, 2010). Symptoms with no clear link to organic pathology are challenging because they defy medical explanation and evidence-based treatments. Illnesses such as fibromyalgia, irritable bowel syndrome, multiple chemical sensitivity, and chronic fatigue are defined by medically unexplained symptoms (Mik-Meyer and Obling, 2012). These diagnoses are often medically and socially contested; therefore, they raise interesting questions about biomedicine's contemporary cultural authority and power (Barker, 2005). In this regard, not all illnesses are the same; they are hierarchized in terms of legitimacy. These distinctions exist for social rather than purely biological reasons (Conrad and Barker, 2010). Fibromyalgia, in particular, is a contested illness that is disproportionately diagnosed in women (Clasen et al., 2001). Although often unnoticed or taken for granted, certain illnesses have particular social or cultural meanings attributed to them resulting in diverse illness experiences, depending on the social positionality of the person diagnosed with the illness.

In this thesis, I will critically evaluate the social construction of medically unexplained symptoms and the context that led to the emergence of the chronic pain condition fibromyalgia (FM) as a contested and gendered illness. The application of Ian Hacking's phenomenon of "looping effects" will be useful in analyzing the illness experiences and sociocultural meanings behind the types of behaviors that arise among women suffering from FM. Furthermore, I will bridge the feminist concept of intersectionality to the conflicting illness experiences women confront as a collective and the additional obstacles Black women encounter, in order to highlight the intertwining roles of gender and race in the social construction of FM. In medical sociology, the social construction of diagnosis and illness is a central theme. By studying how illness is socially constructed, one can examine the way "social forces shape our understanding of and actions toward health, illness, and healing" (Brown, 1995, 34).

<u>Chapter 1: Existing Research on the Sociology of</u> <u>Illness, Medicalization and Intersectionality</u>

The Social Construction of Illness

Medical sociologists often dispute the meaning of social construction and have used it as a broad term. The traditional definition of social constructionism offers an understanding of how health and illness consist of biased meanings and forms of social control, helping sociologists investigate illness experiences and clinical interaction (Brown, 1995). However, Brown points out that this view is limited because it does not incorporate elements of a structural perspective such as the influence of key fundamental social structures in the construction of illness. The effects of core stratification elements such as class, race, gender, culture, the political economy, institutional and professional structures, and norms are also implicated (Brown, 1995; Conrad and Barker, 2010). These aspects shape the basis of our knowledge regarding assumptions about the prevalence, incidence, treatment, and the meaning of a particular disease (Brown, 1995).

Medical sociologists use social constructionist theory to interpret the social and subjective experiences of illness. They look into "the personal and social meanings of illness and explore how illness is managed in the social contexts that sufferers inhabit" (Conrad and Barker, 2010, S72). The majority of this research has been based on in-depth interviews, analyzing how individuals construct and manage their illness, and with what consequences (Conrad and Barker, 2010). Thus, the emphasis is on talk; a more interactionist approach of experience at personal, dyadic and group levels, given that symbolic interactionism underlines the human agency in people's exchanges of meanings (Brown, 1995). However, to focus on discourse analysis between doctors and patients is an oversimplification of the greater connotation of interaction (Brown, 1995). Brown suggests that emphasis should also be placed on how people perform their social roles through their interactions and how they relate to professional and institutional structures where the interactions take place.

Rather than being simply individual experiences of illness,

these experiences are collective social constructions and productions of reality (Brown, 1995). For some sociologists, one of the most troubling results of medicalization is that it encourages medical solutions while downplaying the social context of complicated problems (Conrad and Barker, 2010). Patients may actively participate in or demand the medicalization of their experiences to seek meaning for their suffering, as depicted by Barker (2005). The impulses toward expanding the biomedical boundaries through the medicalization of illnesses as a result of patient demands is relevant in a context where biomedicine has tremendous cultural authority (Barker, 2005).

Medicalization and Diagnostic Authority

Sociological research into medicalization focuses on interpreting previously nonmedical problems that have been medicalized (Conrad, 1992). Medicalization occurs when human problems or experiences become defined as medical problems, usually in terms of illnesses, diseases, or syndromes (Conrad, 1992). Sociologists who study medicalization emphasize the processes by which a particular diagnosis is developed, becomes accepted as medically valid, and gets used to define and treat patients' problems (Conrad and Barker, 2010). For example, Conrad and Muñoz present an initial analysis of the medicalization of chronic pain, focusing on the definitions and treatments of chronic pain that have emerged in recent decades. They view the medicalization of chronic pain as progress, legitimizing the suffering of people with chronic pain (Conrad and Muñoz, 2010). They identify various factors that contributed to its medicalization, such as the emergence of gate control theory of pain, medical advocates for pain treatment and specialty training, multidisciplinary pain clinics, professional pain associations, extended medical treatments and governmental decisions and support (Conrad and Muñoz, 2010).

Conrad and Muñoz's perspective differs from other sociology scholars who view medicalization more skeptically and focus on ways it may be detrimental to society and impose authoritative power over individuals (Conrad, 1992). Jutel argues that although chronic pain has been medicalized and treatments are available, people's sufferings are not granted social recognition nor validation without a diagnosis. The role of a diagnosis in legitimizing symptoms and suffering reflects the role of medical authority in the process of medicalization (Jutel, 2009). Thus, Jutel adds the idea that medicine's authority is embodied in diagnosis, which occurs at both the institutional and individual levels, to Conrad's framework. Jutel argues that a diagnosis is a powerful social tool that deserves its own specific analysis because it underlines the authoritative role of both medicine and the doctor (2009).

Many have written about the distress of patients who do not receive a diagnosis for their complaints (Jutel, 2009). For example, Nettleton conducted qualitative interviews of 18 neurology patients living with MUS and identified diagnostic ambivalence as a source of distress (Nettleton, 2006). Her concept of ambivalence illustrates that the medical processes associated with more precise problem solving and classification during doctor-patient interactions generate even more uncertainty and anxiety (Nettleton, 2006). Similarly, Mik-Meyer and Obling (2012) find that in the eyes of doctors, patients with MUS fall into a particular kind of category. They are given a social diagnosis which means a diagnosis that lacks medical explanations (Mik-Meyer and Obling, 2012). Their findings demonstrate that in some cases, "physicians are prepared to set aside the traditional search for objective findings to confirm the subjective complaints of

patients with MUS" (Mik-Meyer and Obling, 2012, 1036). Furthermore, Barker (2005), in her book about the social construction of fibromyalgia, argues that a legitimate disease does not truly exist until the social institution of medicine creates a representative diagnostic category backed up by biomedical evidence.

Fibromyalgia as a Contested Illness

A low prestige label has been given to conditions classified as medically unexplained or contested in the cultural medical hierarchy of diseases (Werner and Malterud, 2003). Fibromyalgia (FM), strictly speaking, is not a disease. Rather, it is a functional somatic syndrome represented by a collection of symptoms such as chronic widespread pain, stiffness, fatigue, sleep disturbance, and multiple reproducible tender points at symmetrical and distinct locations on the body (Barker, 2005; Clasen et al., 2001). It has comorbidities with irritable bowel syndrome, irritable bladder syndrome, cognitive and mood disorders and increased sensitivity to stimuli, all conditions that fall under the social category of contested illnesses (Barker, 2005). Physicians ascribe a lower status to FM in comparison to other diseases (Asbring and A.L., 2003; Oldfield, 2010). This explains why FM is controversial, especially since the medical institution has yet to see the illness experiences associated with FM as legitimate (Barker, 2005).

People with uncontested, high-prestige diseases are more likely to have their health care needs met (Asbring and A.L., 2003). The low prestige of a disease coincides with the lack of medical consensus. FM can be verified to a certain extent, since the establishment of the diagnosis consists of identifying the tender trigger-points on the patient's body (Asbring and A.L., 2003). However, Boulton's research on people diagnosed with FM illustrates that the tender-point test is not considered objective in medicine (Boulton, 2009). The participants describe having the tender point exam following the exclusion of other conditions (Boulton, 2009). It was only after their doctors were unable to detect a link between symptoms and an underlying cause with blood tests, x-rays and scans that participants were diagnosed with FM (Boulton, 2009). These narratives reflect that the FM diagnosis is the "last resort," and a "diagnosis of exclusion" (Boulton, 2009, 812). For FM sufferers, the period between when someone notices symptoms and receives an accurate diagnosis can be lengthy—up to an average of 6.7 years (Clasen

et al., 2001).

Boulton outlines the concepts of diagnosis of exclusion and inclusion (Boulton, 2009). The inclusion diagnostic process can be understood as an attempt to contain all the invisible, and unexplainable symptoms under a label that is not "perfect" but is a "best fit" explanatory model (Boulton, 2009, 813). However, participants' stories reflect that there is no typical FM illness experience because the experience of pain is varied (Boulton, 2009). Boulton's study also focuses on the diagnostic process which promises a label that validates patients' embodied experiences and a road map for living with and treating illness (Boulton, 2009). The participants felt that the FM diagnosis is ultimately an empty promise because "it does not help patients to understand and make sense of their illness experiences" (Boulton, 2009, 817). She explains participants felt the diagnostic process was unsettling; they also felt "cheated" by the FM label and had a shared understanding that the FM label is largely meaningless (Boulton, 2009, 817).

Intersectionality and Illness

The concept of intersectionality was coined by third-wave

feminist Kimberlé Crenshaw. She described intersectionality as a lens through which you can see where power emerges and collides, where it interlocks and intersects (Newton, 2017). Systems of oppression such as sexism, classism, racism and homophobia cannot be treated separately because they all equally serve to oppress women of color. Sources of oppression collectively play a role in which one oppression reinforces the other. In the case of contested illnesses, stigma arises from the fact that women of color with FM may have a harder time than white women proving that they are impaired by a legitimate condition. Applying intersectionality will be useful in capturing the multi-layered marginalization of women of color suffering from a contested illness.

At its foundation, stigma is about social inequality and social control, which creates a hierarchy that devalues stigmatized people (Best and Edwards, 2018). Experiences with stigma expressed by women with FM are linked to the modern biomedical paradigm, including the growing emphasis on evidence-based medicine (Lian and Robson, 2018). Individual freedom and responsibility are emphasized at the core of the modern Western biomedical system (Lian and Robson, 2018). Within this perspective, Lian and Robson state that "allegedly susceptible vulnerable women who do not manage to live up to the ideals of culturally legitimate ways to handle tiredness or harsh life events risk social exclusion and stigmatization from the successful majority" (2018, 34). Current research in medical sociology overlooks how a person's gender in conjunction with their race and ethnicity shapes their chronic illness experience. Barker explains that white women are overrepresented among those with FM whereas racial and ethnic minorities, especially Black people, are significantly underrepresented among those identified with FM in both clinical and community prevalence studies.

Ian Hacking: Looping Effects

Some of the most influential analytical tools used to analyze the history of diagnoses are concepts developed by Ian Hacking in the early 1980s and onwards (Millard, 2013). In Hacking's book, Mad Travelers, he illustrates his interest in evaluating how scientific knowledge changes how we think about ourselves, the possibilities that are open to us, and the kinds of people that we see ourselves as and others to be (1998). One of the most relevant concepts of Hacking's discoveries is "making up people," which describes how people come to occupy the identities that exist at various points in history or in different environments (Millard, 2013, 569). Hacking states that we tend to think of people, such as prostitutes and obese people, as objects of scientific inquiry and place them in specific classes outlined by definite properties in order to be able to control them, help and change them for the better (Hacking, 2006). However, this is not the case because our investigations and interactions change them, transforming them into something they were not before (Hacking, 2006). The general term Hacking gives to this phenomenon is the "looping effect" (Hacking, 2006). He emphasizes that sometimes science creates types of people that in a certain sense did not exist before (Hacking, 2006).

Chapter 2: The Social Construction of Fibromyalgia

The Diagnostic Making

While current objective notions of biomedical science discard the basis of fibromyalgia (FM) as a musculoskeletal disorder, its history is continuously linked with the subspecialty field of medicine referred to as rheumatology (Barker, 2005, 15). Barker explains that those who suffer from FM experience intense muscle and joint pain, placing rheumatologists at the center of their story. Rheumatology as a field in American medicine emerged between the 1920s and 1940s with steady progress in its organizational development (Hazmeijer and Rasker, 2003). However, there was a little corresponding success in the treatment of most rheumatic diseases, and this remains true even today.

Not only is there a hierarchy of diseases, but also a hierarchy of medical fields in which rheumatology is not held to the same regard as other fields of medicine, adding an extra dimension to the instability of FM as a contested diagnosis. Barker states that one of the most important reasons for rheumatology's precariousness is that there are few clear solutions for the wide range of illnesses that fall under its jurisdiction. Initially, the subfield of rheumatology was established to study and treat disorders of the musculoskeletal system, but it has expanded to treat patients on the basis of symptomatic experience of pain (Barker, 2005). Pain is positioned at the margins of biomedicine because no objective evidence of pain exists; only a patient's subjective testimony (Barker, 2005).

From the vast and disparate residual category of patients sent

to rheumatologists, the diagnostic category of FM emerged, and it illustrates the field's historical relationship to, and the struggle with, pain more generally (Barker, 2005). Muscle pain has been described in medical literature for centuries and in fact, tender points were first associated with disease in the early 1800s, as a symptom of rheumatism (Clasen et al., 2001, 46). It is widely recognized that the term "fibrositis" was first coined by Sir William Gowers in the 1904 British Medical Journal (Barker, 2005; Clasen et al., 2001). Fibrositis was referred to as "general muscle pain thought to be caused by inflammation of muscle tissues" (Clasen et al., 2001, 46). However, it was quickly judged faulty because muscle tissue cannot become inflamed (Barker, 2005). Nonetheless, the term persisted and was used to describe unexplainable, and oftentimes exaggerated, muscle and joint pain (Barker, 2005). It was also applied to shell-shocked soldiers in World War II (Barker, 2005).

A 1947 article argued that fibrositis is a form of "psychogenic rheumatism" because those who suffered displayed no inflammation but seemed to have high rates of depression and anxiety (Barker, 2005, 22). This psychological association was widely adopted during most of the 20th century, leading to fibrositis becoming synonymous with psychogenic rheumatism (Barker, 2005). This belief persisted and became entrenched in the minds of most physicians today. Oftentimes when a medical condition is poorly understood, psychiatric explanations abound, especially when the sufferers are largely women. Historically, in medical literature, women have often been portrayed as overly emotional or hysterical (Vearrier, 2015). Therefore, women have to negotiate their social position in order for their pain symptoms to qualify as a biological disease (Conrad and Barker, 2010).

Throughout the early 1900s, tender places on the body were associated with muscular rheumatism with various labels such as "nodules," "nerve points," "trigger points" and "tender points" used by different researchers at various times throughout the century (Barker, 2005, 23). However, Barker emphasizes that the existence of many different terms implies that a clear sense of the nature of these tender places and their biomedical existence has never been validated. Since the patients had no muscle and tissue inflammation, the term "fibromyalgia" better captured what they considered the disorder's central symptom: muscle and joint pain (Barker, 2005). During the 1970s, with a new label for the illness, rheumatologists Muhammad Yunus, Robert Bennett, Fred Wolfe and Don Goldenberg clinically tested and published fibromyalgia criteria (Barker, 2005; Clasen et al., 2001). The results of their collective research efforts led to varied conclusions in which they all proposed tender points as criteria but disagreed on their location and how many were required for diagnosis (Barker, 2005). Identifying criteria, formally adopting the diagnosis into medical nomenclature, and changing the disorder's name did not result in medical consensus (Barker, 2005). Goldberg, one of the leading experts of FM, explained that, "fibromyalgia is simply a label to use when patients have chronic unexplained diffuse pain" (Barker, 2005, 20).

In 1990, the American College of Rheumatology (ACR) endorsed classification criteria for the FM syndrome, stating that eleven or more positive tender points out of eighteen, in combination with widespread pain, offered the most specific and accurate criteria for the diagnosis of FM (Barker, 2005; Clasen et al., 2001). The disorder was subsequently recognized by the World Health Organization in 1992 (Clasen et al., 2001). Despite the ACR's Committee's best intentions to move beyond the contested history of psychogenic rheumatism and fibrositis, what remained the same, was the disorder's lack of an objective biomedical sign or marker (Barker, 2005). A standard set of subjective criteria derived by clinical observation was formalized instead.

A vital dimension of fibromyalgia that is important to this discussion is the fact that it is both a contested and a gendered illness. Much of the literature on contested illnesses center around gender, affecting women disproportionately. According to Robert Bennett, one of the national figures in FM syndrome research and treatment, describes FM as a "construct developed by rheumatologists to account for a common group of patients that they see in their routine practice" (Barker, 2005, 26). What he fails to mention is that these common groups of patients are women. In fact, approximately 90 percent of those who meet the FM criteria are women and nearly every physician knows that FM is a disorder that primarily affects women (Schone, 2019). Despite this, women's reports of pain are less likely to be taken seriously by providers and women are less likely to receive adequate treatment for their pain (Vearrier, 2015). However, Barker demonstrates that medical research on FM disregards this fact because it does not direct attention to gender or

gender differences to make sense of the feminization of FM.

The Feminization of Fibromyalgia

Throughout history, women have been more vulnerable to medicalization than men because their natural reproductive functions have been routinely medicalized, specifically regarding reproductive issues such as childbirth, birth control, infertility, abortion, menopause and PMS (Conrad, 1992; Barker, 2005). The debate around these conditions is whether they are primarily sociocultural, psychiatric or biological in nature (Jutel, 2009). In contrast with the scarcity of sex and gender research in the FM literature, scientific articles examining its neurobiological and psychogenic-behavioral basis prevail, especially since no biomedical evidence adequately explains the link between FM and muscle pathology (Barker, 2005). The biomedical understanding of FM is still unconvincing and highly contentious. The only uncontested fact about the FM diagnosis is its feminization.

FM is a gendered syndrome in part because of its historical associations of similar types of disease with negative stereotypes of women (Clasen et al., 2001). It has particularly been described as the latest manifestation of a psychiatric disorder in a long trajectory of related illnesses (Clasen et al., 2001). Beginning in the 19th century, the increase in female patients with broadly felt embodied distress and the hopeful institution of biomedicine gave birth to the diagnostic classifications of hysteria and neurasthenia (Clasen et al., 2001; Barker, 2005). Both these disorders were never granted medical orthodoxy because physicians viewed them as "women illnesses" consisting of a range of somatic complaints, psychoneurotic in origin (Barker, 2005, 55). The general symptomatic and epidemiological similarities between hysteria, neurasthenia, chronic fatigue syndrome (CFS) and FM are well documented. In brief, those who suffered from intense seizures, common symptoms of hysteria and neurasthenia, like those of CFS and FM, included pain, fatigue, headaches, cognitive and mood impairments, upper respiratory problems, and sleep and bowel irregularities (Barker, 2005, 55).

Whereas each one of these disorders have a unique trajectory tied to their specific historical location and medical specialty, their similarities as categories of medical knowledge and patient experiences are significant (Barker, 2005). Among their similarities, the emergence of each of these diagnoses involves women clinically presenting common, distressing and ill-defined symptoms and physicians using their available medical knowledge to offer them imperfect explanations and remedies for their distress (Barker, 2005). These diagnoses, including FM, have been found to be incompletely intelligible in biomedical terms and have instead been identified as psychosomatic for more than a century. Women have historically filled and continue to fill the slots of contested diagnoses that grant them neither the full legitimacy of disease nor a meaningful remedy towards health.

Chapter 3: The Illness Experiences of Fibromyalgia Sufferers

Doctor-Patient Interactions: Gendered Dimensions

Ian Hacking immerses himself in the ways a diagnosis, as a name, interacts with the named, which he refers to as the looping effects phenomenon (Hacking, 2006). He notes that a diagnosis has "subtle effects on how patients think of themselves, how they feel and how they behave" because "classifying people has an effect on how they conceive themselves; they internalize how they are classified" (Hacking, 2006; Millard, 2016, 576). My interest lies in revealing how both the diagnosis and the accompanying external forces influence behavioral changes in FM sufferers and how the label of FM exacerbates their illness experience. For chronic pain sufferers, the reaction of physicians to their MUS is the first and foremost element that plays a role in the making of their identity. Thus, the involvement of gender politics and cultural forces must also be incorporated in the analysis of doctor-patient interactions. These forces contribute to the feminization of the FM syndrome because its diagnosis cannot be removed from structures of privilege and power through which women's bodies and identities are oppressed and controlled in different ways (Käll, 2012).

Gender has a universal impact on the well-being of all people, in a given time or place (Barker, 2005). Despite differences among women, they "share the reality of occupying more or less subordinate positions in most social and cultural contexts," and this gendered reality has significant consequences for their health (Doyal, 1995, 7). Although pain is universal, women are more likely to report recurrent pain, pain in multiple areas of the body, and pain that is more severe (Vearrier, 2015). Cultural beliefs about masculinity and femininity influence pain experience because it is more socially acceptable for women to report pain and display emotions than men (Vearrier, 2015). This socialization originates in childhood; young boys are encouraged to act tough and avoid showing suffering from physical pain whereas young girls are not stopped from responding to pain by crying, screaming and displaying anger (Vearrier, 2015). Thus, women's complaints are equated with irrationality and sensitivity, resulting in their reports of pain being taken less seriously by healthcare professionals.

Women seeking medical care for their pain are subject to judgment by their physicians (Oldfield, 2010; Asbring and A.L., 2003). Doctors are more likely to prescribe them antidepressants rather than opioid analgesics (Vearrier, 2015; Oldfield, 2010). One of the main findings Oldfield presents in her article is moral judgment elicited by physicians, which manifests in five forms: "disbelief of women's pain reports, blaming women with FM for adding to their pain by catastrophizing, dismissing new symptoms by assuming that they are related to FM, accusing women of not wanting to get better and seeing them as a frustrating waste of time" (2010, 44). Due to physicians taking on a patient-blaming approach and the use of terms such as "somatization, somatizer and catastrophizing" to discredit them, most women suffer from chronic pain and the wide range of other symptoms without a sense of relief (Schone, 2019). They are left in the dark for years before attaining a confirmed diagnosis. Even when the FM diagnosis is provided, since FM is a widespread chronic pain disease without a known cause, it is the ultimate "non-diagnosis." For most women, it does not take long before they find themselves peculiarly between neither healthy nor "diseased" (Barker, 2005, 117).

The majority of general practitioners and specialists who come into contact with FM suggest that they support a psychosomatic view of the condition (Schone, 2019). Some of them regard it as a "non-disease,", hence the term "non-diagnosis,", while others refuse to receive referrals or provide ongoing care for patients diagnosed with FM (Schone, 2019, 127). Evidence also shows that experienced doctors across a variety of countries lack confidence in diagnosing and treating FM, especially in relation to making a differential diagnosis, because they find FM patients frustrating to treat (Schone, 2019). This refers back to doctors viewing FM as less prestigious than other diseases, placing it at the bottom of the hierarchy of medical classifications. Many women with FM recall situations where their complaints were trivial-
ized and they were written off as overly emotional, neurotic and hysterical (Barker, 2005). In fact, racial biases have been identified as one of the factors that influence whether a physician will provide patients with adequate treatment for their pain symptoms, particularly concerning female patients.

Racialized Dimensions of Pain and Women's Bodies

Race is not biological; it is a social construct. The social meanings given to particular racial groups in Western society have remained historically stagnant (Labunski, 2017). Lived experiences and unequal treatment by physicians and the medical institution likely play a far greater role in the distribution of diagnoses than socially constructed racial categories (Labunski, 2017). Many feminist scholars address is the influence of gender roles and racial differences in doctor-patient interactions. Black women have reported having inferior experiences compared to white women when visiting physicians regarding their pain symptoms. Beliefs connecting race and disease classification reveal "pseudo-binaries, mapping two kinds of pain onto two kinds of bodies: the "Black" female body and the "White" female body" (Labunski, 2017, 161). These are conveyed as "ideological concepts that are relationally constructed" because the two bodies are always juxtaposed against each other (Labunski, 2017, 168). "Whiteness is inherently a position of relative privilege marked by distance from Blackness," whereas "Blackness" is a social construction of subordination marked by the distance from "White" privilege (Labunski, 2017, 168).

Historically, medical research has mainly focused on the young white male adult body as the normative standard for diseases. In many clinical studies, there is no mention of race (Barker, 2005). In fact, Labunski, with her research on intersectional and racialized dimensions of gynecological pain, suggests that Black women were previously and likely continue to be missing from key medical research. As a consequence, ethnic minorities receive lower quality healthcare than their white counterparts (Baker et al., 2008). Black patients are less likely to be given pain medications, and when they are, they receive lower quantities (Hoffman et al., 2016). Furthermore, Black women are at an increased risk for chronic pain conditions that are more severe, physically debilitating, and undertreated compared to men and white women (Baker et al., 2008). The health disparity between Black and white women is decidedly in white women's favor, as conveyed by Barker (2005).

In the United States, beliefs that Black and white people are fundamentally and biologically different were advocated in various forms for centuries by scientists, physicians, including slave owners to justify slavery and the inhumane treatment of Black people in medical research (Hoffman et al., 2016). In the 19th century, prominent physicians sought to establish the "physical peculiarities" of Black people that could serve to distinguish them from white people (Hoffman et al., 2016, 4297). Some physicians believed that Black people could tolerate surgical operations with little, if any, pain at all (Hoffman et al., 2016,). Well into the 20th century, "researchers continued to experiment on African Americans based in part on the assumption that the "Black" body was more resistant to pain and injury" (Hoffman et al., 2016, 4297). Consequently, the Black female body was socially constructed as being distinctively strong, able to endure pain, and surmount otherwise difficult obstacles (Bailey and Mobley, 2019). Colonialist notions about the inferiority of Black people and the long history of slavery ingrained racism into Western society's structures and institutions. Today, these notions continually influence the medical institutions' view on Black women suffering from pain symptoms.

Black feminists have documented the significant role that the controlling image of the "Strong Black Woman" has played in the social construction of African American womanhood (Miles, 2019, 43). This image was cultivated from the history of Black women's exploitation as unpaid laborers during slavery, and later as underpaid workers and service providers (Miles, 2019). Their positionality as laborers both inside and outside the home conflicted with the traditional white American family ideal that proposed that women's roles should be constrained primarily to mother and wife (Miles, 2019). Therefore, their positionality did not enable them to conform to white standards of womanhood and femininity (Miles, 2019). Research suggests that for African American women, aspiring to conform to the Strong Black Woman image can be concurrently empowering and harmful to their health and self-concept (Miles, 2019). Many physicians avoid diagnosing patients with FM in the first place, fearing that they will become illness-fixated and that the label itself will ultimately become disabling (Barker, 2005).

Intersectional Stigma

A diagnosis serves an administrative purpose as it enables access to services and status, from insurance coverage of

specialty medication, disability status, and sick leave. However, when contention is present around an illness, it may deny the patient access to the sick role in society and more importantly, to institutional recognition of suffering. Within the biomedical paradigm, finding a specific underlying mechanism is key to establishing an illness's moral legitimacy, and therefore only people diagnosed with legitimate illnesses are entitled to sympathy (Oldfield, 2013). FM is a contested illness as well as an invisible disability. In an inherently ableist society, an invisible disability caused by a medically contested chronic pain illness is not granted the same compassion as a physical disability caused by a well-known disease. The profound uncertainty stemming from social stigma and the potential denial of access to benefits and services is an additional burden of suffering for women with FM (Greco, 2017).

Women with FM are subjected to a stigmatizing discourse with negative labeling and discrediting accusations leading to humiliation, shame, blame, stigma and social exclusion (Lian and Robson, 2018). Physicians have speculated that women with FM are unmotivated to get better because they do not help themselves to get better (Oldfield, 2013). This form of moral judgment is referred to as malingering (Oldfield, 2013). This disbelief and accusation played a role in the history of hysteria where physicians in the 18th century described a frustration with the ineffectiveness of hysteria remedies they prescribed (Oldfield, 2013). Frustration spilled over into anger at their patients because the physicians suspected a willful retreat into illness (Oldfield, 2013). With the etiology of FM unclear, sufferers are easily branded as malingerers who capitalize on a broadly defined syndrome. Ian Hacking shows how categories relating to selfhood and identity are intimately connected to specific historical circumstances (Millard, 2016). Today, since capitalism is society's central economic and political system, malingering deserves particular attention because it underlies the basis for struggles women with FM encounter in securing disability benefits.

Women suffering from chronic pain face many barriers of credibility, as their symptoms are read through gendered moral discourses that cast women as hypochondriacs, and weaker, less rational, more emotional, and more likely to complain than men (Pryma, 2017). These stereotypes are linked to the notion that women with FM seek "secondary gains" which is a biomedical explanation for the persistence of chronic pain (Oldfield, 2013, 49). According to this explanation, "patients are blamed for not wanting to let go of their pain because they gain attention or approval, money in the form of disability payments, and freedom from social responsibilities, such as employment" (Oldfield, 2013, 49). Women with disabling chronic pain have to navigate moral boundaries in order to separate themselves from the malingerers and disability frauds present in society. The challenges Black women with FM confront in order to legitimize their suffering highlights the ways moral boundaries that separate the worthy from the unworthy disabled are racialized and gendered (Pryma, 2017, 66).

Using intersectionality, a term coined by third-wave feminists, Pryma identifies how moral boundary-work is used by white and Black women when asserting the credibility of their FM disability. For FM sufferers, moral-boundary work serves as the first step toward obtaining a diagnosis, applying for disability, gaining credibility for their pain and receiving the disability payments often necessary for their survival (Pryma, 2017). FM advocacy groups, self-help publications, and pharmaceutical ads practice symbolic boundary-work as they represent typical FM patients as white, middle-class, married women, which in turn, affects how women of color with FM make claims about their pain and disability as apparently atypical patients, despite studies that indicate that women of color are susceptible to FM (Pryma, 2017). Regardless of their class, women of color recognize the need to work extra hard to prove their worthiness of treatment because they feel as though their pain is invisible to others due to the intersection of their race and gender (Pryma, 2017). All women with FM encounter gendered stigma during interactions with physicians but women of color face intersectional stigma relative to the racial privilege of white women.

The intersectional stigma experienced by Black women extends to their workplaces. Employment brings multiple social benefits such as regular interactions with others, raised self-esteem, intellectual challenges, status and many people regard it as fundamental to their identity (Schone, 2019). Without work, or with reduced working hours, patients with FM find their lives are more restricted financially and their reliance on others increased (Schone, 2019). Black women are usually in a position of social and economic disadvantage which exposes them to greater hardship and gives them fewer resources to alter the situations that infuse their lives with stress and suffering (Barker, 2005). When they apply for disability benefits, Pryma reports that they struggle to find physicians willing to support their applications for disability. The Black women she interviewed were, on average, highly educated and were forced to leave successful professions because of their debilitating FM symptoms (Pryma, 2017). They reported facing additional skepticism about the legitimacy of their disability that carried over to their social relationships with their families and communities (Pryma, 2017).

Black women suffering from FM experience marginalization within dominant majority communities as well as within their minority communities. The image of the "Strong Black Woman" emerged out of the era of slavery, which consists of "celebrated traits such as selfless, nurturing, independent, and exemplifying a physical and emotional will to endure great difficulties" (Miles, 2019, 43). This "Strong Black Woman" ideal acts as a counternarrative that celebrates characteristics in Black women who demonstrate their devotion to Black men and families, and to the African American community (Miles, 2019). However, women with disabilities are socially constructed as weak, dependent and unfit as providers, and they are considered unable to fulfill their expected gender roles as women (Miles, 2019). Since the characteristics of Black women include being hardworking, independent and caregiving, then the presence of disability caused by chronic pain symptoms directly conflicts with traditional ideals of Black womanhood (Miles, 2019). Consequently, Black women with FM experience intersecting stigma regarding their condition within the public sphere and the private sphere of their lives.

Hacking states that previously stable or treatable people may come to understand themselves in a way that is not amiable to their recovery (Schone, 2019). The meanings that guide their lives may be hijacked by one force or another (Schone, 2019). For Black women with FM, the layering of dismissal imposed by intersectional stigma disallows them to be in pain and disabled. They are unable to leave their jobs and access disability benefits due to the interlocking systems of oppression, gender and race. To make matters worse, they also do not receive sympathy from their family and communities because of the precariousness and invisibility of the syndrome as well as the image of the "Strong Black Woman." The emotional consequences of disbelief and the attendant loss of social support can be devastating, leading to a reaction such as a change of behavior from the person, influencing the diagnosis itself. Some Black women with FM may come to resist the diagnosis because of the internalization of the skepticism they received from every social sphere of their lives including physicians, employers, friends, and family members. They may also resist it in order to conform to the "Strong Black Woman" image, despite their pain or because they cannot afford to leave their jobs. Some of them may catastrophize their pain symptoms in an attempt to be prescribed medications for their chronic pain or attain disability benefits, "looping back" to the always-already present assumptions of malingering associated with the FM diagnosis. At the same time, their inclusion within the dominant white culture may blunt their awareness of the social forces giving shape to their suffering, leading them to internalize the prevailing cultural assumption regarding the abnormality of pain (Barker, 2005). Furthermore, since the stereotypical image of a woman with FM is of a white middle-class woman, some Black women presented to physicians with pain symptoms may not ever acquire a FM diagnosis, giving them no chance at an attempt to legitimize their suffering. Consequently, they are then pushed further into the sidelines of the healthcare system.

Ian Hacking states that knowledge interacts with us with a larger body of practice and ordinary life, generating socially permissible combinations of symptoms and disease entities. Hacking is not interested in telling people how to live their lives, or in saying that there is a right way to remember or structure one's experiences (Schone, 2019). He emphasizes that "when we are grouped or organized according to some principle or other, we react to that grouping: we are happy or sad to see ourselves or be seen in this or that way, we change" (Schone, 2019, 100). Applying Hacking's looping effect phenomenon to the illness experiences of people with different racial and ethnic identities is beneficial in revealing the gaps that are present in our healthcare system and medical research. It also uncovers how a diagnosis and its social consequences exacerbate behaviors and transform the self-identity of sufferers.

Conclusion

The historical and social diagnostic construction of FM is linked to the medical subspecialty of rheumatology in which

the majority of patients suffer from pain symptoms. Since the management of chronic pain lacks a testable organic pathology to account for a person's suffering, the field of rheumatology has had minimal success in curing rheumatic diseases (Barker, 2005). These factors add an extra layer of instability to the FM diagnosis, reinforcing its attributed contested features. In addition, the FM diagnosis has interrelating symptoms with other contested illnesses such as chronic fatigue syndrome and irritable bowel syndrome, and they all exist on a historical continuum with previously labelled psychosomatic conditions (Barker, 2005). Oftentimes when a medical condition is poorly understood, psychiatric explanations abound, particularly when the sufferers are primarily women. Furthermore, in medical literature, FM is perceived as the latest incarnation of hysteria, both conditions that are disproportionately diagnosed in women. This contributes to the feminization of FM and constructs it as a gendered syndrome.

The bias towards female patients as having psychogenic pain has led to mismanagement of medical conditions (Vearrier, 2015). Women have to work harder to acquire a diagnosis for their medically unexplained pain symptoms, because their complaints are often trivialized by physicians. Even after years of searching for a meaning and being morally judged by medical experts, when women are finally diagnosed with FM, they quickly come to realize that the diagnosis places them in a situation where they are neither healthy nor "diseased" (Barker, 2005, 117). Women of color, specifically Black women, confront additional dilemmas as a consequence of racial stereotypes. They receive lower quality health care than white women, especially concerning pain symptoms. Their pain is more often dismissed when compared to white women, as is a result of the long history of slavery and colonialist notions about the inferiority of Black people. These beliefs contribute to the social construct of the Black female body as being resilient and able to withstand higher levels of pain.

The central professional struggle of rheumatology and medicine in general lies in providing medical representation to people's subjective distress (Barker, 2005). The skepticism physicians have towards MUS, including the belief that a condition with MUS does not exist, reflects their professional biomedical view. "Illness does not exist until biomedically accounted for" is a value-neutral scientific statement within a biomedical frame of reference (Lian and Robson, 2018, 35). However, through an experiential viewpoint, patients suffering from MUS come to perceive such statements as personal, damaging and judgmental (Lian and Robson, 2018). Whether intended or not, doctors transfer their skepticism to patients' illness experiences. Without differentiating between the biomedical reality of illness and the socially defined illness experience, conflicts in medical uncertainty can neither be understood nor resolved (Lian and Robson, 2018). For instance, there is a necessity for the illness experiences of women of color to be distinguished because it uncovers the racial biases that are impeding their healthcare needs from being met.

In clinical practice and medicine, there is the need for a holistic patient-centered assessment in diagnosing patients' symptoms that incorporates the perspectives of patients and recognizes them as persons with their own expectations and goals (Lian and Robson, 2018). The emphasis on evidence-based treatments and explanations are predominant approaches that Western healthcare systems strive for. However, these principles, being deeply ingrained in the medical system, restrict the autonomy of patients that are suffering from a contested illness, creating types of behaviors that further obstruct their healing process. Leading FM expert, Don Goldenberg originally developed the label "fibromyalgia" and formalized it as a category of biomedical knowledge, stating that the label provides representation to the subjective suffering of millions (Barker, 2005, 20). Conversely, the contested FM diagnosis has not succeeded in capturing the full scope of the illness experiences of all women suffering from medically unexplained chronic pain symptoms. It has instead created a diagnosis that is detrimental to their identities within a society that embraces the biomedical paradigm of objectivity.

References

Asbring P. and Närvänen A.L. 2003. "Ideal versus reality: physicians' perspectives on patients with chronic fatigue syndrome (CFS) and fibromyalgia." Social Science and Medicine, 57, no. 4 (August): 711-720. https://www.doi.org/10.1016/ s0277-9536(02)00420-3

Bailey, Moya and Izetta Autumn Mobley. 2019. "Work in The Intersections: A Black Feminist Disability Framework." Gender and Society, 33, no. 1: 41-63. https://doi. org/10.1177/0891243218801523

Barker, Kristin K. 2005. "The Fibromyalgia Story: Medical Authority and Women's World of Pain." Philadelphia: Temple University Press: 252 pp.

Baker, Tamara A., Nicole T. Buchanan and Nicole Corson. 2008. "Factors influencing chronic pain intensity in older black women: examining depression, locus of control, and physical health." Journal of Women's Health, 17, no. 5: 869-878. https://doi.org/10.1089/jwh.2007.0452

Best, Jackson and Nancy Edwards. 2018. "Stigma and intersectionality: a systematic review of systematic reviews across HIV/ AIDS, mental illness, and physical disability." BMC Public Health, 18, no. 919: 1-19. https://doi.org/10.1186/ s12889-018-5861-3

Brown, Phil. 1995. "Naming and Framing: The Social Con-

struction of Diagnosis and Illness." Journal of Health and Social Behavior, Extra Issue: Forty Years of Medical Sociology: The State of the Art and Directions for the Future: 34-52. https://www.jstor.org/stable/2626956

Boulton, Tiffany. 2019. "Nothing and Everything: Fibromyalgia as a Diagnosis of Exclusion and Inclusion." Qualitative Health Research, 29, no. 6 (October). https://doi. org/10.1177/1049732318804509

Clasen, Mark E., Jeanne Parr Lemkau and Mary Terrell White. 2001. "Fibromyalgia: A Feminist Biopsychosocial Perspective." Women & Therapy, 23, no.1: 45-58. https://doi.org/10.1300/J015v23n01_04

Conrad, Peter. 1992. "Medicalization and Social Control." Annual Review of Sociology, 18: 209- 232. https://doi. org/10.1146/annurev.so.18.080192.001233

Conrad, Peter and Kristin K. Barker. 2010. "The Social Construction of Illness: Key Insights and Policy Implications." Journal of Health and Social Behavior, 51, Extra Issue: What Do We Know? Key Findings from 50 Years of Medical Sociology: S67-S79. https://www.jstor.org/stable/20798317

Conrad, Peter, and Vanessa Lopes Muñoz. 2010. "The medicalization of chronic pain." Tidsskrift for forskning i sygdom og samfund 7, no.13: https://tidsskrift.dk/sygdomogsamfund/article/view/4147/3601

Doyal, Lesley. 1995. "What Makes Women Sick: Gender and the Political Economy of Health." New Jersey: Rutgers University Press: 292 pp.

Hacking, Ian. 1998. "Mad Travelers: Reflections on the Reality of Transient Mental Illnesses." University of Virginia Press: 239 pp.

Hacking, Ian. 2006. "Making Up People." London Review of Books, 28, no. 16. https://www.lrb.co.uk/the-paper/v28/n16/ian-hacking/making-up-people

Hoffman, Kelly M., Sophie Trawalter, Jordan R. Axt and M. Normal Oliver. 2016. "Racial bias in pain assessment and treatment recommendations, and false beliefs about biological differences between blacks and whites." Psychological and Cognitive Sciences, 113, no. 16: 4296-4391. https://doi. org/10.1073/pnas.1516047113

Jutel, Annemarie. 2009. "Sociology of Diagnosis: A Preliminary Review." Sociology of Health and Illness, 31, no. 1 (March): 278-299. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9566.2008.01152.x

Käll, Lisa Folkmarsen. 2012. "Dimensions of Pain: Humanities and Social Science Perspectives." Routledge: 160 pp.

Labunski, C. M. 2017. "A black and white issue? Learning to see the intersectional and racialized dimensions of gynecological pain." Social Theory and Health, 15: 160-181. https://doi-org.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/10.1057/s41285-017-0027-4

Lian, Olaug S. and Catherine Robson. 2018. "Socially con-

structed and structurally conditioned conflicts in territories of medical uncertainty." Social Theory and Health, 17 (November): 23-39. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41285-018-00082-w

Mik-Meyer, Nanna and Anne Roelsgaard Obling. 2012. "The negotiation of the sick role: general practitioner's classification of patients with medically unexplained symptoms." Sociology of Health and Illness, 34, no. 7 (May): 1025-1038. https://www.doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9566.2011.01448.x

Miles, Angel Love. 2019. ""Strong Black Women": African American Women with Disabilities, Intersecting Identities, and Inequality." Gender and Society, 33, no. 1: 41-63. https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243218814820

Millard, Chris. 2016. "Concepts, Diagnosis and the History of Medicine: Historicising Ian Hacking and Munchausen Syndrome." Social History of Medicine, 30, No. 3 (October): 567–589. https://doi.org/10.1093/shm/hkw083

Nettleton, Sarah. 2006. "I just want permission to be ill': Towards a sociology of medically unexplained symptoms." Social Science & Medicine, 62, no. 5 (March): 1167-1178.

Newton, Tandie. 2017. "Kimberle Crenshaw on Intersectionality, More than Two Decades Later." The Guardian, Columbia Law School. Accessed April 11th, 2020. https://www. law.columbia.edu/news/archive/kimberle-crenshaw-intersectionality-more-two-decades-later

Oldfield, M. 2013. ""It's not all in my head. The pain I feel is

real": How Moral Judgment Marginalizes Women with Fibromyalgia in Canadian Health Care." Women's Health and Urban Life, 12, no. 1: 39-60.

Pryma, Jane. 2017. "Even my sister says I'm acting like a crazy to get a check": Race, gender, and moral boundary-work in women's claims of disabling chronic pain." Social Science and Medicine, 181 (May): 66-73. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. socscimed.2017.03.048

Ravenzwaaij, D van, Tim olde Hartman, H van Ravesteijn, R Eveleigh, E van Rijswijk ad PLBJ Lucassen. 2010. "Explanatory models of medically unexplained symptoms: a qualitative analysis of the literature." Mental Health in Family Medicine, 7, no. 4 (December): 223-231.

Rosendal, M., Tim Olde Hartman, Aase Aamland, Henriette van der Horst, Peter Lucassen Anna Budtz-Lilly and Christopher Burton. 2017. ""Medically unexplained" symptoms and symptom disorders in primary care: prognosis-based recognition and classification." BMC Family Practice, 18, no. 18. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12875-017-0592-6

Schone, Harry Quinn. 2019. "Contested Illness in Context: An Interdisciplinary Study in Disease Definition." Routledge: 216 pp.

Vearrier, Laura. 2015. "A Feminist Perspective on Gender Justice in the Treatment of Chronic Pain." Archives of Medicine, 8, no.3. https://www.archivesofmedicine.com/medicine/a-feminist-perspective-on-gender-justice-in-the-treatment-of-chronic-pain.php?aid=9574 Werner, Anne and Kirsti Malterud. 2003. "It is hard work behaving as a credible patient: encounters between women with chronic pain and their doctors." Social Science and Medicine, 57, no. 8 (October): https://www.doi.org/10.1016/ s0277-9536(02)00520-8

Chapter XVI

"It takes Many Beers:" The Process Towards Authentic Leadership in Today's Evangelical Church of Montreal

Written By: Daria Danita

Chapter XVI Written By: Daria Danita

Religion has, for a long time been seen in social sciences as a coercive force and agent in people's lives, particularly in a Quebecer society before the rise of the quiet revolution. Today, new movements arise. One of these movements is the evangelical non-denominational movement which is rapidly growing in Quebec. For this reason, this movement and its discourses should be thoroughly studied and understood. My research question seeks to investigate how Christian evangelical men situate themselves and negotiate contemporary notions of authentic and sincere masculinities in various social and educational contexts. With the rise of new waves of feminism, a light has been shed on male dominance in the church (Connell 1995; Schrock & Schwalbe 2009). Scholars have slowly moved away from the power and inequality discourses into understanding the living realities of everyday men (Thornton 2018; Van Klinken 2011). Within the 'church' institution, men still detain a certain power in most Christian circles although their power is now

acknowledged to come with certain specific and burdensome demands (Wignall 2016; Van Klinken 2011; Dawley & Thornton 2018). It is often overlooked as to how these same men relate to God as men and construct themselves within 'godly' parameters. There are very few accounts on the lived experiences of evangelical men in Quebec (Le Page 2015). Furthermore, lots of studies on "structures" around men within churches but there was a real gap in studying theological or religious institutes within an evangelical movement. Therefore, a study of men's gender imaginaries in relation to the intersections of their faith and the discourses that influence them, such as stoicism and authenticity, is an interesting avenue worth exploring in the social sciences.

This ethnographic account addresses questions of personal experience, identity negotiation, and performativity of gender as to gain insight into students' and alumni's imaginaries of authenticity. I hypothesized at first that men had turned 180 degrees around and had created alternative masculinities that were somewhat brand new, away from the previous generation's more 'traditional' understandings of manhood in terms of gender roles and cultural mores. I also originally believed that any institution, just as any sub-culture, might perspire a set of values and cultural expectations unique to it, which ended up being quite untrue in my interactions. Indeed, not only do young men continually challenge previous generations' notions of masculinities, but they also shape and reimagine new hybrid masculinities around a notion that serves their purposes: the notion of transparent authenticity in the private emotional sphere as well as in the public ministerial sphere. The men in my study rarely agreed to being shaped by their theological school in their everyday life; it was rather done by their everyday missteps, failures and through a deeper understanding of God and their identity in Him as 'sons'. Men could experience change and authenticity by harmonizing their ethos and their actions. Men would thus use sharing spaces sprinkled with accountability which would permeate into inner selves as to help adherents to internalize the notions of authenticity. These spaces become architecture and then a new hybridized authentic masculinity joins the line for hegemony. Instead of performing as emotionless, my participants started men's groups where they could share their emotions and cry in a safe space. Young men started young churches where these behaviours could be embraced. It ultimately adapted the institution of the church into their struggles with performativity as accepted

by the previous generation of leaders. In a sense, these men use the new extremities and structures around them to embrace their own particular authentic selves as well as to reproduce this certain ideal: the ideal of the authentic leader.

Methodology

I chose Montreal as it is unique in Canada for its diversity, language struggles, high immigration rate, plurality of religions as well as general openness to change demonstrated in its political life. This research was situated in a predominantly francophone setting with mostly bilingual informants. I devoted 12 intermittent hours to participant observation at the open offices of a non-denominational church that most alumni interviewed worked at. The church of my participant observation field site is evangelical in essence although under the umbrella of non-denominational movements. Its music is modern, show-like, and meetings are created for a daily application of scripture. This church is also pertinent as it hosts many of the ministerial school's alumni who are leaders of this church. This church has offices in the Mile End borough that are freely accessible to all congregants for prayer, work or just hanging out. There, I took thorough field notes through discrete note-taking during and after each segment, and documented impressions and significant events as well as students' interactions and comments throughout the encounters. Participant observation, at the church, consisted of spending time with participants, participating in conversations, and having lunch with students and alumni to gain their trust. I must interject that throughout this thesis I will address the church where I did my participant observation with a lower case. I interviewed twelve informants which were referred to me by existing participants. The participants' age ranged between 25 and 54 years. All participants were given fictional names for purposes of confidentiality. Two of the men were currently studying in the theological school and seven were alumni. The participants were interviewed between 50 and 120 minutes each and conversations ranged from life-histories to discussions about their opinions and understandings of gender and faith conceptualizations.

Literature Review

Dawley and Thornton (2018) describe the processes through which arise these alternative or "emergent masculinities" which are defined as: "new models or configurations of masculinity emerging and developing in response to social and cultural change, and usually in relation to—often in contrast to-dominant local masculinities that are seen as harmful or destructive" (Dawley and Thornton 2018, 15). By exploring the emergence of different masculinities as well as highlighting how the nuances of conventional forms of masculinity are navigated, the authors here demonstrate how, for instance, "religious masculinities emerge in concert with and in contrast to pre-existing ideas, affects, practices, and institutions pertaining to men's gender, making masculinity an important locus of contemporary religious and cultural transformation" (Dawley and Thornton 2018, 15). In other words, as we progress to the religious facet of gender and into this piece, we ought to keep in mind that masculinities and religion are "mutually constitutive" (Dawley and Thornton 2018, 5) and emerge in co-dependence with religion within different contexts and life experiences.

Luhrmann (2012) completes this analysis by explaining how gradually people slowly move away from 'sin' in their lives by shifting meanings associated with sin; instead of sin becoming a synonym of shame, it becomes a "state from being separated from God" (Luhrmann 2012, 104). In other words, believers seek for a unity in their everyday life with God, who offers a sense of security, joy and peace to the believer (104, 111, 112). Luhrmann addresses how the ultimate purpose for every believer is the "Imitation of Christ" or the process through which "God's will becomes my will" (109) as to truly achieve happiness in the present as well as in the afterlife (106, 111). In the light of Luhrmann's text, men's aspirations ought to be seen as aligning with God's goals as they are higher than the mere personal benefits and expand their scope to an afterlife.

Hansen claims that through evangelical doctrine, his informants could "bypass ideals of male dominance" (2018, 101) The meanings of "humility, domesticity, and emotional sensitivity" are thus associated with a "proper male behaviour modeled on Christ" (100). Santos understands these post-conversion inner changes as 'agency only made possible by a complex and transformative structure: The Evangelical Worldview Story' in El-Salvador (2012, 3). This story tends to be understood as godly power "to be in charge but to exercise authority in a Christ-like fashion, based on love and wisdom, never aggression" (38). He says that it is this "gendered cosmic narrative that allows for masculine transformation" (3). Due to the fact that this story is gendered, it provides its protagonists with the "individual agency to

restructure patriarchy, but not nullify it" (Santos 2012, 3). Evangelical doctrine, facilitated by conversion (22), acts as an agent that brings an evolution into gender ideology by reinforcing its own gender roles based on individuals' "static" interpretations of it (24). He also explains how the Evangelical narrative allows men to "reclaim their masculinity by transforming it" (Santos 2012, 37). These pieces resonate with Connell's framework where men restructure definitions of manhood which do not challenge the current gender order but still transform it into a strong different and somewhat valid discourse (Connell, R.W. 1995, 77-80).

<u>Analysis</u>

Intergenerational Transformation

L.P. Hartley wrote in 1953 how "the past is a foreign country: they do things differently there" (Hartley 1997, 5). In terms of notions of masculinities as authentic and vulnerable, my findings demonstrated more than foreignness, but literal alienation. It seems that "as soon as younger generations assimilate into the cultural knowledge, they axiomatically seek to transcend it" (Bristow 2016, 19). The men in my study had mixed feelings towards their theological teachings within their current or previous theological school. One critique seemed to be that teachers would teach students more "what to do" in their ministries rather than focusing on "what to be" which made them generally not appreciated among students. One man reported on how "simplistic" some teachings were at times. A young pastor complained about the scarcity of theological material in the classes and the high amount of ministerial advice which was given by some "elder teachers" not acknowledging the "new" challenges ahead of new ministers. In other words, some teachings were not adapted to young men's realities.

Many students felt that the foundations provided by their ministerial establishment did not cultivate in them the emotional strength of openness and authenticity that were needed for their later ministerial work and their personal lives. Authenticity in this text addresses the unhindered "congruence of thoughts and feelings" which "points to the true reflection of one's self in relation to its encounters with the world" (Akin & Akin, 2014; Bialystok, 2009; In Counted 2016, 269).

In sharp contrast with their moral values of authenticity, stu-

dents and alumni reported different anxieties when facing 'traditional' conscious and unconscious discourses of masculinities and ministerial leadership as opposed to their own lives' needs. These discourses are unconsciously transferred and received between generations: "The data transmitted by conscious teaching are of more limited importance, both quantitatively and qualitatively. All those attitudes and ideas which go on functioning satisfactorily in the new situation and serve as the basic inventory of group life are unconsciously and unwittingly handed on and transmitted: they seep in without either the teacher or pupil knowing anything about it" (Mannheim 1952, 299).

These unconscious transmissions took a few forms for the students in my study. They included a lack of gender egalitarianism in regards to ministerial positions within churches, a sluggish advance in paternal parental leave attitudes, a reticence towards breeches in masculine leadership performance, as well as an overall cultural knowledge of emotional closure. A clear evidence of this clash was the elders' discomfort with the notion of showing emotions and vulnerability. Some teachers would, as per my participants, portray a stoic role for leaders or a pastor in a church, with very few people in which to confide. Oppositely, they were known to sometimes encourage students to show their vulnerabilities and emotions in one-on-one meetings which was deeply disconcerting to some of my participants. This was thus the main critique of young pastors: a formal obligation to follow a 'traditional', 'non-emotional' approach to the ministry in the public sphere and to divulge their emotional vulnerabilities in very small and private groups. It was at times understood as a hypocrisy since young men had themselves considerable struggles with, among many others, self-concept, self-control, and self-loathing. So they refused to project themselves as flawless leaders.

This ambivalence and constant uncertainty led many of my participants to rethink critically these emotional and performative norms being passed out from previous generations now that they are themselves faced with positions of leadership and counselling.

Cedric is a 40-year-old pastor from France with many years of experience within the ministry. Cedric came to Canada to finish his Master's in theology. He has three children, and a full-time working wife who, like Cedric, is very engaged in the local church. Cedric explained that vulnerability was a big issue among pastors in his ministerial experience. He sees it as a more generational thing where with the previous generation (his parents'), men were unable to articulate their emotions. Even within his experience with counselling couples, he sees how it tends to be counter-intuitive for men to talk about themselves individually and to share their feelings. Expanding on his own experience, Cedric affirms how "with three men having a beer, they will talk generalities but before being vulnerable "it takes many beers" so it is not a normality" (Cedric's Interview).

Cedric now came to see this need for "many beers" before disclosure as abnormal. It symbolizes that the evangelical discourses which he was raised on rendered vulnerability between men improper. Only under alcohol influence can this performance anxiety be diluted and a more truthful self can be revealed (Counted 2016, 280). Cedric implicitly rethinks these "many beers" which not only lead men to alcohol abuse but ultimately lead to undesirable toxic masculinities (Connell, R.W. 1995, 78-80; Schrock & Schwalbe 2009, 289). To him, his difficulty in articulating and sharing emotion is presented as a "hole" in him or as something very important that is missing. Today, Cedric tries to create for his own children a space where they can express these emotions although it is far from being natural or easy since he is not happy with the status quo.

The notion of performance and performativity arises a lot in masculinity studies and is intricately related to Cedric's critique. Indeed, studies based on performativity show increasing fluidity and allow these oppositions, and contradictions to arise. These sources tend to show the overall desires of men and the different performances to realise such desires. For instance, Morris (1995) nuances essentialist frameworks (i.e. Schrock and Schwalbe 2009) through Butler's concept of gender performativity that is "the process by which difference and identity are constructed in and through discourses of sexuality" that entails a "forceful reiteration rather than meaning" (Morris 1995: 569, 571). In other words, it is gendered language and normative ideals that create notions of manhood and womanhood. Thus, "gender is something people do rather than an entity or a quality they possess" (Morris 1995, 572-573). The nuance brought by Morris explains that instead of associating masculinities with power and hegemony, one should rather assess them in terms of
performances or "sets of acts" that reinforce cultural acceptance by adapting one's ethos to the different socially approved behaviours (Morris 1995, 573, 580). Amidst my informants, performance for the older generation was associated with an emotion-free stoic leader with great empathy but little self-disclosure. Yet, upon a breach in performance, this image would inevitably lead to the translation of failure into feelings of shame and inappropriateness. In order to avoid these possible breaches upon their performance and thus being excluded from inclusivity, young men decided to opt for a transformation. They decided that instead of being flawless leaders, they would be truthful to themselves and others with struggles. Instead of hiding their humanity, they embraced it.

Olivier is a 30 years single pastor who graduated from theological school five years ago. He has had a negative experience with evangelical leaders such as his father who lacked transparency and authenticity. Indeed, he mentioned that "My father was a pastor and lived a double life; a double standard. I used to live very difficult moments" (Oliver's Interview). Olivier's father, a product of his generation, was in Olivier's view, inauthentic. By saying that his father "lived a double life," refers, amidst other things, a lack of authenticity and veracity of whom he truly was. He would be different at church than at home which was also a common critique found amidst my participants. Today, Olivier is an artist writing non-liturgical, very personal music expressing his struggles with himself, his spirituality and his relationships, which was previously frowned upon within the evangelical church: "In my concerts, I used to be uncomfortable with what people thought of me. With adolescents [that I pastor] I used to be very real and transparent. I rendered myself vulnerable. [...] I wanted to show that all these spheres are me. I do not see how it would not be good for people for me to show all my facets [including the dark ones]. People liked it. [...] Some don't understand. Some feel uncomfortable. People were very happy about the album. I could have coffees with people who did not feel well. [Through the album] I put the finger on a subject that is not touched upon. Sometimes people do not want answers, they want people who understand them." (Oliver's Interview)

Olivier initiated his own movement of vulnerability and authenticity through his art. He felt that he needed to be true to himself and show the world all his "facets". Through his music, he not only resisted previous generational norms he knew but also used this vector to instill the change that he felt would contribute the most positively for the people within the church. His statement made others open up over 'coffee' which translated into a movement of authenticity. His display of vulnerability led others, with similar life experiences and realisations to join the movement to create a new and alternative way to be an evangelical leader. Olivier was a youth pastor and he used his influence to teach vulnerability, openness and authenticity to his group of adolescents. My findings demonstrated that many men had a similar quest and yearned for more authentic masculinities. These would not challenge the current gender order but rather, just as Connell predicted, opened the space for inborn alternative hybrid masculinities which change definitions and performance of manhood without challenging its fundamental notions of male authority. These translate in new powerful and valid discourses. Olivier later joined a church which embraces his authenticity and who advocates for authenticity within the church culture as well as infrastructure.

Becoming an Authentic Leader: The Anchoring in Peace and Openness

It is vital here to discuss how masculinities and religion are "mutually constitutive" and emerge in co-dependence with religion within different contexts and life experiences (Dawley and Thornton 2018, 5). The implication of faith is particularly true amidst my participants where their identity is intricately related to their faith and transcendent positionality. Their notions of self, process, and identity are intricately related to their faith. My interpretation of the vast notion of 'identity' will rest upon Dunnington's understating where identity incorporates "self understanding", "sense of self worth", "vocation" and "ego ideal" (2018, 244). Indeed, the first step of becoming authentic leaders for my participants was to reach a state of emotional stillness when faced with adversity and defeat. Faith here acts as an empowering force to reach the goal of peace (Lechner et al. 2015, 212). This stillness could only be achieved through a deep realisation of one's identity 'in Christ'.

When asked to describe themselves, many of my informants identified as 'sons of God' or 'adoptive sons'. The concept of 'sons of God' ought to be understood in its entire complexity. Being a son implies a few things. It first means that one is under the authority of a father which also implies a sense of obedience and respect to the authority of the father. It implies that there ought to be a close relationship, as in a family. But ultimately it implies that the father has the ultimate sovereignty over His own affairs. Therefore, when evangelical men do 'God's work', they have a sense of unconditional love despite their mistakes. As a result, in their everyday ministry, they did not welcome all the responsibility their church told them they had because, to most of my participants, it was their 'Father's work' and not theirs. Through this process of surrendering, men came to understand that who they were today, as humans, was less important than whom they were understanding to be in God's eyes.

The identity of son of God, in an Evangelical context, builds upon the Pauline notion of discipleship only to incorporate a profound feeling of security and love from God the Father (Lechner et al. 2015). In other words, men mostly understood that through complete surrender of their failures to God, they could acquire a certain essential identity, or as Dunnington explains, a "sense of self worth", where one is "deserving of unconditional love and care" (2018, 244). Cedric explained how he was taught to do things which he had to renegotiate later in his life. Since he is a task-oriented person, he has always been focused on doing things just because it was what a minister and a man was expected to do. Later, he underwent an identity crisis upon going through a professional burnout. Since he was now unable to "do" things, he went on for a quest of meaning. It is how his larger attitude changed. He reported moving away from "I am a pastor" to "I am a son" (Cedric's Interview). He learned to find his true identity in God as a son of God. In a sense, he gave up the things he would do that would give him value and opted towards a vision where he had intrinsic value in himself due to his positionality towards God.

However, not all men could attain this state of grounded stillness in their identity as sons of God. It seemed to require time, experience, and spiritual maturity. In order to remedy the generational and normative pitfalls that led men into states of despair and confusion in regards to their identities, some men, such as Julien, opened spaces for these men, who were at risk of inner turmoil if left in solitude. It was the second step of becoming an authentic leader: becoming an example of authenticity and thus of humanity. These liminal

spaces were rooted in authentic accountability. One of my participants, Julien is a 29 years old student in theology, pastor in apprenticeship and the head of volunteers within his local church. He hosts a group for young single men. He says that his young men's group is 'a place where men can take off their "masks" and bring to light their inner dark sides and sins in a space of connexion, trust and accountability' (Interview). Accountability here is described as part of the "mechanisms for maintaining a social system" through "the model of social judgment and choice" (Frederick, Wood, West, G. R. Bud & Winston 2016, 304). Although it is 'usually described negatively', accountability in this context should be perceived as including 'regular and positive steps as to maintain proactive connections with followers' (Frederick, Wood, West, G. R. Bud & Winston 2016, 304). Indeed, my findings showed that through accountability and close relationships with other Christian men my participants get to heal from previous wounds, restore a healthy self-concept (Counted 2016), or are helped to bring to a better harmony their ethos and their actions. By guarding each other's actions and being accountable to each other, men can be transparent, and humble (Dunnington 2018). In this sense, Julien believes that a Christian's character is always in the process

of "growing", leaving the control unto God, which tends to be, in his opinion, against the natural instinct of a leader (Julien's Interview). Dwelling in a state of stillness in one's visceral identity as a son of God is thus a process which can only come to life with one's realisation of one's fallibility. I would argue that in the process of sharing and opening up about their emotional wounds and struggles, men are constantly confronted with their constant failure and humanity. Thus, when faced with failure, men in my study were led to redefine their identity based upon different theological frameworks. The way this process was started was through the power of openness; openness between men led to the confession of one's failures. The repetitive exteriorisation of one's faux pas in a safe space will lead men to have to renegotiate their sense of self in relation to these failures, as explains Dunnington in his analysis of Christian addiction recovery (2018, 248). This sense of self would then be redefined in terms of being sons of God.

Just as in Van Klinken's ethnographic account, sharing one's humanity, or accountability, when being sons of God generated change due to these strong biblical and theological arguments at their essence (Van Klinken 2011, 119). These discourses are powerful since they come back to moral and theological frameworks of separation from God through sin, as well as, of unity with God through repentance and sanctification out of love for God (Klaits 2011; Luhrmann 2012). Given these theological arguments, the ideal of the authentic leader can arise and then lead the reproduction of such men and leaders through spaces of accountability. The literature on authentic leadership affirms that "accountability has been defined as essential to support the fundamental structure of society" (Von Dornum 1997; In Frederick et al. 2016, 303). Wood and Winston (2007) defined "a three-variable concept of accountability that included responsibility, openness, and answerability" (Frederick et al. 2016, 303). In the movement of religious masculinities perceived throughout this piece, accountability, openness and sharing were the core ingredients to the concept of authenticity. Thus, an authentic leader in this Evangelical context ought to himself be open, answerable, accountable and transparent in order to demonstrate a harmony in his identity 'in Christ, as a forgiven and peaceful son. One might argue here that in essence, the change that occurred in the men was a movement away from the performance of stoic masculinities towards a performance of open and authentic masculinities. My findings did not express such possible avenues. The men did not have active exterior pressures from the Church to open up about their lives. They did it because it helped them find peace in a world of chaos. It helped them find friends and brothers instead of solitude. Emotional openness, I would argue, helped my participants transcend their gender and performance anxieties into hybrid masculinities composed of ideals of strength within vulnerability.

Architectural Authenticity

Structure's responsibility for social change is limited in comparison to the complex inner and spiritual processes needed for shaping a self-surveilled mind; it is yet an essential part of the reproduction of authentic hybrid masculinities. I realised that the architecture of the office indirectly contributed to this aim for authenticity through notions of openness which, ultimately sustains new and alternative notions of being a man. Indeed, it is commonly understood that architecture of a building both "produces and represents certain ideologies of its inhabitants" (Thornhan 2012, 787). The concept of the open space, the design and architecture of the place was made to have people talk to each other. Several sofas are present as well as large tables and desks. The space is generally relaxed and informal. All offices have glass doors to maintain a sense of transparency. It is something communicated previously by the principal pastor when addressing the church on issues of purity and transparency of the church. The pastors are all protected by these glass doors which are never obstructed. This way, everything that is done in the pastor's office can be seen by anyone coming in. It also provides a sense of proximity with the leadership. There are conference rooms, meeting rooms and prayer rooms with the same glass window concept. Having the means for such design and the way it was deployed is an interesting way of understanding the visions of leaders. I believe there is also an attempt at authenticity. The space displays people who are regular, down to earth, accessible and have nothing to hide.

The architecture of the space was echoing the church's aims but also many men's struggles. A few of my participants addressed their previous battles against pornography as well as various sins and addictions. The pastor himself shared on one Sunday about his previous fight with pornography addiction as well as his ongoing weaknesses and his need for accountability in his leadership. The church itself, which has different rented campuses, has transformed in the last years its offices into a space of transparency. These spaces include a few elements in its design which Hurdley calls "architecture of openness" (2010, 47). First, the element of light is very important as it draws on natural light resources through large aligned windows that visually connect rooms and spaces within the space. Natural light brings about an interesting symbol between the light that Christians are supposed to be in the world with the light that ought to reign on believer's lives. Second, the geographic positionality of the office in rapport to Mount Royal's cross made the view a symbolic reminder of Jesus' sacrifice and the restoration that the cross brought about within humanity. It resonates with the churches' intent of helping people restore their lives through the message of Jesus' sacrifice. Third, the partial clear-glass doors allow for whomever to gaze upon the offices, meeting rooms and small conference rooms. Rooms are mostly organized almost similarly to Bentham's Panopticon model which could serve a similar purpose, encouraging Christians, through peer surveillance, to act accordingly to their identity as sons of God. I would argue that overall, the architectural design of the offices aimed at facilitating the complex processes of the transmutation of the self-surveilled body

within the self, leading to a self-surveilled mind. The space thus contributes as a passive empowerment and encouragement to transparency and purity. For these matters, the lead pastor publicly invited all congregants to come work and study within the offices, probably to have a safe place. The space echoed to the social demographics of pornography addiction, substance abuse as well as other temptations or struggles that a Christian might hold secretly. It was often stated by my participants that the Church is a spiritual hospital indeed and people come to get help: "You must not show other people that you live in an ideal world as yours is not different from theirs". It brings strength and authenticity to "take off the mask" (of perfection). [...] Churches are spiritual hospitals' where you have lots of unwell people together to get well. There are a few bumps in the way." (Michael's Interview)

For Michael, vulnerability is key to healing or progressing in one's life. He understands this progress as an ascendance of authenticity. He acknowledges the failures or perhaps struggles as "bumps in the way". The notion of hospitals in our current context oversees the need for surveillance in terms of assistance and care until recovery. In Thornhan's ethnography, the gaze, reflected by staff members, entrenches diverse power-relations and gender inequalities (787, 793, 797). In contrast, the offices were not designed to reflect hierarchies. The spaces were to my knowledge all accessible by all members. The space thus offers this help to congregants but also staff members. My last but most important finding, was the emphasis on sharing. Everywhere, in open and closed spaces there were several places or chairs. There was almost no space with only one chair. This alignment of space allowed Christians to constantly interact with each other.

The materiality of the space, such as the kitchen which has two enormous tables where people sit face to face similar to picnic tables, renders it nearly impossible to eat without talking to others. This space, I would argue, through its architecture and design encourages exchanges between people. Smaller prayer rooms are situated on one's way out as an extension of a conversation where accountability, authenticity and vulnerability are meant to take place. If one skips this step, another half-open space or 'the coat area' will lead the people to this conversation due to it being a small area. There are seats for boots change which make it a last pos-

sible lounge for discussion before exiting the premises. The space is thus an extension of the churches' aim. It is a permeation of an ideology of authenticity and vulnerability which finds every trivial encounter a right moment for authentic exchange. Just as any structure, this specific church could be understood as using implicit imagery and architecture to instill their own ideal of leadership: the authentic, answerable and open pastor. Since in this church most pastors happen to be men, and also since the architecture seems to be a response to publicized masculine scandals of sexual impurity, this message could be easily understood as gendered. It is thus not a stretch to understand the architecture as feeding into alternative masculinities where the congregation is not afraid of emotions, vulnerability, or transparency. The architecture feeds into the ideal of a new or different type of leadership.

Conclusion

Hybrid masculinities occur in many shapes and forms when human beings decide to exert their agency against present evangelical church-infused hegemonic masculinities. Vulnerability implemented through different personal and interpersonal strategies led to an informal change within institutional dynamics. Among my informants, men learned to navigate the complex notions of evangelical masculinities by first finding their own value and self-worth grounded in theological ideology; then by merging and personalizing this notion of self as 'sons of God' with vulnerability and authenticity. They then reconfigured intergenerational norms by affirming and reproducing authenticity to younger generations; and ultimately created new churches, offices and structures which represented this ideal of demonstrating genuine vulnerability and accountability within their community. This phenomenon of collective sharing and openness helped men overcome local vernacular societal taboos and personal struggles such as pornography addiction and empowered them by re-emphasizing on their ultimate identity. All these strategies were used to operate an inner change motivated by personalized and context-based public initiatives which led to the reproduction of hybrid masculine discourses of authenticity. Masculinities studies amidst contemporary men's movements are still to come and ought to change the social perceptions and understandings of religion in the long-term.

References

Bristow, J., 2016. Fresh Contacts, Education, and the Cultural Heritage, in: Bristow, J. (Ed.), The Sociology of Generations: New Directions and Challenges. Palgrave Macmillan UK, London, pp. 19–42.

Connell, R. W., 1995. The Social Organization of Masculinity. In Masculinities. London, England: Polity. pp. 77-80. Counted, V., 2016. Being authentic is the new image: a qualitative study on the authenticity constructions and self-images of Christian millennials in Africa. Mental Health, Religion & Culture. 19(3), pp. 268–294.

Dawley, W. & Thornton, B.J., 2018. New Directions in the Anthropology of Religion and Gender: Faith and Emergent Masculinities Introduction. Anthropological Quarterly, vol. 91, no. 1, pp. 5-23.

Dunnington, K., 2018. Recovery and the Humble Reconstitution of the Self. Perspectives on Science and Christian Faith. vol. 70, no. 4, p. 242-250

Fredrick, H. & Wood, J. West, G & Winston, B. (2016). The Effect of the Accountability Variables of Responsibility, Openness, and Answerability on Authentic Leadership. Journal of Research on Christian Education. 25. 302-316

Hartley, L. P. 1997 [1953]. The go-between . London: Penguin. Hansen, H., 2018. Addicted to Christ: remaking men in Puerto Rican Pentecostal drug ministries. California: University of California Press. pp. 100-101.

Hurdley, R. (2010) 'The Power of Corridors: connecting doors, mobilising materials, plotting openness', Sociological Review, 58(1), pp. 45–64.

Klaits, F., 2011. Introduction: Self, other and God in African Christianities. Journal of Religion in Africa, vol. 41, no. 2, pp. 143-153.

Lechner, C. M. et al., 2015. Getting going and letting go: Religiosity fosters opportunity-congruent coping with work-related uncertainties. International Journal of Psychology. 50(3), pp. 205–214

Le Page, P., 2015. Megachurch Pentecôtiste en contexte Québécois : La Religion Vécue à l'église Nouvelle Vie de Longueuil, Université du Québec à Montréal. Mémoire. pp. iii; 164-167.

Luhrmann, T.M., 2012. When God talks back: Understanding the American Evangelical Relationship with God. New York: Vintage books edn, Vintage Books. pp. 104-126.

Mannheim, K. (1952). Essays on the sociology of knowledge. Paul Kecskemeti (Ed.). London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd.

Morris, R.C., 1995. All Made Up: Performance Theory and the New Anthropology of Sex and Gender. Annual Review