

MINUTES OF THE OPEN SESSION OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD OF GOVERNORS

Held on Thursday, April 21, 2011, immediately following the Closed Session meeting, in the Norman D. Hébert, LLD Meeting Room (Room EV 2.260), SGW Campus

PRESENT

Governors: Mr. Peter Kruyt, *Chair*, Mr. Adnan Abueid, Dr. Shimon Amir, Mr. Robert Barnes, Sister Françoise Boisvert, Dr. Tien Bui, Hon. Baljit Singh Chadha, Mr. James Cherry, *Vice-Chair*, Me Francesco Ciampini, Mr. Amine Dabchy, Mr. Howard Davidson, Me Rita de Santis, Mr. Brian Edwards, *Vice-Chair*, Mr. David Gobby, Ms. Suzanne Gouin, Prof. Arpi Hamalian, Mr. Abdullah Husen, Dr. Arvind K. Joshi, Mrs. Judith Kavanagh, Dr. Lawrence Kryzanowski, Dr. Frederick Lowy, *President and Vice-Chancellor*, Ms. Heather Lucas, Mr. Michael Novak, Ms. Stephanie Siriwardhana, Dr. Johanne Sloan, Dr. Peter Stoett, Ms. Annie Tobias, *Vice-Chair*, Mr. Jonathan Wener, *Vice-Chair*

Non-voting Observers: Mr. Graham Martin

Officers of the University: Mr. Philippe Beauregard, Mr. Roger Côté, Dr. Louise Dandurand, Me Bram Freedman, Dr. David Graham, Mr. Patrick Kelley, Me Dominique McCaughey

Guests: Me Jonathan Levinson

ABSENT

<u>Governors</u>: Mr. Charles G. Cavell, Mr. Jean-Pierre Desrosiers, Ms. Hélène Fortin, Mr. Norman Hébert jr., Me John Lemieux, Mr. L. Jacques Ménard, *Chancellor*, Mr. Tony Meti, Mr. Andrew Molson, Me Marie-José Nadeau, Ms. Patricia Saputo, Mr. Ivan Velan, Mrs. Lillian Vineberg

Non-voting Observers: Ms. Jean Freed

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 8:28 a.m.

2. <u>Approval of the Agenda</u>

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Barnes, Gouin), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

R-2011-4-5 That the Agenda be approved, and that items 3 to 5 be received, ratified or approved by consent.

CONSENT

- 3. Approval of the Minutes of the Open Session meeting of March 31, 2011
- R-2011-4-6 The Minutes of the Open Session meeting of the Board of Governors, held on March 31, 2011 were approved by consent.
- 4. Monthly reports submitted for information
- 4.1 Chief Communications Officer Mr. Philippe Beauregard (Document BG-2011-4-D3)
- 4.2 Acting Vice-President, Services Mr. Roger Côté (Document BG-2011-4-D4)
- 4.3 Vice-President, Research and Graduate Studies Dr. Louise Dandurand (Document BG-2011-4-D5)
- 4.4 Vice-President, External Relations and Secretary-General Me Bram Freedman (Document BG-2011-4-D6)
- 4.4 Provost and Vice-President, Academic Affairs Dr. David Graham (Document BG-2011-4-D7)
- 4.6 Chief Financial Officer Mr. Patrick Kelley (Document BG-2011-4-D8)
- 4.7 Acting Vice-President, Advancement and Alumni Relations Me Dominique McCaughey (Document BG-2011-4-D9)

The monthly reports were provided for information purposes.

- 5. <u>Additional appointments to the Advisory Search Committee for the Dean of the John Molson School of Business</u>
- R-2011-4-7 In accordance with the composition set out in the Rules and Procedures for Senior Administrative Appointments (Policy BD-5), the appointment of the following members was approved by consent:
 - Ms. Eva Ferrara, representing the JMSB support staff
 - Mr. Abdullah Husen, representing the undergraduate students.

REGULAR

6. Business arising from the Minutes not included on the Agenda

There was no business arising from the Minutes not included on the Agenda.

7. <u>Approval of the collection of an undergraduate student fee levy</u> (Document BG-2011-4-D10)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Lucas, Husen), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

- R-2011-4-8 That the Board of Governors authorize the University to collect a fee levy of \$0.02 per credit from all undergraduate students to fund the operations of Queer Concordia, to be implemented with registration for the Fall term of 2011 (2011/2), in accordance with the University billing, refund and withdrawal policy.
- 8. <u>Discontinuance of the collection of an undergraduate student fee levy</u> (Document BG-2011-4-D23)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Lucas, Dabchy), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

- R-2011-4-9 That the Board of Governors authorize the University to discontinue the collection of a fee levy of \$0.41 per credit from all undergraduate students to support the Canadian Federation of Students, as of the Fall term of 2011 (2011/2).
- 9. Approval of the collection of graduate student fee levies
- 9.1 <u>Fee levy of \$0.50 per semester to support Sustainable Concordia</u> (Document BG-2011-4-D11)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Abueid, Lucas), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

- R-2011-4-10 That the Board of Governors authorize the University to collect a fee levy of \$0.50 per semester from all graduate students to support Sustainable Concordia, to be implemented with registration for the Fall term of 2011 (2011/2), in accordance with the University billing, refund and withdrawal policy.
- 9.2 <u>Fee levy of \$1 per semester to support the Graduate Student Advocacy Center</u> (Document BG-2011-4-D12)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Abueid, Lucas), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

R-2011-4-11 That the Board of Governors authorize the University to collect a fee levy of \$1 per semester from all graduate students to support the Graduate Student Advocacy Center, to be implemented with registration for the Fall term of 2011 (2011/2), in accordance with the University billing, refund and withdrawal policy.

10. <u>Tuition fee increase for the programs in the Goodman Institute of Investment Management</u> (Document BG-2011-4-D13)

In response to a question, Provost Graham said that the justification for the increase was essentially to provide more resources to the programs, as fully detailed in the background document. Mr. Abueid opined that any increase is detrimental to students and urged Governors to vote against the proposed motion. However, some Governors wondered if the increase was sufficient and cautioned that we should be careful, as we build world class programs, not to look like we have inferior programs if their cost is too low. Provost Graham responded that JMSB monitors fees on an annual basis and emphasized that the clientele for this program is not the average graduate student but rather a career professional.

Dr. Kryzanowski pointed out that these privatized programs are given in Montreal and Toronto, that the fees are lower compared to those of University of Toronto, even in the regular MBA programs, that any increase is helpful and that most students in the program are in the investment industry and supported by their companies.

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Lowy, Chadha), it was RESOLVED:

- R-2011-4-12 That, upon recommendation of the Dean of the John Molson School of Business and the President's Executive Group, the Board of Governors approve an increase in the annual tuition fee from \$16,000 to \$18,000 per year for new students registering for the Fall term of 2011 (2011/2) in the following programs in the Goodman Institute of Investment Management:
 - Diploma in Investment Management (DIM);
 - Master of/Magisteriate in Investment Management (MIM); and
 - Master of/Magisteriate in Business Administration (Investment Management Option) (IMBA).
- 11. Recommendations from the Audit Committee on year-end results
- 11.1 Approval of Concordia University's financial statements for the fiscal year ended on May 31, 2010 (Document BG-2011-4-D14)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Cherry, Barnes), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

R-2011-4-13 That, upon recommendation of the Audit Committee, the Board of Governors approve the financial statements for the fiscal year ended on May 31, 2010, as reported by Concordia's external auditors Raymond Chabot Grant Thornton and outlined in Document BG-2011-4-D14; and

That Chair of the Board of Governors, Mr. Peter Kruyt, and the President and Vice-Chancellor, Dr. Frederick Lowy, be designated to sign the financial statements on behalf of the University.

11.2 Approval of the interfund transfers (Document BG-2011-4-D15)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Cherry, Joshi), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

- R-2011-4-14 That, upon recommendation of the Audit Committee, the Board of Governors approve the interfund transfers disclosed under Note 16 to the financial statements for the fiscal year ended on May 31, 2010, as set out in Document BG-2011-4-D15.
- 11.3 Approval of the Rapport financier annuel for the fiscal year ended on May 31, 2010 (Document BG-2011-4-D16)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Cherry, Edwards), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

R-2011-4-15 That, that, upon recommendation of the Audit Committee, the "Rapport financier annuel" of Concordia University for the fiscal year ended May 31, 2010, as outlined in Document BG-2011-4-D16, be approved; and

That Chair of the Board of Governors, Mr. Peter Kruyt, and the President and Vice-Chancellor, Dr. Frederick Lowy, be designated to sign the "Rapport financier annuel" on behalf of the University; and

That the University be authorized to submit the said "Rapport" to the Ministry of Education of Québec.

12. Recommendations from the Audit Committee on policies

Mr. Kruyt underlined the work that went into review and/or creation the policies to ensure that the University has the appropriate benchmarks and state of the art controls.

12.1 Policy on the Internal Audit Function (Documents BG-2011-4-D17 and D18)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Cherry, Chadha), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

- R-2011-4-16 That, upon recommendation of the Audit Committee, the Board of Governors approve the revised Policy on the Internal Audit Function (Policy BD-13) (formerly the Policy on Internal Audit Services Policy PRE-1), as set out in Document BG-2011-4-D17.
- 12.2 Policy on Enterprise Risk Management (Document BG-2011-4-D19)

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Cherry, Novak), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

R-2011-4-17 That, upon recommendation of the Audit Committee, the Board of Governors approve the establishment of the Policy on Enterprise Risk Management (Policy BD-14), as set out in Document BG-2011-4-D19.

13. Report and recommendation from the Budget Committee (Document BG-2011-4-D20)

Mr. Kelley noted that the provincial budget was released on March 17 but that MELS was not prepared to provide the details of its implication until May 20. So far, it is known that MELS wishes to enter into a series of written agreements with universities in connection with the following sources of funds:

- Student contributions increased tuition
- Government contributions maintenance of core funding and additional funds
- University contributions increase in some revenues in some targeted areas
- Seeking increased donations.

Mr. Kelley explained that universities will have to compete, in part, with the other universities for the \$530 million in additional revenues commencing in 2011/2012. The budget measures call for an increase in tuition of \$325 as of 2012/2013 with a 35% clawback to fund student aid. The forfaitaires charged to non-Quebec students are still under discussion with MELS. However, MELS requires that the additional revenue derived from tuition fee increases be devoted exclusively to quality of teaching and student services and quality of research.

Mr. Kelley detailed the other budget measures stated by MELS regarding competitive positioning of universities, donations, administration and management, noting that each target is subject to a formal agreement which would impact the receipt of the funds if the targets are not met. He outlined the budget highlights and showed projected budgets for 2011/2012, 2012/2013 and 2013/2014 based on projected FTEs, which would result in a small operating surplus before funding the financial obligations in connection with unfunded liabilities and the impact of GAAP.

Upon motion duly moved and seconded (Cherry, Edwards), it was unanimously RESOLVED:

R-2011-4-18 That, upon recommendation of the Budget Committee, the Board of Governors approve the preliminary operating budget for the year ended April 30, 2012, as set out in Document BG-2011-4-D20; and

That, should there be no material change further to the receipt of the final budget information on May 20, 2011, the Board of Governors authorize the Executive Committee to approve the final operating budget.

14. <u>President's report</u> (Document BG-2011-4-D21)

Dr. Lowy noted that there had been a considerable and salutary shift in the climate and morale on campus. He reported that Steering Committee of Senate and the Executive Committee had engaged in a frank and constructive dialogue at a meeting held on April 4, during which all participants recognized the value of holding regular meetings between both committees and emphasized the importance of improving communication between the Board and Senate. The External Governance Review Committee continues to do its work and is expected to submit its report in June.

Dr. Lowy updated the Board on the status of the searches for the Vice-President, Advancement and Alumni Relations and the Vice-President, Services. The launch of the public phase of the comprehensive campaign is scheduled for the Fall and will show the outside world that the University is back on track.

15. <u>Presentation by Dean Catherine Wild on the state of the Faculty of Fine Arts</u> (Document BG-2011-4-D22)

Dean Wild provided a snapshot of the Faculty with respect to the number of departments, research centres and chairs, programs, students, faculty, staff and alumni. The Faculty's main competitors are York and UQAM. Aging faculty is a concern since about half of the faculty retire by the age of 65 and the other half by the age of 70.

She outlined the Faculty's signature areas and spoke of program renewal. The Faculty is known for its interdisciplinary niche and its growing strength in the area of sustainability. The Faculty is a recognized leader. It has the University's top acceptance rate with 81% registration of accepted first choice undergraduate applicants as well as steadily increasing applications and a consistent success rate in research funding. Two key external indicators are media recognition and external prizes.

Dean Wild expanded on the four key strategic priorities which include attracting the next generation of students; faculty renewal to ensure stewardship of core programs; consolidating the Faculty on the SGW campus; and effective and responsible management of resources and services. The ongoing challenges include strengthening the signature areas, recruiting and retaining first choice graduate students and renewal of faculty and staff while the new challenges consist in meeting the increasing need for research space; reinvigorating technical and administrative support to meet increased enrolment and new technology demands; and guiding the development of the Grey Nuns site.

Further to her presentation, Dean Wild responded to questions. Copy of the detailed presentation is filed with the Secretary and was also forwarded to Board members in advance of the meeting.

16. Other business

Mr. Dabchy spoke about the *Dinner for Eight* initiative, a mentorship program launched in 2009 by Advancement and Alumni Relations, which enables alumni to share their

professional experience with students over dinner. He encouraged Governors to host such a dinner, since this would be an effective way to build bridges, increase transparency, improve the perception of the Board and foster interaction. Me McCaughey indicated her full support of this idea and would send the information to any interested Board member.

Mr. Kruyt thanked the students attending in the visitors' gallery for being calm and invited one of them to briefly address the Board. Mr. Erik Chevrier, a graduate student, shared the concerns of a number of students and faculty with respect to the Board's conduct in the termination of Dr. Woodsworth. He spoke of problems with transparency and of the Board's failure to deal with the Senate motion calling for the resignation of the Chair of the Board due to its lack of confidence, a motion which was supported by several associations and faculty councils. He underlined the importance of dealing which these issues in an open and transparent manner. Dr. Lowy responded that the Board will address the issue of its confidence in the Chair in the upcoming weeks.

17. Next meeting

The next regular meeting of the Board of Governors will be held on Thursday, June 9, 2011, at 8 a.m., in Room EV 2.260, on the SGW Campus.

18. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 10:15 a.m.

Danielle Tessier

A Tomis

Secretary of the Board of Governors